

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide Council information following the public consultation process on the proposed Valley East Twin Pad Multipurpose Sports Complex including recommendations relating to recommended building program elements and a recommended site plan.

Executive Summary

As part of 2018 budget deliberations, Council received a business case for a Valley East Twin Pad arena. The business case identified the Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre location as a potential location for a new twin pad facility.

Yellowega Bélanger Salach Architecture (YBSA) was retained to conduct a community consultation process to gather input on the proposed facility and to confirm desired programming within the facility. YBSA has produced a Valley East Twin Pad Multipurpose Sports Complex which includes a summary of public consultation and a conceptual site design (Appendix A).

Key program elements of the proposed facility following the community consultation process are:

- Twin Pad Arena (NHL size rinks each with 400 seat capacity)
- 8 changerooms and referee changerooms per ice surface
- Gymnasium (multipurpose sports programming such as indoor soccer training, pickleball, roller hockey, exercise classes etc.)
- Daycare Administrative offices and Daycare services for Centre Pivot du Triangle Magique.
- Heated viewing area
- Café/ Restaurant/ Concessions
- Public Concourse / Lobby
- Support Spaces

YBSA has also provided a recommended schematic site plan based on community and stakeholder input. The recommended site plan considers the following:

- A new main entrance off of Domionon Drive.
- Proposed facility is situated close as possible to the existing Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre, soccer fields and library/Citizen Service Centre to create a community hub.
- Building does not disturb existing parkland.
- Building displaces existing day care building, which would be constructed new within the proposed facility.

The estimated cost for the proposed new facility is \$29M for construction costs and \$36M for total project costs.

Background

At the June 19, 2017 Community Services Committee meeting, resolution CS2017-16 was passed stating “that the City of Greater Sudbury Council directs staff to prepare a business case to replace various arenas and/or ice pads, with the build of a multi-pad/multi-purpose arena facility in Valley East, indicating the cost of the build, recommended location, efficiencies to be had, financial options for the build, and any/or all other information to assist Council with its deliberations, to be included in the 2018 budget process.”

As part of the 2018 budget process, Council received a business case for a Valley East Twin Pad arena. The business case identified the Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre location as a potential location for a new twin pad facility.

A report titled “Valley East Twin Pad Next Steps” was presented to the Community Services Committee on July 8, 2018. The report indicated that the City would engage a third party to complete community consultation and confirm facility programming.

Yellowega Bélanger Salach Architecture was awarded work through a competitive process. Scope of work included:

- Information Gathering (review relevant information, research other similar facility builds)
- Consultation (meet with community stakeholders, City staff and lead public consultation process)
- Produce a site schematic
- Provide preferred programming requirements
- Produce a final Report and present to the Community Services Committee

Public consultation sessions were held on March 30th at Capreol Community Centre/Arena, Centennial Community Centre/Arena, Raymond Plourde Arena and the Valley East Citizen Service Centre/Library. Residents also had opportunity to provide input online and through hard copy surveys from March 30th through April 23rd. A number of meetings were held with identified stakeholders as part of the process. The purpose of the stakeholder meetings and community consultation sessions were:

- To give the community an opportunity to provide input on the programming, design and characteristics of the proposed Valley East sports complex.
- To ensure the proposed Valley East sports complex meets the current and future needs of ice users.
- To hear public opinion about the proposed replacement of three existing single ice pads.
- To consult with sports associations and outdoor recreational groups to avoid potential conflict with existing indoor and outdoor uses of the Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre and to create synergies in building design and landscaping that may benefit both the City and stakeholders.

The attached report (Appendix 'A') from YBSA summarized input received from the community consultation process. Input received and research conducted was used to develop a list of recommended program elements of the proposed facilities and the development of a site plan schematic. The questionnaire used and full public consultation results can be found in Appendix B (YBSA report appendices).

