

Update on CSD Station Revitalization Project

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide Council with an update on asset condition data being used to formulate recommendations with respect to Emergency Services Station Revitalization. This report deals with the condition of the facility assets within Community Safety only, it is not intended to contemplate specific service levels, response times, or firefighter staffing.

Background

In 2017, Council authorized an Enterprise Asset Management Strategy. The purpose of the policy is to provide guidance applicable to the whole organization and all of its services to minimize the risk of service interruption or increased cost due to asset failure while supporting the consistent delivery of expected service levels.

The Ministry of Infrastructure has set Municipal Asset Management Planning Regulations (O. Reg. 588/17) which require all municipalities to inventory assets, measure current levels of service and estimate costs to maintain those service levels. Work is proceeding on detailed asset management planning, which includes gaining an understanding of the building condition of each of the City's roughly 600 buildings and facilities.

The Community Safety Department (CSD) operates 25 buildings to provide fire and paramedic services to the community. In 2014 assessments of those facilities identified a requirement for \$12M over the next 1-5 years (short-term) and \$5M over the next 5-10 years (long-term). Only the Capreol Paramedic Station was not assessed at that time. The Auditor General has noted the generally poor state of CSD facilities and associated risks during value for money audits of both Fire and Paramedic Services.

The condition of these buildings has not improved since 2014 and the state of CSD facilities remains generally poor. These reports have driven the need for a coordinated approach in managing CSD facilities, thus a consultant was contracted to provide an independent assessment on best practices in managing Fire and Paramedic facilities. A final report is forthcoming; however, this report will provide a preliminary look at what we have found in relation to most recent building condition assessments.

Analysis

The consultant's team visited every CSD facility with a member of the Assets & Fleet Services Division. The consultant has additionally been given a variety of information

and documents previously released in relation to the facilities. Key staff were interviewed including CSD Leadership, all Executive Leadership Team members, the City Auditor General, and Assets & Fleet Services Leadership. Also, representatives from the respective employee labour groups were consulted with to inform them of the project and to help the consultant better understand the challenges that exist within the Community Safety facilities. Lastly, a survey of front line staff was taken and will be detailed as part of the final report.

The goals and objectives of the proposed CSD Station Revitalization Plan are to:

- Present a series of facilities management options that consider renovating, rebuilding, consolidation and new builds.
- Within the plan, identify and prioritize those stations that should be renovated, consolidated and built new.
- Complete a review of station location to identify those stations that would improve the delivery of fire and paramedic services by relocating them to better serve the community.
- Address the long-term sustainability of the stations as it relates to their location, size, age, condition and for the health and safety of our staff who occupy these facilities.
- At a minimum, maintain current service levels.
- Provide sustainable long-term funding plans based upon the delivered facility management options that provide for consideration of various options in the revitalization of CSD stations.
- Develop at a minimum three options that each will form a business case for consideration by City Council during the 2021 budget process.
- Provide analysis and recommendations regarding the transfer of all stations under the Assets Division.

The methodology undertaken involves first assessing building condition and then comparing the condition to required asset level of service. Asset level of service is the condition and performance expectation of the buildings to support desired levels of service.

Current Conditions

A BCA is an evaluation of a building's structure and mechanical systems. It also includes other property elements such as lighting, façade, drainage, roadways, etc. The BCA evaluation attempts to determine costs associated with bringing the building up to a

state of good repair (SOGR). SOGR can be defined as the condition in which the asset is returned to the condition upon which it was built. SOGR does not factor in any improvements or upgrades such as shower facilities, adequate garage and training space, etc. It simply means the costs to bring the building back to its former original condition.

It cannot be understated that bringing the stations up to a SOGR will not address the current functional and operational needs of today's fire and paramedic services. Therefore, this is not a viable option.

The current CSD Station Revitalization project is uncovering evidence that some of the current facilities do not meet current functional and operational needs of the Department. In terms of housing modern apparatus and vehicles, the current facilities do not allow for flexible options for fleet management in that some vehicles do not fit appropriately in some stations. Additionally, the appropriate storage of equipment such as firefighter bunker gear, pumps, hoses, and hand tools are hampered by limited space in many facilities. It has also been made clear that other functional issues exist within some of these facilities such as inadequate training space and a lack of proper washroom/locker room facilities to meet the needs of the employees. Further, BCAs have provided information about the potential for costly upgrades to be required based on the presence of designated substances (like lead and asbestos) and non-compliance with accessibility legislation.

Based upon the BCAs, the Assets Division has been able to arrive at a Facility Condition Index (FCI) for each building. FCI can be defined as a standard facility management scale used to objectively assess the current needs of a building in relation to its replacement value. The calculation is presented as a ratio of needs against value and produced as a percentage. Different industries and services will determine their comfort level with their FCI results, but a standard practice suggests a facility in a good to very good state would fall within 0%-10%, fair state would fall within 10%-30%, poor state within 30%-50%, and very poor state greater than 50%.

The following table details the FCI for CSD facilities.

STATION	Capreol EMS Station	FS 1 Van Horne	FS 2 Minnow Lake	FS 3 New Sudbury	FS 4 Long Lake	FS 5 Copper Cliff
FCI	22.2%	35.6%	17.8%	35.9%	23.1%	70.7%
STATION	FS 6 Waters	FS 7 Lively	FS 8 Whitefish	FS 9 Beaver Lake	FS 10 Azilda	FS 11 Chelmsford
FCI	30.0%	65.7%	39.8%	101.1%	3.4%	19.7%
STATION	FS 12 Dowling	FS 13 Vermillion	FS 14 Levack	FS 15 Val Caron	FS 16 Val Therese	FS 17 Hanmer
FCI	43.7%	137.8%	54.0%	81.5%	27.1%	71.5%
STATION	FS 18 Capreol	FS 20 Garson	FS 21 Falconbridge	FS 22 Skead	FS 23 Coniston	FS 24 Wahnapiatae
FCI	41.5%	44.2%	108.5%	97.7%	107.5%	118.0%

The following table summarizes the FCI ratings for the CSD stations.

Very Good 0 to 5%	Good 5 to 10%	Fair 10 to 30%	Poor 30 to 50%	Very Poor >50%
1 Facility	0 Facilities	6 Facilities	6 Facilities	11 Facilities

The evidence gathered to date suggests that state of CSD facilities has declined since the last BCAs conducted in 2014. This is not however without attempting to remedy outstanding concerns, as approximately \$3.3M has been spent on the buildings since the last BCA. Even with those repairs, the estimated costs to repair these facilities over the next 10 years has increased by \$17.2M since 2014.

Conclusion/Next Steps

Fire and Paramedic Services require functional facilities that house staff, vehicles, and equipment to support the delivery of services. When these facilities falter it becomes harder to deliver efficient services and harder to ensure the health and safety of our employees. The majority of CSD facilities are in a poor to very poor state.

Staff intend to return in the future to seek direction from Council on a comprehensive asset revitalization plan to maintain CSD facilities in not only the short, but long-term as well. A capital project to further this work has been included for Council's consideration in 2020 budget deliberations. The final report on this matter will provide options for Council to consider regarding management and sustainability of CSD facilities. Council will continue to be informed as progress is made on this project.

Resources Cited

- City of Greater Sudbury Enterprise Asset Management Policy
- Asset Management Status Report to Council October 22, 2019