

Request for Decision

Project 6 Million – Final Update

Presented To: Finance and
Administration
Committee

Presented: Tuesday, Nov 17, 2015

Report Date Monday, Nov 09, 2015

Type: Presentations

Recommendation

THAT Council accepts the report titled “Project 6 Million – Final Update” for information only.

Finance Implications

The 2016 budget savings which are identified in this report amount to \$6,065,359 and will be incorporated into the 2016 Budget.

New savings identified since the last P6M report, total \$1,678,108, inclusive of the Category 2 savings of \$426,074 identified in the Managers Reports on this agenda.

To achieve the \$3.9 Million in savings related to attrition, a draw of up to \$958,694 from the Human Resources Management Reserve Fund and \$96,314 from the Water Waste Water Reserve Funds is required to fund the transition costs associated with retirements taking place in 2016 and 2017. The full savings for those retirements will be achieved by 2017 once those employees have effectively retired.

As reported previously, approximately \$600,000 of the \$6,065,359 is related to Water/Wastewater reductions, which will be used to reduce the 2016 Water/Wastewater user fees.

In addition, the identified measures result in total savings of \$736,938 for 2015, which will be used to lessen the actual contribution from the Tax Rate Stabilization Fund.

Should Council not adopt the savings identified in the Managers Reports, staff will report through the 2016 Budget document with additional means to achieve the shortfall during the course of 2016.

Background

The municipal budget 2015 was passed with a 0% tax increase, which was partially achieved by way of a draw from reserves of approximately \$6 million. On March 5, 2015 City Council passed the following resolution (FA2015-17):

Signed By

Report Prepared By

Eliza Bennett
Manager of Communications & French
Languages Services
Digitally Signed Nov 9, 15

Recommended by the Department

Lorella Hayes
General Manager of Assets and
Finance/Chief Financial Officer
Digitally Signed Nov 9, 15

Recommended by the C.A.O.

Kevin Fowke
Acting Chief Administrative Officer
Digitally Signed Nov 9, 15

“That staff be directed to implement a strategy to achieve a target of \$6 million in savings through a combination of attrition, reductions in purchasing contract services, and user fee revenues, as outlined in Scenario 3, and contribution 100% of the actual savings achieved during 2015 to replenish the Tax Rate Stabilization Reserve and that permanent budget savings be incorporated into the 2016 Budget and used to reduce the tax levy in 2016 and beyond; and that staff prepare regular reports to Council (i.e. Monthly or Quarterly Report Cards) to report on the progress towards achieving the targets set by City Council.”

Staff have achieved the savings as directed by Council, with a focus on maintaining service levels and customer service excellence, as well as improving business processes and identifying efficiencies and opportunities. This report provides the last update on Project 6 Million.

Overview of this Report

This is the last in a series of four reports on the progress of Project 6 Million (P6M). At the August, September and October Finance and Administration Committee meetings, departments identified initiatives pursued, savings achieved, and responses to ideas associated with their respective areas. This report provides a final wrap-up and identifies those initiatives and ideas that have not previously been reported on as part of the P6M updates. Those ideas and initiatives have been included below and are sorted by category of idea. Those categories are defined as noted below.

Category 1 - Initiatives already implemented by the department under management's scope of authority.*

Category 2 - Recommended actions for Council's consideration for decision or direction to report back through a Council Committee. These recommendations include initiatives with negligible or minor service level impacts, along with the associated budget implications. Background information and recommendations for these items are detailed in separate reports on this Agenda.

Category 3 - Those items that may have a have a larger impact on current service levels for Council's consideration and reports for direction will be provided as the background work is completed. Note: All Category 3 ideas have been converted to Category 4 ideas, which require additional time to analyze or implement, beyond the P6M timeframe. All P6M savings have been achieved outside of Category 3 ideas.

Category 4 - Other submissions and initiatives, with staff responses that describe whether an idea is not feasible, already being pursued in some manner or requires additional time to analyze or implement such that savings cannot be realized in 2016.

*In-Camera - In cases where suggestions, responses or implemented initiatives refer to identifiable individuals, Council will be briefed at the in-camera meeting which will follow this meeting.

Wrap-Up of Project 6 Million

Project 6 Million was officially launched in May 2015, and over the last six months, staff have received, reviewed, and responded to more than 800 ideas from citizens and employees at all levels. P6M was an intense undertaking, involving an ambitious objective within a very tight timeframe; staff have worked diligently across the organization to achieve the goal. Appendices A, B, C and D attached to this report includes a list of all savings that have been achieved across the organization.

Many other ideas are undergoing further review as representing longer-term possibilities for efficiencies or savings – including a review of garbage collection frequency, a fleet rationalization review, and the continued analysis of utilities for City facilities and buildings.

Staff will work to bring forward ideas in 2016 and beyond, which flow from a strong sense of fiscal responsibility as well as the many other values that make up municipal service, such as customer service,

civic responsibility, environmental sustainability, and solid business approaches.

Staff's dedication to the task of responsibly removing \$6 million from the budget has demonstrated the City's ability to adapt to changing circumstances and to seek innovative solutions to operational challenges. The City thanks all employees and residents who took the time to provide their input into the rethinking, refocusing and rebalancing process that has been underway since 2010 and more specifically into the P6M process.

As outlined in Appendix A (attached), of the \$6,065,359 in savings that have been achieved, \$3.9 million has been taken through attrition. Although in a given year, the City sees approximately 160 separations by way of retirements, terminations, or other employee departures, in the majority of cases, the resulting vacancies must be filled for operational purposes. Given the short timeframe of the P6M process, areas for potential attrition did not always match where vacancies were available. As a result, senior staff have had to creatively restructure around opportunities as they presented themselves during the P6M period in some cases making a time limited draw on reserves in order to take advantage of attrition occurring within 2016.

