

R3

Business Case - Service Level Change

Title	Reduce Timeline to Merge Fire Stations		
Department	Community Safety	Division	Fire Services
		Council Resolution	CC2023-134, CC2023-136, CC2023-170

I. Executive Summary

Overview of Proposal

Council Resolutions CC2023-134, CC2023-136, and CC2023-170 directed staff to consolidate a number of emergency service stations into new builds or stations to be renovated. This business case recommends staff be directed to expedite the consolidation of several stations to reduce operating and future capital costs. These consolidations will also enhance supervision and worker safety and better support effective team work by enhancing fireground operations.

Staff recommend early consolidation of Val Caron Station into Val Therese Station, Falconbridge Station into Garson Station, and Copper Cliff Station into Waters Station, as previously approved by Council through the Station Revitalization Project. An expedited consolidation would be within existing stations and infrastructure, with future development to occur in line with the approved station revitalization. This early consolidation will help to reduce operating costs but does not resolve any requirements to address the health and safety, space, or other operational concerns through new builds or station renovations which were approved by Council, and will need to be addressed in the future.

II. Background

Current Service Level

The Val Caron, Falconbridge, and Copper Cliff Stations are stand-alone locations, however they respond to emergency incidents in their assigned district as part of a response team. Multiple stations respond together to form each emergency response. Each station has two fire apparatus assigned and the following staffing: Val Caron (11 staff), Falconbridge (two staff), and Copper Cliff (seven staff). All volunteer firefighters would be provided the opportunity and encouraged to transfer to the next closest station as per the collective agreement. If all volunteer firefighters were to transfer, it would result in the following number of volunteer firefighters at each station: Val Therese Station (25 staff), Garson Station (19 staff), Waters Station (33 staff).

III. Recommendation

Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Change to base operating budget	<input type="checkbox"/>	Change to base FTE allocation
<input type="checkbox"/>	Change to fees (unit price)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Change to revenues (volume change)
<input type="checkbox"/>	Investment in project (Operating)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Investment in project (Capital)

Recommendation and Rationale

Staff are recommending this early consolidation to assist in reducing operating and unanticipated capital costs to maintain these facilities. Council has already approved these consolidations as part of the Station Revitalization Project. Accelerating the consolidation would reduce the operational and capital financial impact of any unplanned asset failure. These consolidations would also assist in mitigating potential health and safety issues resulting from lack of supervision, operational issues and shrinking the City's carbon footprint. Should this not be approved, identified safety risks and occupational exposures to staff are anticipated to escalate (e.g. WSIB, mental health, lack of supervision).

How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Asset Management and Service Excellence	<input type="checkbox"/>	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
<input type="checkbox"/>	Climate Change	<input type="checkbox"/>	Housing
<input type="checkbox"/>	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	<input type="checkbox"/>	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

This business case supports Council's Strategic Plan as it relates to the Asset Management and Service Excellence pillar by reducing physical assets (buildings), future capital costs (apparatus), and ongoing building maintenance. In order to recognize cost savings in 2024 associated with the station consolidations, the buildings would need to be closed, declared redundant and sold as soon as possible.

Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

This business case does not have any direct link to CEEP.

IV. Impact Analysis

Qualitative Implications

If the proposed business case is approved, this will achieve cost savings through a reduction of physical assets (buildings), future capital cost (apparatus), and ongoing building maintenance costs including unplanned asset failures. The consolidation of all three recommended stations would result in a reduction of fleet by three apparatus (two pumpers and one tanker). The financial savings of a reduced fleet would not be identified until Q4 of 2025 as the two pumpers will be utilized to conduct NFPA 1002 (pump operations) training to all City firefighters in 2025. Implementation of this change will reduce safety risks, improve supervision, increase number of responders on an apparatus, promote consolidated training, and provide an overall increase to effective fireground response and operations.

Quantifiable Implications

Early consolidation would reduce the operating costs of the stations by approximately \$74,000, this includes snow removal, insurance, building maintenance, and utilities.

Operating Revenue - Per Year

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Going	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		One-Time	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

Operating Expenditures - Per Year

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Falconbridge - Snow Removal	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (6,519)	\$ (6,519)	\$ (6,519)	\$ (6,519)	\$ (6,519)
Copper Cliff - Snow Removal	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (5,835)	\$ (5,835)	\$ (5,835)	\$ (5,835)	\$ (5,835)
Val Caron - Snow Removal	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (6,603)	\$ (6,603)	\$ (6,603)	\$ (6,603)	\$ (6,603)
Insurance	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (14,568)	\$ (14,568)	\$ (14,568)	\$ (14,568)	\$ (14,568)
Falconbridge - Building Maintenance	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (735)	\$ (735)	\$ (735)	\$ (735)	\$ (735)
Copper Cliff - Building Maintenance	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (2,569)	\$ (2,569)	\$ (2,569)	\$ (2,569)	\$ (2,569)
Val Caron - Building Maintenance	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (3,140)	\$ (3,140)	\$ (3,140)	\$ (3,140)	\$ (3,140)
Natural Gas	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (17,620)	\$ (17,620)	\$ (17,620)	\$ (17,620)	\$ (17,620)
Hydro	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (9,722)	\$ (9,722)	\$ (9,722)	\$ (9,722)	\$ (9,722)
Water	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ (6,522)	\$ (6,522)	\$ (6,522)	\$ (6,522)	\$ (6,522)
		On-Going	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		One-Time	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)
		Total	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)

FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
			Permanent	-	-	-	-	-
			PT Hours	-	-	-	-	-

Yearly Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
On-Going	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
One-Time	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)
Total	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)	\$ (73,833)

Net Levy Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
On-Going	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
One-Time	\$ (73,833)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Total	\$ (73,833)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
% Levy Increase	-0.02%	0.00%			

Implementation

Once approved we would consolidate (move people and necessary equipment) to the new station over a period of three to four weeks, with a desire to ensure the consolidations are complete by end of December 2024. Dispatch and related technologies would be adjusted as required to reflect the elimination of the consolidated stations.

Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Worker safety • Improved supervision • Future capital cost avoidance • Effective fireground staffing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Potential loss of staff who choose not to consolidate

V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact