# Appendix 1

BC #	Page #	Description	Council Resolution	2025 Impact	2026 Impact	2027 Impact	2028 Impact	2029 Impact
		Council Directed	-				•	
1	2	Proceed with Phase 2 of MR 55 Lorne Street Infrastructure Renewal	FA2023-54 / FA2023-75-A4	1,154,313	1,154,313	1,157,013	1,157,013	1,157,013
2	5	Enhance Pedestrian and Cycling Safety Along Notre Dame Street West (Azilda)	OP2023-28 / FA2023-75-A4	800,000	-	-	-	-
3	8	Implement Mattress Diversion Program	OP2022-17 / FA2023-75-A5	356,250	475,000	475,000	475,000	475,000
4	11	Construct Sidewalk on Murray Street	OP2023-21 / FA2023-75-A4	350,898	925	953	981	1,010
5	14	Install Road Weather Information Stations	FA2023-75-A4	255,000	5,000	5,000	5,000	5,000
6	17	Expand Community Homelessness Prevention Initiative Guidelines	CC2024-130	200,000	200,000	200,000	200,000	200,000
7	20	Extend Funding for Climate Resilience Officer Contract Position	CC2023-125-A1 / FA2023-75-A14	164,948	169,897	-	-	-
8	23	Install Attlee Avenue Speed Hump	OP2022-23 / FA2023-75-A20	11,500	-	-	-	-
9	25	Create an Outdoor Sports Court at O'Connor Playground	FA2023-53 / FA2023-75-A4	3,000	255,000	3,000	3,000	3,000
10	n/a	Hire Full-Time Position for Road Safety Program*	FA2023-75-A25			be deferred to 2		•
			Total	3,295,909	2,260,134	1,840,966	1,840,994	1,841,023

\*At this time, staff do not have sufficient data available to determine the projected revenue of the Automated Speed Enforcement program due to the delay of the launch of the program until late March 2024. Due to this delay, there is limited revenue data available so it remains unclear to staff if there is a need for an additional full-time employee to help deliver the Road Safety Program. Staff will continue to collect data regarding the Automated Speed Enforcement program and bring forward the business case entitled "Hire Full-Time Position for Road Safety Program" as part of the 2026 budget deliberations.

BC #	Page #	Description	Council Resolution	2025 Impact	2026 Impact	2027 Impact	2028 Impact	2029 Impact
		Staff Initiated						
11	28	Implement Modern Workplace Efficiencies for Municipal Relocation		553,790	545,077	312,551	312,551	304,962
12	32	Implement Endpoint Detection and Response System with Cybersecurity Analyst		91,441	275,508	280,508	285,508	290,508
13	36	Hire Part-Time MLEO for Onboard Transit		37,503	38,628	36,641	34,595	32,487
14	39	Hire Transit Electronic Technician		17,799	18,333	18,333	18,333	18,333
15	41	Install New Exterior Columbarium Wall		46	(26)	(43)	17	(58,233)
16	44	Implement User Fee for Tom Davies Courtyard Event Bookings		(5,700)	(5,871)	(6,047)	(6,229)	(6,415)
			Total	694,879	871,650	641,943	644,775	581,642

Grand Total 3,990,787 3,131,784 2,482,909 2,485,769 2,422,665

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Proceed with Phase 2 of MR 55/Lorne Street Infrastructure Renewal Project

Department

Growth & Infrastructure

Infrastructure Capital Planning

**Council Resolution** 

Division

FA2023-54 / FA2023-75-A4

# I. Executive Summary

# Overview of Proposal

The Municipal Road 55 (MR 55)/Lorne Street Infrastructure Renewal Project consists of the renewal and rehabilitation of the corridor from Elm Street to Power Street with the exception of the recently improved section between Logan Avenue and Martindale Road. MR 55/Lorne Street is an arterial road that connects the communities of Whitefish, Naughton, Lively and Copper Cliff to downtown and has an average daily traffic volume of around 20,000 vehicles. It is a key commercial and industrial transportation route, is one of the five main connections to the provincial highway system and a gateway to the community.

The underground infrastructure (watermain, sanitary sewer and storm sewer) are approaching the end of their useful life and require rehabilitation and/or renewal in the near future, along with upsizing of the watermain infrastructure as recommended by the Water/Wastewater Master Plan to provide improved hydraulics in the area. Phase One of the renewal project in 2023 included a rehabilitation of the storm sewer system from Lorne Street to Junction Creek. Phase Two (Big Nickel Road to Logan Avenue) and Phase Three (Power Street to Big Nickel Road) are ready for tender, pending the approval of the capital budget to proceed with construction.

As outlined in Council Resolution FA2023-54, the second phase of the project, from Big Nickel Road to Logan Avenue, has an estimated construction cost of \$21.8 million, \$5.2 million of which would be funded from Water and Wastewater, leaving a balance of \$16.6 million requiring a funding source. Phase Two would include full reconstruction of the roadway including new asphalt, a proposed 1.5 metre sidewalk and active transportation improvements including grade separated cycle tracks, Kelly Lake Road and Lorne Street intersection geometry improvements, a proposed 400 millimetre new watermain on the south side, proposed storm sewers, removal and replacement of existing sanitary sewers, traffic signal and streetlight improvements, and proposed pavement markings and signage.

With approval of \$16.6 million of funding, Phase 2 of the MR 55/Lorne Street Infrastructure Renewal Project could begin construction in 2025. Awaiting funding from other levels of government to address this infrastructure renewal project could delay the project indefinitely, increasing the risk of failure of critical underground infrastructure on this key commercial and industrial route.

# II. Background

#### **Current Service Level**

Currently, MR 55 and Lorne Street are in need of asset renewal and rehabilitation. The asset is approaching the end of its service life and components are becoming deficient. Maintenance costs exceed acceptable standards, the asset is performing lower than expected and deterioration is evident. The City has an opportunity to enhance pedestrian safety and make transit improvements. During detailed design, recommendations of the Transportation Master Plan and complete street principles are being reviewed and considered.

Currently, the Sidewalk Priority Index (SPI) rankings for MR 55/Lorne Street are: Power Street to Balsam Street – 65.5 (Rank 92), Balsam Street to Big Nickel Road – 63 (Rank 134), Big Nickel Road to Kelly Lake Road – 61.5 (Rank 167), Kelly Lake Road to Webbwood Drive – 71.25 (Rank 57).

The current Potential for Safety Improvement (PSI) index score for road safety of signalized intersections and rank out of all signalized/stop controlled intersections are as follows: MR 55 at Power Street – 2.15 (Rank 52), MR 55 at Balsam Street – 0.57 (Rank 69), Lorne Street at Kelly Lake Road – 5.66 (Rank 33), Lorne Street at Logan Avenue – 0.73 (Rank 66), Lorne Street at Gutcher Avenue – 2.94 (Rank 44), Lorne Street at Martindale Road – 0 (Rank 91), Lorne Street at Regent Street – 5.71 (Rank 32), Lorne Street at Douglas Street – 13.64 (Rank 11), Lorne Street at Walnut Street – 0.14 (Rank 82), Lorne Street at Elm Street – 5.79 (Rank 30).

#### **III. Recommendation**

#### Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation
Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)
Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)

# **Recommendation and Rationale**

The main driver for the recommendation is asset renewal and rehabilitation. As stated previously, the current infrastructure is aging, the asset is becoming deficient and costs are exceeding standards. Health and safety is also a very large driver for the recommended action. The recommendation addresses pedestrian safety with the installation of active transportation improvements as well as intersection improvements. As stated previously, the detailed design considers the recommendations of the Transportation Master Plan and considers complete streets principles. Lastly, the Water/Wastewater Master Plan recommended action apply redundancy. The recommendation is to rehabilitate and renew Lorne Street and MR 55 infrastructure. It is recommended to do so in order to address health and safety concerns, asset renewal as per the City's asset management strategy, and enhance quality of life by implementing active transportation improvements, intersection improvements, intersection improvements, and corridor beautification. It is also recommended to renew and rehabilitate the underground infrastructure at the same time.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

x	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	Climate Change	Housing
x	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

The project will satisfy the Asset Management and Service Excellence objectives within Council's 2019-2027 City of Greater Sudbury Strategic Plan. The asset renewal project will satisfy objective 1.1 reinforce infrastructure for new development. The project will also support a healthier community with the inclusion of the complete streets strategies and active transportation improvements.

#### Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

As part of the work to renew the infrastructure in this corridor, active transportation improvements, transit improvements, and traffic flow improvements will be implemented with the goal of reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

The recommendation will result in increased customer satisfaction due to the asset being rehabilitated, as well as improvements to active transportation, intersections, transit, and corridor beautification. The renewal and rehabilitation of the underground infrastructure will result in a more reliable water and wastewater system, which will require less maintenance.

#### **Quantifiable Implications**

Council has approved a portion of funding for the entire project, with what was originally presented to have proposed federal and provincial funding covering the majority of the remaining costs. This outside funding has not materialized. The City currently has \$10.8 million budgeted and committed to the completion of the design of all phases and the construction of Phase One. This request is for the balance of funding to carry out construction of Phase Two of the project (Lorne Street from Big Nickel Road to Logan Avenue). For the Roads portion of Phase Two, the cash flow represents a \$16.6 million requirement for 2025. For the Water and Wastewater portion, the \$5.2 million cash flow required for 2025 is already in the approved capital budget. For the outstanding \$16.6 million for the Roads portion, the City is recommending the use of debt financing which equates to \$1.2 million per year for 25 years, at an estimated rate of 4.8 per cent. If funded by the tax levy, the annual debt repayment work in progress funds to pay for the construction work in 2025, and return those funds in 2026 when then debt is issued.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Roads - Debt	One-Time	Debt	\$ (16,600,000)				
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ (16,600,000)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ (16,600,000)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Capital Costs	One-Time	1	\$ 16,600,000				
Debt Repayment	On-Going	Capital	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,154,313
Incremental Operating	On-Going	Tax Levy			\$ 2,700	\$ 2,700	\$ 2,700
	On-Goin	g	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013
	One-Tim	e	\$ 16,600,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 17,754,313	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013

This would add a new project to the Roads and Water and Wastewater capital program. The \$5.2 million for the Water and Wastewater portion of Phase Two is already in the approved capital budget. Should this business case not be approved by Council, the portion of Water and Wastewater capital not required to complete the

Impact to Capital design will be returned to the Water and Wastewater reserve fund. The \$16.6 million required for the Roads

portion of Phase Two would need to be added to the capital budget cash flow for 2025. As well, redirecting funds from the proposed capital budget will result in reprioritizing this project within the arterial/collector program and delaying work that is identified as a higher priority in asset management plans.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		Permane	nt	-	-	-	-	-
		PT Hours	S	-	-	-	•	-
		Ye	arly Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013
		One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,154,313	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013	\$ 1,157,013
		Net	Levy Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ 1,154,313	\$ -	\$ 2,700	\$ -	\$ -
		One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 1,154,313	\$ -	\$ 2,700	\$ -	\$ -
		% Levy I	norease	0.32%	0.00%			

# Implementation

The design and tender documents of all phases will be completed in 2025 and ready for tender, pending approval of the capital budget for construction. The first phase of construction was completed in 2023, and involved the rehabilitation of the storm sewer from Lorne Street to Junction Creek. The second phase of construction outlined in this business case would be constructed in 2025 to 2026 and would cost \$21.8 million (\$16.6 million Roads and \$5.2 million Water and Wastewater). The third and fourth phases of construction are a lower priority and can be addressed under a future capital budget request. If the budget is approved, Phase Two construction on Lorne Street/MR 55 from Big Nickel Road to Logan Avenue will be tendered in early 2025, and construction completed in 2026. The underground work and binder asphalt would be completed in 2025, with final restoration and surface asphalt complete in 2026. The anticipated cash flow would be as follows: Water and Wastewater portion: 95 per cent (\$3.3 million Water, \$1.6 million Wastewater) of budget expenditures in 2025 and 5 per cent (\$171,000 Water, \$35,860 Wastewater) of budget expenditures in 2026. Roads portion: 70 per cent (\$11.6 million) in 2025 and 30 per cent (\$5 million) in 2026.

#### Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
Improve resident satisfaction	Increase in overall municipal debt levels
Address aging and deteriorating infrastructure	<ul> <li>Over-committing limited City resources (Engineering and ICP) as this project would be an addition to the overall capital program for 2025.</li> </ul>
Foster economic development by properly servicing area and developable land to attract new development and keep existing ones	
Increase in service level with the addition of active transportation facilities	

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact
Status Quo - Continue to wait for funding opportunities from senior levels of government.	<ul> <li>No financial impact</li> <li>Does not reprioritize capital work determined in the Asset Management Plan</li> <li>Does not improve resident satisfaction / quality of roads</li> <li>Does not address aging infrastructure</li> <li>Could require higher maintenance costs as the asset continues to age</li> </ul>	\$
Construct Phase Two of the project at 100% City cost with an increase to general tax levy (no debt financing)	<ul> <li>1.6 per cent increase in the property tax levy in 2025, assuming collected over three years</li> <li>Improves resident satisfaction / quality of roads</li> <li>Addresses aging infrastructure</li> <li>The cash flow required for Roads portion would be \$11.6 million in 2025 and \$5.0 million in 2026 if we were to complete the project without debt financing</li> </ul>	Additional \$16.6 million required to be collected from the tax levy over three years \$2,700 ongoing operating costs
Re-prioritize the arterial program to fully fund this project ahead of others. (No debt financing)	<ul> <li>Improves resident satisfaction / quality of roads</li> <li>Addresses aging infrastructure</li> <li>Delays work on higher priority projects as determined by the asset management plan</li> </ul>	Additional maintenance required on delayed projects \$2,700 ongoing operating costs
Debt finance the work and fund the repayment costs from the capital budget.	<ul> <li>Completes the project without an increase in the property tax levy.</li> <li>Reprioritizes this project ahead of other high priority projects.</li> <li>Increase in overall debt levels.</li> </ul>	\$

2	

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Enhance Pedestrian and Cycling Safety Along Notre Dame Street West (Azilda) Department Growth & Infrastructure Division Infrastructure Capital Planning

**Council Resolution** 

OP2023-28 / FA2023-75-A4

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

At the August 2023 Operations Committee meeting, a motion was carried directing staff to conduct a pedestrian safety assessment of Notre Dame Street between Montée Principale and Champlain Street. This assessment was to include options available to improve and enhance pedestrian safety separate from future road infrastructure improvements, and to present the results to the Operations Committee by the fourth quarter of 2023. The motion also asked that staff be directed to present a business case for each of the available pedestrian and cycling safety enhancements identified for Council's consideration during 2024 budget deliberations. This business case was deferred during 2024 budget deliberations.

This project includes the addition of a paved shoulder for the 1.25 kilometre stretch of Notre Dame Street West between Montée Principale and Champlain Street. This would include milling 0.5 metres of asphalt from the southern road edge, followed by the application of a 40 millimetre surface asphalt overlay along the milled edge and an additional 2.0 metres for the paved shoulder. The existing line markings would be removed, the travel lanes would be reduced to 3.5 metres in each direction, and the centre lines and edge lines would be repainted. This would yield 3.5 metre drive lanes with the addition of a 2.0 metre wide paved shoulder and edge lines.

This area of Notre Dame Street West has five different segments which have been ranked on the Sidewalk Priority Index. The five segments rank between 276 and 1,277 out of 4,013 segments.

# II. Background

#### **Current Service Level**

Notre Dame Street West in Azilda, between Montée Principale and Champlain Street, is a collector road with a 50 km/hour speed limit and an average annual daily traffic volume of 1,100 vehicles. It has a 7.5 metre asphalt surface with a paved shoulder ranging from 1.5 to 2.0 metres on the north side and a gravel shoulder on the south. The area consists of low- and medium-density housing and acts as a direct connection to the town centre, which offers various essential services and amenities. GOVA transit route 104 also serves this section. Pedestrians currently have access to the paved and gravel shoulders while cyclists can use the paved shoulder on the north side of the road or share the vehicle lane on the south side of the road.

Notre Dame Street West is designated as a class 1 to 3 road and is maintained to bare pavement during the winter season. The paved shoulder on the north side of the road is plowed when the drive lane is plowed. The gravel shoulder on the south side is not plowed until the shoulder is frozen and then the snowbank is pushed back as snow storage is needed. While it may be possible for some pedestrians to walk on this shoulder, gravel shoulders in general throughout Greater Sudbury are not maintained to a state for pedestrians to use them during the winter months.

#### **III.** Recommendation

#### Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation
Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)
Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Bationale**

The main driver for the recommendation is health and safety. The recommendation addresses pedestrian and cyclist safety with the installation of 2.0 metre wide paved shoulders for active transportation.

Not constructing the paved shoulder and maintaining the status quo presents a low risk to the City's strategic goals related to Climate Change and A Healthier and More Vibrant Community as active transportation projects continue to be advanced throughout the community as part of planned capital projects.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

		Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	x	Climate Change	Housing
	x	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience
1			

This project aligns with Climate Change and Create a Healthier Community initiatives as identified in the Strategic Plan and Goal 8: Achieve 35 per cent active mobility transportation mode share by 2050 in the Community Energy and Emissions Plan (CEEP).

# Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

The Council-approved Community Energy and Emissions Plan puts forth an ambitious goal to achieve a modal split target of 35 per cent of residents using primarily active transportation modes by the year 2050, as part of the effort to make Greater Sudbury a net-zero emissions community. Investing in active transportation infrastructure, which encourages car-free travel, has been shown to have an effect on people choosing to travel by foot, bike or transit. This will directly result in a reduction in local greenhouse gas emissions and support the City's efforts to become more resilient to the effects of climate change locally.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

#### **Qualitative Implications**

The installation of a 2.0 metre wide paved shoulder can have positive qualitative implications for pedestrians and cyclists. This includes improved safety, enhanced accessibility, increased active transportation, improved community connectivity, enhanced recreational opportunities, and potential aesthetic and environmental benefits. Further, these enhancements will lead to additional pedestrians and cyclists using this corridor as they recognize this space can be used safely and comfortably.

# **Quantifiable Implications**

This project includes the addition of a paved shoulder for the 1.25 kilometre stretch of Notre Dame Street West between Montée Principale and Champlain Street. This would include milling 0.5 metres of asphalt from the southern road edge, followed by the application of a 40 millimetre surface asphalt overlay along the milled edge and an additional 2.0 metres for the paved shoulder. The existing line markings would be removed, the travel lanes would be reduced to 3.5 metres in each direction, and the centre lines and edge lines would be repainted. This would yield 3.5 metre drive lanes with the addition of a 2.0 metre wide paved shoulder and edge lines. The paved shoulders would be plowed during the winter as the drive lanes are maintained.

This project is estimated to cost \$800,000.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Notre Dame Azilda Paved Shoulders	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 800,000				
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ 800,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 800,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

Impact to Capital This would add a new project to the capital budget with cash flow as noted above.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028		2029	
		Permane	ent	-	-	-		-		-
		PT Hours	S	-	-	-		-		-
		Ye	early Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028		2029	
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	
		One-Tim	e	\$ 800,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	
		Total		\$ 800,000	\$ -	\$ •	\$	-	\$ -	
		Net	Levy Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028		2029	
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	
		One-Tim	e	\$ 800,000	\$ (800,000)	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	
		Total		\$ 800,000	\$ (800,000)	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	
		% Levy II	ncrease	0.22%	-0.21%					

# Implementation

If approved, it is anticipated the detailed design and construction of this project would be completed in 2025 or 2026 based on available resources within Engineering Services.

Advantages/Disadvantages	
Advantages	Disadvantages
• The installation of a paved shoulder on the south side of the road will improve service levels for pedestrians and cyclists as well as motorists who need to pull their vehicle over.	<ul> <li>By installing the paved shoulder on the south side of Notre Dame Street West, this section will receive a pedestrian facility before other higher-ranked locations on the Sidewalk Priority Index.</li> </ul>

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact
Rehabilitate the road by milling the entire asphalt surface, applying a 40 millimetre surface asphalt overlay across its entirety, adding an additional 2.0 metre wide paved shoulder and repainting the centre lines and edge lines.	Advantages: - Improves resident satisfaction by improving the quality of roads. - Enhances pedestrian and cyclist safety. - Aligns with practice of adding paved shoulders to rural roads as part of rehabilitation projects. Disadvantages: - None.	\$ 1,800,000
Partial reconstruction of the road which will result in the urbanization of one side of the road. This would include 3.5 metre driving lanes, a barrier curb on one side and ditch on other side, and the addition of a 3.0 metre multi-use path behind the curb.	Advantages: - Improves resident satisfaction by improving the quality of roads. - Enhances pedestrian and cyclist safety. Disadvantages: - A more complex project requiring more time to complete the detailed design, meaning construction will occur in 2026.	\$ 7,200,000

_

Department

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Implement Mattress Diversion Program
Growth and Infrastructure
Division

Environmental Services

Council Resolution

OP2022-17 / FA2023-75-A5

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

Mattresses and box springs are currently disposed at landfill sites. This business case proposes that mattresses and box springs be diverted to eliminate key challenges associated with their disposal and to save landfill space. By diverting these items, the City will benefit from a net savings in the form of landfill space resulting in a longer lifespan of the existing landfill assets and contributing to environmental sustainability by reducing greenhouse gas emissions. This program will progress the City's CEEP goal of diverting 90 per cent of solid waste.

# II. Background

#### **Current Service Level**

Mattresses and box springs are currently collected roadside from low density residential units (six units or less) as part of the City's large furniture, appliances and electronics collection program. Other generators of used mattresses and box springs may dispose of these items by delivering them directly to any waste disposal site. Presently, all mattresses and box springs are disposed in the City's landfill sites.

The disposal of mattresses and box springs in landfills has always posed challenges. Landfill operations rely on compaction as a way of maximizing landfill space. Since mattresses are made to resist compaction, they use approximately 400 per cent more space than household garbage. Their disposal is a very inefficient use of valuable landfill space. Mattresses tend to pop up during compaction resulting in costly damages when they get entangled in equipment. Mattresses decompose very slowly and may take approximately 80 to 120 years to reach full decomposition, over which time they slowly release toxic chemicals. Mattresses can have a negative effect on leachate flow causing it to percolate upwards to the surface of the landfill rather than downwards where it can be captured and treated. Leachate that seeps to the surface can cause nuisance odours.

# **III. Recommendation**

# Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

x	Change to base operating budget	Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)	Change to revenues (volume change)
	Investment in project (Operating)	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

It is recommended that mattresses and box springs be diverted by shipping them to a private recycling facility. More than 95 per cent of all discarded mattresses and box springs materials can be transformed into new products. By diverting mattresses and box springs, the key challenges associated with their disposal will be eliminated and landfill space that would have otherwise been occupied by these materials can be reserved for other waste requiring disposal. Eliminating mattresses from the disposal system will extend the life of the landfill sites and contribute to progress in achieving CEEP goals.

# How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

x	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
x	Climate Change	Housing
	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

Diverting mattresses and box springs will result in a longer lifespan of the existing landfill assets. Over the course of the landfill lifespan, the saved space is equivalent to approximately 10 per cent of the landfill volume which translates to approximately three additional years of usage. Diverting these materials rather than disposing of them in the landfill them will reduce greenhouse gas emissions and contribute to climate change mitigation.

#### Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

This program will assist in meeting the City's CEEP goals of diverting 90 per cent of solid waste by 2050. Based on the available data, it is estimated that approximately 325 tonnes of mattresses and box springs will be diverted annually and transported to a diversion facility rather than to the landfill. This will result in a net CO2 emissions savings of over 2.1 million kilograms.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

Diverting mattresses and box springs will provide a net savings in the form of landfill space. This will result in a longer lifespan of existing landfill assets and contribute to environmental sustainability by reducing greenhouse gas emissions. Saving landfill space delays the need for costly replacements of our landfill sites. This program will contribute to progressing the City's CEEP goals of diverting 90 per cent of solid waste by 2050.

#### **Quantifiable Implications**

A program for the diversion of mattresses and box springs will increase operational costs by \$475,000 annually (\$356,250 for nine months in 2025) for on-site handling, record keeping, transportation and recycling fees at the receiving facility. Future year costs would be adjusted annually based on inflationary rates and actual program use. If mattresses and box springs are designated under a provincial full-producer responsibility system in the future, the City would transition the program at that time and benefit from additional financial savings involved in the recycling of these products.

Overall, it is estimated that the implementation of a permanent mattress diversion program would have a potential annual net savings of \$357,380 in the form of saved landfill space. In addition, a permanent mattress and box spring diversion program is estimated to save 10 per cent of the landfill volume over the course of the expected remaining lifespan, which is equivalent to approximately three years of additional usage.