Appendix B to this report provides the list of Category 1 savings implemented under management's authority since October 2015, amounting to \$1,252,034. Because the remaining ideas being reported on are fewer in number, the appendices are organized by category of idea, as opposed to by department.

Appendix C provides the remaining Category 2 ideas, amounting to \$426,074, which are subject to the Committee's approval and are outlined in Managers' Reports on this agenda.

Appendix D provides the Committee with a copy of the P6M savings achieved by department and as reported at the meetings of September 22nd and October 27th, 2015.

Appendix E provides the remaining Category 4 responses to ideas and initiatives that have not already been reported on, for all departments.

As previously noted, the total 2016 budget savings achieved across the organization during the Project 6 Million timeframe amount to \$6,065,359. If none of the savings identified in the Managers' Reports on this agenda, having a value of \$426,074, are adopted by the committee, the total budget savings achieved through Project 6 Million to date will be \$5,639,285, leaving a savings gap of \$360,715 that City staff will achieve with additional means before the tabling of budget 2016 on December 8, 2015.

Next Steps

Good financial management requires regular review and ongoing value-based analysis. Since 2010, under the Toward Fiscal Sustainability Plan and Project 6 Million, more than \$15 million in savings, additional revenues, and cost avoidances have been implemented. These efforts will continue to and beyond the tabling of budget 2016, scheduled for December 8, 2015.

In addition, P6M ideas which have been identified as having the potential for savings, efficiencies, or which present an opportunity for improved customer service or business process, but which require more time to review and/or implement (Category 4 ideas), will be pursued over the course of the next several years. Staff and Council will continue to work together on high priority, high value ideas that will positively impact the tax levy.

Appendix A:

P6M Tracking Achievements

	2016 Estimated Savings					
Achievement	Salaries & Benefits / Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	2016 Budget Impact	2015 Savings (1)
All Departments	\$ 920,670				\$ 920,670	\$ -
Executive and Legislative	\$ 107,552	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 9,500	\$ 117,052	\$ 22,000
Administrative Services	\$ 138,483	\$ -	\$ 45,300	\$ 261,791	\$ 445,573	\$ 15,800
Human Resources and OD	\$ 179,282	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 32,154	\$ 211,435	\$ 15,647
Growth and Development	\$ 194,631	\$ 20,000	\$ -	\$ 33,713	\$ 248,343	\$ 134,828
Assets and Finance	\$ 215,107	\$ 140,000	\$ 192,740	\$ 175,639	\$ 723,486	\$ 278,664
Health Social and Emergency	\$ 665,539	\$ 115,000	\$ 151,726	\$ (118,581)	\$ 813,684	\$ -
Citizen and Leisure	\$ 638,729	\$ 47,992	\$ 25,000	\$ 242,224	\$ 953,945	\$ 200,000
Infrastructure	\$ 913,232	\$ 551,736	\$ 85,000	\$ 81,204	\$ 1,631,172	\$ 70,000
TOTALS	\$ 3,973,223	\$ 874,728	\$ 499,766	\$ 717,644	\$ 6,065,359	\$ 736,938
	66%	14%	8%	12%	101%	

Total Water and Waste Water	\$ 606,822
Total Parking	\$ 60,747
2016 Tax Levy impact (\$958,694 to be funded from reserves in 2016)	\$ 5,397,790
TOTAL	\$ 6,065,359

(1) 2015 Savings will reduce the total contribution from Tax Rate Stabilization Reserve

Appendix A: Summary by Reporting Date

P6M Tracking Achievements

	Reported Savings			
	September 22	October 27	November 17	
Achievement	(see details on Appendix D)		(See details on Appendix B & C)	Total
All Departments			\$ 1,020,670	\$ 1,020,670
Executive and Legislative		\$ 117,052		\$ 117,052
Administrative Services		\$ 400,274	\$ 45,300	\$ 445,574
Human Resources and OD	\$ 111,436			\$ 111,436
Growth and Development	\$ 248,343			\$ 248,343
Assets and Finance		\$ 359,345	\$ 364,141	\$ 723,486
Health Social and Emergency	\$ 645,794		\$ 167,887	\$ 813,681
Citizen and Leisure	\$ 873,835		\$ 80,110	\$ 953,945
Infrastructure		\$ 1,631,172		\$ 1,631,172
TOTALS	\$ 1,879,408	\$ 2,507,843	\$ 1,678,108	\$ 6,065,359

Appendix B:
Category 1: Within Management Authority
Savings reported November 17, 2015
All Departments

			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Salary / Benefits and Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
All Departments							
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 920,670				\$ 920,670
Vacation Purchase Policy	HR52	2016	\$ 100,000				\$ 100,000
Total All Departments			\$ 1,020,670	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 1,020,670
Assets & Finance							
Attrition Property Tax Analyst		2015	\$ 68,992				\$ 68,992
Savings as a result of re-tendering the banking contract		2016				\$ 60,000	\$ 60,000
Additional parking revenue as a result of fewer fleet vehicles at TDS Parking Garage		2015			\$ 3,240		\$ 3,240
Convert vacant coordinator to Union Position		2015	\$ 42,409				\$ 42,409
Total Assets & Finance			\$ 111,401	\$ -	\$ 3,240	\$ 60,000	\$ 174,641
Health, Social & Emergency Services							
Emergency Services attendance at OHL games		2016			\$ 11,723		\$ 11,723
Inspection of buildings		2016			\$ 40,000		\$ 40,000
Fire reports		2016			\$ 2,000		\$ 2,000
False alarms		2016			\$ 3,000		\$ 3,000
Total Health, Social & Emergency Services			\$ -	\$ -	\$ 56,723	\$ -	\$ 56,723
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 1,132,071	\$ -	\$ 59,963	\$ 60,000	\$ 1,252,034

