



GREATER SUDBURY PUBLIC LIBRARY AND ART GALLERY OF SUDBURY

Co-Location Facility and Business Plan Final Report

Prepared by:
Lord Cultural Resources
and
Susan Kent Consulting
Altus Group Limited

December 2017

Lord Cultural Resources is a global professional practice dedicated to creating cultural capital worldwide.

We assist people, communities and organizations to realize and enhance cultural meaning and expression.

We distinguish ourselves through a comprehensive and integrated full-service offering built on a foundation of key competencies: visioning, planning and implementation.

We value and believe in cultural expression as essential for all people. We conduct ourselves with respect for collaboration, local adaptation and cultural diversity, embodying the highest standards of integrity, ethics and professional practice.

We help clients clarify their goals; we provide them with the tools to achieve those goals; and we leave a legacy as a result of training and collaboration.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	1
1. Introduction.....	6
1.1 Background to and Purpose of this Study	6
1.2 Scope of Work and Methodology	4
2. Contextual and Comparables Analyses.....	6
2.1 Key Issues From Literature Review of Cultural Co-Locations.....	6
2.2 Experience of Selected Specific Public Library and Art Gallery Co-Locations	9
2.3 The Art Gallery/Museum Marketplace	15
2.4 The Public Library Marketplace.....	19
3. Operations and Market Analyses.....	25
3.1 Existing Operations of the Co-Locating Institutions.....	25
3.2 Potential Markets.....	28
4. Key Recommendations/Assumptions Underlying Projections for Co-Located GSPL/AGS...37	
4.1 Core Elements of the Co-Location.....	37
4.2 Site.....	38
4.3 Spaces and Facilities	39
4.4 Staffing	44
4.5 Operating Schedule.....	46
4.6 Admission Charges	47
4.7 Revenue Centres	47
4.8 Marketing.....	49
4.9 Options/Recommendations for Future of Existing Main Branch of GSPL and Bell Mansion Sites	50
4.10 Bell Mansion Property	50
4.11 Other Assumptions	51
5. Financial Analysis.....	75
5.1 Capital Cost Estimate	75
5.2 Attendance, Operating Revenue and Expense Projections.....	87
Appendix A: Acknowledgments	A-1
Appendix B: Literature Review Bibliography.....	B-1
Appendix C: Detailed Capital Cost Estimate	C-1

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Greater Sudbury Public Library (GSPL) and the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS) have served the city and region well for many years. It has long been recognized that the buildings they occupy suffer from substantial deficiencies and there has been substantial levels of deferred maintenance in both as they have awaited implementation of new facilities.

The concept of co-location of the GSPL and AGS has been identified as a way to reduce capital and operating costs relative to separate facilities and thereby increase the likelihood of implementation of needed new facilities. A potential co-location is also intended to achieve potential synergies and benefits for both institutions, the City of Greater Sudbury and the region it serves. The benefits to the two institutions include crossover visits and joint programming initiatives to help create a community hub.

The co-location takes into account that the Greater Sudbury Public Library is a division of the City of Greater Sudbury that offers free access whereas the Art Gallery of Sudbury is an independent not-for-profit institution that has charged for admissions, public programs and facility rentals. Each has a different governance and funding structure that will need to be maintained and hours of operation that differ as well. This planning study has sought to mitigate the differences between the two organizations while recognizing the reality of them.

The conclusions and recommendations in this study were based on a literature review about the experience of public library and art gallery co-locations in other cities, as well as contextual, comparables and market analyses and a site evaluation process. The core elements of the co-location summarized here are based on these analyses, the direction that emerged from two vision/assumptions workshops with the Library and Gallery Boards and senior staff, the interview process and the judgment and experience of the consultants:

- A single building will be constructed and owned by the City of Greater Sudbury on behalf of the Greater Sudbury Public Library to include space leased to the Art Gallery of Sudbury.
- The co-location will result in less space than would be required in two separate facilities, resulting in lower unit capital and operating costs, as well as the sharing of some spaces.
- The size of the overall building, as detailed below, is assumed to be 61,800 net sq. ft. of useable space which 18,000 net sq. ft. is dedicated space for the AGS, plus access to some spaces of the Library. (The 2010 study for an independent Art Gallery of Sudbury assumed 33,000 net sq. ft. for the AGS while an internal study for the GSPL estimated 57,000 net sq. ft.) At this pre-design stage a grossing factor of 50% has been applied to account for circulation, mechanical and electrical spaces and wall thicknesses, leading to 92,700 gsf of space.

- Two charts follow. The first is for the existing space in the Main Branch of the Greater Sudbury Public Library, which totals 25,516 net square feet of useable space. This is compared to the assumed space for the new Main Branch. Excluding the AGS the Main Branch will grow to 43,800 net sq. ft. Including the AGS the building is 61,800 net sq. ft. The second chart compares the spaces of the existing AGS in the Bell Mansion at 6,749 net sq. ft. of interior space plus access to outdoor opportunities on that site. The interior space for the Gallery within the Main Branch is assumed to increase to 18,000 nsf with uncertainty regarding outdoor opportunities.

GSPL - Main Branch Total - Square Feet by Area	Existing Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Assumed New Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.
Area 1: Entry Level Lobby Spaces	1,332	7,500
Area 2: Meeting Rooms	1,071	5,550
Area 3: Age Level Service Spaces	14,264	22,900
Area 4: Staff Spaces	8,849	7,850
Total New Main Branch Excluding AGS (Net Sq Ft.)	25,516	43,800
Total New AGS Facilities (Net Sq Ft.)		18,000
Total New Main Branch Including AGS (Net Sq Ft.)		61,800

Art Gallery of Sudbury Total Sq Ft. by Zone	Existing Space Net Sq Ft	New AGS Net Sq Ft
Zone A: Public Service/Program	1,994	2,850
Zone B: Public Collection Space	2,193	6,000
Zone C: Non-Public Collection Spaces	1,241	5,480
Zone D: Non-Public Non-Collection Spaces	1,321	3,670
Total Indoor Net Sq Ft.	6,749	18,000
Existing Outdoor Space	8,280	N/A
Total Indoor and Outdoor Net Sq Ft.	15,029	18,000

- The separate missions, governance and staffing structures and sources of operating revenues of the GSPL as a municipal public library and AGS as an independent art gallery will continue.
- The AGS will have its own clear identity within the building and on the basis of exterior signage.
- More space, exhibitions, programming and marketing expenditures and an increase in staffing levels will substantially exceed the earned income opportunities for the AGS in the co-located facility.

- This study recommends that the City's cash operating contribution for the AGS remain at the current \$200,000 level based on the following recommendations/ assumptions that assume in-kind City support for the Gallery:
 - Space will be leased by the City of Greater Sudbury to AGS on a long-term basis at one dollar per year. This represents substantial value provided by the City to the AGS.
 - AGS will retain its own independent governance as a long-term tenant within the space, including its own Board and staff, including internal security.
 - As in-kind rather than cash support to AGS, the City of Greater Sudbury as owner of the building will pay for all building occupancy costs (utilities, repairs and maintenance, insurance) and staff associated with these requirements to include spaces occupied by the AGS.
 - Evening rentals of the lobby space will take place only from Friday to Sunday evenings when the Library is closed to the public. On other evenings when the Library is open until 9 pm there will be no lobby rentals. This allows for a shared lobby as opposed to separate lobbies.
 - Lobby rentals income will go to AGS while revenue from rental of the multi-purpose and meeting rooms within the GSPL will go to the Library.
 - Revenue from the gift shop will go to AGS, which will also bear the staffing and operating costs of the retail operation.
 - AGS will seek to raise as much in capital funding from private and non-municipal government sources as possible.
 - Although it will only be a long-term tenant in the building, the AGS should be able to generate several million dollars of senior government capital funding as well as private support that will help to limit the capital investment of the City of Greater Sudbury in the GSPL building.
 - The AGS will offer the value achieved by receiving the Mastin collections of Carmichael works of art valued at \$3.5 million, which would otherwise be lost to Greater Sudbury.
 - It is also assumed that AGS will seek to develop an endowment to support operations.

A **site evaluation** process was conducted by a team of City staff and Board members of the Public Library of Greater Sudbury and the Art Gallery of Sudbury, with input from the consultant. The evaluation process included site tours, collection and analysis of data regarding each of five sites that were short-listed for more detailed analysis, the identification of evaluation criteria and a weighting and rating system, all culminating in an all-day evaluation workshop.

The results of the evaluation led to identification of the Sudbury Community Arena as the highest ranked site assuming demolition and new construction on that site to offer the primary benefit of new, purpose-built construction. That being said, there are also uncertainties regarding the timeliness of implementation.

Both institutions will require an increase in **staff levels** to better meet their responsibilities in the new facilities. This includes an additional 3 FTE for the GSPL and the AGS is recommended to add 4.4 FTE positions, of which 2.0 FTE are reinstatements of staff laid off. The report also includes recommendations associated with operating schedules, revenue centres and marketing. And it includes options and recommendations for what to do with the Mackenzie Library and Bell Mansion properties.

The **capital costs** associated with new build on the Sudbury Community Arena site are about \$42 million for the construction and related costs of the co-located facility plus \$4.5 million for decommissioning and demolishing the existing building, for a total of \$46.5 million, plus exclusions set out. Potential capital funding sources are set out in the report.

As is common for all public libraries in Canada, the **capital funding** of the new Greater Sudbury Public Library will be primarily from the financial resources of the City of Greater Sudbury. However, there are available senior government capital funding sources available to public libraries and especially to public art galleries described in the report. In fact, the inclusion of the Art Gallery of Sudbury within the facility will increase the likelihood of and amounts that may be achieved for the co-located project from senior government sources and especially from private support.

Regarding **operation of the Main Branch of the Greater Sudbury Public Library**, the following table summarizes the projections of operating revenues and expenses assuming a new facility at the site of the current Sudbury Community Arena, within which the Art Gallery of Sudbury will be a long-term tenant. The bottom line of the data indicates the additional amount that will be required from government sources to break even on operations each year. The data indicate the need for a rounded additional \$1,150,000 in Year 1, in large part to reflect investment in needed new technology, \$844,000 in Year 2 and about \$992,000 in Year 3, which would be reflective of subsequent years of operation.

Summary of Revenues and Expenses for GSPL - Main Branch					
Revenues	Total GSPL	Main Branch	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Provincial Grants and Subsidies	\$413,240	\$120,972	\$120,972	\$120,972	\$120,972
User Fees	\$157,862	\$39,000	\$51,714	\$52,748	\$53,803
Contributions from Reserve and Capital	\$143,439	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other Revenues	\$5,464	\$5,464	\$5,500	\$5,500	\$5,500
Additional Rentals Income	\$0	\$0	\$25,000	\$28,000	\$30,000
City Allocation	\$7,626,490	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301
Total Revenues	\$8,346,495	\$3,262,737	\$3,300,487	\$3,304,521	\$3,307,576
Operating Costs	Total GSPL	Main Branch	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Staffing Costs	\$5,135,976	\$2,003,520	\$2,266,229	\$2,334,214	\$2,404,242
Materials and Operating Expenses	\$1,677,379	\$776,929	\$1,042,468	\$1,113,317	\$1,185,583
Energy Costs	\$236,355	\$67,742	\$189,540	\$189,540	\$189,540
Purchased/Contract Services	\$11,686	\$0	\$500,000	\$50,000	\$50,000
Debt Repayment	\$143,439	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Contribution to Reserve and Capital	\$168,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Internal Recoveries	\$973,660	\$414,546	\$452,337	\$461,384	\$470,611
Total Costs	\$8,346,495	\$3,262,737	\$4,450,574	\$4,148,455	\$4,299,976
Additional Amount Required from Government Sources to Break Even		\$0	-\$1,150,087	-\$843,934	-\$992,399

For operation of the Art Gallery of Sudbury, on-site attendance levels are estimated to grow from the base level rounded 12,000 annual visitors in the current Bell Mansion facility to 60,000 in the opening year, 55,000 in Year 2 and 50,000 in the stabilized Year 3. The attendance levels are based on free (pay what you can) admissions each year with the exception of Year 2 when a fixed admission 3-month major temporary exhibition is assumed.

