

CAO Performance Evaluation Process for 2021

Presented To:	Finance and Administration Committee
Meeting Date:	October 19, 2021
Type:	Managers' Reports
Prepared by:	Kevin Fowke Corporate Services
Recommended by:	General Manager of Corporate Services

Report Summary

This report provides a recommended approach for the CAO performance evaluation process for 2021.

Resolution

THAT the CAO Performance Evaluation process be amended for 2021 as outlined in the report entitled “CAO Performance Evaluation Process for 2021” presented at the Finance and Administration Committee meeting on October 19, 2021.

Relationship to the Strategic Plan, Health Impact Assessment and Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)

This report refers to operational matters and has no direct connection to the Community Energy and Emissions Plan (CEEP).

Financial Implications

There are no financial implications associated with this report.

Background

Prior to 2017, CAO performance discussions were held on an annual basis using the performance planning and development process in place for non-union staff. The process focused on an annual presentation in closed session. The CAO presented their assessment of the performance of the organization during the prior year and outlined the performance goals and personal development objectives for themselves and the senior team for the upcoming year. The Director of Human Resources and Organizational Development assisted the Mayor on behalf of Council to present a letter summarizing their collective performance feedback.

In January 2017, Council directed the implementation of a new performance evaluation process following the

steps outlined by the Canadian Association of Municipal Administrators (CAMA) in a recommended CAO performance evaluation toolkit. The toolkit recommended three steps to the evaluation process:

1. CAO creates a CAO Handbook for Performance Evaluation
2. Mayor and Council meet to create a final performance evaluation report
3. CAO, Mayor and Council meet to discuss the performance evaluation report

The handbook was developed in 2017 and includes a number of job description documents and the goals set for the CAO for the year. The first full iteration of the new process took place in late 2017 and has continued each year since that time.

This process has evolved to include a quarterly presentation by the CAO, offering insights into organizational performance using a set of metrics and discussion about the progress towards annual goals in both a closed and open session of City Council.

In 2020, the Q4 performance review included discussion about the evaluation process and alternatives that would make the input process easier and more uniform for participants.

ANALYSIS

The Process as Designed in 2017

In 2016 CAMA surveyed CAOs and Council members across Canada on the subject of performance evaluation of CAOs. Their findings resulted in the production of a toolkit for CAO Performance Evaluation. The following process was adopted in 2017 in response to Council's direction, it was "personalized" to CGS to include components of the City's talent development system.

The CAO Handbook for Performance Evaluation is comprised of the following:

- a. The CAO Job Description and Predictive Index profile of the role used by the CAO Hiring Committee.
- b. The CAO By-law and relevant sections of the delegations By-law.
- c. S. 229 of the *Municipal Act*.
- d. The Level 5 (Enterprise Leadership) competencies from the CGS core Leadership Competency Dictionary.
- e. The generic accountabilities from the CGS Performance Planning and Development process at Level 5.
- f. A list of eight (8) to ten (10) goals as decided by the CAO in consultation with Executive Leadership Team (ELT) to be representative of the deliverables for a given year that summarize the goals and key results expected of the CAO and;
- g. Measures for the goals set by Council for the CAO.

Members of Council, the Executive Leadership Team (ELT) and community partners are interviewed separately by an independent facilitator. They comment on the job documents in the handbook and the CAO's execution in terms of leadership competencies and performance results compared to the goals identified at the beginning of the year. The interviews provide qualitative assessments which are summarized into the final performance report and published for Council in advance of the annual performance evaluation discussion.

Once the evaluation discussion has taken place, the Mayor, with the assistance of the General Manager of Corporate Services produces a letter to the CAO summarizing Council's feedback. The letter is placed in the CAO employee file and is linked to progression (if any) within the CAO pay group, if applicable.

The Process Used by Comparator Municipalities

Many municipalities are following a CAO evaluation process that mirrors the process in place for other non-union and managerial staff. Durham, Halton and Peel Regions follow the process in place for other non-union staff, lead by the Regional Chair with assistance from Human Resources.

Niagara Region follows a process which is based upon the CAMA model with the Regional Chair asking for the CAO's self-assessment and coordinating input from members of Council. The Regional Chair produces a report based on the feedback received and it is discussed by Council in closed session. The Regional Chair then sets objectives and development plans for the following period using the tools available for other non-union staff.

The City of Windsor also uses a survey format to collect information about CAO performance and sends the survey to union executives, direct reports and those in the community that interact on a more regular basis with the CAO. The CAO also provides a self-assessment and completes the same survey as the other contributors to the process.

Thunder Bay follows the CAMA toolkit as well. City Council uses a performance evaluation survey based on the eight leadership competencies at the level appropriate for the CAO. The surveys are also sent to direct reports to the CAO and key community stakeholders. The CAO completes a self-assessment and all data gathered is used to form a report for Council for their discussion and evaluation of CAO performance. The Director of Human Resources assists Council in documenting their feedback for the CAO and the results are linked to the CAO's annual salary increase.

RECOMMENDED PROCESS FOR 2021

Based on feedback about the process from members of Council and the CAO, the following change is recommended to the process for 2021.

1. The data collection method to create the final performance evaluation report will be automated using an electronic survey methodology. This survey will utilize a standard process for input from members of Council, the Executive Leadership Team and community partners, with opportunity for unstructured comments. This data will form the basis for more in depth discussion with members of Council which will comprise the complete input to the evaluation report.
2. A new external process facilitator will be engaged maintaining the arm's length process in place to produce the final performance evaluation report. The external facilitator who had assisted with the process from 2017 – 2021 has retired.

CONCLUSION

Based on the recommended process for 2021, members of Council can expect to receive a link to a confidential electronic survey in December.

Once this data is collected, all members of Council will be invited to individual meetings with the external process facilitator in January, 2022. The facilitator will then prepare the final performance evaluation report. The report will accompany the 2021 fourth quarter performance report from the CAO anticipated to be published for the February 22, 2022 meeting of City Council in closed session.

Resources Cited

CAO Performance Evaluation and Performance Planning and Development Report, presented January 17, 2017: <https://pub-greatersudbury.escribemeetings.com/filestream.ashx?documentid=9553>

CAMA CAO Performance Evaluation Toolkit: <https://pub-greatersudbury.escribemeetings.com/filestream.ashx?documentid=9554>