MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE OF THE CITY OF GREATER SUDBURY

Council Chamber Tom Davies Square	COUNCILLOR FABIO BELLI, CHAIR	Monday, February 11, 2013 Commencement: 4:47 p.m.
Present	Councillors Dutrisac, Kilgour, Belli, Craig	
<u>Staff</u>	Bill Lautenbach, General Manager of Baskcomb, Director of Planning Services; ordinator; Lisa Miller, Deputy City Clerk	
Declarations of Pecuniary Interest	None declared.	
<u>Closed Session</u>	 PL2013-17 Craig/Rivest: That the Plannin session to deal with one acquisition/dispos Acquisition of Easement – Douglas Stream in accordance with the Municipal Act, 2001 	ition of land matters; et, Sudbury
<u>Recess</u>	At 4:57 p.m., the Planning Committee rece	essed.
Reconvene	At 5:30 p.m., the Planning Committee reconvened in the Council Chamber for the regular meeting.	
	COUNCILLOR DAVE KILGOUR IN THE C	CHAIR
Present	Councillors Dutrisac, Rivest, Belli, Craig	
	Councillor Caldarelli	
<u>Staff</u>	Bill Lautenbach, General Manager of Baskcomb, Director of Planning Servic Development Approvals; Cindy Dent, M Webb, Supervisor of Development Engine Clerk; Christopher St-Onge, Audio Visual Assistant	ces; Eric Taylor, Manager of Ianager of Recreation; Robert eering; Lisa Miller, Deputy City
Declaration of Pecuniary Interest and the General <u>Nature Thereof</u>	None declared	

MATTERS ARISING FROM THE CLOSED SESSION

<u>Rise and Report</u> Councillor Belli reported the Committee met in closed session to deal with one acquisition/disposition of land matters and the following recommendation emanated therefrom:

Acquisition of Easement – Douglas <u>Street, Sudbury</u> PL2013-18 Craig/Rivest: THAT the City of Greater Sudbury authorize the acquisition of an easement over vacant land located on part of 171 Douglas Street, Sudbury, legally described as part of PIN 73585-0607(LT), formerly Parcel 12944, S.E.S., part of Lots 94 and 95, Plan M-95, Township of McKim, City of Greater Sudbury;

THAT a by-law be passed authorizing the execution of the documents required to complete the real estate transaction;

AND THAT the acquisition and associated costs be funded from the Land Acquisition Reserve Fund.

CARRIED

PUBLIC HEARINGS

APPLICATIONS FOR OFFICIAL PLAN AMENDMENT AND TEMPORARY USE BY-LAW IN ORDER TO PERMIT A MOBILE HOME AS A GARDEN SUITE, 3213 PERCY AVENUE, VAL CARON - DAN & FRANCINE GAGNON

The Planning Committee meeting was adjourned and the Public Hearing was opened to deal with the following application.

Report dated January 29, 2013 was received from the General Manager of Growth and Development regarding applications for Official Plan Amendment and temporary use bylaw in order to permit a mobile home as a garden suite, 3213 Percy Avenue, Val Caron -Dan & Francine Gagnon.

Dan and Francine Gagnon, the applicants, were present.

The Director of Planning Services outlined the application to the Committee.

The Chair asked whether there was anyone in the audience who wished to speak in favour or against this application and seeing none:

The Public Hearing concerning this matter was closed and the Planning Committee resumed in order to discuss and vote on the application.

APPLICATIONS FOR OFFICIAL PLAN AMENDMENT AND TEMPORARY USE BY-LAW IN ORDER TO PERMIT A MOBILE HOME AS A GARDEN SUITE, 3213 PERCY AVENUE, VAL CARON - DAN & FRANCINE GAGNON (CONT'D)

The following recommendations were presented:

PL2013-19 Rivest/Craig: THAT the City of Greater Sudbury approve the application by Dan & Francine Gagnon to amend the City of Greater Sudbury Official Plan to provide a site-specific exemption from Section 3.2 in order to permit a mobile home as a garden suite on those lands described as PIN 73501-1138, Part of Lot 16, Plan M-390, Parcel 33682A in Lot 9, Concession 6, Township of Blezard.

