

Auditor General's Office

Management Response And Proposed Actions

2011

Audit of Watermain Repairs

Brian Bigger, C.G.A

Auditor General, City of Greater Sudbury

Appendix 2

Management Response: 2011 Audit of Watermain Repairs

Rec No	Recommendation	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: (Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)	Action Plan/ Time Frame
1	When the Auditors brought to Management's attention an excavation that did not appear to meet OHSA O. Reg. 213/91, they investigated and took immediate action to formally address this incident with the workers involved. Management must ensure that tools and options required for excavation work in accordance with the Act are available to all City work crews.	X			Although there is no history of trenching incidents at the City management intends to remedy any noted deficiencies and take concrete actions to consistently meet the safe trenching requirements. Changes to pilot new trenching equipment and business processes have already started and will be in full effect by the end of the second quarter 2012.
2	Based on an average 7 foot depth excavation, our analysis indicated that a 20 tonne dump truck / backhoe / trench box method is the most economical, efficient and effective method. Supervisors should document their work plan instructions on CMMS job cards for all excavation repairs in support of excavation crews who are expected to consider other options based on the actual conditions of each excavation.	X			Procedural changes to adopt this method as the standard operational mode have already been taken. This method will be implemented whenever specific site conditions allow. Supervisors have started attaching work instructions to CMMS job cards.
3	The volume and carrying capacity of dump trucks commonly used in current excavation				Management has requested that fleet convert three existing 10 tonne dump

Appendix 2

Management Response: 2011 Audit of Watermain Repairs

Rec No	Recommendation	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: (Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)	Action Plan/ Time Frame
	projects contributes to unproductive wait times for City excavation resources, and can contribute to unnecessary overtime. Management should take the necessary steps to ensure the consistent use of larger 20 tonne dump trucks which will allow the City to save resource hours on each excavation.	X			<p>trucks to 20 tonne dump trucks at the first available opportunity.</p> <p>Fleet advises that the incremental cost per truck is about \$35,000 and the conversion can be completed over the next two years within existing Fleet capital allocations.</p> <p>In the interim, we will coordinate with Roads to utilize any of their existing 20 tonne trucks that may be available during non winter control periods.</p> <p>There will be additional operational fleet costs for a 20 tonne versus a 10 tonne truck. The fleet charges are approximately \$2,200 per month for a 20 tonne as opposed to \$2,036 per month for a 10 tonne. That works out to about \$2,000 a year per truck more or \$6000 for 3 trucks.</p>
4	Update the Standard Operating Procedures to reduce to a standard repair crew size to three				This recommendation has already been implemented as a pilot and the

Appendix 2

Management Response: 2011 Audit of Watermain Repairs

Rec No	Recommendation	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: (Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)	Action Plan/ Time Frame
	rather than four. The crew size can be reduced by 1.0 FTE (Relief Operator) on each excavation. Some exceptions may be required.	X			employee resources redeployed to other core operational work tasks.
5	During unproductive wait time, Management should consider scheduling preventative maintenance work within the same proximity of the job for the Operator B.	X			Management has begun scheduling preventative maintenance work in the area of the work site for the Operator B. This recommendation is scheduled to be fully implemented by the end of the second quarter of 2012.
6	Management should review the current process of dispatching entire crews to the job site. When safe to do so, less staff may be required to be dispatched to the work site until locate information is obtained, providing the opportunity to save resource hours.	X			Management has already begun to deploy the crews to and from work sites on an incremental basis as required by the site specific conditions and requirements.
7	Management must continue to improve and re-enforce the organizations commitment to internal controls intended to detect the abuse or falsification of overtime.	X			Management has implemented improved controls including improved pre-approval processes, increased time sheet documentation requirements and supervisory reviews, and spot checks of depot

Appendix 2

Management Response: 2011 Audit of Watermain Repairs

Rec No	Recommendation	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: (Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)	Action Plan/ Time Frame
					activity to detect and control abuse or falsification of overtime.
8	Allowing workers to work through their lunch does not provide value for money. This practice should be discouraged whenever possible unless required to improve service to the public.	X			Changes to work processes have been implemented to discourage working through lunch unless required to protect public health and safety.
9	Management should continue to work with the Union in order to explore the use of afternoon shifts and other non-dayshift options for Water/Wastewater work crews.	X			Management is actively continuing attempts to achieve consent from the Local Union to implement non-dayshift, non-weekday straight time shift opportunities.
10	Management should consider centralizing water/ wastewater operations. The location should have adequate storage for parts, stockpiles and meet all health and safety requirements. Centralization will enable the establishment of specialty teams, aid in supervision and employee deployment.	X			A list of requirements will be prepared to identify required improvements to the existing core depot or any new strategically located depot option that will reduce travel times, satisfy health & safety, indoor heated storage for parts & equipment, and other requirements to support centralized staff deployment and the specialty crew concept.

Management Response: 2011 Audit of Watermain Repairs

Rec No	Recommendation	Agree (X)	Disagree (X)	Management Comments: (Comments are required only for recommendations where there is disagreement.)	Action Plan/ Time Frame
11	Management should focus on the consolidation and rationalization of obsolete or overstocked repair parts and establish and maintain desired inventory levels for parts. Centralizing inventory will reduce costs of maintaining buildings, assist in ensuring parts are stored in a safe and organized manner, and that desired inventory levels are maintained.	X			<p>Management will emphasize rationalization of existing parts inventory and in association with the central depot concept above, develop a central inventory concept where parts will be stored in a safe and organized manner.</p> <p>Depletion of existing parts inventory will commence through 2012 and a centralized critical parts inventory will be coordinated with implementation of Recommendation 10 (Centralized Depot).</p>