#### **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Sudbury Landfill	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 277,324	\$ 369,765	\$ 369,765	\$ 369,765	\$ 369,765
Azilda Landfill	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 28,495	\$ 37,993	\$ 37,993	\$ 37,993	\$ 37,993
Valley East Landfill	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 39,181	\$ 52,242	\$ 52,242	\$ 52,242	\$ 52,242
Walden Transfer Site	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 11,250	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000
	On-Goin	g	\$ 356,250	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000
	One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 356,250	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		Permane	nt	-	-	-	-	-
		PT Hours	6	-	-	-	-	-
		Ye	arly Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ 356,250	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000
		One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 356,250	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000	\$ 475,000
		Net	Levy Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ 356,250	\$ 118,750	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 356,250	\$ 118,750	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		% Levy I	ncrease	0.10%	0.03%			

# Implementation

Pending business case approval, a program for the diversion of mattresses and box springs can be implemented in Q2 2025 through a change order to the existing landfill operations contract (ISD20-30: Operation of Transfer, Disposal and Waste Diversion Sites).

There will be no impact to residential collection services or direct delivery of these items to the landfill and waste diversion sites. The collection contractor and customers delivering mattresses and box springs directly to the landfill and waste diversion sites will be directed to place the items in a diversion area rather than the tipping face or garbage containers.

Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul> <li>Mattress and box spring diversion will eliminate key challenges associated with their disposal.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>If the mattress recycler were to cease operations, a new recycler would have to be identified or the mattresses and box springs may need to return to landfill disposal.</li> </ul>
• Landfill space that would have been occupied by these materials will be used for disposal of other waste that cannot currently be diverted. Delaying the requirement for more landfill space also delays costly capital investments in new infrastructure.	<ul> <li>Lower priority work may be delayed while staff balance priorities to assume the additional administration of managing a new program within existing resources.</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>The City will benefit from a net savings in the form of landfill space resulting in longer lifespan of the existing landfill assets and contributing to environmental sustainability by reducing greenhouse gas emissions.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>This program will assist in meeting the City's CEEP goals of diverting 90 per cent of solid waste by 2050 and contribute to climate change mitigation through reduced greenhouse gas emissions.</li> </ul>	
V. Alternatives Considered	

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact

Δ	
	r,

Department

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Construct Sidewalk on Murray Street

Growth & Infrastructure

Division Infrastructure Capital Planning

Council Resolution OP2023-21 / FA2023-75-A4

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

During the July 10, 2023 Operations Committee meeting, resolution OP2023-21 was carried. This resolution directed staff to present a business case for the construction of a sidewalk on the east side of Murray Street from Lagace Street to Bond Street. This 130 metre section of Murray Street currently ranks 605 on the Sidewalk Priority Index (SPI). The SPI prioritizes locations where sidewalks should be installed, based on a variety of factors, including road classification, speed, volume, proximity to parks and schools and number of pedestrian collisions. Currently there are a total of 4,013 road segments without sidewalks that have been scored under the SPI.

Approval of this business case will result in a sidewalk being installed on Murray Street in advance of locations with a higher priority.

#### II. Background

# **Current Service Level**

Murray Street is a local road with a posted speed of 50 km/h located in the Flour Mill area. It is constructed to an urban standard with a width of nine metres. Both the east and west sides of Murray Street have sidewalks that begin from Leslie Street. The sidewalk on the west side of Murray Street ends approximately 240 metres north of Leslie Street at the driveway entrance to the grocery store. The sidewalk on the east side of Murray Street ends approximately 280 metres north of Leslie Street at the oriving Street. There is a pedestrian bridge at the end of Agnes Street that crosses Junction Creek and connects to Murray Street approximately 280 metres approximately 50 metres north of Lagace Street. Winter maintenance is provided on the existing sidewalk on the east side of Murray Street.

# **III. Recommendation**

# Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation
Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)
Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

The motion for the installation of the sidewalk was submitted in response to concerns regarding pedestrian safety on Murray Street. Murray Street is primarily a residential road, however, there are several commercial properties which also front onto Murray Street. The traffic accessing these commercial properties, which at times includes heavy trucks, is the primary concern of area residents.

In order to substantiate the concerns of residents, staff conducted traffic studies on Murray Street in August 2023. The results indicate that the 85th percentile speed of vehicles on the road was 53 km/h, the average annual daily traffic volume (AADT) is 1,243 vehicles and non-local traffic accounts for 33 per cent of the total traffic. The data from the traffic studies was applied to the City's Traffic Calming Policy and indicates that Murray Street warrants traffic calming. Murray Street will be added to the 2024 traffic calming ranked list and will qualify for the temporary traffic calming program.

Not constructing the sidewalk and maintaining the status quo presents a low risk to the City's strategic goals related to Climate Change and A Healthier and More Vibrant Community as active transportation projects continue to be advanced throughout the community as part of planned capital projects.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
x	Climate Change	Housing
x	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

This project aligns with Climate Change and Create a Healthier Community initiatives as identified in the Strategic Plan and Goal 8: Achieve 35 per cent active mobility transportation mode share by 2050 in the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP).

#### Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

The Council-approved Community Energy and Emissions Plan (CEEP) puts forth an ambitious goal to achieve a modal split target of 35 per cent of residents using primarily active transportation modes by the year 2050, as part of the effort to make Greater Sudbury a net-zero emissions community. Investing in active transportation infrastructure, which encourages car-free travel, has been shown to have an effect on people choosing to travel by foot, bike or transit. This will directly result in a reduction in local greenhouse gas emissions and support the City's efforts to become more resilient to the effects of climate change locally.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

The installation of a sidewalk will increase pedestrian safety on Murray Street and encourage active transportation.

# **Quantifiable Implications**

At the November 14, 2023 Operations Committee meeting, a report titled "Road Safety Review – Murray Street" was presented. This report included information on the study completed on Murray Street and an estimated cost to construct a sidewalk. Since the report was prepared, additional engineering has been completed and the estimated cost to construct the 130 metre sidewalk has increased to \$350,000. The primary driver for the change in estimated cost is the inability to construct the sidewalk adjacent to the embankment of Junction Creek and the need to reduce the width of Murray Street to 7.5 metres in order to accommodate a 1.5 metre wide sidewalk with an asphalt boulevard that will be less than 0.5 metres wide. If constructed, this sidewalk would be maintained throughout the winter.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
	On-Going		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

#### **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Sidewalk Murray St	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 350,000				
Sidewalk Maintenance	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 898	\$ 925	\$ 953	\$ 981	\$ 1,010
	On-Goin	g	\$ 898	\$ 925	\$ 953	\$ 981	\$ 1,010
	One-Tim	e	\$ 350,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 350,898	\$ 925	\$ 953	\$ 981	\$ 1,010

Impact to Capital This would add a new project to the capital budget for 2025.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
5	Permanent		-	-	-	-	-	
	PT Hours		-	-	-	-	-	

Yearly Impact	2025		2026	2027		2028		2029
On-Going	\$ 898	\$	925	\$ 953	\$	981	\$	1,010
One-Time	\$ 350,000	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-
Total	\$ 350,898	\$	925	\$ 953	\$	981	\$	1,010
Net Levy Impact	2025		2026	2027		2028		2029
On-Going	\$ 898	\$	27	\$ 28	\$	28	\$	29
On-Going One-Time	\$ 898 350,000	\$ \$	27 (350,000)		\$ \$	- 28	\$ \$	- 29
V	 	*		\$ 28	<u> </u>		<u> </u>	

# Implementation

If approved, it is anticipated the detailed design of this project would be completed in 2025. This project would be incorporated into the Junction Creek Improvements capital project and the construction of the sidewalk would occur in 2025 or 2026 based on the overall schedule of the capital project.

# Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
Pedestrian safety will be increased on Murray Street	• By installing sidewalk on this section, Murray Street will receive sidewalk before other higher-ranked locations on the sidewalk priority index.

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact	
Implement traffic calming measures (speed humps)	Advantages - Addresses concerns regarding speeding and discourages cut-through traffic. - Less complex which would require less Engineering Services resources and could be implemented in a shorter time frame. Disadvantages - Does not create the separated pedestrian facility that is desired by area residents. - While Murray Street will qualify for traffic calming, it will not be the highest priority so the implementation of traffic calming measures would be done ahead of higher priority locations.	\$ 60,0	000

5

Department

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Install Road Weather Information Systems

Division

Linear Infrastructure Services

**Council Resolution** 

FA2023-75-A4

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

This funding request is for the supply and installation of two full Road Weather Information Systems (RWIS) with integration of data into the City's existing RWIS weather forecasting network. The City currently operates one non-invasive (no ground sensors) RWIS on MR 8 in Levack and one full (includes ground sensors) RWIS on MR 55 in Whitefish. The full RWIS will provide real-time information on road conditions, including atmospheric and pavement temperature, wind information, rain and snow accumulation as well as live video. RWIS data will also be collected and interpreted by the City's weather forecasting service to provide localized weather forecasts, which helps determine microclimate forecasts. This weather information is used as an important tool for making winter road maintenance decisions on plowing and sand/salting operations. Amec Foster Wheeler prepared a report to the Linear Infrastructure Services Division (formerly known as Roads and Transportation) on August 17, 2016 recommending minimum requirements for RWIS installations in order to optimize weather forecasting in Greater Sudbury. The Auditor General's report titled "Performance Audit of Winter Maintenance Programs for Roads" on September 17, 2019 supported the use of technology that would assist with effective deployment of winter maintenance resources to manage winter events. The Auditor General's report also recommended that a business case be prepared to seek approval to expand the existing RWIS network to be used as an effective decision-making tool for winter maintenance supervisors.

# II. Background

#### **Current Service Level**

The City relies on road patrols and weather information as primary decision-making tools for managing winter road and sidewalk conditions in accordance with Councilestablished policies. Weather information services (real-time and forecasted weather) are provided by WSP and primarily use weather data collected from the Sudbury Airport and nearby Ministry of Transportation Ontario (MTO) RWIS. The WSP Weather System's forecast provides a variety of weather-related information, including but not limited to atmospheric temperature, snow, rain, freezing rain and wind conditions. Through WSP Weather Systems, the City also gains access to nearby MTO RWIS (Benny, Hagar, Webbwood and Highway 69/17) that provide localized pavement temperature readings amongst a variety of weather information. The City currently operates one non-invasive RWIS on MR 8 at the Onaping River Bridge in Levack that is used predominantly by the City's Northwest Section to respond to localized winter road conditions as necessary. The City also uses a recently installed full RWIS on MR 55 at the Vermillion River Bridge in Whitefish that provides localized real-time and forecasted atmospheric and pavement weather information that can be predominantly used by the Southwest Section to respond to winter road conditions as necessary. Roads operations supervisors closely monitor available real-time and forecasted weather information throughout the year but particularly during the winter months in accordance with Section 3 of O.Reg 239/02 (Minimum Maintenance Standards) which provides minimum forecast monitoring requirements of winter road maintenance to supervisors.

# **III. Recommendation**

# Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

х	Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)
	Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

The recommended change is to enhance the City's local weather monitoring network from two to four RWIS. The full RWIS will provide interchangeable sensory components that can be updated as technology evolves. Full RWIS are commonly used by the MTO and other municipalities in the province to provide real-time and forecasted weather information that can be used to maintain their respective road networks. Adding two full RWIS to the City's weather monitoring network will fill in weather information gaps left by the City's several microclimates. If approved, the two full RWIS would be installed in the Northeast (Valley/Capreol) and Southeast (Nickel Centre) sections of the City's maintenance areas as described in the AMEC Foster Wheeler report dated August 17, 2016. This will be in addition to the existing two RWIS already installed in the Northwest (Levack) and Southwest (Whitefish) sections of the City's maintenance areas. Combined with the MTO RWIS located within the City's South section (Highway 17 and Highway 69), a well rounded data set of weather information would be available through WSP Weather Services such that they could provide the City with focused weather forecasting that can be used very effectively by operations supervisors to maintain roads in each of the City's five maintenance areas.

Although this will allow operations supervisors to make better winter control decisions that will improve road and sidewalk safety and optimize the use of City resources (i.e., labour, equipment and material), not approving the business case will not degrade how the service is delivered presently. Therefore, the risk from a safety perspective of not accepting the business case is low to moderate.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

X	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness						
x	Climate Change	Housing						
	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience						

The RWIS will improve service delivery by providing an additional decision-making tool for operations supervisors to address microclimate weather patterns within the City's large geography. This will enable the optimization of winter control materials such as salt, thereby reducing harmful impacts to the surrounding natural environment. Similarly, optimal deployment of personnel and equipment to address specific winter weather conditions will reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

# Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

The RWIS will provide localized current and forecasted weather information services to operations supervisors. This additional decision-making tool is expected to reduce labour and equipment deployment and salt/sand application on nearby roads as winter maintenance services will more closely match the required service standard based on actual weather conditions.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

It is widely known that Greater Sudbury has several microclimates due to its large geographical size. Strategically installing RWIS throughout the city will allow road operations supervisors to obtain more accurate localized real-time weather data and forecasting that can be used to optimize winter maintenance service delivery. This will be a vast improvement to obtaining general weather information that primarily relies on weather data recorded at the Greater Sudbury Airport. It is difficult to calculate measurable savings. However, a more focused response to winter events based on accurate localized weather monitoring should result in reduced risk and cost avoidance by ensuring that service delivery matches the service standard required based on actual weather conditions.