We project, assuming free rent and that most building occupancy costs will be absorbed by the GSPL, that the operating budget in a larger, better staffed and operated AGS will increase from the base level \$635,000 to the range of \$908,000 to \$1,053,000 over the three years projected. With no phasing, Year 3 will be a stabilized year representative of subsequent years of operation.

The projected earned income and continuation of existing levels of government, endowment and private support minus operating expenses would leave an additional amount required from government, endowment and private sources to break even ranging from about \$65,000 to \$105,000 per year. Given an objective to limit the cash operating support from the City of Greater Sudbury to the current \$200,000 per year, it will be important that the AGS initiate an endowment fund drive and seek to increase annual private support for the new Gallery as well as additional support for operations from other levels of government.

Summary of Projections for Art Gallery of Sudbury (Franklin Carmichael Art Gallery) within Greater Sudbury Public Library					Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
					Base Level	Year 1 %	Year 2 %	Year 3 %
Total Attendance (rounded)					12,000	60,000	55,000	50,000
Revenues (excluding in-Kind support)								
Pay What You Can Admissions					\$5,810	\$36,000	\$22,000	\$22,500
Fixed Admissions for Major Exhibition					\$0	\$0	\$59,811	\$0
Retail Sales					\$33,600	\$120,000	\$137,500	\$104,000
Membership					\$3,400	\$15,000	\$21,000	\$14,300
Educational and Public Programs					\$88,800	\$155,400	\$158,508	\$161,678
Rentals					\$3,200	\$20,000	\$24,480	\$29,131
Fundraising Events (net)					\$13,900	\$20,000	\$35,000	\$22,000
Other Earned					\$11,600	\$15,000	\$16,000	\$17,000
Existing Endowment					\$20,000	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$20,000
Existing Private Support					\$53,000	\$53,000	\$53,000	\$53,000
Existing Government Support					\$400,000	\$400,000	\$400,000	\$400,000
Total Revenue (rounded)					\$633,310	\$854,400	\$947,299	\$843,609
Expenses (excluding depreciation)								
Salaries, Wages, Benefits					\$332,800	\$476,475	\$489,630	\$482,615
Occupancy					\$96,000	\$2,000	\$4,000	\$5,000
Exhibitions					\$53,500	\$146,400	\$242,400	\$146,400
Programs					\$23,976	\$62,160	\$55,478	\$56,587
Conservation/Curatorial					\$47,400	\$70,000	\$60,000	\$60,000
General & Administrative					\$39,300	\$52,412	\$53,859	\$53,088
Marketing					\$9,800	\$36,000	\$44,000	\$30,000
Cost of Fundraising					\$11,000	\$15,800	\$27,650	\$17,380
Retail Cost of Goods Sold					\$21,700	\$66,000	\$75,625	\$57,200
Total Expenses (rounded)					\$635,476	\$927,247	\$1,052,642	\$908,270
Amount Required to Break Even from Additional Government, Endowment and Private Sources					(\$2,166)	(\$72,847)	(\$105,343)	(\$64,661)
					-0.3%	-7.9%	-10.0%	-7.1%

1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter summarizes the background to, purpose and methodology of this facility and business plan study for the co-location of the Greater Sudbury Public Library (GSPL) and the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS). Although it is assumed that the Art Gallery of Sudbury will be renamed the Franklin Carmichael Art Gallery in the future, we have retained the AGS name for the purposes of this study.

1.1 BACKGROUND TO AND PURPOSE OF THIS STUDY

The mission of the Greater Sudbury Public Library is as follows:

The Greater Sudbury Public Library strives to enrich the lives of individuals and the spirit of the community by providing the highest quality library service to our citizens in their quest to read, learn, educate and dream. We support all members of the community by providing equitable access to a wide variety of information sources and literature.

The mission of the Art Gallery of Sudbury is:

The Art Gallery of Sudbury provides access to, and understanding, knowledge and appreciation of the visual arts. We are dedicated to achieving excellence in all of our activities, including the collection, exhibition, preservation and promotion of art for the community of Sudbury.

Both institutions are focused very much on community service and both have long outgrown their current deficient facilities – the 1907 Bell Mansion that has been the home of the AGS since 1967 and the Mackenzie Main Branch of the GSPL, which was constructed in 1952.

Focusing on the older Bell Mansion building first, it has always had severe limitations as a site and facility for the **Art Gallery of Sudbury** since when it occupied the building as a centennial project in 1967. A facility analysis prepared by Lord Cultural Resources in 2010 concluded that it was no longer cost-effective to consider retrofitting the Bell Mansion for the following main reasons:

- The gallery space is too small for exhibitions of sufficient impact to generate sufficient public interest. The overall building is only 9,122 gross square feet. Even when used together, the two galleries at 2,193 net sq. ft. offer less than most galleries do just for temporary exhibitions of quality and importance. Programming space is limited to an attic studio at only 960 nsf and library of 420 sq. ft. There is clearly insufficient space for exhibitions, public and educational programs.

- The Bell Mansion provides insufficient space for storage of the Gallery's permanent collection. An on-site vault is only 291 sq. ft. with additional storage of 374 sq. ft. in the garage, 145 sq. ft. in the basement and 376 sq. ft. in three eaves. The present tiny storage space is among the most crowded and unsatisfactory spaces that Lord Cultural Resources has encountered. The works in the Gallery's collection that were acquired by Laurentian University are stored in the University's Library building in 576 sq. ft., and there is no way to bring them into the Bell Mansion.
- Since the AGS has a Category A designation under the Cultural Property Act, it is required to meet specific legal, collections management and environmental requirements to properly care for, preserve and make publicly accessible, objects or collections that are of "outstanding significance and national importance". Due to storage and exhibition space challenges, the AGS currently does not meet all the requirements.
- The Class A designation qualifies the Gallery to receive major traveling exhibitions however, the existing AGS does not have the space to exhibit major exhibitions, nor the space for the requisite shipping-receiving and exhibition handling facilities.
- The building systems would have to be substantially upgraded for the Bell Mansion to continue operating as a Class A Gallery, but it would be a questionable investment, since the result would still be a building that cannot serve its purpose for the citizens of Greater Sudbury.
- The layout of the Bell Mansion is convoluted and vertical, so that additions would only compound the problem.
- The location of the Bell Mansion is extremely disadvantageous for the Gallery, placing a public facility in a residential area. This limits crossover with retail, restaurant and other cultural institutions that have benefitted from synergy with art galleries in downtown areas of other cities. Location in a residential area also limits opportunities for evening functions and other rentals that would likely draw complaints from neighbours. Furthermore, it is located in what is perceived to be a more 'exclusive' or 'upscale' part of the city, thus intimidating some potential visitors from the Greater Sudbury Area who perceive it as for the elite.

It is now eight years later and the condition of the Bell Mansion has only worsened. The need for a new facility also relates very much to an offer by the grandchildren of famed Group of Seven artist, Franklin Carmichael, to donate 30 works of art valued at \$3.5 million plus \$100,000 in cash to the AGS assuming it has new facilities. That donation is at risk every year that goes by without implementation.

The Main Branch of the **Greater Sudbury Public Library** facility on Mackenzie Street in the downtown was originally constructed in 1952 with an addition in 1976. It is 25,516 net square feet of usable or 32,772 gross sq. ft. in size, taking circulation, mechanical and electrical space into account. A building condition report prepared in 2012 concluded that "some of the components of the building are not in a state of good repair. Major capital outlay is required to ensure the viability of this facility."¹ Deficiencies cited include:

- The building envelope, including the reinforced columns and roof cladding, windows and exit and service doors.

¹ *Building Condition Assessment Mackenzie Main Library* (Construction Control, Inc., November 2012).

- HVAC systems, including the hydraulic boiler, air handling units, condensers and associated piping and valves, some of which include asbestos insulation.

The capital investment required within a decade was estimated at over \$1 million, of which close to \$600,000 was required within one to five years. Most of the recommended changes have not been implemented and so deferred maintenance continues to build up.

A 2014 report by Yallowega Belanger Architects and observations by library specialist Susan Kent identified a variety of other deficiencies associated with parking, public programming spaces, workspace and storage. These include:

- Inadequate number of parking spaces during peak periods to serve both visitors and staff.
- Spaces have substantial temperature variations with some too cold and others too warm.
- Poor quality public washrooms.
- Lack of space for larger events requires them to be held in the lounge and therefore disruptive to the regular activities of the library.
- Public meeting rooms that are too small and have no natural light.
- Inadequate storage space.
- Poor quality work spaces.
- A children's area that is too small and that does not provide space for program activities.
- Poor layout and adjacencies that are confusing to the library user.
- Broken up floor spaces and lack of natural flow from one area of library to other
- Lack of quiet spaces, study rooms and meeting rooms for small and large groups.

The concept of co-location of the GSPL and AGS has been identified as a way to reduce capital and operating costs relative to separate facilities and thereby increase the likelihood of implementation of needed new facilities. A potential co-location is also intended to achieve potential synergies and benefits for both institutions, the City of Greater Sudbury and the region it serves. The benefits to the two institutions include crossover visits and joint programming initiatives to help create a community hub. One of the benefits to Greater Sudbury heard in the interview process includes helping to build upon the success of Science North in helping to change the image of Sudbury as a mining town to one that is pursuing creativity and innovation.

However, the co-location must take into account that the Greater Sudbury Public Library is a division of the City of Greater Sudbury that offers free access whereas the Art Gallery of Sudbury is an independent not-for-profit institution that has charged for admissions, public programs and facility rentals. Each has a different governance and funding structure that will need to be maintained and hours of operation that differ as well. This study seeks to mitigate the differences between the two organizations while recognizing the reality of them.

It must also be emphasized that governance of the Greater Sudbury Library includes responsibility for the Greater Sudbury Museums, which form the building blocks in preserving, exhibiting and interpreting important collections. Greater Sudbury Museums includes four small community history museums.

Three of the four are located on heritage properties and the fourth is located in the Azilda Gilles Pelland Library that functions as a temporary exhibit space. Anderson Farm Museum is located on a 14-acre site in Lively and once served as a dairy farm owned by Finnish immigrants while the Copper Cliff Museum is housed in a log cabin of the very first homestead in the community. The museum depicts the lifestyle of a miner's family in the area. The Flour Mill Museum was constructed in 1902 and the museum celebrates the life and history of the Franco-Ontarian community in the Flour Mill area. The new Main Library can serve to inform and orient visitors to these museums.

The study is led by Ted Silberberg, the Lord Cultural Resources Senior Principal responsible for Market and Financial Planning, assisted by Library specialist Susan Kent, capital cost consultant Mel Yungblut from the Altus Group, Lord Senior Consultant Marina Ramirez (facility planning), Communications and Marketing Specialist Sarah Hill, and Research Consultants Rebecca Frerotte and Maureen Marshall.