Appendix C:
Category 2: Minor Service Level Change
Savings reported November 17, 2015
All Departments

			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Salary / Benefits and Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Administrative Services							
Parking fines increase	AF8	2016			\$ 45,300		\$ 45,300
Total Administrative Services			\$ -	\$ -	\$ 45,300	\$ -	\$ 45,300
Assets & Finance							
Eliminate 2 hour free parking at Beech St	AF1	2016			\$ 19,500		\$ 19,500
Increase the special event parking rate from \$3.00 to \$5.00	AF3	2016			\$ 15,000		\$ 15,000
Change age of senior from 55 to 65 - Transit	AF5	2016			\$ 130,000		\$ 130,000
Change age of senior from 55 to 65 - Parking	AF5	2016			\$ 25,000		\$ 25,000
Total Assets & Finance			\$ -	\$ -	\$ 189,500	\$ -	\$ 189,500
Health, Social & Emergency Services							
Convert 2 PT Business Service Representatives to 1 FT position		2016	\$ 16,164				\$ 16,164
Recovery of costs for Fire Services attendance at special events		2016			\$ 10,000		\$ 10,000
Revenue from open air burning permits		2016			\$ 10,000		\$ 10,000
Revenue from sale of fire and carbon monoxide alarms		2016			\$ 5,000		\$ 5,000
Revenue from Fire Marquee		2016			\$ 70,000		\$ 70,000
Total Health, Social & Emergency Services			\$ 16,164	\$ -	\$ 95,000	\$ -	\$ 111,164
Citizen & Leisure							
Change age of senior from 55 to 65 - Leisure	AF5	2016			\$ 20,000		\$ 20,000
Repurpose Capreol Ski Hill as a sliding hill	CL70	2016				\$ 35,000	\$ 35,000
Closure of Whitefish Welcome Centre	CL66	2016	\$ 9,500	\$ 5,610			\$ 15,110
Discontinue printing the leisure guide in hard copy	CL52	2016				\$ 10,000	\$ 10,000
Total Citizen & Leisure			\$ 9,500	\$ 5,610	\$ 20,000	\$ 45,000	\$ 80,110
TOTAL CATEGORY 2			\$ 25,664	\$ 5,610	\$ 349,800	\$ 45,000	\$ 426,074

Please see Managers Reports on this Agenda for more information on the ideas above

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: September 2015
Human Resources & Organizational Development

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 79,282				\$ 79,282
Reduce expenditures for Safety Awards	HR 6	2015				\$ 10,000	\$ 10,000
Move safety training elements in house and reorganize provision of first aid training	HR 61	2015				\$ 18,654	\$ 18,654
Revenue for Health & Safety contractor training	HR 74	2015				\$ 3,500	\$ 3,500
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 79,282	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 32,154	\$ 111,436

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: September 2015
Citizen & Leisure

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 616,019				\$ 616,019
Custodial Use of Vehicle Policy - vehicle returned to Fleet	CL21	Jan-16				\$ 7,216	\$ 7,216
Efficiencies in grass cutting operations	CL26	Jan-16		\$ 25,000			\$ 25,000
Reduction of Leisure General Administration expenses	CL55	Jan-16		\$ 10,000			\$ 10,000
Archives Building (Energy Savings)	CL79	May-15				\$ 20,000	\$ 20,000
Mitigation Funding - Reduce interest earned to the bank rate and use the interest to fund Children Services expenditures	CL81	2015/2016				\$ 115,000	\$ 115,000
Set up recovery from Children services to General Manager of Citizen & Leisure		2015				\$ 33,000	\$ 33,000
Use of liquid chlorine for pools to save on operating costs		Jun-15				\$ 2,600	\$ 2,600
Remarketing ice rentals due to cancellations		Jan-16			\$ 5,000		\$ 5,000
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 616,019	\$ 35,000	\$ 5,000	\$ 177,816	\$ 833,835

Category 2: Minor Service Level Change			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Details contained in routine management reports							
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Closure of Ben Moxam Centre	CL91		\$ 13,210	\$ 7,382		\$ 19,408	\$ 40,000
TOTAL CATEGORY 2			\$ 13,210	\$ 7,382	\$ -	\$ 19,408	\$ 40,000

GRAND TOTAL			\$ 629,229	\$ 42,382	\$ 5,000	\$ 197,224	\$ 873,835
--------------------	--	--	-------------------	------------------	-----------------	-------------------	-------------------

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: September 2015
Growth and Development

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	2016 Budget Impact
Attrition Vertical Control Person Tourism / Cultural Development Assistant			\$ 131,288				\$ 131,288
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 63,342				\$ 63,342
Reduction in the Earthcare expense account	GD27	2015		\$ 20,000			\$ 20,000
Reduction from sale of former Hwy 69 Welcome Centre	GD33	2015				\$ 24,000	\$ 24,000
Reduce cell phone budget	GD34	2015				\$ 2,463	\$ 2,463
Reduce welcome sign maintenance budget	GD38	2015				\$ 7,250	\$ 7,250
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 194,630	\$ 20,000	\$ -	\$ 33,713	\$ 248,343

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: September 2015
Health Social and Emergency