# **Quantifiable Implications**

Depending on environmental (wind and salt damage) and physical (vehicular strikes) impacts, full RWIS have a maximum life span of 15 to 20 years (\$125,000 per unit) and three to five years for sensory components (\$2,000 each). Annual maintenance and upkeep of each full RWIS is approximately \$1,500. A cellular data fee of \$40 per month per unit can also be expected.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
	On-Going S		\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Time	One-Time		-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source		2025	2026		2027		2028		2029	
Weather Monitoring	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000
Contribution to Capital	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$	250,000								
	On-Goin	On-Going		5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000
	One-Time	One-Time		250,000	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
	Total		\$	255,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000

Impact to Capital This business case includes the purchase of two full RWIS at a cost of \$125,000 each for a total of \$250,000 in 2025.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time		2025		2026		2027		2028	2029
		Permane	nt		-		-		-		-	-
		PT Hours	3		-		-		-		-	-
		Ye	Yearly Impact		2025	2026		2027		2028		2029
		On-Going		\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$ 5,000
		One-Time	e	\$	250,000	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
		Total		\$	255,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$	5,000	\$ 5,000
		Net	Levy Impact		2025		2026		2027		2028	2029
		On-Going	]	\$	5,000	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
				\$	250,000	\$	(250,000)	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
		Total		\$	255,000	\$	(250,000)	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
		% Levy Ir	ncrease		0.07%		-0.07%					

# Implementation

If approved, the two full RWIS are planned to be installed in the Valley/Capreol area and in the Nickel Centre area as described in the AMEC Foster Wheeler report dated August 17, 2016. Full RWIS can be procured as standalone contracts or as a larger capital roads or bridge project. The installation and commissioning of the RWIS into the City's real-time and weather forecasting services can be implemented as early as 2025.

Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul> <li>Reduced risk that service delivery is not aligned with required winter maintenance based on local weather conditions.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Modest increase in risk that resources may not be available when RWIS data indicate need to address change in weather condition.</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Increased efficiency should result in reduced material deposition (sand and salt) and more timely deployment of personnel and equipment.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Reduction in greenhouse gas emissions and less impact on local environment.</li> </ul>	
Cost avoidance by closer alignment of winter maintenance with Council- approved service standards.	

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact
Install one full RWIS	Provides more real-time information and predictability of microclimate weather within the City which would lead to better localized decision-making when addressing winter maintenance of roads and sidewalks.	One-time \$125,000 On-going \$2,500

16	

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Expand Community Homelessness Prevention Initiative Guidelines Department Division Community Development Children and Social Services

**Council Resolution** 

CC2024-130

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

On May 28, 2024, the City of Greater Sudbury Council directed staff to develop relevant business cases based on recommendations included in the Roadmap to End Homelessness by 2030 and deliver them as part of the 2025 budget process. The Roadmap to End Homelessness by 2030 includes a recommendation to expand the Community Homelessness Prevention Initiative (CHPI) guidelines to increase support for homelessness prevention in the community.

An expansion to the CHPI program guidelines is needed as the current program guidelines and funding limits do not adequately meet demand. An expansion of the guideline would allow the program to better reflect market conditions (e.g., average market rate) with additional flexibility to pay off community housing debts and arrears to ensure low-income households can maintain their housing. The expansion of guidelines would allow further discretionary ability from staff based on costbenefit analysis compared to costs associated with accessing the emergency shelter system. Evidence also highlights the most cost-effective way to end homelessness is to stop it before it begins with effective prevention.

# II. Background

#### Current Service Level

The CHPI program is currently administered by the Social Services Section for individuals who are in receipt of social assistance and are either at risk of homelessness and require support to maintain their housing, or are currently experiencing homelessness and require support to become housed. The program provides financial support to obtain or maintain housing by providing funds to pay a last month's rent deposit, rental arrears, utility deposit or arrears, and/or household items.

In 2023, approximately \$1 million was allocated to the program through funding provided by the provincial Homelessness Prevention Program (HPP). 884 individuals were supported through the program in 2023, of which 58 per cent of allocations were to support people who were at risk of homelessness and 38 per cent were to support people who were experiencing homelessness to become housed (the status for the remaining 4 per cent is miscellaneous).

In the 2023/2024 fiscal year, approximately \$2.9 million was allocated to the cost of operating four emergency shelter programs (77 beds) in Greater Sudbury through the provincial Homelessness Prevention Program funding and federal Reaching Home funding. In 2023, the average length of time for an individual to become housed on the By-Name List was seven months. The cost of an individual accessing an emergency shelter program in Greater Sudbury, given the seven months on average to obtain housing, is approximately \$22,000 (\$3,100/month/shelter bed). By providing further support to individuals to maintain their housing and prevent them from entering the emergency shelter system, this will provide upstream investments and prevent more costly responses from the homelessness system.

#### **III. Recommendation**

# Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

x	Change to base operating budget	Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)	Change to revenues (volume change)
	Investment in project (Operating)	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

This proposal includes increasing the CHPI program budget by \$200,000 through municipal contributions to meet the current need. The increased costs would be used to expand the current CHPI guideline for a last month's rent deposit and payment of rental arrears for a single household from \$900 to \$1,100 to meet the average market rent in Greater Sudbury for a one-bedroom unit (\$1,043. Source: CMHC, 2023). The guideline for \$900 was implemented a number of years ago and has not kept pace with inflation.

Over the past few years, the program has been operating under pandemic guidelines to increase discretionary ability of the program to meet community needs. Due to the increased need, the program exceeded the anticipated budget for 2023 by \$200,000, further indicating a growing need for supports for homelessness and housing loss prevention in the community.

The 2024/2025 Homeless Prevention Program investment plan, as approved by Council, required an increase in funding for some of the emergency shelter providers as their budget needs have grown and further resources were required to help maintain operations, leading to reduced investments for other initiatives under HPP. The current CHPI budget included in the 2024/2025 budget is sitting at approximately \$930,000. This is based on year-to-date actuals and increasing needs, and is well below the anticipated spending for this current fiscal year.

The risk of status quo is that the City will be unable to meet community need for homelessness prevention and homelessness supports. The community would continue to observe an increase of individuals entering into the homelessness system and remaining homeless for several months.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

	Asset Management and Service Excellence		Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	Climate Change	x	Housing
x	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community		Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

This proposal aligns with the Council's Strategic Plan through pillar 4: Housing, specifically 4.3, Develop and Promote Solutions to Support Existing Housing Choices, by providing additional solutions to support individuals to maintain their housing. In addition, this proposal aligns with pillar 5: Create a Healthier and More Vibrant Community, through providing additional supports for individuals to remain in their existing housing, preventing them from entering into the homelessness system and decreasing their health outcomes.

# Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

There will be no impact on CEEP.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

Through expanding CHPI program guidelines, it is expected the following outcome measures will be impacted:

- Reduction of inflow into homelessness on the By-Name List (decrease of individuals accessing the homelessness-serving system)

- Increase of outflow into housing from the By-Name List (increase of individuals becoming housed)

- Overall reduction of individuals actively homeless on the By-Name List (reduction of individuals experiencing homelessness in the community)

- Reduction of unique individuals accessing the emergency shelter system

Note: success of these outcomes are dependent on other factors (e.g., housing vacancy rate, average market rate, social assistance rates, etc.)

# Quantifiable Implications

The financial implication of this business case would be an ongoing municipal contribution of \$200,000 from tax levy.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration Revenue Source		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	
	On-Going S		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-
	One-Time		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-
	Total		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027		2028		2029
Homelessness Program Costs	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000	\$	200,000	\$	200,000	\$ 200,000
	On-Going		\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000	\$	200,000	\$	200,000	\$ 200,000
	One-Time		\$ -	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
	Total		\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000	\$	200,000	\$	200,000	\$ 200,000

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		Permane	nt		-	-	-	-	-
		PT Hours	6		-	-	-	-	-
				1					
		Ye	arly Impact		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Going	g	\$	200,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000
		One-Time	9	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$	200,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 200,000
		Net Levy Impact			2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Going	g	\$	200,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		One-Time	9	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$	200,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		% Levy Ir	ncrease		0.06%	0.00%			

# Implementation

The implementation of increased funding to the CHPI program would begin immediately upon approval from Council following an update to the Local Business Practice guideline.

Constraints impacting success of the program include the ability for individuals experiencing homelessness to obtain housing due to low vacancy rates in the community (0.7 per cent for a one-bedroom unit) and high average market rent costs (\$1,043/month for a one-bedroom unit).

Synergies with other departments include Housing Services and Housing Operations through the ability to identify individuals within community housing who are at risk of accumulating arrears due to loss of subsidy.

Communications between departments should take place whenever possible to identify individuals who are at risk of losing their subsidy and support individuals to complete the necessary documentation in a timely manner to ensure their subsidy is maintained.

## Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
Costs avoided through the homelessness-serving sector by individuals maintaining their housing.	• There is a risk that once the funding is allocated to an individual or family, they may shortly thereafter become at risk of homelessness once again due to other underlying social or mental health issues that are left unaddressed.
<ul> <li>Reduction of individuals accessing the shelter system through an increase in individuals becoming housed and housing loss prevention.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Improvements to the well-being of individuals through housing loss prevention and ability to maintain stability within the household (e.g., proximity to schools and social networks).</li> </ul>	
Research and evaluation data highlights this program type is successful at housing loss prevention and reducing homelessness.	

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact
Use of funds are reviewed and redistributed within the program (e.g., use of funds for last month's rent, arrears, household items).	Advantages: Funds used for household items are re-distributed to last month's rent or arrears costs. Program is able to support more individuals with last month's rent costs or arrears. Disadvantages: Funds for other issuances are reduced (e.g., household items, discretionary items).	\$-

7

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

# Extend Funding for Climate Resilience Officer Contract Position Department Growth & Infrastructure Services Division **Planning Services**

**Council Resolution** 

CC2023-125-A1 / FA2023-75-A14

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

This business case proposes to create a senior contract position of Climate Resilience Officer (CRO) that reports at the level of the Executive Leadership Team (ELT). The CRO would have the authority to provide direction and guidance across all City departments to ensure that the City's two climate action plans, the Community Energy and Emissions Plan (CEEP) and Community Climate Change Adaptation Plan (CCCAP), are implemented in a timely fashion. From improving natural infrastructure assets that manage stormwater, to proposing social procurement policies, to supporting local food systems, the CRO adopts a holistic approach to climate and community resilience.

#### II. Background

# **Current Service Level**

Climate and sustainability action are currently undertaken by service areas in various City divisions and coordinated and monitored by the Climate Action Resource Team (CART) with the assistance of the Climate Change Coordinator, the Manager of Strategic and Environmental Planning and the Director of Planning Services.

# **III. Recommendation**

#### Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

x	Change to base operating budget	Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)	Change to revenues (volume change)
x	Investment in project (Operating)	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

Climate action is currently perceived as one of many competing priorities that the City's many service areas need to consider. The Climate Resilience Officer, being a senior position, would have the authority to provide direction and guidance across all City departments to ensure that the City's two climate action plans (CEEP and CCCAP) are implemented in a timely fashion. This two-year position would help establish the business processes required to maintain a coordinated approach to municipal climate actions, which could then be continued through the existing Climate Action Resource Team (CART).

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan? х Asset Management and Service Excellence Х Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness Х Climate Change Housing Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 A Healthier and More Vibrant Community Experience

From improving natural infrastructure assets that manage stormwater, to proposing social procurement policies, to supporting local food systems, the Climate Resilience Officer adopts a holistic approach to climate and community resilience.

# Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

The Climate Resilience Officer, being a senior position, would have the authority to provide direction and guidance across all City departments to ensure that the City's two climate action plans (CEEP and CCCAP) are implemented in a timely fashion.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# Qualitative Implications

Empowering a senior staff member to lead the City's actions to meet emissions reduction targets and foster strategies for environmental resilience and climate adaptation is a natural extension of the City's declaration of a Climate Emergency in 2019 and the adoption of the Community Energy and Emissions Plan and Community Climate Change Adaptation Plan. This step will help ensure that our community is able to address the impacts of climate change so future generations can continue to enjoy a high quality of life in Greater Sudbury.