1.2 SCOPE OF WORK AND METHODOLOGY

In order to meet the objectives of this study we carried out the following work elements. We:

- Reviewed and analyzed background material provided to us as well as additional data that we gathered. This includes facility, collections, operational and financial data provided by each of the institutions along with previous planning studies:
 - Concept Development and Business Plan for the Art Gallery of Sudbury: Franklin Carmichael Art Gallery (Lord Cultural Resources, December 2010)
 - Building Condition Assessment Mackenzie Main Library (Construction Control Inc, November 2012)
 - *Franklin Carmichael Art Centre* (Moriyama and Teshima, December 2013)
 - The City of Greater Sudbury Main Library, Archives, and Heritage Museum Complex: Program Development and Site Selection Parameters (Yallowega Belanger Architects, October 2014)
- Toured the GSPL and AGS sites and facilities.
- Facilitated a Visioning/Assumptions Workshop that brought together board members and senior staff of the GSPL and AGS.
- Conducted a literature search/ environmental scan associated with shared cultural facilities, a contextual analysis to establish benchmarks for art galleries and public libraries as well as research regarding comparable co-locations of public libraries and art galleries/museums in Canada and the United States. The analyses are set out in Chapter 2.
- Analyzed data and interview feedback regarding the market for the existing AGS and GSPL operations, as well as potential resident, school and tourist markets for Sudbury, as set out in Chapter 3.
- Prepared an Interim Report, which detailed the analyses, conclusions and recommendations in this study. The recommendations and assumptions associated with the co-located facility are in Chapter 4 based on meetings to finalize the assumptions that underlie the projections of attendance, operating revenues and expenses for a co-located GSPL/AGS in the Main Branch and includes capital cost estimates and potential capital funding sources assuming a specific site and new construction on it.

- A Draft Final Report was submitted and subsequently reviewed at a meeting to discuss it. This led to modifications and this Final Report.

Bold italics are used throughout the document to highlight key findings, conclusions and recommendations.

2. CONTEXTUAL AND COMPARABLES ANALYSES

The contextual and comparables analyses in this chapter focus on lessons learned and benchmarks to help guide the recommendations and projections in Chapter 5 of this study. The analysis includes:

- A literature review associated with cultural facility co-locations, with a preference for those involving public libraries and museums;
- An environmental scan or comparables analysis focused on selected specific public library/ art gallery co-locations;
- Art gallery/museum trends and consideration of the overall museums marketplace in Ontario, Canada and the United States in comparison to data for the existing AGS;
- Public library trends and comparison of data for the Greater Sudbury Public Library to the public libraries of the other major cities in Northern Ontario – North Bay, Sault Ste. Marie and Thunder Bay.

2.1 KEY ISSUES FROM LITERATURE REVIEW OF CULTURAL CO-LOCATIONS

This section includes a review of selected available literature associated with co-location of cultural facilities, with preference given to those involving public libraries and museums and art galleries and the potential applicability to the GSPL/AGS co-location. The bibliography of sources used is set out at in Appendix B.

In 1991 Victor J. Donolov wrote the first comprehensive article on shared Museum/ Cultural Complexes in which there are shared or co-located facilities but that retain separate identities. In his article he discusses that while this was once a rare occurrence it would become more common. Through the lens of nine case studies he discusses both single building and adjacent building initiatives related to co-location. The key characteristics identified include:

- Most of the examples cited are smaller communities without large cultural institutions.
- Reasons for shared or co-located facilities are:
 - Increasing the likelihood for better facilities for the participating cultural organizations than if they were fully separate;

- Cost efficiencies in capital development and operations;
- More effective mechanism for raising funds, handling building management and providing shared services;
- Maximizing limited resources;
- Enhancing the community's cultural image and assisting the area's economic development efforts;
- Establishing a greater museum/cultural core that will attract and serve more resident and tourist visitors.
- The main obstacles to such shared or co-located complexes are as follows:
 - Higher level of funding that becomes necessary to develop such a facility relative to competition between the institutions that might see only one institution implemented;
 - The resistance of participating organizations to relinquish partial control associated with a co-location; and
 - The problems of diverse cultural organizations once fully independent in working together and understanding each other's needs.

In 2001 Karen A. Donsief wrote on the topic of "Joint-Use Libraries: Balancing Autonomy and Cooperation." The study was based on the case example of the Harmony Library in Fort Collins Colorado, which was the combination of an academic library and a public library in a single facility. According to Donsief, in planning this library the partners carefully crafted a common vision and then examined their own libraries and expectations, identifying the areas in which they needed to maintain control and those in which they could operate less independently.

Using examples from over four years of experience at Harmony Library, Donsief shows how balancing the need for control with the opportunities for cooperation is an ongoing, delicate process enhanced by constant communication and coordination. Such communication and coordination will clearly be required for the GSPL/AGS co-location but the challenge is greater than at Fort Collins, in which both were libraries while in Greater Sudbury it is a public library and an independent public art gallery.

Donsief's article establishes three types or levels of co-located facilities: minimal integration (co-location of facilities with individual services maintained separately), selective integration (sharing of some specific projects or departments), and full integration (in which both organizations share one mission and governance). The GSPL/AGS co-location is likely to be primarily "minimal", according to this definition, but includes elements of selective integration in regard to public programming and some shared spaces.

In 2003 Juris Dilevko and Lisa Gottlieb began writing about the idea of Museum and Library convergence, first with the article "Resurrecting a Neglected Idea: The Reintroduction of Library-Museum Hybrids." This was followed by the publication of their book the following year, *The Evolution of Library Museum Partnerships: Historical Antecedents, Contemporary Manifestations and Future Directions*. Dilevko and Gottlieb's work focuses on the intellectual connection between these two institutional types. They note that the Institute of Museum and Library Services' grants in 1996 began to encourage the collaboration between these two silos of institutions particularly around the intellectual management of their collections, and digitization of resources.

In 2006 Bruce Monley wrote about the co-location phenomenon and trend in Queensland Australia. He observed that stand-alone libraries had become a rarity in the preceding 10 years in rural Queensland. Instead libraries were being co-located with government service delivery, tourist facilities, including heritage, museums or galleries. The article includes survey responses from 17 respondents in co-located facilities. The key results were as follows:

- Over half of the respondents were co-located in new buildings, the rest into renovated buildings.
- The majority of the buildings were funded by local governments, but federal and special funding sources were also used.
- All but three of those studied increased their opening hours in the new facilities.
- All libraries experienced increases in membership in most cases greater than could be expected from natural growth. The most dramatic was an eleven fold increase.
- All libraries offering other services to the local community reported that co-location had resulted in increased awareness of the library by non-users.
- Changes to patterns of library usage noted an increased usage of newspapers, reference collection and computers, increased local and family history research, increased school visitation using IT facilities and galleries.
- The majority of respondents said there were no negative impacts, they were just busier.

The International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions (IFLA) commissioned a study by Alexandra Yarrow, Barbara Clubb and Jennifer-Lynn Draper in 2008 which examined the trends in collaboration and cooperation among public libraries, archives and museums. They concluded that in many cases the shared or similar missions of the institutions reviewed make them ideal partners in collaborative ventures. Different types of collaborative projects were examined, including exhibits, community programs, digital resources and joint-use facilities.

The report also outlines a start to finish approach for a successful collaboration and best practices. Among the useful insights are the following points:

- **Stage 1- Preplanning-** ensuring alignment between partner's goals, understanding, and commitment to the project is key to advancing to the planning stage.
- **Stage 2- Planning-** during this stage it is important to ensure adequate representation from all partners, and to market the partnership to peers, management and other involved to ensure buy-in both externally and internally.
- **Stage 3- Implementation-** continue to invite input and be open to change and adaptation of the collaboration as it progresses.
- **Stage 4- Evaluation-** at a suitable marker it is essential to evaluate the success of the collaboration and use both quantitative and qualitative inputs to evaluate.
- **Stage 5- Share your experience-** publishing or presenting on the collaboration at conferences or on the web will allow the hard work and success of your project to guide and influence future efforts.

Published in 2011, Jo Oliver's article "A Practical Partnership: Library, Museum and Family History Society Cooperation in Camden NSW" (New South Wales Australia) focuses on the Camden Council Library Service, the Camden Museum operated by Camden Historical Society and the Camden Area Family History Society. All are co-located in the centre of the historic town of Camden on the semirural fringe of Sydney. These three organizations worked in partnership guided by a memorandum of understanding. The article outlines how this complex came to be through a Camden Council library strategic plan, and goal of becoming a community hub. The partnership credits its success to the co-location of the services and mutual respect amongst the participating organizations.

Leith Robinson also takes a case study approach in the article "Library and Cultural Service Convergence: A Case Study of the City of Wanneroo, Western Australia." The resulting Waneroo Library and Cultural Centre is a strong endorsement of local government pursuing convergence, with the construction of the building transforming and improving communities, physical and virtual collections, skills and practices, and achieving quantitative and qualitative benefits, such as higher levels of efficiency and satisfaction.

The only article found that took a negative perspective on the topic of co-location is called "The Canadian Disease: The Ethics of Library Archives and Museum Convergence" by Braden Cannon. It was published in 2013 and takes a critical stance on the convergence practices in Canada and abroad. According to Cannon, much of the literature on convergence is couched in business terminology that favours top-down management approaches and works to create non-democratic structures with more power in fewer hands, with many of the pro-convergence arguments having little to no evidential support. Cannon further believes that many real-life examples of Library, Archives and Museum convergence have been problematic and under-examined in the literature.

2.2 EXPERIENCE OF SELECTED SPECIFIC PUBLIC LIBRARY AND ART GALLERY CO-LOCATIONS

In considering a potential co-location between the Greater Sudbury Public Library and the Art Gallery of Sudbury it is useful to consider existing library/gallery co-locations. We sought examples of public art galleries that are of a similar size to spaces allocated to public libraries in co-located facilities but could not find any. Similarly, we sought out examples of art galleries that charged admission in a co-located facility with a public library and could not find any either. In all cases, the art galleries are relatively small and even when they have a separate governance appear to be part of the public library. As shown in Chapter 4, the recommended size of the AGS space within the GSPL is much more substantial and will therefore help it to maintain an independent identity.

The following co-locations were identified and researched:

- The Grimsby Public Library and Grimsby Public Art Gallery
- Idea Exchange (formerly the Cambridge Libraries and Galleries)
- Oakville Galleries Og2 at the Oakville Public Library
- Dunlop Art Gallery at the Regina Public Library
- San Diego Central Public Library and Art Gallery

2.2.1 Grimsby Public Library and Grimsby Public Art Gallery

The Grimsby Public Library (GPL) and Grimsby Public Art Gallery (GPAG) are separate entities within the same 21,300 sq. ft. building that was purpose-built for the library and art gallery in 2004 by the Town of Grimsby. The Gallery was founded as an independent not-for-profit in 1975 and became a department of the Town in 1999. The space in the building is primarily allocated to the public library as the GPAG includes only 3,500 sq. ft., of dedicated space of which 1,600 sq. ft. is exhibition space. The relatively small building complex reflects the modest size of the Grimsby population at less than 28,000 residents.



Image: Exterior of Grimsby Public Library and Art Gallery
Source: Pinterest

The Library and Gallery operate with separate advisory boards and have largely separate spaces and employees. The shared spaces are the entrance, lobby, public washrooms and a meeting/studio room. The only shared staff are custodians and security personnel. Operating budgets are separate with the exception of shared hydro, water and heating costs. No rent is paid for the use of the municipally owned space. Admission is free to all self-guided Gallery visitors and it attracts about 20,000 visits per year while the Grimsby Public Library reports approximately 160,000 visits per year.

The Town of Grimsby is the primary funder of the Gallery whose operating budget in 2106 was about \$324,000 compared to the \$964,000 for the Library. The Gallery generates modest revenues from a variety of charged programs. School programs involving in-gallery tours (based on a minimum of 18 students) are charged at \$4 per student for a one- hour tour and an activity book. There is a charge of \$6 per student for a guided tour and an art class (approximately two to three hours). Given the limited space within the GPAG, in-school programming is also offered. Pricing is \$36 per student for 15 students or less, and \$30 per student for 16 to 25 students. An additional fee is applied for the instructor's mileage. Additionally, the Gallery offers classes for both children and adults that change throughout the year and a half-day March Break camp is available for children aged 5 to 12 years.