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 133,509				\$ 133,509
Attrition - Social Services - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 379,655			\$ (219,081)	\$ 160,574
Housing Services reduction in operating expenses adjusting budget to historical actuals		2016		\$ 50,000			\$ 50,000
Reduce Purchased Services in GM's office		2016		\$ 50,000			\$ 50,000
Termination of the automatic aid agreement with Estaire-Wanup Volunteer Fire Brigade		2016		\$ 15,000			\$ 15,000
Increased revenue from realizing prosecution and conviction of fire code offences		2016				\$ 20,000	\$ 20,000
Repurpose Public Safety Officer in Fire Services to funded position		2016	\$ 136,211				\$ 136,211
Reductions in Social Services expenses		2015				\$ 80,500	\$ 80,500
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 649,375	\$ 115,000	\$ -	\$ (118,581)	\$ 645,794

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: October 2015
Infrastructure Services

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Attrition Engineering Technician/Inspector position Material Controller Convert 3 superintendents to planner positions			\$ 167,137				\$ 167,137
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 746,095				\$ 746,095
Annual Savings of Leaf & Yard material collected in paper bags (approved 2015 budget option)		2015		\$ 60,000			\$ 60,000
Eliminate Contribution to Reserve for Radios		2016				\$ 25,500	\$ 25,500
Energy reduction initiatives at Sudbury WWTP	IS130	2016		\$ 50,000			\$ 50,000
Reduce 3 white fleet vehicles	IS181, IS165	2016				\$ 30,000	\$ 30,000
Reduction of Sewer Inspection Costs		2016		\$ 38,000			\$ 38,000
Elimination of permitting contingency		2016		\$ 8,736			\$ 8,736
Elimination of Contribution to reserve for Scanner / plotter		2016				\$ 10,404	\$ 10,404
Elimination of Contribution to reserve for Inspection Equipment		2016				\$ 15,300	\$ 15,300
Savings as a result of new AVL Provider	IS49(?)	2016		\$ 45,000			\$ 45,000
Reduction of streetlight maintenance		2016		\$ 50,000			\$ 50,000
Reduction of Traffic Signal & Railroad Maintenance		2016		\$ 100,000			\$ 100,000
New Revenue - Hauled liquid waste & sludge	IS171	2015			\$ 85,000		\$ 85,000
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 913,232	\$ 351,736	\$ 85,000	\$ 81,204	\$ 1,431,172

Category 2: Minor Service Level Change or requires Council approval			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Details contained in routine management reports							
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Reduce processing costs for leaf and Yard material and transport to Vale [Idea submitted 3 times - IS54, IS104, IS127]	IS54	2015		\$ 200,000			\$ 200,000
TOTAL CATEGORY 2			\$ -	\$ 200,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 200,000

GRAND TOTAL			\$ 913,232	\$ 551,736	\$ 85,000	\$ 81,204	\$ 1,631,172
--------------------	--	--	-------------------	-------------------	------------------	------------------	---------------------

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: October 2015
Administrative Services

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Attrition Legal Secretary Mail/Finishing Clerk			\$ 126,850				\$ 126,850
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 11,633				\$ 11,633
Reduce mail delivery vehicle		2016				\$ 7,240	\$ 7,240
Reduce by-law fleet by 2 vehicles	AS40	2015				\$ 14,646	\$ 14,646
Reduction in ERP Capital Envelope	AS22	2016				\$ 239,905	\$ 239,905
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 138,483	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 261,791	\$ 400,274

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: October 2015
Assets & Finance

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Attrition Lead Crossing Guard Crossing Guards			\$ 61,236				\$ 61,236
Attrition - changes related to identifiable individuals. Information to be provided in camera.			\$ 42,470				\$ 42,470
Reduce annual contribution to Sick Leave Reserve and fund the Sick Leave Liability from the HR Management Reserve Fund		2015				\$ 75,000	\$ 75,000
Reduction in Insurance Premiums resulting from taking brokerage services in house, as well as adjusting deductible limits		2016		\$ 140,000			\$ 140,000
Software upgrade for fuel savings in transit busses	AF41	2016				\$ 40,639	\$ 40,639
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 103,706	\$ 140,000	\$ -	\$ 115,639	\$ 359,345

Appendix D:
P6M Achievements: October 2015
CAO's Office and Corporate Wide

Category 1: Within Management Authority			Annual Savings for 2016 Budget				
Achievement	Idea #	Implementation Date	Attrition	Purchased Services	User Fees	Other	TOTAL
Attrition Coordinator of Strategic Initiatives and Policies			\$ 107,552				\$ 107,552
Reduce special events budget in Corporate Communications and French Language Services		2016				\$ 1,000	\$ 1,000
Reduce special events budget in Chief Administrative Office		2016				\$ 2,500	\$ 2,500
Reduce office expense budget in Corporate Communications and French Language Services		2016				\$ 1,000	\$ 1,000
Reduce office expense budget in Chief Administrative Office		2016				\$ 2,000	\$ 2,000
Reduce corporate marketing budget in Corporate Communications and French Language Services		2016				\$ 1,500	\$ 1,500
Reduce Community Development advertising budget in Corporate Communications and French Language Services		2016				\$ 1,500	\$ 1,500
TOTAL CATEGORY 1			\$ 107,552	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 9,500	\$ 117,052

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Idea	Idea #	Operating department Comment
------	--------	------------------------------