YEAS: Councillors Dutrisac, Rivest, Belli, Craig, Kilgour

CARRIED

PL2013-20 Craig/Rivest: THAT the City of Greater Sudbury approve the application by Dan & Francine Gagnon to amend Zoning By-law 2010-100Z with respect to lands described as PIN 73501-1138, Part of Lot 16, Plan M-390, Parcel 33682A in Lot 9, Concession 6, Township of Blezard in order to permit a garden suite in accordance with Section 39 of the Planning Act for a temporary period of ten (10) years, subject to the following conditions:

- a. That the temporary use by-law include the following site-specific provisions:
 - i) A garden suite in the form of a mobile home with a maximum size of 85 m^2 shall be permitted;
 - ii) Minimum setbacks for the garden suite shall be as follows:
 - (a) 15 metres from the front lot line;
 - (b) 3 metres from the southerly lot line.

YEAS: Councillors Dutrisac, Rivest, Belli, Craig, Kilgour

CARRIED

APPLICATION FOR AN OFFICIAL PLAN AMENDMENT TO PERMIT A RESIDENTIAL DWELLING LOT IN THE MINING/MINERAL RESERVE, HIGHWAY 69 NORTH, VAL CARON - ROGER LAVOIE

The Planning Committee meeting was adjourned and the Public Hearing was opened to deal with the following application.

Report dated January 29, 2013 was received from the General Manager of Growth and Development regarding an application for an Official Plan Amendment to permit a residential dwelling lot in the Mining/Mineral Reserve, Highway 69 North, Val Caron - Roger Lavoie.

APPLICATION FOR AN OFFICIAL PLAN AMENDMENT TO PERMIT A RESIDENTIAL DWELLING LOT IN THE MINING/MINERAL RESERVE, HIGHWAY 69 NORTH, VAL CARON - ROGER LAVOIE (CONT'D)

Dave Dorland and Dara Lavoie-Robillard, agents for the applicant, were present.

The Director of Planning Services outlined the application to the Committee.

Mr. Dorland stated his client has agreed to move the entrance and join it with the existing driveway as requested by Traffic and Transportation so a new entrance on to Municipal Road 80 is not created. He feels this application comes down to an interpretation of the mapping and that a portion of the lot is already designated in Living Area 2. He feels the report only speaks to the portion of the property that is located in the mineral reserve. He does not believe there is an issue to build one house at this location as it will not hinder any mineral/mining operation. He requested an alternate recommendation to permit the Official Plan Amendment be approved. He believes the Provincial Policy Statement and the Official Plan are not compromised by allowing the severance and that this application should be considered infilling.

The Chair asked whether there was anyone in the audience who wished to speak in favour or against this application and seeing none:

The Public Hearing concerning this matter was closed and the Planning Committee resumed in order to discuss and vote on the application.

The following recommendation was presented:

PL2013-21 Rivest/Dutrisac: THAT the City of Greater Sudbury approve the application by Roger Lavoie with respect to those lands described as Part of PIN 73498-0108, Parcel 45 S.E.S., Lot 5, Concession 3, Township of Blezard to amend the Official Plan for the City of Greater Sudbury in order to provide for an exception to Section 4.6.1 and 5.2.2 in order to permit the creation of one new rural residential dwelling lot within the Mining/Mineral Reserve designation.

YEAS: Councillors Dutrisac, Rivest, Belli, Craig, Kilgour

CARRIED

PRELIMINARY PLANNING REPORT - APPLICATION FOR REZONING AND PLAN OF SUBDIVISION IN ORDER TO PERMIT THE DEVELOPMENT OF A 63 LOT RESIDENTIAL SUBDIVISION AND THREE MULTI-FAMILY BLOCKS FOR 72 CONDOMINIUM UNITS, KEAST DRIVE, SUDBURY - 1721074 ONTARIO INC.

The Planning Committee meeting was adjourned and the Public Hearing was opened to deal with the following application.