Despite the free admission, the Gallery has a membership program that offers a 10% discount at the gift shop and an invitation to the annual pre-holiday season sale, in addition to discounts on classes, and an opportunity to support the mission of the Gallery. The annual membership charges are \$32 for a family, \$27 for an individual and \$17 for a senior or student. At present, the Gallery has over 200 memberships.

The Library and Gallery have common operating hours for only one day per week as shown on the following table. These hours are maintained on a year-round basis for the Gallery while the Library closes on Sundays during the summer months. *It is a common phenomenon among all of the comparable co-locations analyzed that the public library and art gallery have different open hours. We have not recommended common open hours for the GSPL and AGS.*

Open Hours	Grimsby Public Library	Grimsby Public Art Gallery
Monday	9 - 9	10 - 5
Tuesday	9 - 9	10 - 8
Wednesday	9 - 9	10 - 8
Thursday	9 - 9	10 - 8
Friday	9 - 5	10 - 5
Saturday	9 - 5	1-5
Sunday	1 - 5	1-5

An interview with the Gallery Director indicated that the Gallery benefits from location within the Library building as many Library users wander into the Gallery because they are already in the building and because of the free admission offered by the Gallery. The most significant challenge as identified by the Gallery Director was maintaining a separate brand identity within a building that is primarily a public library since they share a main door and lobby. *The Art Gallery of Sudbury should also benefit from access to Library patrons and while it could face a challenge of maintaining a separate identity, this should be mitigated by a larger AGS space co-located within the Greater Sudbury Public Library.*

2.2.2 Idea Exchange, Cambridge

The Idea Exchange, formerly the Cambridge Libraries and Galleries, was formed in 2015 and serves a city population of close to 132,000 in 2016 plus nearby smaller communities. The Idea Exchange name was borne out of the thinking that it would attract new audiences who were negatively predisposed to the words "library" and "art gallery" while still retaining the traditional audiences. The mission of Idea Exchange is to support and inspire reading, innovation, learning and the arts through environments that invite curiosity and discovery through exploring new technologies and the arts.

The Idea Exchange is not a single building housing a public library and art gallery. There are Idea Exchange facilities in five locations, three of which include art galleries. This reflects the fact that Cambridge is an amalgamation of three different towns – Galt, Preston and Hespeler. Within each Idea Exchange building, the library components occupy the bulk of the space but the art galleries are able to maintain their identities by means of their names: The Queen's Square Gallery, Design at Riverside Gallery, Gallery Preston. The Art Gallery of Sudbury will also have an independent name, likely the Franklin Carmichael Art Gallery.

Positive in Cambridge as well is that all of the art galleries are located on the main floor of the buildings. They share some amenities with the libraries such as lobbies, washrooms and boardrooms.

The Idea Exchange has one overall governing board but has a sub-committee that manages the galleries and an Executive Director who manages them. The galleries have primarily separate employees. The only shared staff with the Library are custodial and security staff. The galleries also have a separate operating budget and pay rent to the library for the use of their space. This is primarily a bookkeeping exercise as the large majority of the operating funds are from the City of Cambridge. Funds for the galleries are also raised by means of fundraising and charged programs. Idea Exchange runs hundreds of free and charged art programs every year ranging from in-house art programs, programs at festivals, art competitions, art camps and MakerKits that can be borrowed and taken home.

Admission is free to all of the art galleries and the combined attendance for them was approximately 86,000 in 2016. The galleries have fewer open hours than the public libraries. They are open daily but closed on Sundays from the Victoria Day to Labour Day holidays.

According to the Galleries Executive Director, the art gallery within a shared library building model is beneficial in that there is a sharing of resources, collaboration on projects and an increase in attendance due to exposure to library users. However, sharing the Idea Exchange name with the Library poses a challenge when trying to distinguish itself as a separate brand within it. This is especially important for fundraising purposes.

2.2.3 Oakville Galleries (Og2) at the Oakville Public Library

The Oakville Galleries (Og2) operates in two locations, one of which is a space at the Centennial Square location within the Oakville Public Library with a shared lobby. Og2 is a contemporary art gallery and serves the City of Oakville (population close to 194,000 in 2016) and the surrounding area. The Gallery had originally been managed by the same board as the Library but in 1980 the boards separated and Og2 became its own entity. As such, the Gallery maintains separate staff, has its own operating budget, and pays the Library an annual fee to cover maintenance and utilities costs amounting to approximately \$18,500. The only shared staff is security.

The entire Library and Gallery complex is 41,400 sq. ft., with Og2 occupying only about 2,800 sq. ft. (of which 1,900 sq. ft. is exhibition space) and the space also includes collections storage. Office space is at the second Gallery site at Gairloch Gardens. The annual operating budget for both galleries was \$1.1 million in 2016.

The Centennial Square Gallery attracts about 15,000 to 20,000 visitors per year. Admission is free but a membership program is in place that entitles members to lower rates for programs, and to support the mission of Og2. The Og2 currently has approximately 400 members. Given the small size of the space in the Centennial Square Library most public and educational programming, including charged children's camps and birthday parties, are offered at the Gairloch Gardens location. The various membership levels are:

- \$30 Individual
- \$20 Student/Senior/Artist
- \$50 Family

- \$100 Business
- \$250-\$499 Sustaining Member
- \$500-\$999 Advocate Member

Og2 is open Tuesdays through Sundays with evening hours Tuesday through Thursday. There are fewer hours than those of the Public Library.

An interview with the Director of the Gallery included his perceptions of the advantages and disadvantages of being part of the Library. The main benefit is that there is no expectation of charged admission inside the Library. The free admission reduces the barrier to entry and a broader cross-section of the population attending the Library also visits the Gallery. *He expressed two main disadvantages in being inside a facility that is largely a public library. The first was that a shared entrance with the library devalues Og2's brand and the Gallery is not able to maintain a separate identity. The ideal is separate entrances. This was heard in other interviews but there is a contradiction in liking the fact that a shared lobby exposes library visitors to the art gallery while at the same time being concerned about a loss of identity because of a shared lobby.*

The second disadvantage related to the content of the art gallery. Since the Gallery shares space with the Library and has a glass front, the interior exhibition space is visible from the Library. As a contemporary art gallery, content with difficult subject matter is sometimes explored in exhibitions and must be hidden from younger audiences attending the library. *The lesson for the Art Gallery of Sudbury in a larger Greater Sudbury Public Library is to limit opportunities for Library visitors to be able to see into most exhibition spaces. This should be easier at the AGS because the recommended exhibition space set out in Chapter 4 is much larger than available in Oakville.*

2.2.4 Dunlop Gallery of the Regina Public Library

The Dunlop Gallery of the Regina Public Library is integrated with both the Central Library Branch and the Sherwood Village Branch. The Gallery is not independent and is therefore not governed by a separate board and nor does it pay rent or any other fees for the use of its space. However, the Gallery does maintain its own staff with the exception of custodial and security staff which are responsible for the entire building.

The Central Library Branch is a three-storey building with the Gallery located on the main floor off of the lobby. The Gallery exhibition space is approximately 2,000 S. F. with a 300 S. F. reception area, a 1,000 sq. ft. office space, and 2,000 sq. ft. of prep space or a total of 5,300 sq., ft. The smaller Sherwood Village Gallery is approximately 1,200 sq. ft.

The Dunlop Gallery does not charge an admission fee and receives approximately 20,000 to 30,000 visitors annually at the Central location compared to the Library that receives approximately 300,000 to 400,000 visitors. The smaller Sherwood Village Gallery receives approximately 10,000 to 15,000 visitors compared to the approximately 200,000 annual library visitors. The Dunlop Gallery has an operating budget of approximately \$750,000, covering both sites.

An interview with the Director/Curator of the Gallery indicated that the Gallery benefits from exposure to Library visitors and provides access to Library staff, services and funding that would not be possible if separately located. Concerns expressed were similar to the Oakville Og2 Gallery in that the Dunlop Gallery has a glass front facing onto the lobby. This poses a challenge when some art exhibitions might be visible to younger library patrons. Also heard was the issue of the difficulty maintaining a separate identity and a challenge in applying for grants. When doing so the Gallery must make it very clear to funders that they manage their own programs and curatorial content that are separate from the Library.



Image of the Diabolique installation at the Dunlop Art Gallery, 2009
Source: Amanda Cachia via www.amandachachia.com

2.2.5 San Diego Central Public Library and Gallery

The San Diego Central Public Library opened its new nearly 367,000 sq. ft. nine-story building in 2013. It includes a very small 2,500 S. F. art gallery on the ninth-floor that is free to the public and also not visible to most library visitors or the general public. The exhibition space is approximately 2000 S. F. with 500 S. F. of office and storage facilities. The gallery is part of the San Diego Central Public Library but has an Advisory Board. The Gallery is managed by one employee who is Library staff and the Gallery is part of the Library's overall operating budget.

The Gallery exhibits the City of San Diego's art collection and therefore functions as a municipal art gallery. It also showcases local and regional artists. As the gallery is part of the library system, it does not offer separate gallery-specific public programming. This will be a difference in Greater Sudbury where the AGS and the GSPL will have separate programming, sometimes in shared spaces.

The San Diego Central Public Library is open daily, staying open until 7 on Mondays through Thursdays. The Gallery operates on reduced hours from noon to 5 Tuesday, Wednesday and Friday, noon to 4 Saturday and Sunday and closed on Mondays.

An interview with the Gallery Director confirmed the advantage of having a free admission art gallery within the Public Library that offers the community an opportunity to see the works of local artists and the municipal collection. Not surprisingly, the disadvantages heard were the loss of brand identity as a very small art gallery in a very large public library, and the need for staff to work at differentiating themselves internally from library employees and externally with the community.

2.3 THE ART GALLERY/MUSEUM MARKETPLACE

A co-located AGS with the GSPL has the opportunity to lead to substantially higher attendance and earned income and operating cost efficiencies relative to the current situation in the Bell Mansion. However, it is important to understand attendance and financial benchmarks from other art galleries/museums to help establish realistic attendance, operational and financial expectations. These benchmarks follow an overview of selected trends associated with art galleries/museums.

2.3.1 Art Gallery/Museum Trends

The following selected trends are from a document prepared by Lord Cultural Resources for art galleries/museums in general. Points have been selected to show both the big picture and in some cases the implications to the Art Gallery of Sudbury and a potential co-location with the Greater Sudbury Public Library:

Physical Facilities:

- Increased fusion of architecture and art and of “star-architects” in which the building is as important as the art. Although attractive facilities are assumed for the AGS, the focus is on increasing the likelihood for long-awaited implementation by controlling size and capital costs, including by means of co-location.

Collections:

- More donations rather than loans or purchases. The assumption is that the Franklin Carmichael collection will be donated, not loaned, to the AGS which is to be renamed the Franklin Carmichael Art Gallery or Centre.
- More private collections/museums. These are primarily in the United States. One example in Canada is the Audain Art Museum in Whistler, BC.

Market:

- Although the market for exhibitions still skews older, more female, highly educated, urban and wealthier, millennials are most active in cultural programming. One of the objectives of the relocation from the Bell Mansion is a downtown site that will be easily accessible to young people, as well as seniors and others.

Visitor Experience:

- Art museums as places to socialize (cultural hubs) including see and be seen events. The concept of a cultural hub is part of the rationale for the GSPL/AGS co-location.

- Increasing use of technology and new ways of engagement, including digital platforms and increased events, including recognition of the need to adapt to mobile devices.
- Increased emphasis on programs for children, and sometimes spaces specific to them.
- A focus on spectacle, or “instagrammable” exhibitions.
- Artists thinking and working on a larger scale, requiring more exhibition space than in the past. More exhibition space is proposed for the AGS.
- Increased potential for more diverse modes of visual arts presentation.