# Quantifiable Implications

Hiring a senior level contract position in 2025 and 2026 would cost approximately \$164,948 and \$169,897, respectively.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
	On-Going	J	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Time	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Wages	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 142,442	\$ 146,716	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Benefits	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 22,506	\$ 23,181	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	On-Going	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Time	e	\$ 164,948	\$ 169,897	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 164,948	\$ 169,897	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028		2029	
Climate Resilience Officer	NMGT	One-Time	PT Hours	1,820		(1,820)				
		Permane	nt	-	-	-		-		-
		PT Hours	3	1,820	-	(1,820)		-		-
		Ye	arly Impact	2025	 2026	2027	2028		2029	
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		One-Tim	e	\$ 164,948	\$ 169,897	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		Total		\$ 164,948	\$ 169,897	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		Net	Levy Impact	2025	 2026	2027	2028		2029	
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		One-Tim	9	\$ 164,948	\$ 4,948	\$ (169,897)	\$ -	\$		-
		Total		\$ 164,948	\$ 4,948	\$ (169,897)	\$ -	\$		-
		% Levy Ir	ncrease	0.05%	0.00%					

# Implementation

The Climate Resilience Officer would be hired through a competitive recruitment process in early 2025 with funding approved through this business case for 2025 and 2026.

# Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
Senior level staff will help ensure priority of divisional climate actions.	
<ul> <li>Senior level staff will help promote climate action participation among external community stakeholders.</li> </ul>	
Senior level staff will promote, pursue and negotiate energy and climate- related business opportunities.	
V. Alternatives Considered	- -

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact

8		
$\mathbf{O}$	C	
	0	ľ

Department

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Install Attlee Avenue Speed Hump

Growth and Infrastructure

Division

Infrastructure Capital Planning

**Council Resolution** 

OP2022-23 / FA2023-75-A20

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

At the July 2022 Operations Committee meeting, Councillor Leduc presented a motion to add a speed hump on Attlee Avenue between Lexington Court and Beatrice Crescent which directed staff to submit a business case for the 2023 budget. The business case was deferred as part of 2023 and 2024 budget deliberations. This section of Attlee Avenue currently ranks 36th on the ranked traffic calming list which ranks all locations that qualify for traffic calming. Each year the number one ranked location is selected for permanent traffic calming measures. Approval of this business case will result in additional traffic calming measures being installed on Attlee Avenue in advance of locations with a higher priority.

#### II. Background

# **Current Service Level**

Currently there are traffic calming measures on Attlee Avenue which were installed in 2013 and 2019. A speed study was conducted in 2021 and an 85th percentile speed of 51 km/h was recorded. Attlee Avenue has been included as part of the Gateway Speed Limit pilot project and as a result has a posted speed limit of 40 km/h. Prior to the implementation of the pilot project, the posted speed limit on Attlee Avenue was 50 km/h.

#### **III. Recommendation**

Cate	Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)									
	Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation							
	Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)							
	Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)							
-										

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

This motion for a speed hump was submitted by Councillor Leduc in response to concerns received regarding speeding on Attlee Avenue.

The risk of not accepting this business case is low. As noted in the Current Service Level Section, traffic calming measures have been implemented on Attlee Avenue and operating speeds are in line with the posted speed limit outside of the ongoing Gateway Speed Limit Pilot Project. In addition, this section of Attlee Avenue remains on the ranked traffic calming list and will be considered for traffic calming measures in the future.

# How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	Climate Change	Housing
x	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

The implementation of traffic calming supports the achievement of strategic objectives under the Create a Healthier Community strategic initiative.

# Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

The implementation of traffic calming will reduce vehicle operating speeds in the area and in turn, reduce the total amount of greenhouse gases emitted by vehicles. This supports the goals of the Community Energy and Emissions Plan.

#### **IV. Impact Analysis**

#### **Qualitative Implications**

The speed hump will reduce the operating speeds of vehicles on this section of Attlee Avenue.

# Quantifiable Implications

The installation of the speed hump will cost approximately \$11,500.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026		2027	2028	2029
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ -	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Traffic Calming	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 11,500				
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ 11,500	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 11,500	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

Impact to Capital This business case will create a new capital project for 2025.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028		2029	
		Permane	nt	-	-	-	-			-
		PT Hours	\$	-	-	-	-			-
								1		
		Ye	arly Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028		2029	
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		One-Tim	e	\$ 11,500	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		Total		\$ 11,500	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		Net	Levy Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028		2029	
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		One-Tim	e	\$ 11,500	\$ (11,500)	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		Total		\$ 11,500	\$ (11,500)	\$ -	\$ -	\$		-
		% Levy Ir	ncrease	0.00%	0.00%					

# Implementation

The speed hump can be designed using internal resources and installed during the 2025 construction season.

#### Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
Traffic speed will be reduced in the immediate area of the speed hump.	By installing additional permanent traffic calming measures, this section of Attlee Avenue will receive traffic calming before other higher ranked locations.
	<ul> <li>Operating speeds on Attlee Avenue have been recorded at 51 km/h. Staff do not anticipate the installation of an additional speed hump to impact operating speeds beyond the immediate vicinity of the speed hump.</li> </ul>

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact

9		
		1
		λ.
	-	2

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Create an Outdoor Sports Court at O'Connor Playground

Department

Community Development

Leisure Services

**Council Resolution** 

Division

FA2023-53 / FA2023-75-A4

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

Council has directed staff to prepare a business case for a paved or concrete outdoor sports court to be created on the property of O'Connor Playground (140 St. George Street, Sudbury). The requested design is to include four basketball hoops and a separate hopscotch/play area.

# II. Background

#### **Current Service Level**

O'Connor Playground currently includes a field house (leased to Better Beginnings Better Futures), the Flour Mill Museum, play equipment, splash pad and pickleball courts. In the past, O'Connor Playground also had an outdoor rink which has not been functional for approximately 10 years. The outdoor rink infrastructure (rink boards) were recently removed for health and safety reasons.

The Parks, Open Space and Leisure Master Plan (2014) established a provision level for outdoor basketball courts of a one-kilometre service radius, striving to provide one full court equivalent for every 650 youth ages 10 to 19.

The Flour Mill neighbourhood is currently serviced by a basketball court at Ryan Heights Playground (approximately 300 metres away), which has been identified for revitalization through the Outdoor Court Revitalization project.

The area is also currently served by outdoor rinks at Ryan Heights and Antwerp Playground (approximately 900 metres away). Our Parks, Open Space and Leisure Master Plan provides a service radius standard of one kilometre.

# **III. Recommendation**

# Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

x	Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)
	Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

The recommendation is to create a 106 by 64 foot (6,784 square feet) asphalt sports court as per Council's direction for a business case. As this area is currently serviced for basketball courts and outdoor rinks as per Parks, Open Space and Leisure Master Plan provision recommendations, there are no risks associated with not proceeding with the business case at this time.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

	Asset Management and Service Excellence		Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	Climate Change		Housing
x	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	x	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

This project would represent an investment in infrastructure to support community recreation with a focus on quality of life. Through the pandemic, residents have rediscovered parks and open space and are relying on these facilities for physical health and well-being.

#### Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

There are no direct links to the City's Community Energy & Emissions Plan.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

As per the original Notice of Motion requesting a business case for the O'Connor Playground sports courts, the creation of dedicated pickleball courts has left no sports court availability at the playground. The resolution also noted that Better Beginnings Better Futures operates out of the O'Connor Playground field house, serving an average of 36 to 40 youth in an afterschool program.

# **Quantifiable Implications**

It is estimated that the development of asphalt sports courts would cost \$280,000. This figure is an opinion of probable cost and may change based on soil studies, geotechnical work and detailed design. Once developed, the outdoor sports court would result in incremental operating costs of \$3,000 annually (sweeping, equipment replacement, vandalism repairs etc.). It is proposed to fund \$25,000 of the project costs from the Healthy Community Initiatives fund (HCI).

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Contribution from Capital (HCI)	One-Time	Capital	\$ (25,000)				
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ (25,000)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ (25,000)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Grounds Maintenance - Labour	On-Going	Tax Levy		\$ 2,500	\$ 2,500	\$ 2,500	\$ 2,500
Grounds Maintenance - Materials	On-Going	Tax Levy		\$ 500	\$ 500	\$ 500	\$ 500
Contributions to Capital	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 28,000	\$ 252,000			
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000
	One-Tim	e	\$ 28,000	\$ 252,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 28,000	\$ 255,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000

Impact to Capital Yes. If approved, this business case would result in a newly created outdoor sports court (new capital amenity) and reduce HCI funds available for other projects in 2025.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		Permane	ent	-	-	-	-	-
		PT Hours	S	-	-	-	-	-
		Ye	early Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000
		One-Tim	e	\$ 3,000	\$ 252,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 3,000	\$ 255,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000
		Net	Levy Impact	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ 3,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		One-Tim	e	\$ 3,000	\$ 249,000	\$ (252,000)	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 3,000	\$ 252,000	\$ (252,000)	\$ -	\$ -
		% Levy I	ncrease	0.00%	0.07%			

If approved, this capital project would be completed within a 24-month period, as with all other capital projects. Staff anticipate design work would occur in 2025 with project completion in 2026.

Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul> <li>Realization of a new outdoor court complex would result in new parks and recreation infrastructure.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Council has previously approved the Outdoor Court Revitalization Project and the City's resources are focused on the redevelopment of existing courts in poor condition</li> <li>The City's Parks, Open Space and Leisure Master Plan states the area is already serviced for basketball courts.</li> <li>HCI would only cover a small portion of the project. Limited capital dollars for asset renewal.</li> </ul>

V. Alternatives Conside	red
-------------------------	-----

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact
As with other community-led projects, have applicant apply for HCI and secure other required project funding through sponsorships, donations, work-in-kind, etc.	Advantages - Consistent with approach to other HCI and community-led projects, less impact to tax levy. Disadvantages - Capacity to fundraise required funds, project may not be realized as quickly.	\$-

|--|

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Implement Modern Workplace Efficiencies for Municipal Relocation Department Information Technology Corporate Services Division

**Council Resolution** 

N/A

# I. Executive Summary

#### **Overview of Proposal**

The introduction of a Cultural Hub into Tom Davies Square (TDS) means that some staff spaces in the facility will need to be consolidated and moved. Currently there are 17 municipal areas that will need to move from 200 Brady Street to 199 Larch Street. The Modern Workplace Efficiencies project will facilitate the relocation of staff and help maximize square footage by minimizing the need for physical storage of paper. It will transition work processes to a digital format, enhance efficiency, and significantly reduce the ongoing production of paper. This will provide valuable space for the project that is currently being used for physical file storage.

The timing for this project is opportune as the Modern Employee Experience project has recently established digital storage on SharePoint. In addition, a Retention Bylaw update is currently underway to provide clearer guidance on how long records must be retained. Furthermore, a recent cybersecurity audit recommended document level security classification and protection, which this proposed project can implement.

To align with the Cultural Hub timeline, this proposal exclusively includes areas transitioning from Tom Davies Square to 199 Larch Street. However, all City service areas stand to gain from comparable efficiencies, as the newly introduced tools and methodologies can be implemented across the corporation.

Substantial efficiencies are anticipated. Opportunities derived from a recent staff survey include: 59 per cent of respondents indicated difficulties in locating the necessary information to fulfill their work obligations and 35 per cent reported obstacles in collaborating on their work products. These challenges will be addressed by reducing steps to complete work, introducing digital workflows to better track processes, and facilitating collaboration through real time access to information. Created efficiencies will be tracked so gained time can be applied to new work demands.

# II. Background

# **Current Service Level**

Substantial space in TDS is taken up by filing cabinets, which staff often use for their day-to-day work. Moving staff to more consolidated spaces in 199 Larch Street means that there is inadequate space for all of the filing cabinets. Fortunately, the City has the technology to replace paper workflows with digital ones and store digital documents. Staff are also ready to support this move; a recent survey reported that 93 per cent of staff said they are ready to switch from paper to digital.

Various City services store information digitally, but the way it is organized varies. A common method of storing digital information is for staff to manually copy files into shared folders, which has been a common practice for over 20 years. The organization is seeing increasing data stored through emails, Microsoft Teams messages, and more. This has made the City's storage volume grow by 12.5 per cent each year. Manual filing into shared folders cannot sustain this growth.

Digital data will prepare the organization for opportunities to implement Artificial Intelligence (AI) to support work processes or improve service delivery.

To support the Cultural Hub timeline from a technology perspective, staff have already started planning to support these changes, but executing the plan requires the support outlined in this business case.