Administrative Services

Develop corporate asset disposal program	AS13	Assets are currently disposed of in accordance with the Purchasing By-Law. Where appropriate equipment may be donated or sold. Has minimal budget impact.
Order removal of yard sale and garage flyers from telephone posts, etc., within a week or receive a fine	AS16	Extensive staff resources would be required to manage a program or mandatory removals within one week which would likely not be offset by fine revenues.
Corporate ERP project contribution	AS37	IT staff identified a saving in the amount of \$239,905 from the ERP capital fund based on a new model of system upgrades which will come into effect after the current HCMS and FMIS upgrades.
Consider installing red light cameras at busy intersections [Idea submitted 3 times - AS9, AS42, AS45]	AS45	See also Idea 147 and AS42. Installation of Red Light cameras and new penalties for traffic enforcement would require changes to provincial legislation and/or an order in Council in order to be implemented and some would require significant capital costs at the outset. Risk Management and Roads are investigating this idea.
Booking of space at TDS	AS49	This item is being incorporated into the broader overview of how CGS provides support, either directly by way of grant, or indirectly by way of services in kind, to community groups and organizations. Since most bookings are for the courtyard and foyer which are planned for renewal in the next year, short-term opportunities for new revenues are very limited at this time.

Citizen & Leisure Services

Re-classification of some of the arenas	CL41	<p>Back in 2003 as part of a budget reduction option council approved an option that reduced the number of daytime weekday hours at a number of community arenas. The objective was to concentrate on block booking weekday ice times at a selected number of arenas. The re-classification provides for a more efficient operation related to scheduling ice booking(s) based on program demand. The option further provided an opportunity to re-classify the arena operation as per the following :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Class 1 arenas : schedule : Mondays through Fridays - 9:00 am to 1 am and Saturdays and Sundays - 7:00 am to 1 am . The class 1 arenas include : Centennial , Dr. Edgar Leclair , Garson , Gerry McCrory Countryside sports complex and TM Davie Arenas. - Class 2 arenas : schedule : Mondays, Tuesdays and Wednesdays - 3:00 pm to 1:00 am , Thursdays , Fridays , Saturdays and Sundays - 6:00 am to 1:00 am. The class 2 arenas include : Cambrian , Capreol , Carmichael , Chelmsford , McClelland , Raymond Plourde and Toe Blake arenas. - Class 3 arenas : schedule : Mondays to Fridays - 4:00 pm to midnight and Saturdays and Sundays schedule is based on program demands. The class 3 arena includes : IJ Coady arena. <p>Based on the current program demands at community arenas, staff recommend that the current scheduling and operations are not expanded or changed. The current scheduling allows staff the flexibility to adjust certain facilities hours of operation to meet program demands. In addition, current arena classification was agreed by the local union as part of</p>
Offer the opportunity to adopt gardens	CL94	The City has an agreement with the Sudbury Horticultural Society for the maintenance of a passive park along Paris Street. This agreement pre-dates amalgamation; further expansion of a garden "adoption" program would need to be achieved by way of collective bargaining agreement negotiations.

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Assets & Finance

Review Council-approved service levels for crossing guards	AF6	This has been reviewed, and associated savings were presented during the Finance and Administration October 27 meeting.
Increase parking ticket fines	AF8	See Manager's Report from Administrative Services recommending this change
Not for profit organizations that have space in City buildings should be charged rent	AF20	A review was conducted and agreements with not for profits at less than market value will be presented to Council as the leases expire and require renewal.
Review lease agreements with tenants in City buildings	AF22	A number of non-for profit groups and associations have exclusive use of City buildings or portions of City buildings. An analysis completed by Citizen and Leisure of these types of tenants showed a number of different scenarios, from charge backs for dedicated space, negotiated lease agreements and in some instances no charges for space used. Staff will be preparing a report to CS Standing Committee in 2016 regarding tenants of City of Greater Sudbury buildings including historic arrangements and charges for Council's review.
Close and/or sell to willing adjoining property owners the footpaths that run through various neighbourhoods	AF25	Also Idea 298. Staff will continue to review opportunities to dispose of City owned land in accordance with procedures and by-laws.
Annex Developed Areas in Abutting Unorganized Townships	AF27	Staff analysis indicates that the provincial process required to amalgamate the unorganized areas bordering the CGS is lengthy and far from certain as it requires support from affected residents. Staff will continue to assess the implications and opportunities in the future.
Introduce articulated buses	AF34	Staff has reviewed the boarding counts where the City deploys two buses for a route. Based the review of the boarding counts, and capital costs, a compelling business case can not be made at this time. Transit staff will continue to monitor.
Tax ore haulage trucking companies and the major area mining, milling and smelting companies more	AF39	Also AF78 response from October 27 Finance and Administration report.
Have retail mass/stores have security staff hand out parking tickets	AF55	A number of larger retailers/malls have Private Property Parking Control Officers (PPPCOs) who are appointed under CGS By-Laws for enforcement of parking related offences. No further action is required.
Eliminate / reduce seniors' rate for parking	AF79	Not recommended at this time, since staff are recommending a change in the definition of an older adult.
Sell off unused laneways	AF81	Also Idea 298. Staff will continue to review opportunities to dispose of City owned land in accordance with procedures and by-laws.
Sell vacant land in residential areas	AF83	Staff will continue to review opportunities to dispose of City owned land in accordance with procedures and by-laws.
Purchase and use high horsepower tractors as multi-use tools	AF88	Staff will review when tractors are replaced, if the business case is solid.
Stop purchase of what become "green door" houses	AF103	More information is required to fully respond to this suggestion.
Reduce bus service on Easter Monday	AF109	This idea is being reviewed and will be presented to Operations Committee in the coming months. Savings are approx. \$10,000 to change from weekday to Saturday Service and staff recommend reinvesting in Transit Services.
Change working hours for by-law personnel similar to example in Kawartha Lakes	AF132	Hours of work are established by way of the collective bargaining agreement. This suggestion will be reviewed in the context of negotiations and within the framework of enhanced customer service.
Add one permanent employee to purchasing to provide more guidance, support, and expertise to operating departments when making decisions		Management has made some organizational and business process changes during 2014 and 2015. This suggestion will be reviewed again in 2016.