Report dated January 29, 2013 was received from the General Manager of Growth and Development regarding a preliminary planning report - application for rezoning and plan of subdivision in order to permit the development of a 63 lot residential subdivision and three multi-family blocks for 72 condominium units, Keast Drive, Sudbury - 1721074 Ontario Inc.

Letter of concern dated December 20, 2012 was received from Elaine G. Porter, area resident.

Letter of concern received November 26, 2012 was received from Dr. Robin & Barbara Bolton, area residents.

Letter of opposition dated December 21, 2012 was received from Naomi Grant, Chair, Coalition for a Liveable Sudbury.

Letter of concern dated October 15, 2012 was received from Rainbow Routes Association Board of Directors.

Letter of concern was received from S. J. Lane, area resident.

Letter of objection dated August 22, 2012 was received from Mark Browning, city resident.

Letter of concern dated August 30, 2012 was received from Dr. Elaine Porter, city resident.

Letter of objection dated August 20, 2012 was received from Norman Cheadle, city resident.

Letter of objection dated December 14, 2012 was received from Peter Villa, area resident.

Email of concern dated January 28, 2013 from Jo Duke, city resident, was distributed at the meeting.

Letter of concern dated January 29, 2013 from Cathy Jakelski, area resident, was distributed at the meeting.

PRELIMINARY PLANNING REPORT - APPLICATION FOR REZONING AND PLAN OF SUBDIVISION IN ORDER TO PERMIT THE DEVELOPMENT OF A 63 LOT RESIDENTIAL SUBDIVISION AND THREE MULTI-FAMILY BLOCKS FOR 72 CONDOMINIUM UNITS, KEAST DRIVE, SUDBURY - 1721074 ONTARIO INC. (CONT'D)

Letter of support dated January 30, 2013 from Cliff B. Richardson, area resident, was distributed at the meeting.

Letter of concern dated February 4, 2013 from John Lindsay, Chair, Minnow Lake Restoration Group – CAN, was distributed at the meeting.

Email of concern dated February 5, 2013 from Julie Noël de Tilly, area resident, was distributed at the meeting.

Letter of concern dated February 7, 2013 from Klaus Jakelski, area resident, was distributed at the meeting.

Email of concern dated February 10, 2013 from Jan Browning, area resident, was distributed at the meeting.

Letter of concern dated February 11, 2013 from Lily Noble, Co-chair, Ramsey Lake Stewardship Committee was distributed at the meeting.

Letter of objection dated February 11, 2013 from Naomi Grant, Chair, Coalition for a Liveable Sudbury, was distributed at the meeting.

Norm Eady, the applicant, was present.

The Director of Planning Services outlined the application to the Committee.

Mr. Eady stated he is aware of the community's issues and concerns regarding development around lakes and he has had made many revisions to this application over that last couple of years. He has spoken with the neighbours regarding the development and is a member of the Community Action Network. He believes the existing properties pollute the lake from run-off and sewage systems more than this new development would. He stated the dedicated parkland is sized according to the requirements. He believes existing houses on Keast Drive have been built in the designated flood plain. He informed this development has no proposed buildings within the flood plain and believes the development will increase the quality of Lake Ramsey. He hired an engineering firm to conduct a traffic study which states there will not be an increase in traffic as the new traffic generated will be travelling in the opposite direction during rush hour traffic. He stated the drainage plans for the development take into consideration water run-off. He also believes the development will improve the water and sewer conditions and the quality of Ramsey Lake. He informed he held three meetings to inform the community about the development and believes there is a lot of misinformation regarding his application.