Analysis

The attached report from YBSA (Appendix 'A') includes a recommended building program for the proposed Valley East Twin Pad Multipurpose Sports Complex. Based on new twin pad construction across Ontario and experience with the Gerry McCrory Countryside Sports Complex, the major program components being recommended are the following:

- Arena: 57,630 ft²
 - A twin-pad (2 NHL size 85' x 200' ice surfaces) with capability for summer ice.
 - 300-400 seating capacity per ice surface
 - 8 change rooms and referee room per ice surface
- Gymnasium: 6,727 ft²
 - Single Court Gymnasium with changerooms and support space
- Daycare: 19,200 ft²
 - Infant, Toddler and Preschool programs
 - Before and After Program
 - Early ON Centre
 - Offices
- Public Shared: 4,008 ft²
- Atrium / Lobby / Circulation: 4,200 ft²
- Support Function: 3,537 ft²

The proposed addition of licensed child care and early learning space in the project is a result of consultation with Children's Services staff and Centre Pivot du Triangle Magique (CPTM), the not-for-profit agency which owns and operates the early learning programs on the property. CPTM has expressed that there are some challenges with the existing building on the site related to layout and acoustics. CPTM recognizes that collaborating with the City and moving the operations into a multipurpose space, would create multiple benefits for families, who could access a range of co-located services. The co-location would create a number of synergies and potential cost savings between the daycare and recreation facilities. Incorporating the daycare within the proposed multipurpose sports complex will also allow flexibility to best use the site and would minimize any negative impact on existing greenspace.

The report indicates that a minimum of 10 acres of land required to accommodate the proposed 100,000 ft² building and necessary support facilities. The following site development criteria have been identified:

- 100,000 ft² building
- 10 acres required
- 400 Parking spaces
- Bus Layby
- Drop-off Layby
- Covered Entrance

The report confirms the Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre property as the recommended location for a new twin pad sports complex for the following reasons:

- There are 28 acres (11.3 hectares) of parkland on the site, providing room for an eight acre (3.2 hectare) footprint for the recreation complex, ample parking and complementary benefits. The site is municipally owned thereby reducing overall development costs.
- The Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre is the municipality's largest indoor pool and fitness centre. It is also the site of the Valley East Public Library and Citizen Service Centre.
- The addition of a twin pad arena will make this site a convenient one stop destination for multi-generational households. Residents would have a choice of accessing municipal services through the Citizen Service Centre, borrowing materials from the library, exercising in the pool and fitness facilities at the Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre, or skating and hockey in the new twin pad arena.
- Outdoors, the Howard Armstrong Recreation Centre has a variety of recreational opportunities with soccer fields, a basketball court, a splash pad and hiking trails. A new playground structure and two new courts for beach volleyball opened in 2019.
- Two existing arenas in the Valley East area are in need of major capital investments over the next 10 years to remain viable, making them logical candidates for closing.

The report includes an estimated cost for the proposed new facility of \$29,070,000 for construction costs and \$36,261,918 for total project costs. Other costs include professional and design fees, escalations and contingencies.

In addition to the report from YBSA, the following information is provided relating to Building Condition Assessments of existing facilities, operating and cost recovery information of existing facilities, ice utilization and ice pad provision levels. This information will be included as part of a future business case for the development of the proposed Valley East Twin Pad Multipurpose Sports Complex:

Building Condition Assessment Summary

Updated Building Condition Assessments (BCAs) were completed on area facilities in 2018. The BCA's provide an overall condition assessment for each facility, as well as opinions of probable repair costs required in the immediate term (1 to 5 years) and long term (6 to 10 years). Figures represent the estimated cost to maintain facilities in a good state of repair and do not include costs associated with enhancements or building improvements (modernization of spaces or full accessibility improvements). The following is a summary of the building condition assessments relating to Capreol (Side #1), Centennial and Raymond Plourde arenas. An estimated \$9.3M of capital funds are required to maintain the facilities over the next 10 years.

Facility	Construction Date	Building Condition	1 to 5 year Costs	6 to 10 year Costs	Replacement Cost
Capreol (Side #1)	1960	Fair Condition	\$1,292,300	\$559,340	\$13,819,120 to \$16,890,160
Centennial	1972	Fair Condition	\$3,159,985	\$1,561,400	\$10,339,663 to \$12,637,459
Raymond Plourde	1974	Fair Condition	\$1,154,500	\$1,574,200	\$8,710,981 to \$10,646,833
Sub Total			\$5,606,785	\$3,694,940	

Notes:

1. Replacement cost noted for Capreol represents estimated replacement cost of the entire Capreol Community Centre/Arena.