Operations:

- Larger city art museums are most likely to have a fixed admission charge – 60% among the Association of Art Museum Directors – but smaller city art museums/galleries are most likely to offer free or suggested admissions.
- Recognition that attendance and admissions revenue are not a major success measure. On average admissions account for only 7% of operating revenue in the United States and 8% in Canada (6% for art galleries). Also important as measures of success are artist exposure, contribution to contemporary thought, and the reputation of the institution, including risk taking.
- Much less resistance to weddings, concerts and other rentals opportunities, assuming they are separated from the works of art. Generating rentals income will be important for the new AGS.

2.3.2 Art Galleries within Museum Marketplace

The following table indicates what we term the “realities of the museum marketplace.” The primary objective is to convey that even with new, higher quality facilities co-located with a new public library, expectations for the extent of the likely increase in attendance and earned income levels must be realistic. The table includes data for the AGS, small, medium and large art galleries and museums in Ontario, and data from Canada and the United States². The data are supplemented, where relevant, by the *Statistical Profile of Art Galleries in Ontario* (Ontario Association of Art Galleries, March 2014). More detailed information regarding the AGS is set out in the following chapter:

- **On-Site Attendance:** The AGS would be categorized on the basis of its size and operating budget as a medium-sized art gallery. It has averaged about 12,000 annual on-site visitors based on admission by donation, which was introduced in the fall of 2015. The on-site AGS attendance is somewhat lower than the nearly 18,000 visitor range for medium-sized art galleries/museums in Ontario and well below the figures for Canadian and US art galleries/museums set out in the table below. In part this reflects the deficiencies of the Bell Mansion site and facilities. More persons are served by the off-site delivery program of the AGS, as discussed further in Chapter 3.

² The Canadian data are averages and the US are medians.

- **Admission Charge Basis:** In the fall of 2015 the AGS switched from fixed admission charges to admission by donation (pay what you can). This is consistent with the findings of the *Statistical Profile of Art Galleries in Ontario*, which reported that of 46 respondents, 31 offered free admission to all visitors, 10 had a voluntary charge and 9 a mandatory charge. In the United States art museums are the museum type most likely to offer free admission (48%) compared to the overall museum average of 41% free. In 2016 admissions revenue totaled \$4,794, an average of less than 40 cents per visitor based on the total on-site visitor count. Our recommendation regarding admission charges is set out in Chapter 4.
- **School Groups as Percentage of Total Visitors:** The AGS reports about 12% of its on-site visitors arrive in school groups. This is a higher percentage than the benchmarks in the table below and may either reflect a very successful school program or, more likely, weakness in attracting non-school market segments. *Since it will be new and better quality, the new facility should increase overall attendance, including more school visitors, and with higher attendance should cause the school group percentage to decline.*
- **Memberships and Member Visits:** The 90 memberships at the AGS is quite low relative to the figures in the following table, but it must be understood that the data in the following table is for members as opposed memberships. To allow for comparison we estimated the 90 memberships equate to about 200 members. They account for a very substantial 19% of visitors to the AGS. A better located facility offering larger exhibition space should help to increase repeat visitation and therefore the motivation for membership from a wider number of potential visitors. Fixed admission charges would result in more lower-level memberships seeking value for money, but pay what you can should help to increase upper level memberships.
- **Staffing Levels:** The AGS reports only five full-time staff, a reduction from the previous seven, to reflect financial constraints, but is in the same range as reported for medium-sized museums and art galleries in Ontario. However, it is clear that a larger, new facility will require a larger AGS staff.
- **Volunteers:** The AGS reports 17 regular and 36 periodic volunteers, which is lower than the median and average figures for Ontario, Canadian and US art galleries/museums shown in the following table. The trend in Canada has been a decline in the percentage of Canadians who volunteer their time to any cultural or recreational organizations, as reported in the Canadian Index of Wellbeing.³ However, the increasing retirement and longevity of the large baby boom generation should increase volunteer levels in the coming years. It is likely that *the excitement generated for the new co-located facility should increase volunteer support levels for AGS.*
- **Sources of Operating Revenue:** The 2015-16 AGS revenues and especially expenses were skewed by the impact of the Lynn Johnston (*For Better or Worse*) project funds and costs. The AGS reported that about 61% of its operating revenues were from government sources (30% from the City of Greater Sudbury, 11% provincial and 20% from federal funds). Under other circumstances government funding of the AGS is about 50% and in the same general range as art galleries in Ontario and Canada. The *Statistical Profile of Art Galleries in Ontario* reported that, on average, 56% of operating revenues are from government sources. For galleries in the same budget range as the AGS it is 44% from government. In the United States non-earned income support is primarily from private sources.

³ <https://uwaterloo.ca/canadian-index-wellbeing/>

The data indicate the reality that even with larger, better located and higher quality facilities, the City of Greater Sudbury will remain the largest single funding source for the AGS. Moreover, if the same general percentage from government is maintained in a larger facility then it means that the dollar amount from government sources, primarily the City of Greater Sudbury, will also increase unless in-kind methods of financial support are provided. This study has recommended maintaining the current City financial support for the AGS at the same level but with more in-kind support as set out in Chapter 4.

- **Sources of Operating Expenses:** Staffing costs in both Canada and the United States are generally in the range of 50% of total operating costs. For the AGS it was only about 38%, decline from the 48% in the previous year because of additional costs allocated to *For Better or Worse*. In 2016-17 staffing costs increased to a more common 51%.

	Art Gallery of Sudbury	Small Ontario M&AG	Medium Ontario M&AG	Large Ontario M&AG	All Ontario M&AG	Canadian Museums	Canadian Art Galleries	All Canadian Heritage Institutions	US Art Galleries	All US Museums
Sample Size		253	160	41	454	1,088	196	1,974	156	671
On-Site Attendance	12,033	4,063	17,869	206,535	27,213	23,019	56,451	31,336	44,878	26,500
School Groups as % of Total Members	11.8%	7.4%	9.0%	6.6%	7.2%	8.5%	6.4%	6.0%	8.4%	12.3%
Total Full-Time Staff	5	0	3	44	5	4	10	6	15	7
Total Part-Time Staff	16	1	6	37	6	7	12	9	9	5
Total Contract Workers	0	1	3	4	2	2	5	2	N/A	N/A
Total Volunteers	36	21	66	235	56	49	82	52	100	65
Sources of Operating Revenues										
Earned Income as % Total	22.3%	47.3%	33.3%	39.1%	38.6%	37.0%	29.6%	36.4%	21.5%	27.6%
Government Sources %	60.8%**	27.1%	45.9%	45.8%	45.4%	49.4%	44.6%	49.4%	13.3%	24.4%
Private Donations %	10.9%***	24.6%	18.4%	13.3%	14.2%	11.4%	24.1%	12.7%	46.6%	36.5%
Interest/Endowment %	6.0%	1.0%	2.4%	1.7%	1.8%	2.3%	1.7%	1.6%	18.6%	11.5%
Total Operating Revenue	\$707,673	\$45,838	\$423,913	\$11.5 million	\$1.2 million	\$838,000	\$2.2 million	\$1.1 million	\$2.4 million	\$1.2 million
Sources of Operating Expenses										
Staffing	38.1%****	30.7%	50.8%	44.5%	45.0%	47.3%	42.4%	47.5%	48.6%	49.9%
Occupancy	12.5%	12.6%	10.0%	11.8%	11.6%	13.1%	8.8%	12.0%	N/A	N/A
Collections Care	6.9%	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	6.4%	8.0%
Marketing	4.4%	3.9%	3.3%	3.8%	3.7%	3.5%	3.9%	3.1%	4.4%	4.1%
Source: 2013 Canadian Heritage Survey (2015) and 2013 Special Report on Museums & Art Galleries by Size and Province/Territory (2015) and 2009 Financial Survey of American Alliance of Museums										
Note: *Museums categorized as small have annual revenue of under \$100,000; medium \$100,000 to \$999,999; large \$1 million+										
Canadian figures represent averages and US figures medians										
* It is 90 memberships for the AGS										
** The 2016 data were skewed higher by more governmental support for the <i>For Better or Worse</i> exhibition. Normally it is less than 60%.										
*** The private support for the AGS includes both donations and in-kind support										
**** Staffing costs are normally higher but there were additional exhibition, marketing and other costs associated with the <i>For Better or Worse</i> exhibition										

2.4 THE PUBLIC LIBRARY MARKETPLACE

This section considers trends for public libraries that will affect the future of the Greater Sudbury Public Library.

2.4.1 GSPL Within Public Library Trends

The Greater Sudbury Public Library has 13 library locations throughout the City of Greater Sudbury. The Main Library, New Sudbury Library and South End Library are located in Sudbury and additional branches are located in the communities of Azilda, Capreol, Chelmsford, Coniston, Dowling, Garson, Levack/Onaping, Lively, and Valley East.

The Main Branch of the future must be an exciting new public landmark that provides its users a mixture of tradition and innovation, creativity and discovery to accommodate more accessible formats, including digital. The future Main Branch will be an institution on the edge, experimenting with the new, leading the user on the way into the possibilities and potential of technology and collaboration. It will be a place for the individual to work alone and also to experience the energy of participation in groups, small and large. A place for cultural programs and exhibitions, a centre for young people and families, the library will be the downtown public institution that welcomes and serves the entire community.

The library will play an integral role in the daily lives of community members as a place for:

- Active community engagement
- Lifelong learning and literacy
- Creativity and innovation
- Collaboration and exploration

It will be an adaptable and flexible space that will meet the changing needs of the community and accommodate new and innovative technologies and new demands.

The library looks towards the future, a future that assumes that:

- More materials will be available in digital formats
- Collections of physical materials, (books and media) will stay at current levels in the short term and decline in the longer term
- More and more people will bring their own electronic devices to be used in the facility
- Access to spaces for the creation of content via digital media labs and maker spaces is becoming more critical
- Virtual reality and augmented reality are important tools for creativity and education
- Interior spaces must be flexible and adapt as services and technology evolve.

The planning that will go into the library building must take into account trends and innovations in terms of service, collections, staffing, technology and layout. The proposed library must accommodate collections, new technology, and operations in an open, light-filled, flexible and inviting space.

As envisioned, it will be an exciting center for families and children in Sudbury a place for children and teens to do schoolwork and explore new areas of digital media creation, spaces for adults to read, learn and participate in the latest technological innovations and a center for exploring new innovations in technology and the maker movement.

The building must also be planned to be environmentally friendly and sustainable. With inviting spaces for exhibitions, programs, civic engagement and quiet reading, the library will be a beacon in the ongoing development of downtown Sudbury.

Taking into account trends affecting public libraries the Greater Sudbury Public Library – Main Branch of the future will:

- Focus on the customer in the building and in the “cloud”.
- Provide physical and digital collections that are responsive to customer demands and community needs.
- Enhance the customer experience by providing latest technologies for public use and library operations.
- Provide flexible and sustainable physical spaces for community interaction, collaboration, collections and customer-center creation and maker spaces.
- Create virtual resources for individuals to create and share content.
- Encourage literacy and learning through services both traditional and innovative.
- Have a building design that offers opportunities for limitless learning, bridging the education gap, supporting interest-driven learning and multiple literacies.
- Support business and career success through resources and collaborative spaces.
- Serve a key role in the social service network, providing space for training, partners and private meetings.
- Add to the continued vitality of Sudbury in a welcoming environment where community members feel empowered and enlightened by their own learning experiences.
- Become an active node in residents’ daily lives, in which people connect with one another and work collaboratively, as well as individually.