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Growth & Development

Relocate 3 staff members to Building Services to work with Building Inspectors, Plan Examiners and Clerks to improve services related to lot grading issues	GD2	This will be reviewed as part of future reorganization discussions.
Stop Planning Act notices in French newspaper	GD5	Notice costs are recovered through a separate notice fee applied to planning applications. A review of application fees will be the subject of a report to Planning Committee in the first quarter of 2016.
Start a three-month pilot project where development costs are reduced to 10-20%	GD10	Development charges are approved by Council and reviewed on a regular basis.
Keep water moving to avoid blue green algae	GD11	Cyanobacteria (blue-green algae) are native organisms occurring in freshwater systems that can form problematic 'blooms' due to complex interactions of factors that are still not clearly understood by science. It is known that increases in phosphorus levels, water temperatures and stillness of surface water can increase the risk of cyanobacterial blooms. Movement of surface waters is a natural phenomenon that is not within the purview of City operations
Stop including tenants in development approvals circulation	GD18	Notice costs are recovered through a separate notice fee applied to planning applications. A review of application fees will be the subject of a report to Planning Committee in the first quarter of 2016.
Review the budgets of EarthCare and Environmental Planning Initiatives	GD20	An ongoing reduction in EarthCare budget of \$20,000 starting in 2015 with out impacting service levels can be achieved. These savings were presented at the September 22 Finance and Administration meeting.
Allow exceptions from the Urban Expansion Reserve Designation	GD37	This idea relates to decisions being made on land use designations in the City's Official Plan. The process for making such decisions is governed by the Planning Act and is appropriately dealt with through the Official Plan review process which is currently underway.

Health, Social & Emergency Services

Charge people with rescue efforts made by emergency services for people who do not follow alerts and warnings	HSE3	Currently Paramedic Services are not permitted to directly invoice for services under the Ambulance Act. Fire has made amendments to the User Fees Bylaw to do this if approved.
Fire - restructure vehicles and equipment rather than purchase new	HSE4	This is ongoing as per the tactical plan.
Amalgamate 911 call centre with EMS call centre	HSE6	This recommendation was identified as a Priority E1 Integrated Dispatch in our Emergency Services Strategic Plan 2014-2020 as approved by Council. An integrated dispatch system specifically designed to meet our community's unique characteristics is critical to ensuring the most effective multi-agency response of emergency personnel (Police, Fire, and Paramedic). We will pursue the feasibility of integrating the Emergency Medical Services dispatch, which is currently managed by Ministry of Health and Long Term Care, with the City's current dispatch system to achieve a fully integrated Emergency Communications Services system for the City. It should be noted that although there are likely to be efficiencies, the fiscal outcomes are unknown at this time.

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Eliminate the 24-hour shifts for Fire Services	HSE7	This is a contractual obligation and operational consideration. Fiscal pressures are being monitored.
Abolish the practice of using fire trucks and emergency vehicles to run errands (i.e. fire trucks at grocery store)	HSE8	Paramedics while on-duty in their assigned coverage areas are permitted to stop to pick up meals. They are not permitted to "shop" This practice is covered by policy to ensure public safety. When a fire fighter is on duty, they are assigned to a vehicle. They do not leave the station unless they are all on the vehicle. The department supports healthy eating and supporting local businesses when purchasing groceries.
Review budget for Fire Services educational programs/products	HSE11	Fire education programs are mandatory as legislated by the Fire Protection and Prevention Act, 1997.
Consolidate fire stations	HSE12	A fire optimization review is currently underway. A report will be brought forward to Council in 2016.
Utilize volunteer firefighters as associate instructors for volunteers	HSE15	This matter has been discussed in a labour relations format and has further been remedied by a new command structure. All training at volunteer stations is primarily conducted by volunteer staff under the direction of the Training Division as delegated by the Chief.
More integration between Fire and EMS	HSE17	<p>Part of a larger integration strategy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * integration of operational support services such as logistics, inventory, warehousing, procurement, training etc. * need further studies related to gap analysis, cost / benefit analysis and impact study * potential methodologies <p>DMAIC - define, measure, analyze, improve, control</p> <p>Scientific - observation, hypothesis, experiment, conclusion</p> <p>Ongoing effort that is approved by Council and is embedded in the department's strategic plan.</p>
Don't allow City owned vehicles for personal use, i.e., fire trucks at grocery stores	HSE18	Paramedics while on-duty in their assigned coverage areas are permitted to stop to pick up meals. They are not permitted to "shop." This practice is covered by policy to ensure public safety. When a fire fighter is on duty, they are assigned to a vehicle. They do not leave the station unless they are all on the vehicle. The department supports healthy eating and supporting local businesses when purchasing groceries.
Do not hire more full-time firefighters	HSE24	Also see HSE16. All matters of hiring will be addressed in the fire service optimization review. CGS is obliged to meet hiring requirements as per fire service collective agreements. Reductions in full time staff will result in additional overtime costs based on minimum staffing levels in accordance with the CBA.
Review Fire policy regarding cancelled dispatches	HSE28	Fire Services response procedures are constantly reviewed to ensure best practices. Dispatch policies are being transformed to address over-staffing at some incidents.
Paramedic dispatch out of Lionel Lalonde Centre	HSE29	Currently, the Ministry of Health and Long Term Care (MOHLTC) is responsible for dispatch of land-based ambulance services.
Close the Emergency Operations Centre	HSE30	The Emergency Management and Civil Protection Act provides the framework for all Emergency Management Programs in Ontario. Meeting compliance with this legislation requires the established CGS Emergency Management Program be adopted in bylaw, (CGS By-Law 2009-33). The Regulation sets the standard which includes the establishment of an EOC. "Every municipality shall establish an emergency operations centre to be used by the municipal emergency control group in an emergency. O. Reg. 380/04, s. 13 (1)."