Planning Committee (2013-02-11)

PRELIMINARY PLANNING REPORT - APPLICATION FOR REZONING AND PLAN OF SUBDIVISION IN ORDER TO PERMIT THE DEVELOPMENT OF A 63 LOT RESIDENTIAL SUBDIVISION AND THREE MULTI-FAMILY BLOCKS FOR 72 CONDOMINIUM UNITS, KEAST DRIVE, SUDBURY - 1721074 ONTARIO INC. (CONT'D)

Lily Noble, Co-Chair, Lake Ramsey Stewardship Committee gave a powerpoint presentation demonstrating the concerns about the proposed development. She stated concern over Lake Ramsey being swimable, fishable, drinkable and enjoyable in the future due to the increase of blue green algae. She believes the application has been completed; however, a number of studies including environmental impact, geotechnical, and water shed as well as a stormwater management plan have not been completed. These studies should be completed and considered to assess all the issues before the development is considered. She stated the applicant proposes a Comprehensive Planned Unit Development for reduced frontage and condo developments and will preserve unique environmental features, natural vegetation, sensitive to terrain and natural drainage but questions how this will occur if new roads and homes are to be built. She believes the dedicated parkland should be increased. She is concerned about the visual quality of the higher elevations from the lake as this should be protected and preserved. She feels the application should be denied.

Naomi Grant, Chair, Coalition for a Liveable Sudbury stated she has similar concerns regarding the safety of Lake Ramsey and believes the application should be denied. She stated over 1000 lots are being developed around Lake Ramsey and the studies required are not completed to be able to move ahead. She stated there are two species at risk and field studies which need to be completed. She believes the development does not meet existing policies. She stated the sewer and water requirements have not been met and the proposed septic lift station is located in the flood plain which is not acceptable to the City or the Ministry. The parklands are not located in an area that is convenient. Lots are being built on natural streams and the wetlands are being proposed to be filled in. Policies are in place that state there cannot be any interference with natural wetlands. She believes development of some proposed lots will require significant blasting. She stated there is a sensitive fish habitat located close to the development. She is concerned about traffic increases and believes this development does not meet the policies that are in place and is not in the interest of the community.

Cathy Jakelski, area resident, stated she is concerned about the traffic as there will only be one access point in and out of the development. She stated the traffic study reads that the existing traffic is at capacity. She believes the traffic issues are not seasonal. The development is not close to arterial roads, and is accessed off a collector road. She is concerned about public safety and the impact the heavy construction equipment will have on the roads. She feels the proposal does not keep with the natural topography and building is to occur in the flood plains and close to fish habitats. She is also concerned about the runoff into Bethel Lake and Lake Ramsey and feels this development is not compatible with the area.

PRELIMINARY PLANNING REPORT - APPLICATION FOR REZONING AND PLAN OF SUBDIVISION IN ORDER TO PERMIT THE DEVELOPMENT OF A 63 LOT RESIDENTIAL SUBDIVISION AND THREE MULTI-FAMILY BLOCKS FOR 72 CONDOMINIUM UNITS, KEAST DRIVE, SUDBURY - 1721074 ONTARIO INC. (CONT'D)

Mark Browning, city resident, stated his mother resides on Ramsey Lake Road and is concerned about the increase of traffic. He believes it is the responsibility of the government to protect the natural resources especially Lake Ramsey as it is a drinking water source. He has seen the lake suffer with blue green algae and when this happens the community suffers. He believes a moratorium on development around Lake Ramsey should occur. He requested the application be denied and stop all development surrounding Lake Ramsey.

Steve May, area resident, stated Lake Ramsey should be protected as it is the main source of drinking water. He believes the plan of subdivision and the rezoning do not meet existing policies. He feels the plan should be refused or remove buildings in the flood plain. He stated the wetlands are being replaced with a storm water management plan and with the expectation of more extreme weather events due to climate change this will cause more flooding. He requested the application be refused due to lack of conformity to the Official Plan, flood plain lands be removed from development and all studies be completed before the applicant returns.

Peter Villa, area resident stated he is concerned about the water quality and storm water management. He does not believe that completing the sewer loop at Bethel Lake will improve water quality. He is concerned about storm water runoff from rain and melting snow as it carries silt, salt, fertilizers, pesticides, pet waste and garbage into the lake. Without proper management and studies the development will increase the pollutants and the growth of blue green algae and milfoil. He stated the wetlands are essential to the life of the lake and the pond should be located outside the wetlands. He does not believe that using the suggested alternative way to clean the water is appropriate as only the course debris will be removed not the salt, silt and oils. He requested construction of an appropriate storm water management plan and the reports be made public.