These trends also reflect the recent findings (2016) of a study commissioned by the Aspen Institute and the Public Library Association. The nationwide survey of chief administrative officers in local governments focused on the evolving role of public libraries in advancing community goals.

The top five priorities were the areas where local government leaders see libraries playing an important role:

- Access to high-speed Internet service (73%)
- Digital literacy (65%)
- Early childhood education (65%)
- Primary and secondary school attainment (59%)
- Online learning/virtual learning (52%)

As the Greater Sudbury Public Library – Main Branch is developed, it is important to consider the demographic factors in Sudbury so that services, programs and collections meet the need of residents. For example, a focus on early childhood literacy, information and assistance for job seekers, partnerships with the schools, access to technology and citizenship education will be very important.

2.4.2 Comparison of Data for Greater Sudbury Public Library to North Bay, Sault Ste. Marie and Thunder Bay Public Libraries

It is useful to compare the performance of the Greater Sudbury Public Library with public libraries in the other relatively large larger cities in Northern Ontario. The key comparative data are set out in the following tables including commentary regarding the main findings and implications.

The data indicate that of the libraries compared, the GSPL serves the largest population base and has the most library locations at 13. The GSPL is also open the most hours per week (618) and has the most visitors (722,400). Because of its reach geographically and the accessibility of it open hours, the GSPL is a draw to a broad cross-section of the community. A better Main Branch facility should enable it to attract even more visitors.

The Main Branch opens for 68.5 hours per week and exceeds those of the other main branch libraries. When a public library is open a wide range of hours – days, evenings and weekends – it encourages use by all segments of the community.

	Resident Population Served + Contracting Population Served	# of Library Locations	Total Open Hours Per Week	Annual Visitors
Greater Sudbury	161,531	13	618	722,400
Thunder Bay	107,909	4	200	444,850
Sault St. Marie	81,344	3	148	376,050
North Bay	51,553	1	61	458,500
<i>Source: Ontario Public Library Statistics 2016</i>				

In terms of annual operating budgets, the Greater Sudbury Public Library expenditure budget for 2016 at \$8,231,720 was the highest among the four libraries. This equates to \$50.96 per capita, which ranks the second highest in the group of four.

	Annual Expenditures	Materials Expenditure Per Capita	Expenditures Per Capita
Greater Sudbury	\$8,231,720	\$5.20	\$50.96
Thunder Bay	\$6,267,209	\$4.83	\$58.08
Sault St. Marie	\$3,417,597	\$1.65	\$42.01
North Bay	\$2,379,087	\$3.48	\$46.15

Source: Ontario Public Library Statistics 2016

Regarding collections, as the largest library system reviewed it is not surprising to see that the total volumes held at the GSPL are substantially higher than the other libraries reviewed. It is important to remember that Sudbury also has the most library facilities and, therefore, the collection is distributed across multiple venues. The importance of collection size has diminished as more and more materials are made available electronically by libraries to their customers. Other libraries in the north are leading in the provision of E-resources. *It is therefore important that the Greater Sudbury Public Library look at its allocation of collection funds and adjust to add more funding for electronic resources and the demand for these increases and more and more become available.* This has been recommended and assumed for the new Main Branch.

	Collection/ Print	Collection- Media	E-Resources
Greater Sudbury	306,602	65,276	19,892
Thunder Bay	248,674	45,152	107,866
Sault St. Marie	115,375	15,254	72,782
North Bay	170,154	29,856	107,915

Source: Ontario Public Library Statistics 2016

The Greater Sudbury Public Library has the highest annual circulation of library materials (items borrowed) of northern libraries studies, holds the most programs annually and has the highest annual program attendance. It circulated slightly more than 5 books per capita and 55% of the population having an active library card. This percentage should increase with implementation of the new Main Branch library.

	Annual Circulation	Circulation per Capita	Active Card Holders % of Population	Annual Program Attendance
Greater Sudbury	825,407	5.1	55%	47,620
Thunder Bay	743,832	6.9	23%	37,727
Sault St. Marie	412,221	5.1	23%	23,365
North Bay	321,851	6.2	88%	6,301

Source: Ontario Public Library Statistics 2016

Regarding operating revenue, government sources, not surprisingly, account for 96- 98% of total operating revenues for all four of the libraries compared, with small contributed and earned revenue that makes up the remainder. This is typical of public libraries in North America which have traditionally been financially supported by governments and open to the public free of charge as a “public good”. This contrasts with the greater earned and private sources that art galleries must generate.

Staffing represents the highest percentage of expenses for all libraries studied, but the percentage is lower in Greater Sudbury. This is somewhat surprising because of the larger number of facilities run by GSPL. Regarding other operating costs, the GSPL allocates the highest percent of its expenses to facilities/utilities at 10%, *confirming the energy inefficiency and other deficiencies of the existing Mackenzie building.*

2.4.3 Comparison to Similar Libraries in Other Parts OF Ontario

It is useful to compare the performance of the Greater Sudbury Public Library with public libraries in the other comparable municipal library systems in southern Ontario. The following three library systems were selected for comparison to the GSPL:

- **Chatham-Kent Public Library** is an amalgamated system with 11 library locations throughout the municipality of Chatham-Kent. The Chatham Branch is open for 60 hours per week and is housed in a 62 year old facility. This public library system was selected based on number of service points and its amalgamated municipality.
- **Kingston Frontenac Public Library** is an amalgamated system with 16 library locations throughout the City of Kingston. Their Central Branch has been closed to the public since 2016 pending major renovations to a building that has housed the library since 1978 and is set to open in 2018. This public library system was selected based on number of service points, amalgamated municipality and similar operating budget.
- **Barrie Public Library** has 2 library locations throughout the City of Barrie. The Downtown Branch is centrally located in the Downtown core is open for 65 hours per week. Barrie Public Library has been selected based on its similar operating budget and similar service model comparable to Greater Sudbury Public Library.

The data indicate that of the four libraries compared, the GSPL serves the largest population base and the second most library locations. The GSPL is also open the most total hours per week (618) however, the Kingston-Frontenac Public Library currently has a larger number of annual visitors. At 68.5, Greater Sudbury's main library is open the most hours per week, with the average across the three libraries studied at 64.3 hours.

	Resident Population Served + Contracting Population Served	# of Library Locations	Total Open Hours Per Week	Annual Visitors
Greater Sudbury	161,531	13	618	722,400
Chatham-Kent Public Library	102,042	11	320	354,250
Kingston Frontenac Public Library	149,855	16	392	744,100
Barrie Public Library	155,784	2	129	368,300

Source: Ontario Public Library Statistics 2016

In terms of annual operating budgets, the Greater Sudbury Public Library expenditure budget for 2016 was \$8,231,720, the highest among the four libraries, but on a per capita basis at \$50.96 the GSPL ranked second in the group of four. The GSPL expends \$5.20 per capita on library materials (books, media and electronic resources) currently ranking lowest of the four.

	Annual Circulation	Circulation per Capita	Active Card Holders % of Population	Annual Program Attendance
Barrie Public Library	1,518,309	10	25%	36,182
Kingston Frontenac Public Library	1,330,394	9	39%	44,601
Greater Sudbury	825,407	5	55%	47,620
Chatham-Kent Public Library	819,728	8	23%	21,338

	Annual Expenditures	Materials Expenditure Per Capita	Expenditures Per Capita
Barrie Public Library	\$8,382,475	\$5.82	\$53.81
Greater Sudbury	\$8,231,720	\$5.20	\$50.96
Kingston Frontenac Public Library	\$7,540,863	\$7.35	\$50.32
Chatham-Kent Public Library	\$4,275,259	\$6.42	\$41.90

Source: Ontario Public Library Statistics 2016

Regarding collections, GSPL's collections are on par with the other libraries reviewed. Other libraries studied, however, are leading the way in the provision of electronic resources and the demand for these increases and more and more become available. Plans for the new Main Library seek to address this issue.

	Collection/ Print	Collection- Media	E-Resources
Kingston Frontenac Public Library	319,103	41,663	10,634
Greater Sudbury	306,602	65,276	19,892
Chatham-Kent Public Library	295,908	28,879	122,848
Barrie Public Library	208,910	47,880	141,153

Source: Ontario Public Library Statistics 2016

The Greater Sudbury Public Library has the second lowest circulation of library materials (items borrowed) of libraries studied. However, GSPL holds the most programs annually and has the highest annual program attendance but also the lowest circulation per capita of libraries studied. The new Main Library should help to remedy this.

Regarding operating revenue, not surprisingly, government sources account for 97- 99% of total operating revenues for all four of the libraries compared, with small contributed and earned revenue that makes up the remainder.

Staffing represents the highest percentage of expenses for all libraries studied, accounting for 60-75% of total operating expenses, but the percentage is at the low part of the range for Greater Sudbury at 60%. GSPL allocates the highest percent of its expenses to facilities/utilities, again confirming the energy inefficiency and other deficiencies of the existing Mackenzie building.

3. OPERATIONS AND MARKET ANALYSES

It is important to understand the operations of the existing Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS) and the Greater Sudbury Public Library (GSPL) to help provide the basis for future new facilities and operations. This chapter also considers data and interview feedback regarding potential resident, school and tourist markets for Sudbury and the implications to the co-location.

3.1 EXISTING OPERATIONS OF THE CO-LOCATING INSTITUTIONS

3.1.1 Greater Sudbury Public Library

The Main Branch of the GSPL is located in downtown Sudbury and is the largest facility in the system, has the largest collection of library materials and the largest staff, including those providing direct services to the public and those who oversee the entire system. As a Main Branch, its collection resources and staff expertise are critical to the branch libraries operations and to the public's access to the world of information and education.

The Greater Sudbury Public Library – Main Branch is near the Sudbury Secondary School, an adult education centre and senior's assisted living centre. The site includes 40 no charge parking spaces, which tend to be filled during peak periods. The existing Main Branch is 25,516 net sq. ft. or 32,772 gross sq. ft. The Library features a Maker Space that includes sewing machines, a vinyl cutter, items, craft 3D printer, sound recording and other equipment that is made available for a charge on a cost recovery basis. For those who do not have mobility the GSPL has implemented a "homebound" system that delivers books and currently covers 120 active users.

The staff of the GSPL are City staff as opposed to employees of an autonomous public library. However, the GSPL receives city services that other libraries do not receive. This is because in Ontario most public libraries operate as municipally-funded, independently operated organizations (police boards are a good comparison). Generally all assets are owned by the Library Board and staff are employees of the Board. In some cases Boards enter into operating agreements to contract services with the municipality. Most often contracted services include: payroll, HR, and sometimes IT services.

In the case of the Greater Sudbury Public Library, the operating agreement between the Board and CGS is complete: all library services are funded and operated directly by the City. This includes payroll, HR, and IT. Unlike other libraries it also includes: staffing, administration, capital projects, finance (budgets, A/P, A/R, Purchasing), mail (delivery), legal, risk management, etc.

3.1.2 Art Gallery of Sudbury

The Art Gallery of Sudbury was established in 1967 to provide residents of and visitors to Sudbury with a public art gallery and to provide a cultural and educational use for the historic Bell Mansion, which was constructed in 1907. The AGS is a "Category A" art museum that serves as an important showcase for the visual arts within Northern Ontario. In fact, it brings a 50-year history of actively operating as the only public art gallery within 38,000 square kilometres. It has good relationships with the major artists in Northern Ontario and the ability to provide their work with a regional, provincial and national context. The AGS has a proven record with the Ontario Arts Council and the Canada Council for the Arts and has secured multi-year funding from both of them.