# **III. Recommendation**

#### Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

x	Change to base operating budget	x	Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)
	Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

Proceeding with the Modern Workplace Efficiencies project will:

- 1. Provide a standard way of managing digital records that will replace shared folders. This will make it easier for quick searches to find information.
- 2. Enable digital workflows to share documents among staff to help with their work, and these documents will be stored automatically.
- 3. Provide a common way to scan paper into digital files and to store paper copies when it is legislated.
- 4. Lead to work flow efficiencies as each change is made.

The drivers for the change are:

1. Moving municipal staff into spaces in 199 Larch Street to accommodate a Cultural Hub at TDS. Relocating staff spaces in 2025 introduces opportunities for more efficient workspaces with less room for filing cabinets.

2. Initiating the use of data records classification and records protection. This was recommended in a recent cybersecurity audit.

3. The organization is ready to succeed at this change; the Modern Employee Experience has provided the corporation with the necessary technology and recent changes underway for the Retention Bylaw will guide this work.

The risk of not approving this business case is that we will not be able to implement the data classification component of this project as recommended by the Auditor General in the review of the Cybersecurity Plan. As one example of the impact, in the event of a cyber security incident not having data classification increases the complexity of both identifying the scope of an incident and the remediation activities. Furthermore, many of the 17 municipal service areas will experience a productivity drop after the move, as they continue old processes in a space that can not support the proximity and number of file cabinets they had in TDS.

How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

2	x	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	x	Climate Change	Housing
		A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

Asset Management: Information assets will be secure, easier to access and use less office space than storing paper files. Each filing cabinet eliminated frees up about 15 square feet of office space.

Service Excellence: Staff can perform administrative tasks more efficiently and lower the risk of legal issues by ensuring the right records are available when needed. Climate Change: Reducing the need for printing and paper is a positive environmental change and makes the organization more sustainable.

#### Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

This project helps the environment and supports the CEEP in several ways:

- 1. It cuts down on the City's use of paper and printer supplies, which means fewer greenhouse gases.
- 2. It shrinks the office space required for filing cabinets, meaning less space that is needed to heat and cool rooms that house documents and records.
- 3. It reduces the need for travel to access or send paper files.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

#### **Qualitative Implications**

- \* Digital record-keeping supports more efficient office processes which improves service delivery times for residents.
- \* Employees will find it simpler to do their jobs with automated routines and digital filing. This will assist with knowledge transfer when staff leave or join the team. It will also address a recent staff survey finding where 62 per cent of employees reported that they had too many places to look for information.
- \* From a data perspective, having digital data that is well organized and managed will enable the organization to use data analytics to find information that used to be in paper files.

\* As the project automates processes and cuts down on paper storage, it will identify savings and efficiencies that are not yet quantifiable.

#### **Quantifiable Implications**

Record management software will cost \$41,000 in 2025 and will be funded from the Modern Employee Experience capital project. In 2025 and future years, this software will cost \$52,000 annually.

Two full-time permanent employees are required to manage digital records on an ongoing basis at an annual cost of \$252,962. This includes a SharePoint Administrator for new operational tasks to configure document storage sites, security, and automated workflows and an Information Management Clerk to support and train in the new tools, as well as classifying and structuring complex records so that their use is optimized to support services.

A temporary project manager would be required in 2025 and 2026, with a cost of \$140,828 and \$72,526, respectively. Finally, a consultant would be hired for 2025 and 2026 at an annual cost of \$160,000. The consultant will establish digital workflow processes for the operating departments and provide training to staff.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Modern Employee Experience	One-Time	Capital	\$ (41,000)				
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ (41,000)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ (41,000)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Software Licensing	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 41,000	\$ 52,000	\$ 52,000	\$ 52,000	\$ 52,000
Consulting	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 160,000	\$ 160,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Wages - PT	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 111,463	\$ 57,404	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Benefits - PT	One-Time	Tax Levy	\$ 29,365	\$ 15,123	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Salary - FT	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 184,061	\$ 189,583	\$ 189,583	\$ 189,583	\$ 184,061
Benefits - FT	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 68,901	\$ 70,968	\$ 70,968	\$ 70,968	\$ 68,901
	On-Goin	g	\$ 293,962	\$ 312,551	\$ 312,551	\$ 312,551	\$ 304,962
	One-Tim	e	\$ 300,828	\$ 232,526	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 594,790	\$ 545,077	\$ 312,551	\$ 312,551	\$ 304,962

Impact to Capital The Modern Employee Experience capital project will fund the first year of required software licensing of \$41,000.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2	026		2027	2028	2029
SharePoint Administrator/Workflow Developer	IW	On-Going	Permanent	1						
Information Management Clerk	NMGT	On-Going	Permanent	1						
Project Manager	NMGT	One-Time	PT Hours	1,827		(914)		(913)		
		Permane	ent	2		-		-	-	-
		PT Hours	S	1,827		(914)		(913)	-	-
		Ye	early Impact	2025	2	026		2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ 293,962	\$	312,551	\$	312,551	\$ 312,551	\$ 304,962
		One-Tim	e	\$ 259,828	\$	232,526	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 553,790	\$	545,077	\$	312,551	\$ 312,551	\$ 304,962
		Net	Levy Impact	2025	2	026	:	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$ 293,962	\$	18,589	\$	-	\$ -	\$ (7,589)
		One-Tim	e	\$ 259,828	\$	(27,301)	\$	(232,526)	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$ 553,790	\$	(8,713)	\$	(232,526)	\$ -	\$ (7,589)
		% Levy I	ncrease	0.16%		0.00%				

#### Implementation

Work is already underway for this project. This includes the Modern Employee Experience project setting up SharePoint storage and planning work to identify priority changes to support areas moving from TDS to 199 Larch Street. This project will also be guided by the Retention By-law update that is already underway.

Work will be completed in three phases:

Phase One: Priority tasks completed in time for when the staff move in 2025.

Phase Two: Continue through 2026 to complete the necessary efficiency enhancing improvements for all 17 municipal areas moving from 200 Brady Street to 199 Larch Street.

Phase Three: Continue to provide ongoing support and periodic enhancements.

Accomplishing this project will also rely on the efforts of staff in the 17 areas. This will be completed within existing resources and budgets.

#### Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul> <li>Reduces space requirements in support of relocating staff from TDS to 199 Larch Street.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>A move from paper to digital is a big effort; the scope will only be evident as work progresses. Paper inventories will be documented and scanning options identified, but the effort and cost to do this is unknown at this time.</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Applies consistent organization and access to the ever-increasing volumes of information received through email, Microsoft Teams or other systems.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Records retention rules and legislation will constrain a complete move to digital for some documents, however digital duplicates for everyday uses may be applicable in most cases.</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Implements security classifications for information which is a cybersecurity audit recommendation.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Digital workflows will reduce reliance on paper access, reducing work steps and improving workflow efficiencies.</li> </ul>	
V. Alternatives Considered	- -

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact
Complete Phase 1 and 3 only; eliminating Phase 2 in implementation plan.	Advantages: Provides concentrated effort before and shortly after staff relocation, adds staff to support the solution, adds limited ongoing improvements and adds necessary software. Disadvantage: It will not complete all process improvements and digitization needed for the 17 areas moving from TDS to 199 Larch Street in a timely manner. Some areas will miss out on resulting efficiency improvements.	2025 cost of \$595,790 2026 and ongoing costs of \$312,551

5	9
	-

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title	Implement Endpoint Detection and Response System with Cybersecur	rity Analyst	
Department	Corporate Services	Division	Information Technology

**Council Resolution** 

N/A

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

We aim to enhance our cybersecurity strategy by adding an additional cybersecurity analyst to our team. This cybersecurity analyst will provide capacity to better support the cybersecurity functions as defined by the City of Greater Sudbury's (CGS) progressively evolving Cybersecurity Plan. In addition, we aim to deploy Endpoint Detection and Response (EDR) software across all City computers to autonomously detect and proactively stop breaches at the device level.

The analyst will analyze data from protection systems and help achieve our cybersecurity goals by significantly elevating our threat analysis capability and helping secure our Information Technology (IT) systems. This investment will ultimately improve service availability for our residents and provide capacity for the continued, necessary evolution of the CGS Cybersecurity Plan.

As an additional measure, deploying EDR software will allow us to use artificial intelligence (AI) for real-time analysis, providing better protection against malicious actors. With over 7,200 connected devices, including municipal infrastructure sensors and controllers, EDR systems are deployed by most organizations after being subject to a cybersecurity incident. By deploying an EDR system now, we place the City of Greater Sudbury in a better position to both protect itself and mitigate risks should an incident occur.

The combination of an additional cybersecurity analyst and EDR software will offer comprehensive threat analysis and enhanced security for our municipal infrastructure systems.

# II. Background

#### **Current Service Level**

Our current service levels often make it challenging to meet both existing security needs as defined in the City's Cybersecurity Plan, as well as the requirements of new installations or projects. As our industry evolves rapidly, we must continually reassess and adapt our priorities to protect the City from external threats effectively. Presently, our tools operate reactively: we are alerted to suspicious or malicious behaviors, and then we investigate what happened.

Implementing an Endpoint Detection and Response (EDR) system and adding a cybersecurity analyst will enable us to offer more proactive responses. These systems will take immediate action to protect us from suspicious behaviors.

Currently, we protect most of our municipal infrastructure at the point of entry to our networks. Systems such as water/wastewater, traffic lights, and building automation are safeguarded from external internet traffic. However, once traffic enters these networks, more specialized knowledge and tools are required-these are resources that our IT department currently requires.

#### **III. Recommendation**

Cate	gorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)		
x	Change to base operating budget	x	Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)		Change to revenues (volume change)
	Investment in project (Operating)		Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

Enhanced Security: With the growing number of cyber threats, current reactive measures are insufficient. Implementing autonomous threat monitoring and EDR software will provide proactive security, significantly reducing the risk of breaches.

Comprehensive Coverage: Extending cybersecurity measures to all 7,200 connected devices, including sensors and equipment controllers used in municipal infrastructure, ensures that potential vulnerabilities are addressed across the entire network.

Improved Threat Analysis: Adding a dedicated staff member for threat analysis will enhance our ability to interpret and respond to data from autonomous systems, ensuring timely and effective mitigation of threats.

Support for New Initiatives: The new position will also focus on assessing the cybersecurity readiness of new technology initiatives, ensuring that as the City's technology evolves, security measures keep pace.

Alignment with Strategic Goals: This initiative aligns with the City's Cybersecurity Plan and information security framework, helping to achieve long-term strategic objectives.

Reliability of Service: By strengthening our digital infrastructure, we ensure the availability and reliability of essential services provided to our citizens, fostering trust and confidence in the City's ability to protect its systems. As more municipalities suffer cybersecurity attacks, threats increase with every passing year.

The Endpoint Detection and Response System is a critical component in achieving our Cybersecurity Plan supported by the Auditor General, with an objective of attaining a target maturity level across 20 categories of controls. Without approval of this business case, we cannot achieve the target. Furthermore, each new security element that our Cybersecurity Plan has added has also added ongoing day-to-day security management work that now consumes most of our one analysts time, so that without another analyst our Cybersecurity Plan will stall.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

x	Asset Management and Service Excellence	x	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness					
Climate Change Housing								
A Healthier and More Vibrant Community X Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVIE Experience								
Enh Ser	set Management and Service Excellence nanced Protection: Safeguards digital assets, extending their lifespa vice Continuity: Prevents service disruptions due to cyber incidents source Efficiency: Optimizes security resource use with dedicated th	s, ensu	ring reliable service delivery to residents.					
Sec	pnomic Capacity and Investment Readiness cure Environment: Attracts business investments by providing a sec							

Financial Stability: Reduces financial risks and costs associated with cyber incidents.

Innovation Support: Encourages adoption of advanced technologies, boosting economic growth.

Focus on Advancing Caring Services

Data Protection: Ensures the security of residents' personal and sensitive data. Service Availability: Maintains continuous and uninterrupted essential services.

Responsive Care: Enhances the City's ability to respond to threats and adapt to new challenges, improving service quality.

## Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

Protection of Energy Management Systems: By safeguarding IT and municipal systems, including those that manage energy use and emissions, cybersecurity measures ensure these systems operate reliably and efficiently, supporting energy goals.

Supporting Smart Infrastructure: Securely managing smart grids, sensors, and controllers helps optimize energy consumption and reduce emissions, aligning with sustainability objectives.

Encouraging Technological Adoption: Strong cybersecurity can foster the adoption of innovative technologies that improve energy efficiency and reduce emissions.

#### **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

Enhanced Trust and Reliability, Public and Business Confidence: Increases trust in the City's ability to protect data and provide secure services.

