

Business Case for Service Level Change

Request/Project Name: Winter Maintenance of Non-Motorized Trails (Rotary Park)

Department: Community Development

Division: Leisure Services Division

Council Resolution (if applicable):

CC2019-05

I. Executive Summary

Overview of Proposal

At the City Council meeting of January 15, 2019, Council directed staff to prepare a business case for year round maintenance of any of the City's trails which provide active transportation connections, such as the Rotary Park trail and which would prioritize those trails commencing with the Rotary Park trail. The Rotary Park trail provides a 2.9 km community route which connects New Sudbury to Downtown Sudbury. Providing winter maintenance of the Rotary Park trail and other similar trail connections encourages active transportation as a viable alternative to motorized vehicles during the winter months.

II. Background

Current Service Level

The City currently maintains 173 km of non-motorized recreational trails. Non-motorized trails are maintained by Parks Services during the period from May 1st through October 31st. With the exception of the Jim Gordon Boardwalk (2 km) and the Delki Dozzi Track (1 km) non-motorized trails are not maintained during the winter months. The City has 1.07 km of maintained recreational trails per 1,000 persons (MBNCanada measure). The average of maintained kilometers of trail per 1,000 persons for MBNCanada municipalities is 0.52.

Drivers for Proposed Course of Action

A number of groups (Rainbow Routes Association, Sustainable Mobility Advisory Panel, etc.) have advocated for improving the walkability of our community. The City has made significant investments in improving active transportation opportunities in Greater Sudbury. A connection between New Sudbury and Downtown Sudbury would further advance active transportation routes in our community.

III. Recommendation

Categorize your specific request (mark an 'X' for all that apply):

| | | | |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------------------|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Change to base operating budget | <input type="checkbox"/> | Change to base FTE allocation |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | Change to fees (unit price) | <input type="checkbox"/> | Change to revenues (volume change) |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Investment in project (Operating) | <input type="checkbox"/> | Investment in project (Capital) |

Recommendation

At this time winter maintenance on the Rotary Park trail is only recommended. It is further recommended that a report be brought forward to the Community Services Committee in 2019 which provides considerations and a priority rating for the winter maintenance of remaining non-motorized trails in Greater Sudbury. The current maintenance standard of the Jim Gordon Boardwalk is the recommended service level for winter maintenance of non-motorized trails considered active transportation connections. The Jim Gordon Boardwalk is maintained 7 days per week during the off season with daily maintenance activities including inspection, plowing, sanding, clearing and litter pick up as required.

How does this align with Council's Strategic Plan?

| | | | |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> | Growth and Economic Development | <input type="checkbox"/> | Responsive, Fiscally Prudent, Open Governance |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Quality of Life and Place | <input type="checkbox"/> | Sustainable Infrastructure |

Non-motorized recreational trails provide recreational opportunities for residents to participate in healthy lifestyles. Winter maintenance of trails would provide active transportation alternatives in the community during the off season.

IV. Impact Analysis**Qualitative Implications**

Winter maintenance of non-motorized trails will improve walkability in our community by providing active transportation opportunities during the off season for residents.

Quantifiable Implications

Analysis of the current winter service standards of the Jim Gordon Boardwalk provide an estimated per km winter maintenance rate of \$20,000/km for the winter maintenance of non-motorized trails. This rate accounts for services provided November 1st through April 30th on non-motorized trails. Associated costs include equipment rental, fuel, staffing and materials. This business case contemplates the winter maintenance of the Rotary Park trail which is 2.9 km in length. The business case also includes a one-time investment of \$25,000 for necessary trail widening and build up to allow for equipment to be used for winter maintenance.

Operating Revenue - Incremental**Detail**

| Description | Duration | Revenue Source | 2019 \$ | 2020 \$ | 2021 \$ | 2022 \$ | 2023 \$ |
|--------------|----------|----------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | On-Going | | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| | One-Time | | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| Total | | | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |

Operating Expenditures - Incremental**Detail**

| Description | Duration | Funding Source | 2019 \$ | 2020 \$ | 2021 \$ | 2022 \$ | 2023 \$ |
|-------------------|----------|----------------|-----------|-------------|---------|---------|---------|
| Widening of trail | One-Time | Levy | \$ 25,000 | \$ (25,000) | | | |
| Labour | On-going | Levy | \$ 6,781 | \$ 13,339 | | | |
| Benefits | On-going | Levy | \$ 2,373 | \$ 4,669 | | | |
| Spring Sweeping | On-going | Levy | \$ 2,500 | \$ - | | | |
| Sand | On-going | Levy | \$ 2,500 | \$ - | | | |
| Vehicle Rental | On-going | Levy | \$ 8,714 | \$ 17,143 | | | |
| | On-Going | | \$ 22,868 | \$ 35,151 | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| | One-Time | | \$ 25,000 | \$ (25,000) | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| Total | | | \$ 47,868 | \$ 10,151 | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |

FTE Table

| Position | Bargaining Unit | Duration | Permanent / Part Time | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 |
|-----------------------------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Parks Services Trail Person | OW | On-going | PT Hours | 252 | 476 | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | Permanent | | - | - | - | - | - |
| | | PT Hours | | 252 | 476 | - | - | - |

| Net Impact | 2019 \$ | 2020 \$ | 2021 \$ | 2022 \$ | 2023 \$ |
|--------------|-----------|-------------|---------|---------|---------|
| On-Going | \$ 22,868 | \$ 35,151 | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| One-Time | \$ 25,000 | \$ (25,000) | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |
| Total | \$ 47,868 | \$ 10,151 | \$ - | \$ - | \$ - |

Implementation

For the purposes of this business case, winter maintenance of the Rotary Park trail has been considered. Upon approval of the business case, winter maintenance would commence November 1, 2019. It is further recommended that a report be brought forward to the Community Services Committee which provides considerations and a priority rating for the winter maintenance of remaining non-motorized trails in Greater Sudbury. Should Council want to consider additional winter trail maintenance as part of this business case, the estimated operational impact is \$20,000 per every additional kilometer maintained.

Advantages/Disadvantages

| Advantages | Disadvantages |
|---|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved walkability. Greater opportunities for active transportation during winter months. Promotion of healthy and active lifestyles. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Additional costs associated with maintaining non-motorized trails during the winter months. Additional capital costs may be required for certain non-motorized trails to be considered for winter maintenance. Trails located on third party lands may require amendments to land use agreements or other permissions to maintain during winter months. |

V. Alternatives**Alternatives Considered**

| Solution Options | Advantages/Disadvantages | Financial Impact |
|--|---|----------------------|
| Status Quo | Lack of walking opportunities and active transportation routes during the winter months. | |
| Contracting out of winter maintenance of trails. | Upon approval of the business case, staff will explore potential contracting out of services to determine if it would be more cost effective. | Unknown at this time |