As discussed in Chapter 1, the deficiencies of the Bell Mansion site and building for a public art gallery are enormous. In recognition of these deficiencies the AGS has focused very much in recent years on off-site program delivery, including both in-class school programs and seniors' education programs, which served over 2,800 people in 2016. In that year the AGS also offered exhibitions of Lynn Johnston and Darlene Naponse that toured to other venues and were seen by over 11,000 people. In addition, the Laughing Buddha exhibitions and exhibitions in the Sudbury Theatre Centre were seen by over 24,000 people, bringing the grand total of program delivery to about 48,100 in 2016, of which only about 12,000 was on-site at the Bell Mansion. There is no charge for regional off-site exhibition delivery.

The AGS opens on a year-round basis for six days per week from 10 a. m. to 5 p. m. but during the summer months opens one hour earlier with open Mondays. School groups have access from 9 a. m. Art classes are held during evening hours on Mondays through Wednesdays from 5 p. m. to 8 p. m. Hours are from noon to 5 p. m. on Sundays.

Admission by donation was introduced in the fall of 2015 to reflect the state of the Sudbury economy and the deficiencies of the site and building, including the very small size of the exhibition space and the fact that art galleries are the museum type most likely to offer free or pay as you will admissions.

In 2016 on-site attendance was as follows:

Audience	Attendance
General Public	6,069
Education Classes	3,068
School Groups	1,425
Other Groups	483
Rentals	988
Total:	12,033

Although attendance at public art galleries tends to vary primarily by the appeal of specific exhibitions, the summer months have been peak for the past two years. Excluding school groups, Greater Sudbury residents account for about 75% of visitors, with 21% from elsewhere in Ontario, 1% from elsewhere in Canada and 3% international. ***A downtown location for the AGS will make it much easier to find for tourists and a co-location with a public library will help to break down the intimidation factor faced by some residents about attending a public art gallery.***

Taking into account the successful children's programs offered by the AGS, children 12 and under account for 32% of all non-school visitors, with only 20% aged 60 plus. Art museum attendance peaks in middle age but tends to decline among seniors⁴, but this is expected to change among the large and active baby boom generation, which is projected to live longer than previous generations. The relatively low 20% of AGS visitors who are aged 60 plus may be seen to reflect a site that is not seen as easily accessible. As is common, about 60% of visitors are female. Of concern is that only 35% are first time visitors and that only 30% of visitors attend on weekend days. More common is 50% in both cases. This too should be rectified by a downtown site.

Not surprisingly, in such a small space the average length of stay in the AGS is relatively short at about 30-45 minutes. More exhibition space will certainly increase length of stay. The relatively low 90 memberships in the AGS reflects the admissions by donation and limited potential benefits in the existing facility. More emphasis on upper level memberships (Franklin Carmichael Circle) will be possible in the context of the new facility in which the motivation is less on value for money and more on love for the mission of the Gallery or because of civic pride. These 90 memberships account for 19% of all visits, confirming the substantial repeat visitation rate to the AGS.

The AGS currently has a full-time, year-round staff of 5, a reduction of two project-funded positions, supported by 5.5 full-time seasonal staff and 16 part-time seasonal personnel, to deliver education programs and man the front desk. The AGS is supported by 17 regular volunteers and 36 special events volunteers. In 2016-17 the operating budget was about \$751,000 with a projected reduction to about \$615,000 in the current year to reflect reduced corporate funding in the mining sector and staff reductions. The City of Greater Sudbury \$200,000 in grants accounted for close to 27% of total operating expenses.

The primary source of earned income is education programs, which generated close to \$85,000 in 2016, with retail sales at about \$23,000, a fundraising event at \$8,500, admissions at close to \$4,800, memberships at \$4,200 and rentals at \$3,500. All of these earned revenue sources should increase in larger, higher quality and better located facilities with exposure to public library visitors.

In 2016 the donations totaled about \$19,000, while endowment interest generated over \$45,500. A new site and facility should create a much greater level of excitement for the AGS and help to increase the endowment and annual donations.

⁴ <https://www.si.edu/Content/opanda/docs/Rpts2006/06.08.ChangingFaces.Final.pdf>

Staffing costs at \$382,700 in 2016-17 were about 51% of operating expenses. Building occupancy costs, including utilities, repairs and maintenance, insurance and security, at about \$96,600 in a gross building space of 9,122 gsf translates to \$10.53 per gross square foot, well above the common \$6.00 to \$8.00 per gsf. This confirms the energy inefficiency, deferred maintenance and other deficiencies of the Bell Mansion.

3.2 POTENTIAL MARKETS

Whereas the market profile of public library uses is very wide, the profile of people who are most likely to attend art galleries is narrower. This section considers potential resident, school and tourist markets for Sudbury and implications largely to the Art Gallery of Sudbury because of the greater need for it to attract visitors.

3.2.1 Potential Resident Markets

Whereas art galleries attract both resident and tourist visitors, users of public libraries are overwhelmingly residents. In considering the relative importance of residents for the AGS, the resident market is particularly important for the following main reasons:

- The resident market is readily accessible and available on a year-round basis.
- Residents can be made aware of the exhibitions and programs of the AGS more easily and cost-effectively than may tourists.
- Residents are most likely to be repeat visitors.
- Residents are more likely to become volunteers, members and donors.
- Residents often advise, and accompany, visiting friends and relatives to the Gallery.

This section considers data regarding the size, demographic and socioeconomic profile of Greater Sudbury, including data for the downtown, in comparison to provincial and national averages.

Population Size and Projections

The following table offers an overview of population totals and growth trends for Greater Sudbury compared to provincial and national figures. At this time only the population data from the 2016 census have been released and indicate a slight 1% growth in the population to about 164,700. This is positive when some interviews suggested there might be a decline. Of interest as well given our recommendation that the co-located Main Branch of the GSPL and AGS need to be downtown is that there has been a slight decline in the population of the area defined as Downtown Sudbury. ***The data indicate the importance of amenities such as a modern public library and art gallery to encourage more people to wish to live downtown.***

Population					
	Actual 2011	Actual 2016	% Change 2011-2016	Projected 2021	Projected 2031
Downtown Sudbury	3,843	3,775	-1.8%	N/A	N/A
Greater Sudbury	163,067	164,689	1.0%	N/A	N/A
Ontario	12,851,821	13,448,492	4.4%	14,702,643	16,296,000
Canada	33,476,688	35,151,728	4.8%	37,171,200	39,014,900
<i>Source: Statistics Canada, 2016 and 2011 Census; Community & Strategic Planning Section, City of Greater Sudbury</i>					
<i>Note: The definition of Downtown Sudbury is from a relatively large Census Dissemination Area</i>					

Age

The market for art galleries generally skews older, and most have difficulty attracting children to exhibitions but some, like the AGS, are successful in attracting children for various programs. Accordingly, for art galleries/museums that have fixed admission charges to exhibitions it is common for them to offer free admission to children.

The following table indicates age comparisons of the residents of Greater Sudbury, Ontario and Canada in 2016. The data for downtown Sudbury are still for 2011. The data indicate a median age in Greater Sudbury that is older than the provincial and national averages. *Of particular importance is the general aging of the population over the next 20 years as more baby boomers become seniors, live longer and are more active than previous generations. This is positive for the AGS and the GSPL but emphasizes the importance of a site that is easily accessible to seniors by public transportation.*

Age of Population, 2016	Downtown Sudbury 2011		Greater Sudbury		Ontario		Canada	
	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
0-9 years	85	3%	16,770	10%	1,453,445	11%	3,916,920	12%
10-19 years	120	4%	17,575	11%	1,566,200	12%	3,948,805	12%
20-29 years	475	17%	20,375	13%	1,858,740	14%	4,528,680	14%
30-39 years	285	10%	19,590	12%	1,707,250	13%	4,617,760	14%
40-49 years	335	12%	20,610	13%	1,809,260	14%	4,615,100	14%
50-59 years	470	17%	26,015	16%	2,045,805	16%	5,298,315	16%
60-69 years	355	13%	20,365	13%	1,583,890	12%	4,262,990	13%
70-79 years	315	12%	12,320	8%	921,655	7%	2,442,725	7%
80 years and older	275	10%	7,915	5%	479,655	4%	1,520,430	5%
Median Age	N/A		42.3		40.4		40.6	

Education and Income

Level of education is the variable with the closest correlation to art gallery and other cultural attendance and participation, as supported by numerous studies. The higher the level of education of the individual the more likely it will be that this person will attend or participate.

Like education, household income is an important indicator of potential art gallery/ cultural attendance, but is not as significant an indicator as education. That is, high education, low-income persons are more likely to attend than are persons of high income and low education.

Whereas the educational attainment data for Greater Sudbury, Ontario and Canada are for residents 25 and older, the data for downtown Sudbury are for age 15-24 and thus not fully comparable. In any event as seen on the first table below, the percentage of residents with a university degree is lower in Sudbury than provincial and national averages. A new public library/art gallery should help to enhance the quality of life of Sudbury and the likelihood of attracting and retaining people with higher levels of educational attainment.

The second table sets out median family income levels in Greater Sudbury in 2015 that exceeded the provincial average and national averages and experienced a larger growth over the 2010-2015 period. On the other hand, interviews indicated price sensitivity reflecting, for example, that by June of 2016, the price of nickel had fallen to 34% of what it was in 2010. Wages have been frozen and corporate giving has declined or been suspended. The data serve to confirm that *price consciousness will need to be taken into account in establishing admission charges for the AGS.*

The very low median family income figures for the residents of downtown Sudbury reflect substantial numbers of singles and students and people in low income categories. *The data indicate the importance of a public library being easily accessible to people in all income categories and therefore the importance of an easily accessible downtown site. A downtown site and free or low cost admission would also help to make the AGS more accessible to people in lower income categories.*

Educational Attainment, 2016	Downtown Sudbury (15-64)	Greater Sudbury	Ontario	Canada
Less than high school	21%	11%	10%	11%
High school	30%	25%	24%	24%
Trade certificate	13%	9%	6%	11%
College diploma or some university	21%	35%	27%	25%
University diploma or degree	16%	20%	32%	29%
Total Pop (25 to 64 yrs)	100%	100%	100%	100%
<i>Source: Statistics Canada, National Household Survey 2016, total population 25+</i>				

Income	Downtown Sudbury	Greater Sudbury	Ontario	Canada
Median Family Income- all census families, 2015	N/A	\$ 94,426	\$ 91,089	\$ 88,306
Median Family Income- all census families, 2010	\$ 23,699	\$ 80,084	\$ 80,987	\$ 76,511
% Increase 2010-2015	N/A	17.9%	12.5%	15.4%
<i>Source: Statistics Canada, 2016 and 2011 Census, Downtown Public Community Profile 2011</i>				

Gender

Women account for a slightly larger percentage of the population but are generally a more important market for art galleries and public libraries than are men are for the following main reasons:

- Women tend to make the decisions in a household regarding educational experiences for their children, including attending public libraries and art galleries;

- Women account for a large majority of teachers who usually make the decisions regarding school field trip destinations;
- For attractions like art galleries, women tend to make the decisions regarding attractions to visit while on family vacations and account for a large majority of bus tour passengers and trip planners.

About 60% of non-school visitors to the AGS are women, which is within a common 55-65% female range for art museums and public libraries. The data in the table below indicate a slightly higher percentage of women in all categories. Of particular concern to women are issues of public safety and access from parking and public transportation. These factors should be kept in mind in site selection.