Service Continuity: Ensures uninterrupted municipal services and improves resiliency to cyberattacks.

Proactive Threat Management: Allows for faster, more informed responses to cybersecurity incidents.

Protected Infrastructure: Secures critical infrastructure, indirectly supporting community health and safety.

#### **Quantifiable Implications**

In 2023, the global cost of a data breach was over \$6 million, a 15 per cent increase from the year prior. As this cost continues to increase, lowering our risk becomes significantly more important if we want to mitigate the cost of any potential breach.

Annual software licensing fees will be \$151,000, prorated for 2025. A cybersecurity analyst would be hired on July 1, 2025.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025		2026		2027		2028		2029
	On-Goin	g	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
	One-Tim	One-Time \$		-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
	Total		\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025		2026		2027		2028	2029	
Software licensing	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 31,000	\$	151,000	\$	156,000	\$	161,000	\$	166,000
Salaries	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 43,810	\$	90,249	\$	90,249	\$	90,249	\$	90,249
Benefits	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 16,631	\$	34,259	\$	34,259	\$	34,259	\$	34,259
	On-Goin	g	\$ 91,441	\$	275,508	\$	280,508	\$	285,508	\$	290,508
	One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
	Total		\$ 91,441	\$	275,508	\$	280,508	\$	285,508	\$	290,508

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Cybersecurity Analyst	IW	On-Going	Permanent		1				
		Permane	ent		1	-	-	-	-
PT Hours				-	-	-	-	-	
		Yearly Impact			2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$	91,441	\$ 275,508	\$ 280,508	\$ 285,508	\$ 290,508
		One-Tim	e	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$	91,441	\$ 275,508	\$ 280,508	\$ 285,508	\$ 290,508
		Net	Levy Impact		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$	91,441	\$ 184,067	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000
		One-Tim	e	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total			\$	91,441	\$ 184,067	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000
		% Levy I	ncrease		0.03%	0.05%			

# Implementation

This business case would immediately increase our ability to undertake and manage cybersecurity work with the additional staff member in Q3 2025. The increased work capacity would augment our ability to perform security reviews on new project implementations and ensure we can continue to provide the necessary support for all services and applications. The endpoint detection system would be implemented in a phased approach from Q3 2025 to the end of 2026, to minimize any potential disruptions to active work.

# Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
Proactive Threat Detection - Reduced risk of cyberattacks	Training and Integration - This project will require a high amount of learning by IT staff to ensure success
Improved Incident Response - Faster response to minimize damage and downtime	Time - Requires time commitment from all members of the IT team
Long-term Cost Savings - Breaches often cost organizations 7+ figures	Complexity - Autonomous tools often create additional layers of complexity

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact
Contract Endpoint Detection and Response Service	Advantages: Large team to support our security monitoring Disadvantages: Security service staff are not working on our network on a daily basis, less familiarity with our systems and networks. They do not implement new technology, they monitor technology that already exists on our network.	\$ 500,000

13

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Department

Hire Part-Time MLEO for Onboard Transit

Transit Services

Division

Community Development

N/A

**Council Resolution** 

# I. Executive Summary

#### **Overview of Proposal**

Currently, Municipal Law Enforcement Officers (MLEO) are able to promptly respond to security issues within and outside of the Downtown Transit Terminal. However, response to issues onboard transit vehicles requires sharing resources with a mobile team which also shares patrol/response with areas such as Housing, Parks and other City facilities and service areas. To provide increased proactive and reactive response to onboard issues that negatively impact transit services, this business case recommends the addition of 2,496 part time MLEO hours, with net operating costs of \$37,452.

The recommendation aligns with the creation of a permanent internal service level of MLEO at Transit Services, as approved during 2024 budget deliberations. Following a successful pilot of the program in Q3 and Q4 2023, the 2024 business case provided for the static post of two MLEO at the Downtown Transit Terminal between 6 a.m. and 12 a.m. The result of the new service level has had a positive impact on the perception of safety and security at the Downtown Transit Terminal, as expressed by Transit Staff and customers.

# II. Background

#### **Current Service Level**

Transit Services saw the highest recorded ridership in 2023, with over 5.2 million rides provided. In 2024, ridership increases have continued, with a year-to-date annual increase of approximately 32 per cent. Ridership trends are expected to continue for the remainder of Q3 and Q4 and are anticipated to be over 6 million for 2024.

With increased patronage, a similar increase in security incidents has been documented at the Downtown Transit Hub. This can be attributed both to ridership increases as well as improved documentation of security issues by the MLEO. There is a forecasted 20 per cent annual increase of documented security incidents for 2024 for all types of security issues at Transit. MLEO respond to approximately one to two events per week related to documented security incidents on buses, with issues related to fare evasion, conflict, drug use or intoxication/wellness.

Apart from documented security issues, there is a related risk to bus operators, with a negative impact on overall revenue. In 2023, there were 52,230 incidents of fare evasion documented on the conventional system, for an estimated revenue loss of \$182,805. For 2024, there is a forecasted year-over-year increase of 23 per cent in fare evasion, resulting in 64,296 events or an approximate \$257,184 fare revenue loss. There are currently no dedicated resources to support onboard issues as the mobile MLEO unit is shared across City locations. Furthermore, onboard issues are not considered by Police in the absence of a significant/identified threat.

## **III. Recommendation**

#### Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

x	Change to base operating budget	x	Change to base FTE allocation
	Change to fees (unit price)	х	Change to revenues (volume change)
	Investment in project (Operating)		Investment in project (Capital)

# **Recommendation and Rationale**

Adding part-time hours to the MLEO service level for Transit Services will provide improved response to onboard transit security incidents and also enable proactive MLEO patrols/rides on the system which supports the overall feeling of safety for customers and staff. The addition of 2,496 part-time hours provides for two MLEOs to work an average of 24 hours per week supporting Transit Services. Continued increases in ridership will correlate to increases in documented security issues across the system. Providing for an onboard response for parts of each day will support deterrence and response to noted issues on buses.

Avoidance of the additional part-time hours increases reputational risk associated with fare evasion and on-board anti-social behaviours, further increasing risk for increased incidents of psychological/physical events related to fare evasion. Additional part-time hours supports business continuity for static MLEO services at Transit in response to unexpected vacancies, which currently draws from mobile response support otherwise dedicated to Housing Services.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

	x	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
		Climate Change	Housing
		A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience
- E			

This realignment of work supports the City of Greater Sudbury's Strategic Plan through actions to support Asset Management and Service Excellence, specifically Goal 1.5: Demonstrate Innovation and Cost-Effective Service Delivery by continuing efforts to expand ridership through innovative and responsive system improvements. System safety is a key issue that will support retention and recruitment of customers - this was identified in community engagement for the Transit Action Plan, and is still noted in ongoing CRM feedback to staff.

# Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

Within the Low-Carbon Transportation strategy sector, goal #7 commits to "enhance transit service to increase transit mode share to 25 per cent by 2050". Currently, census for the City of Greater Sudbury notes that the mode share for public transit is approximately five per cent. Aside from increasing this mode share, enhancements in Transit Services that support ridership recruitment and retention will reduce greenhouse gases when considering that public transit buses generally produce lower emissions per passenger-mile, compared to individual cars. Further, buses tend to be more fuel-efficient on a per passenger basis. Finally, with increased ridership, there will be an offsetting reduction of passenger vehicles on the roadway. This alleviates traffic congestion and leads to more efficient traffic flow and reduced travel times for all road users.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

This recommended change will achieve a safer environment for conventional transit services, minimizing risk to residents, the municipality and its employees. Along with all other service improvements at Transit, this service level increase will improve the public perception of Transit Services and increase employee morale and engagement. It is anticipated that this enhanced service level will reduce the frequency of documented psychological events/injuries for Transit employees as there were eight documented psychological incidents up to July 2024, which is one more incident than all of 2023. As there is a positive link between employee engagement and customer satisfaction, this change will have a positive impact on ridership as customers will receive high-level customer service and will see that City facilities are safe.

#### **Quantifiable Implications**

There will be an increase of 2,496 MLEO part-time hours to respond to issues onboard buses resulting in increased operating costs of \$101,748. Assuming a 25 per cent recovery (improvement) of forecasted annual fare evasion totals, it is expected that fare box revenues will increase by \$64,296. With focused patrol and messaging for fare evasion, it is hoped that the program can trend towards full cost recovery over the next several years.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025		2026		2027		2028		2029
Fare Box Revenues	On-Going	User Fees	\$	(64,296)	\$	(66,225)	\$	(68,212)	\$	(70,258)	\$ (72,366)
	On-Goin	g	\$	(64,296)	\$	(66,225)	\$	(68,212)	\$	(70,258)	\$ (72,366)
	One-Tim	e	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
	Total		\$	(64,296)	\$	(66,225)	\$	(68,212)	\$	(70,258)	\$ (72,366)

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025		2026		2027		2028		2029
Wages-PT	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$	87,909	\$	90,546	\$	90,546	\$	90,546	\$ 90,546
Benefits	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$	13,890	\$	14,306	\$	14,306	\$	14,306	\$ 14,306
	On-Goin	g	\$	101,799	\$	104,853	\$	104,853	\$	104,853	\$ 104,853
	One-Tim	e	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
	Total		\$	101,799	\$	104,853	\$	104,853	\$	104,853	\$ 104,853

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Municipal Law Enforcement Officer	IW	On-Going	PT Hours	2,496				
		Permane	nt	-	-	-	-	-
		PT Hours	3	2,496	-	-	-	-

Yearly Impact		2025		2026		2027		2028		2029
On-Going	\$	37,503	\$	38,628	\$	36,641	\$	34,595	\$	32,487
One-Time	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
Total	\$	37,503	\$	38,628	\$	36,641	\$	34,595	\$	32,487
Net Levy Impact		2025		2026		2027		2028		2029
On-Going	\$	37,503	\$	1,125	\$	(1,987)	\$	(2,046)	\$	(2,108)
One-Time	¢		\$		\$		\$	-	\$	-
One-Time	\$	-	Ψ		ĮΨ		Ψ		Ψ	
Total	э \$	37,503	\$	1,125	\$	(1,987)		(2,046)		(2,108)

# Implementation

Following approval, the department will proceed with recruitment for a MLEO to support implementation within Q1 2025.

# Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	C	Disadvantages
Positive impact on bus operator safety, having an equal effect o engagement	n overall	
Aligns with strategy of the Transit Action Plan		
Meets ridership needs and allows for continued growth in ridersh on ensuring positive customer experiences	hip based	
Supports the goals of CEEP and the Strategic Plan and enhanc customer experience across all transit routes	es	
V. Alternatives Considered		
Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact

# Page 39

# 14

# **Business Case - Staffing Classification Change**

# Title

Department

Hire Transit Electronic Technician

Transit Services

Division

Community Development

N/A

**Council Resolution** 

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

This business case responds to the expansion of technology systems that support Transit Services and ensures maintenance of these systems is coordinated and efficient. This business case recommends the creation of one full-time Transit Electronic Technician within the Transit body shop to oversee technology maintenance for Transit. Systems such as onboard surveillance cameras, fare boxes, next stop/call out system and patron counters impact customer comfort and convenience and also provide important data that informs business decisions and measures operational performance. The upkeep and maintenance of these systems is currently conducted by Fleet Technicians, but would benefit from a dedicated resource. This new position is supported through the conversion of available part-time hours in the division and results in an operational impact of \$17,799.

#### II. Background

# **Current Service Level**

Currently, the maintenance of transit technology systems is completed by the Fleet Technician II within Fleet Services. This volume of work is combined with inspection, repair, testing and maintenance of engine, drivetrain, suspension, and HVAC systems of conventional buses. As a result, preventative maintenance programs for technology systems are not part of normal service delivery and may result in a bus being out of service for a longer period of time when issues arise, thereby impacting service delivery. Standalone technology for conventional transit departs from standard vehicle and mechanical systems for which technicians have expertise. Lack of familiarity with specific technology can impact repair times. As evident in other municipal transit agencies, the creation of a Transit Electronic Technician position will provide dedicated oversight for systems and also allow opportunities for efficiencies in Fleet Services.

#### **III. Recommendation**

# X Change to base operating budget X Change to base FTE allocation Change to fees (unit price) Change to revenues (volume change) Investment in project (Operating) Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

To support the creation of a subject matter expert in the role of a Transit Electronic Technician, this business case recommends using existing staffing resources to create a full-time position with direct oversight for Transit technology maintenance. This realignment of work provides an opportunity for efficiency within Fleet Services by providing a dedicated resource to manage technology needs and requirements, while allowing Fleet Technicians to focus on scheduled or responsive maintenance within their area of expertise. This redistribution of work aligns with best practice of other transit agencies such as Niagara Transit Commission and MiWay (Mississauga), who have similar positions.