John Lindsay, Chair, Minnow Lake Community Action Network and Minnow Lake Restoration Committee stated the lake is for all residents to use. He is concerned about the values of the existing properties along the lake, especially if the lake dies. He believes there is no value to living on Minnow Lake and he does not want the same problems occurring in Ramsey Lake. He recommended other areas be reviewed to develop.

Claude Jakelski, area resident, stated he is concerned the sewer loop line hook up from Dixon Road to the development will require digging in the swamp bed and this could cause water contamination issues to the lakes. He stated Bethel Lake is high in phosphorous which could lead to more phosphorous in Ramsey Lake. He believes the septic systems along Keast Drive are threats to Ramsey Lake and adding more would increase the issues. He feels a water shed study needs to be completed before any new development occurs and requested the application be denied.

PRELIMINARY PLANNING REPORT - APPLICATION FOR REZONING AND PLAN OF SUBDIVISION IN ORDER TO PERMIT THE DEVELOPMENT OF A 63 LOT RESIDENTIAL SUBDIVISION AND THREE MULTI-FAMILY BLOCKS FOR 72 CONDOMINIUM UNITS, KEAST DRIVE, SUDBURY - 1721074 ONTARIO INC. (CONT'D)

Elizabeth Bamberger, area resident, stated she supports the previous comments and requested the application be reconsidered. She does not believe that enough information has been collected to continue with the application and requested all reports and studies be completed before the application is approved.

Karathduvu Nagarajan, area resident, stated a report was completed in 1974 by the Ramsey Lake Community Improvement Plan to conserve the water shed including this piece of land being the last piece of the water shed left. He stated investments have been made in regreening the area. He requested other areas should be used for this development and the property should be left available for public use.

Recess At 8:02 p.m. the Committee recessed.

Reconvene At 8:13 p.m. the Committee reconvened.

Greg Dalton, Friends of Bennett Lake, stated he is concerned about the water quality of the lake and the impact the development will have on it as most of the development will be on rock and the runoff will be directly into the lake. He is concerned the development is being approved prior to the completion of necessary studies.

Councillor Caldarelli, Ward Councillor, stated she believes the people commenting have concerns about the proposal and the effects it will have on Ramsey Lake. She stated consideration must be given if intensification of the development surrounding the lake is to continue. The residents believe the lift station and the water pond are being located in the swamp lands. Consideration should be given of the development as a whole and requested the studies be completed and available before the application returns to the Planning Committee.

Mr. Eady stated most of the required studies have been completed and believes most of the concerns have been addressed. He informed the Storm Water Management Source Protection and Nickel District Conservation Authority have listed their concerns and he believes they can be mitigated. He feels the sewer and water systems will benefit the new development as well as the existing properties. He stated notice was given to the Ward Councillor regarding the development and a community meeting was held where the plans of development were distributed. He informed there will be 15 lots along the waterfront; the natural shoreline will be protected as the homes will be built on top of the hills. The Creighton fault is not being touched or built on. He stated the property is not greenspace, it is private land. He informed the subdivision is low density and all buildings are meant to blend into the community. He is following the policies set out by the Province and the City.

PRELIMINARY PLANNING REPORT - APPLICATION FOR REZONING AND PLAN OF SUBDIVISION IN ORDER TO PERMIT THE DEVELOPMENT OF A 63 LOT RESIDENTIAL SUBDIVISION AND THREE MULTI-FAMILY BLOCKS FOR 72 CONDOMINIUM UNITS, KEAST DRIVE, SUDBURY - 1721074 ONTARIO INC. (CONT'D)

The Chair asked whether there was anyone else in the audience who wished to speak in favour or against this application and seeing none:

The Public Hearing concerning this matter was closed and the Planning Committee resumed in order to discuss and vote on the application.

The following recommendation was presented:

PL2013-22 Belli/Rivest: THAT the City of Greater Sudbury receive the comments and submissions made at the public hearing on Files 751-6/11-6 and 780-6/11003;

AND THAT staff complete their review of files 751-6/11-6 and 780-6/11003 by 1721074 Ontario Inc. and schedule a second public hearing on this matter before the Planning Committee, when complete.