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Utilize Paramedic modified workers to deliver stock and supplies if available as on shift and or EVT worker already scheduled	HSE31	Injured Paramedics are assessed and assigned modified duties based upon limitation as determined by their health care provider. When able modified staff do conduct deliveries and assist in ferrying vehicles in support of Paramedic Service Logistics. It is important to recognize that modified work is not permanent and we are unable to sustain specific tasks through this process.
Eliminate interim tiered response	HSE32	This matter has been discussed in a labour relations format and at Council. The implementation of this interim plan addresses fire life safety issues for both firefighters and the public. This forms part of the optimization review currently under way as per Council approved Emergency Services Strategic/Tactical Plan. The interim response is in place as publicly explained address the Sudbury Fire Services efficiencies and effectiveness.
Eliminate all the non-emergency response vehicles assigned to Emergency Services and Water/Wastewater	HSE33	The fire service offers a full range of services to the city in addition to emergency response. All of these other services would be negatively impacted or eliminated without a vehicle to perform them. They include fire prevention, education, fire services training, etc. Non-emergency vehicles provide a required means of delivering essential emergency services throughout our 3,600 plus square kilometers.
Use electronic charting system at Pioneer Manor to its fullest capacity	HSE35	All progress notes are done electronically. In Therapeutic Services, there are some remaining assessment tools that still need to be developed in PointClickCare (PCC). In Activation Services, charting is done through the Resident Assessment Instrument in PCC. Resident Services are the largest consumer of paper. Items still on paper are: all physician orders/progress notes, all Health Care Aide progress notes, daily census, versus checks restraints and incident reports.
Remove the inflatable boat from the Van Horne Emergency Services Station during the winter months to allow parking of EMS vehicles indoors.	HSE37	Current Emergency Service Stations within the municipality are being co-habitated by Fire and Paramedic Services. These stations were never designed for this purpose. Currently Fire Services is undertaking a fleet optimization that may result in additional space being freed up for Paramedic Services.
Use certified traffic control personnel at accidents so emergency personnel can focus on the injured	HSE41	Police are responsible under the Highway Traffic Act for the directing traffic. Paramedics are not trained on directing traffic, they are focused on patient care. Police officers are the only persons under the HTA who can perform this activity. Fire crews do so only for short durations until Police arrive.
Review dispatch policy - too many emergency vehicles and personnel dispatched to fender benders	HSE43	Currently, the Ministry of Health and Long Term Care (MOHLTC) is responsible for dispatch of land-based ambulance services. Paramedics attend calls for confirmed or suspected injuries. Our response procedures are constantly reviewed to ensure best practices. It is far better to send more resources than not enough.
Stop sending four man crews of firefighters to medical calls	HSE46	When a fire fighter is on duty, they are assigned to a vehicle. They do not leave the station unless they are all on the vehicle. The current deployment model for Fire allows for system flexibility to respond to multiple call types as a team (structure fire, motor vehicle collision and medical calls) in a timely and nimble fashion. The Medical Tired Response Agreement is in place to add life saving interventions (early CPR and defibrillation) within our community by utilizing the strategic placement of their station, skills and proximity to the location of the call.
Base EMS Ambulances and personnel from the Emergency Services Stations in the community rather than having dozens of them commute from Azilda	HSE48	More review is required. Currently Paramedic Services utilized a combination of both reporting stations and centralized deployment to service the city. Centralized deployment is recognized as a best practice (Ottawa, Peel, Thunder Bay, Waterloo) in deploying and managing resources in an urban service. In addition, the municipality does not have sufficient stations or space to accommodate a non centralized model. A decentralized deployment model also presents unique fiscal pressures and logistical challenges.

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Increase productivity of full time firefighters (complete tasks such as fire prevention, inspections, education)	HSE50	Staff are working to review workloads and activities within the framework of collective bargaining agreements. For example, Fire Services is currently reviewing and increasing the involvement of Fire Suppression Services in proactive activities.
--	-------	---