Avoidance of creating a Transit Electronic Technician creates risk associated with the inability to implement a preventative maintenance program for transit technology. The asset life of key assets such as fareboxes will be reduced, with negative impact on customers and operating budgets. Furthermore, increased time for repair for transit technology can negatively impact service level delivery for transit.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# Qualitative Implications

As in other municipal transit agencies, the creation of a Transit Electronic Technician will provide dedicated oversight for technology systems and create efficiencies in the Fleet Section to ensure necessary vehicle maintenance is prioritized.

In 2025, conventional transit will see an increase of 11,000 operating hours, resulting in the use of four additional buses during peak times (from 42 to 46), thereby increasing the frequency of necessary vehicle maintenance. Approximately 10 to 12 vehicles per month must be inspected as part of semi and annual inspections and Minor A service is completed every 15,000 km, which is every one to two months for each vehicle.

Each hour that a Fleet Technician is spending on instrumentation work is time away from scheduled service, as well as preventative vehicle maintenance. The realignment of technology work will open approximately 20 hours per week of repair time for Fleet Technicians, allowing focus on mechanical work.

In addition to reactive work, the Transit Electronic Technician will perform troubleshooting, testing, repair, interfacing and overhaul of complex electrical, electronic devices and components of Transit's fleet which includes computer hardware, automated fare collection equipment and user interfaces. The Transit Electronic Technician will also support installation, retrofit and preventative maintenance on all electronic systems including passenger counters, radios communication, AVL/Stop Announcement Systems (AODA requirement), on-board surveillance camera system, Wi-Fi, cellular and future systems.

#### **Quantifiable Implications**

This position recommends the conversion of existing part-time hours to support the creation of a full-time Transit Electronic Technician. This business case recommends funding, on a permanent basis, the difference of \$17,799.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
	On-Goin	3	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

#### **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Salaries - FT	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 79,950	\$ 82,349	\$ 82,349	\$ 82,349	\$ 82,349
Wages - PT	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ (80,476)	\$ (82,890)	\$ (82,890)	\$ (82,890)	\$ (82,890)
Benefits	On-Going	Tax Levy	\$ 18,325	\$ 18,875	\$ 18,875	\$ 18,875	\$ 18,875
	On-Going	<u> </u>	\$ 17,799	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333
	One-Time	e	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	Total		\$ 17,799	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Auto Body Repairer	WO	On-Going	Permanent		1				
Transit Kiosk	IW	On-Going	PT Hours		(1,251)				
Transit Service Person	OW	On-Going	PT Hours		(1,564)				
		Permanent PT Hours			1 (2,815)	-	-	-	-
		Yearly Impact			2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	g	\$	17,799	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333
		One-Tim	e	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$	17,799	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333	\$ 18,333
		Net	Net Levy Impact		2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
		On-Goin	On-Going		17,799	\$ 534	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		One-Tim	e	\$	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		Total		\$	17,799	\$ 534	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
		% Levy I	ncrease		0.01%	0.00%			

15

# **Business Case - Service Level Change**

Title

Department

Install New Columbarium Wall at Civic Memorial Cemetery

Community Development

Cemetery Services

N/A

**Council Resolution** 

Division

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

The proposed project will add a new exterior columbarium wall and foundation at Civic Memorial Cemetery to meet needs for above ground interment of cremated remains. In order to meet demand, the project includes a total of 120 units based on historical average sales per year and remaining inventory on hand. The total required capital investment for installing the exterior wall and foundation is estimated at \$325,000 including a 10 per cent contingency. Based on historical sales and current/future user fees, total projected revenues are estimated at \$440,725 which includes the mandatory care and maintenance fee of 15 per cent.

It is proposed that the project would borrow through the Cemetery Care and Maintenance Trust Fund (CMTF) for the full cost of the project with annual repayment from the sale of niche units. The anticipated payback period is five years.

#### II. Background

# **Current Service Level**

An exterior columbarium wall contains individual niches, which provide an above ground interment option for cremated remains. The City has provided this interment option for approximately 25 to 30 years with a very positive response from the community. The cremation rate in our City has increased approximately 20 per cent over the past 10 to 15 years, which has created increased demand for columbarium niche spaces. Civic Memorial Cemetery will require inventory replenishment in 2025. Investment in exterior niche walls is required to meet customer expectations and maintain service levels. The project also has a positive financial return over the life of the asset, as columbariums have minimal maintenance requirements.

# **III. Recommendation**

# Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)

Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation
Change to fees (unit price)	x	Change to revenues (volume change)
Investment in project (Operating)	x	Investment in project (Capital)

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

It is recommended to approve this project so that niche wall inventory is replenished for the identified location to meet future demand, maintain user fee revenues, and improve financial stability for Cemetery Services.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

x	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	Climate Change	Housing
	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

Asset Management and Service Excellence - This project will establish sustainable asset levels for Cemetery Services to provide services in a cost effective manner.

# Does this have a link to the Community Energy & Emissions Plan (CEEP)?

There are no direct linkages to CEEP.

# **IV. Impact Analysis**

# **Qualitative Implications**

Investment in a niche wall will help to maintain current service levels at the Civic Memorial Cemetery to meet community needs.

#### Quantifiable Implications

The total required capital investment for installing the exterior wall is estimated at \$325,000 including a 10 per cent contingency. It is proposed that the project would borrow funds through the CMTF for the full cost of the project with annual repayment funded from the sale of niche units over five years. Based on historical sales and current/future user fees, total projected revenues are estimated at \$440,725, which includes \$57,486 in mandatory care and maintenance fees for ongoing maintenance costs. It is anticipated the CRTF will be repaid by 2029, with revenue from future sales resulting in a one-time net levy reduction.

There are minimal operating costs for niche walls. A care and maintenance fee is collected at the time of each niche purchase and deposited into the CMTF. The interest generated by the trust fund will maintain the columbarium in perpetuity, which results in no future budget impact for asset maintenance.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
CMTF	One-Time	Obligatory Reserve	\$ (325,000)	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Niche Sales	One-Time	User Fees	\$ (34,447)	\$ (95,594)	\$ (98,260)	\$ (104,746)	\$ (107,678)
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ (359,447)	\$ (95,594)	\$ (98,260)	\$ (104,746)	\$ (107,678)
	Total		\$ (359,447)	\$ (95,594)	\$ (98,260)	\$ (104,746)	\$ (107,678)

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Funding Source	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029
Contribution to Capital	One-Time	Reserve	\$ 325,000				
15 per cent care and maintenance fee	One-Time	User Fees	\$ 4,493	\$ 12,469	\$ 12,816	\$ 13,663	\$ 14,045
CMTF Repayment	One-Time	User Fees	\$ 30,000	\$ 83,100	\$ 85,400	\$ 91,100	\$ 35,400
	On-Goin	g	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
	One-Tim	e	\$ 359,493	\$ 95,569	\$ 98,216	\$ 104,763	\$ 49,445
	Total		\$ 359,493	\$ 95,569	\$ 98,216	\$ 104,763	\$ 49,445

Impact to Capital No tax levy impact as project will be funded through the CMTF.

# FTE Table

Position	Bargaining Unit	Duration	Permanent / Part Time		2025		2026	2027		2028		2029
		Permane	ent		-		-	-			-	-
		PT Hours	PT Hours		-		-	-			-	-
						1			1			
		Ye	early Impact		2025		2026	2027		2028		2029
		On-Goin	g	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-		\$ -
		One-Tim	e	\$	46	\$	(26)	\$ (43	\$		17	\$ (58,233)
		Total		\$	46	\$	(26)	\$ (43	\$		17	\$ (58,233)
		Net	Levy Impact		2025		2026	2027		2028		2029
		On-Goin	g	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-		\$ -
		One-Tim	e	\$	46	\$	(72)	\$ (18	\$		60	\$ (58,250)
		Total		\$	46	\$	(72)	\$ (18	\$		60	\$ (58,250)
		% Levy I	ncrease		0.00%		0.00%					

# Implementation

The project is expected to be completed within twelve months. Tendering will occur in Q2 2025 and completion by Q4 2025. Niche units should be available for sale in November 2025.

# Advantages/Disadvantages

Advantages	Disadvantages
Maintain current service level.	None.
Provide service in cost effective way.	
No tax levy impact.	

# V. Alternatives Considered

Solution Options	Advantages/Disadvantages	Financial Impact					

Ľ	
	-

# **Business Case - User Fee Change**

Title

Department

 Implement User Fee for Tom Davies Square Courtyard Event Bookings

 Leisure Services

 Division

**Council Resolution** 

N/A

# I. Executive Summary

# **Overview of Proposal**

Currently there is no user fee associated with community groups and organizations booking the Tom Davies Square (TDS) Courtyard for events and celebrations. There is an increasing amount of events taking place in the courtyard, beyond simple flag raising ceremonies. In order to recover costs associated with providing support for events, Leisure Services is recommending a user fee be added for 2025 and beyond. Staff recommend implementing a fee for events that require use of the space for more than one hour, take place outside working hours (after 5 p.m. Monday through Friday and weekends), include a participant count greater than 100 people, or require use of vendors (food vendors, vehicles, etc.).

#### II. Background

# **Current Service Level**

Currently staff time is requested and required to support many courtyard events which include both union and non-union overtime. Furthermore, event organizers request use of City equipment such as podiums, microphones, speakers, tables, chairs, sandbags, garbage cans and more at no charge. This leaves no revenue opportunities for replacing equipment when items are damaged or not returned. Event organizers often use City services such as utilities and require support from building security in accessing washroom facilities. In the past year there were 50+ events in the TDS Courtyard; approximately half were flag raisings and proclamations and half were special events with larger crowds, included vendors, occurred outside of working hours etc.

# **III. Recommendation**

Cate	Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply)								
	Change to base operating budget		Change to base FTE allocation						
x	Change to fees (unit price)	x	Change to revenues (volume change)						
	Investment in project (Operating)		Investment in project (Capital)						

#### **Recommendation and Rationale**

Staff support required to host events in the TDS Courtyard is increasing. Implementing a user fee for use of the venue would offset these costs and would be consistent with similar venue fees.

The risk associated with not approving this business case is that inconsistent experiences would continue to exist for clients booking City facilities. Furthermore, costs would continue to not be recovered for staff time and other resources for TDS facility bookings.

#### How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

	Asset Management and Service Excellence	Economic Capacity and Investment Readiness
	Climate Change	Housing
x	A Healthier and More Vibrant Community	Focus on Advancing Caring Services Based on Lessons Learned through COVID-19 Experience

By adding a user fee for TDS Courtyard events, the organization will build consistency with how special events are organized and supported within the City of Greater Sudbury. Events play an important role in the community to improve health, economic and social outcomes for all residents.

# IV. Impact Analysis

# Qualitative Implications

The new user fee will provide consistency for event organizers as all City spaces will have user fees associated with them.

# Quantifiable Implications

The proposed user fees would be \$145 for a half-day rental and \$285 for a full-day rental. Based on 20 events per year, it is estimated that total revenues would be \$5,700.

# **Operating Revenue - Per Year**

Description	Duration	Revenue Source	2025	2026		2027		2028		2029
Tom Davies Square Courtyard Fee	On-Going	User Fees	\$ (5,700)	\$	(5,871)	\$	(6,047)	\$	(6,229)	\$ (6,415)
	On-Going		\$ (5,700)	\$	(5,871)	\$	(6,047)	\$	(6,229)	\$ (6,415)
	One-Time		\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
	Total		\$ (5,700)	\$	(5,871)	\$	(6,047)	\$	(6,229)	\$ (6,415)

# **Operating Expenditures - Per Year**

Description	Duration Funding Source		2025	2026		2027	2028			2029
	On-Going	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
	One-Time	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
	Total	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
		1					_		1	
	Yearly Impact		2025	2026		2027		2028		2029
	On-Going	\$	(5,700)	\$ (5,871)	\$	(6,047)	\$	(6,229)	\$	(6,415)
	One-Time	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
	Total	\$	(5,700)	\$ (5,871)	\$	(6,047)	\$	(6,229)	\$	(6,415)
	Net Levy Impact		2025	2026		2027		2028		2029
	On-Going	\$	(5,700)	\$ (171)	\$	(176)	\$	(181)	\$	(187)
	One-Time	\$	-	\$ -	\$	-	\$	-	\$	-
	Total	\$	(5,700)	\$ (171)	\$	(176)	\$	(181)	\$	(187)
	% Levy Increase		0.00%	0.00%						