YEAS: Councillors Dutrisac, Rivest, Belli, Craig, Kilgour

CARRIED

AMENDMENT TO THE ZONING BY-LAW TO ADD CARNIVALS TO THE LIST OF USES PERMITTED IN P. PARK ZONES

The Planning Committee meeting was adjourned and the Public Hearing was opened to deal with the following application.

Report dated January 29, 2013 was received from the General Manager of Growth and Development regarding an amendment to the Zoning By-law to add Carnivals to the list of uses permitted in P, Park zones.

Cindy Dent, Manager of Recreation, was present.

The Director of Planning Services outlined the application to the Committee.

Elaina Groves, President, Summerfest stated this is the largest festival in the District of Sudbury and has operated from Bell Park for 16 years. It supports other not-for-profits and charities. She stated the issues are having a significant impact on the event and volunteers and consideration was given to end the festival. In 2011 the carnival was moved from the Bell Park parking lot to the parking lot located at York Street and Paris Street and revenues were lost. The City has requested the carnival be moved back to the parking lot in Bell Park, which she feels is not possible. They support the changes to the zoning by-law to allow carnivals in city parks, however they object to limits on the location and hours of operation. She believes if the carnival is to be located in the Bell Park parking lot there will be a loss of venders. She informed she has received a

AMENDMENT TO THE ZONING BY-LAW TO ADD CARNIVALS TO THE LIST OF USES PERMITTED IN P. PARK ZONES (CONT'D)

petition signed by approximately 2,000 residents in support of Summerfest. She requested Summerfest be permitted to host carnivals in future years, to allow the carnival to remain in the parking lot at York Street and Paris Street, the hours of operation be written in the by-law and, should the property be considered for zoning amendments, ensure the Summerfest carnival is still permitted.

Councillor Caldarelli, Ward Councillor stated the motion could be worded to include the parking lots and leave the decisions up to Recreation Services. She requested the carnival for Summerfest be located as close to the road as possible. She received multiple phone calls and complaints every year regarding the noise level and other issues during Summerfest. She is concerned about the safety of the patrons crossing Paris Street. She believes the noise level from the carnival is not as much as the level from the concerts held in the amphitheatre. She is also concerned about the level of garbage left in the parking lot and on surrounding properties by the patrons. She stated parking of patrons in areas that it is not permitted the noise of all the events and the disruption at the carnival location.

Denis Groves, Summerfest volunteer, stated the carnival has been held at Bell Park for 12 years. He believes the issue is the timing of the shutdown of the carnival at night. He stated concession were made is 2012 to be able to hold the carnival and feels it is not unreasonable to have expanded hours on the Friday and Saturday night. He stated other cities have carnivals and festival, some of which are permanent. He stated the sound system at the amphitheatre is supposed to limit the volume but it doesn't seem to work.

Proceed Past PL2013-23 Belli/Craig: THAT we proceed past the hour of 10:00 p.m. 10:00 p.m. CARRIED

Cindy Dent, Manager of Recreation, stated the 2012 carnival was located as close to the road as possible.

The Chair asked whether there was anyone else in the audience who wished to speak in favour or against this application and seeing none:

The Public Hearing concerning this matter was closed and the Planning Committee resumed in order to discuss and vote on the application.

The following recommendation was presented:

PL2013-24 Rivest/Belli: That the City of Greater Sudbury amend the Zoning By-law 2010-100Z to add Carnivals to the list of uses permitted in Park Zones with a Special Provision that allows Carnivals only within municipally owned or operated parks.

YEAS: Councillors Dutrisac, Rivest, Belli, Craig, Kilgour

CARRIED

Planning Committee (2013-02-11)

<u>Adjournment</u>

Rivest/Belli : That we do now adjourn. Time: 10:15 p.m.

CARRIED

COUNCILLOR DAVE KILGOUR, CHAIR

LISA MILLER, DEPUTY CITY CLERK