Operational Costs and Cost Recovery Information

Revenues, expenses, and resulting cost recovery rates for the operation of Capreol, Centennial and Raymond Plourde arenas for the year 2018 are provided below. For comparison, the business case for the Valley East Twin Pad presented as part of the 2018 budget projected annual revenues of \$746,750 and annual operating costs of \$949,679 for the proposed facility (78.6% cost recovery rate).

	Capreol	Centennial	Raymond Plourde
Total Revenues	\$265,201.21	\$204,419.33	\$251,664.07
Total Expenses	\$509,635.93	\$440,106.48	\$456,265.79
Salaries & Benefits	\$239,081.84	\$222,710.30	\$228,860.15
Operating	\$93,285.54	\$95,683.70	\$83,136.14
Energy	\$177,268.55	\$121,712.48	\$144,269.50
Cost Recovery	52.0%	46.5%	55.2%

Notes:

1. Revenues and operating costs for Capreol represent revenues and expenses associated with the operation of the entire Capreol Community Centre/Arena facility.

Ice Utilization

The following chart illustrates prime utilization at Capreol, Centennial and Raymond Plourde arenas. Overall prime utilization for all 16 ice pads also included for reference. Prime hours are defined as 5 p.m. to midnight, Mondays to Fridays and 8 a.m. to midnight, Saturdays and Sunday.

Location	2015-2016 Season	2016-2017 Season	2017-2018 Season	2018-2019 Season
Capreol Side #1	51.5%	45.5%	37.3%	37.3%
Capreol Side #2	68.7%	61.2%	63.4%	59.0%
Centennial	81.3%	75.4%	61.2%	58.2%
Raymond Plourde	82.8%	76.1%	81.3%	80.6%
Overall	80.3%	79.2%	77.5%	76.1%

Ice Pad Service Provision Level

The 2013 Arena Renewal Strategy established a market-specific demand target that reflected the City's unique geography and arena utilization profiles at that point in time. To identify needs at a city-wide level, the target was set at one ice pad per 405 youth registrants. During the 2018-2019 season there was a total of 5,892 participants. Based on the recommended target of one pad per 405 registrants, there is a city-wide demand for 14.5 rinks, indicating a surplus of approximately 1.5 pads.

As part of the City's participation in the Municipal Benchmarking Network Canada (MBNCanada) partnership, the City has comparator information about number of indoor ice pads operated by municipalities. The average number of operational indoor ice pads per 100,000 population is 5.14 among the 16 reporting municipalities. The City of Greater Sudbury operates 9.91 ice pads per 100,000 population.

Next Steps

The project will be considered for 2020 capital funding through the capital prioritization process and associated business case.

The Parks, Open Space and Leisure Master Plan Review (2014) states that the decision to close any arena should be accompanied by a community engagement process, capital lifecycle analysis, evaluation of alternate uses, and options for the continued delivery of leisure services within the affected community. Upon Council's approval of a new twin pad facility in Valley East a community engagement process would be initiated as per the Parks, Open Space and Leisure Master Plan.

Resources Cited

Valley East Twin Pad Next Steps, Community Services Committee (July 8, 2018)
<http://agendasonline.greatersudbury.ca/index.cfm?pg=agenda&action=navigator&id=1264&itemid=14525&lang=en>

Finalization of the 2018 Budget Appendix 5 – Valley East Twin Pad, Finance & Administration Committee (December 5, 2017)
<http://agendasonline.greatersudbury.ca/index.cfm?pg=feed&action=file&attachment=20991.pdf>

Arena Renewal Strategy, Community Services Committee (January 21, 2013)
<http://agendasonline.greatersudbury.ca/index.cfm?pg=feed&action=file&agenda=report&itemid=3&id=585>

City of Greater Sudbury Parks, Open Space & Leisure Master Plan Review (2014)
<https://www.greatersudbury.ca/city-hall/reports-studies-policies-and-plans/report-pdfs/parks-open-space-and-leisure-master-plan-review-2014/>