Human Resources & Organizational Development

Audit of eligibility of dependents on benefit plan	HR3	HR/OD staff initiated a Positive Re-enrolment process for all employees who have benefit coverage in April 2015 to validate their coverage and dependants. This has resulted in some amendments and cost savings to date. A follow-up mailing will occur in September for those individuals who have not yet responded. An audit of retiree benefit enrolments will occur in late 2015/early 2016.
Conduct organizational salary review including a cross-reference to similar municipalities/transparency of organizational chart	HR9	Already an established process for Non Union positions - a survey of Council-approved comparators is conducted to monitor the health of the pay line. Pay equity obligations must also be considered and met. Wages for unionized positions are governed by Collective Bargaining Agreements and any changes would require negotiations. Shared organizational charts with position data only is possible and would result in greater transparency of the organizational structure, however, there would be a cost associated with the administration of this process.
Evaluate opportunities for alternate employment relationships	HR18	HR / OD has coordinated an approach to prospective retirees which includes a form of gliding retirement. The individual departments benefitting from these changes will forward forms and records of their budget reductions. The total quantum of these savings is not yet known and will be presented in the form of attrition savings throughout the fall of 2015.
Scrutinize number of FTE's in Human Resources. Eliminate 1 FTE	HR24	Attrition identified with savings reported in September 2015.
Hire outside agency to review staffing requirements and job responsibilities of all senior staff	HR25	Human Resources and Organizational Development performs annual benchmarking of our payline for all non-union staff roles. The target is to pay at the 50th percentile of our Council approved comparators in order to attract and retain appropriate managerial talent to run the organization. There are several attrition recommendations being made to Council as a part of this process which have been arrived at by an analysis of our structure and organization of managerial jobs. These changes will be reviewed by Council in closed session and communicated when appropriate in a more public forum.
Offer an optional 1 week unpaid vacation	HR31	Vacation Purchase Program implemented. Savings to be known once submissions approved (mid-Nov). See also Idea HR52.
Graduated retirement	HR41	HR / OD has coordinated an approach to prospective retirees which includes a form of gliding retirement. The individual departments benefitting from these changes will forward forms and records of their budget reductions. The total quantum of these savings is not yet known and will be presented in the form of attrition savings throughout the fall of 2015.
Develop a Green Team	HR50	Staff work alongside the Energy Initiatives section, as well as EarthCare, to implement energy efficiencies at the sectional, departmental, and corporate levels.

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Move the non-union plan from the current generics to Enhanced Generic substitution.	HR53	Since Amalgamation (and with predecessor municipalities), Non Union employees have had the same benefit coverage as CUPE 4705 employees therefore this change would be a shift in compensation practice. However, a total cost savings of approximately \$7,000 per year could be realized with this plan design change. The benefit plan currently has Generic Substitution Formulary 2 which allows the physician to indicate no substitution on the prescription. We can move to a mandatory generic substitution plan where employees must bear the cost difference between generic and brand name drug, unless the treating professional provides medical evidence that the generic drug is not effective or causes adverse effects.
Use internal resources with proper certifications for additional work if required	HR54	Process to obtain certifications held by all CGS staff part of Talent Development project. One project within HR/OD implemented: Grass Cutting - see Budget Recommendation Form under Idea 763 (HR61). Savings of \$3000 estimated for 2016. No savings for 2015 budget. See also CW28.
Add administration fee for submitting resumes to the City	HR65	Although there are some administrative costs associated with this process CGS could implement a fee for positions that attract high volume applications and where there is little to no difficulty in attracting applicants such as Fire (e.g. last career recruitment resulted in 575 applications at a fee of \$250 as suggested in the idea proposal) would result in revenue to CGS.
Explore revenue opportunity for rehabilitation work in neighbouring municipalities	HR80	Idea is under review currently to determine need within partner organizations. Limited capacity to provide services due to impact on service levels to CGS staff.
Examine all jobs, salaries, compensation, days off, etc.	HR84	Already an established process for Non Union salaries - a survey of Council-approved comparators is conducted to monitor the health of the pay line. Review process of other items mentioned conducted prior to negotiations with our partner Unions, with Non Union historically matching.

Infrastructure Services

Consider contracting out the survey section	IS7	Staff are modifying the business process to reduce costs and transfer responsibility for quality control to general contractors, resulting in modest savings. However, the survey section continues to be an integral part of our programs and services.
Consider contracting out the soils lab	IS37	Staff are modifying the business process to reduce costs and transfer responsibility for quality control to general contractors, resulting in modest savings. However, the survey section continues to be an integral part of our programs and services.
Eliminate the culvert subsidy program [Idea submitted 2 times - IS74, IS131]	IS74	A business analysis will be conducted and a report will be brought to Operations Committee for review.
Convert the Azilda landfill site to a waste transfer station	IS134	Staff will review and will bring a report to Operations Committee should a viable business case be apparent.
Eliminate the use of English and French bilingual road signs, and use only English and/or symbols	IS186	After amalgamation, a street naming committee was established by the transition board to manage this category of work. That Committee recommended that signs be prepared in a bilingual format. Staff do not believe that the bilingual translation is not a significant cost burden to the sign manufacture and installation process. Sign fabrication costs would not be substantially reduced, and the costs of the masts, poles, and installation would not change at all. This would not be an appropriate approach in a community where bilingualism is such an important part of our character and heritage, for what would ultimately amount to insignificant savings.

CAO's Office & Corporate Wide

Appendix E:

Category 4: Other Submissions and Staff Feedback

All Departments

Cut back on management and their salaries	CW24	See also Idea 179. This is possible and in conjunction with a review of all employment costs and increases will be reviewed with Council along with preparation and discussion on negotiations with our partner unions in the usual fashion. In past, CGS has internal equity philosophy of non-union to follow union wage increases. CGS does ongoing salary review and market analysis.
Review food budget for department/committee meetings	CW31	See idea response AS4 in October 27 Finance and Administration Report.
Cut bottled water for staff and Council	CW50	Bottled water is not used at Council or Committee meetings and the purchase and use of bottled water for staff has been significantly reduced in recent years. This idea serves as a reminder for staff to further reduce the purchase of bottled water and to use tap water wherever feasible.
Reduce the amount of third party consultants/ advisors for city internal projects	CW55	See idea response CW97 in October 27 Finance and Administration Report.
Ensure core functions are properly funded while support functions are reviewed and trimmed	CW100	See idea response CW27 in October 27 Finance and Administration report.