Gender of Population, 2016	Downtown, 2011		Greater Sudbury		Ontario		Canada	
	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Male	1,305	48.4%	78,950	48.9%	6,559,390	51.0%	17,264,200	51.6%
Female	1,390	51.6%	82,575	51.1%	6,889,105	53.6%	17,887,530	53.4%
	2,695		161,525		13,448,495		35,151,730	
<i>Source: Statistics Canada, 2016 Census</i>								
<i>Source: Downtown Public Community Profile 2011</i>								
<i>Note: No new information available on downtown Sudbury from the Public Community Profile</i>								

Ethnic Origin

The following table indicates a very substantial percentage of residents of Greater Sudbury in 2016 who were of French (38%) ethnic origin as well as 12% who were of North American Aboriginal (First Nations) origin. This needs to be taken into account in the programming offered by both the public library and the art gallery. In fact, the Director of the AGS would like the new facility to be trilingual – English, French and a First Nations language to the extent practical.

Ethnic Origin (2016)		
Greater Sudbury	Total Responses	%
Total - Ethnic origin*	158,665	100%
North American Aboriginal origins	19,785	12%
Other North American Origins	73,660	46%
British Isles origins	63,835	40%
French origins	59,885	38%
Western European origins (except French origins)	17,145	11%
Northern European origins (except British Isles origins)	10,010	6%
Eastern European origins	13,810	9%
Southern European origins	16,545	10%
Other European origins	355	0%
Caribbean origins	890	1%
Central and South American origins	645	0%
Central and West African origins	315	0%
North African origins	340	0%
Southern and East African origins	275	0%
Other African origins	530	0%
West Central Asian and Middle Eastern origins	1,165	1%
South Asian origins	1,580	1%
East and Southeast Asian origins	2,010	1%
Other Asian origins	20	0%
Oceania origins	130	0%
Source: 2016 National Household Survey		
Note: * The sum of the ethnic groups in this table is greater than the total population estimate because a person may report more than one ethnic origin in the NHS.		

Mother Tongue

The 2016 data indicate that about 66% of Greater Sudbury residents reported English as their mother tongue while about 26% reported a French mother tongue. The data confirm the *importance of bilingual programming, communications and staffing at both the GSPL and the AGS, which a co-location should help to facilitate.*

Greater Sudbury: Mother Tongue Selected Languages	Mother Tongue		Language Spoken Most Often at Home	
	Number	%	Number	%
Total	159,740	100%	159,745	100%
English	105,250	66%	131,430	82%
French	40,955	26%	20,725	13%
Non-Official language	9,860	6%	3,250	2%
Multiple Responses	3,685	2%	4,335	3%

Source: 2016 Census

3.2.2 School Markets

Formal school field trips to a public library take place primarily at the elementary level, with informal visits by students more likely at the secondary level for research and study. There is also a trend for libraries to provide outreach to schools, as is also the case for public art galleries. For the AGS, formal field trips may take place at a variety of grade levels. It is particularly important for the AGS to offer programming of interest to the school market for the following main reasons:

- Education is part of the mandate of all museums, galleries and public libraries. There needs to be opportunities to broaden and deepen participation from school groups;
- Children brought to public libraries and museum-related institutions as part of school field trips often convince their parents to take them again;
- For children in lower income/education families attending on a field trip is often the only opportunity to attend charged admission museums.

Whereas school groups often represent 15% to 25% of total attendance for science and historical museum types, they generally account for 5-10% of attendance at art museums/galleries. *The AGS reported that among on-site visitors school groups accounted for close to 12% of the total. While this might indicate a successful school group program it also indicates weakness in attracting other market segments that should be mitigated with a better site and facility. A co-located GSPL and AGS should increase the likelihood of more school group visits to both.*

The key determinants for schools to attend on field trips are the size of the student population within a convenient distance, relationship to curriculum, student enjoyment, proximity and cost.

Enrolment Levels and Projections

School enrollment levels for the four school districts most likely to attend the Art Gallery of Sudbury and the Main Branch of the Greater Sudbury Public Library, as set out in the following table. The combined enrollment is about 28,400 students. *However, given travel times and costs the school groups most likely to attend are those in or close to Greater Sudbury.*

School Board Enrolment	Sudbury Catholic School Board		Rainbow District School Board		Conseil Scolaire catholique de Nouvel-Ontario		Conseil Scolaire public du Grand Nord de l'Ontario		Total Enrolment	
	Schools	Pupils	Schools	Pupils	Schools	Pupils	Schools	Pupils	Schools	Pupils
Elementary	13	3,999	33	8,652	29	5,084	11	1,636	86	19,371
Secondary	4	1,945	9	4,607	9	1,604	8	873	30	9,029
Total	17	5,944	42	13,259	38	6,688	19	2,509	116	28,400
<i>Source: Annual Report, Sudbury Catholic District School Board, 2016-17</i>										
<i>Source: Annual Report, Rainbow District School Board, 2016-17</i>										
<i>Source: Annual Report, Conseil Scolaire catholique de Nouvel-Ontario, 2016-17</i>										
<i>Source: Plan d'amélioration, Conseil scolaire public du Grand Nord de l'Ontario, 2017-18</i>										

Curriculum Links

The visual arts are part of the curriculum at the elementary level for all students and the interest at this level is not to view art but to help create it in workshop spaces. In grade 9 students must select from among art, music, dance, drama or media. Music ranks highest followed by the visual arts, drama, dance and media in that order. With the requirement for only one arts credit at the secondary school level most students take it only in grade 9. The exception is the English public arts magnet school at Sudbury Secondary, as these students take field trips to Toronto, Ottawa and the McMichael Gallery in Kleinburg. A magnet school is a public school offering special instruction and programs not available elsewhere, designed to attract a more diverse student body from throughout a school district as opposed to students attending a school in their neighbourhood. There are science magnet schools in all the school districts.

Earlier interviews indicated strong support for a larger, better quality AGS. This includes opportunities to view art exhibitions and also studio opportunities to create art. The latter reflects trends to reduce costs by not having art supplies in the schools, thereby making field trip opportunities more important, particularly at the elementary school level.

Greater Sudbury is also home to Laurentian University, Collège Boréal and Cambrian College. Each institution has arts-related programs and students that are looking for opportunities to engage with visual art and whose students would seek to access a high quality public library.

Interactivity and Student Enjoyment

Field trips have often been selected according to the extent to which they provide hands-on or interactive participation. With continuing cutbacks in the funds available to schools, there is likely to be an even greater emphasis on selecting field trip destinations that are learning-based and age-appropriate in relation to both content and activities, but also “fun” and interactive, thus offering students higher levels of learning enjoyment. This is rooted in the knowledge that children are more likely to learn if their experience is interesting and enjoyable.

The Greater Sudbury Public Library offers maker space and other programming opportunities for school groups and the Art Gallery of Sudbury has hands-on opportunities as well, which should increase in new facilities.

Field Trip Policies and Cost

It is generally at the elementary levels that most field trips take place since it is a decision of one teacher. At the secondary level that permission is required from several teachers, so that multi-disciplinary initiatives are of particular importance and so a co-location would be beneficial.

An earlier interview with the Arts Education Coordinator with the Rainbow School District included comments that it is not the cost of admission but rather the cost of bus transportation that is the major impediment to school field trips generally. With transportation time and cost as important factors in field trip selection, it is generally found that the bulk of the school market available to any museum-related attraction is from the local area. This should help to increase school field trips from within and close to Greater Sudbury.

Even within Greater Sudbury, it must be emphasized that the window of opportunity when school buses are available is generally from 9:30 a. m. to 2:00 p. m. Attending one field trip destination is also common because teachers prefer to focus on one unit of study and not mix up the focus of the field trip. However, if the GSPL and the AGS are co-located in one building that should increase the likelihood of attending both on a single trip.

3.2.3 Tourist Markets

Tourists are far more likely to attend an art gallery than a public library in a city they are visiting so the assessment of tourist markets for Greater Sudbury is very much focused on the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS). Sudbury is a regional shopping, health care, entertainment and cultural centre for Northeastern Ontario. There are about 310,000 people who reside within a 100-mile radius of Sudbury. Excluding the nearly 165,000 residents of Greater Sudbury this suggests about 145,000 residents who would be categorized as regional day trip or overnight tourists. There is an opportunity for the AGS to offer a wider level of appeal to this and other tourist markets because of the familiarity with Franklin Carmichael and the Group of Seven.

Profile data associated with Greater Sudbury (CMA 580) and Tourist Region 13A, for Northeastern Ontario, are set out below from 2014:

- **Total Person-Visits, Day Trip and Overnight Visitors:** There were about 4,563,200 person visits to the region of which about 1,187,000, or 26% visited Greater Sudbury. Among regional visitors 52% were day trip visitors from within the region, and the remaining 48% overnight visitors. For Greater Sudbury it was 54% day visitors and 46% overnight. Interviews identified a number of factors that should help to boost tourist visits. These include the completion by 2021 of the 4-lane Highway 69 from Parry Sound to Sudbury, which will reduce driving time from Toronto from 4 to 3.5 hours.
- **Origin of Overnight Visitors:** Of overnight visitors to the region, some 89% are from within Ontario, with the remainder mostly from elsewhere in Canada and therefore most likely to be familiar with Franklin Carmichael and the Group of Seven. For Greater Sudbury it was over 86% from within Ontario, and primarily from the northern parts of the province.

- **Main Purpose of Trip:** For total person-visits to the region as a whole, the main purpose for some 41% was to visit friends and relatives (VFR), followed by leisure travel at 37%, business 9%, shopping 6% and other 7%. For visitors to Greater Sudbury the VFR market was even more important, accounting for about 47% of all visitors. *The VFR market is of particular importance because they are influenced by and often accompanied by residents to art galleries and other things to do in a community also including a public library if it offers facilities and services that are special. This is seen by TripAdvisor data in Halifax, Nova Scotia that ranks its new Central Library as the second most popular thing to do in the city, confirming that a great library can be a tourist destination.*
- **Seasonality of Tourism:** Not surprisingly, the peak season for tourism in the region and to Greater Sudbury is the summer, followed by the spring, fall and winter.
- **Activities Participated In:** Only 1.5% of visitors to the region (1.9% for Greater Sudbury) attended a museum or gallery. The data confirm the need for the cultural infrastructure of Greater Sudbury to be enhanced with a better quality and better located public art gallery.

4. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS/ASSUMPTIONS UNDERLYING PROJECTIONS FOR CO-LOCATED GSPL/AGS

This chapter sets out a series of key recommendations/assumptions that have been approved or modified by the client group to form the basis for the capital cost estimates and the attendance, operating revenue and expense projections for a potential co-location of the Main Branch of the Greater Sudbury Public Library (GSPL) and the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS) in Chapter 5 of this report.

4.1 CORE ELEMENTS OF THE CO-LOCATION

The analyses in the previous chapters, the direction that emerged from the two vision/assumptions workshops, the interview process and the judgment and experience of the consultants help to establish the core elements of the co-location. Some of these points are discussed in greater detail in subsequent sections of this chapter:

1. A single building will be constructed and owned by the City of Greater Sudbury on behalf of the Greater Sudbury Public Library to include space leased to the Art Gallery of Sudbury.
2. The co-location will result in less space than would be required in two separate facilities, resulting in lower unit capital and operating costs, as well as the sharing of some spaces.
3. The size of the overall building, as detailed below, is assumed to be 61,800 net sq. ft. of which 18,000 net sq. ft. is dedicated space for the AGS, plus access to some spaces of the Library. (The 2010 study for an independent Art Gallery of Sudbury assumed 33,000 net sq. ft. for the AGS while an internal study for the GSPL estimated 57,000 net sq. ft.) The combined gross square footage of the building, including circulation, mechanical and electrical spaces and wall thicknesses is about 92,700 gsf.
4. The separate missions, governance and staffing structures and sources of operating revenues of the GSPL as a municipal public library and the AGS as an independent art gallery will continue.
5. The AGS will have its own clear identity within the building and on the basis of exterior signage.

6. More space, exhibitions, programming and marketing expenditures and an increase in staffing levels will substantially exceed the earned income opportunities for the AGS in the co-located facility. Specific attendance and financial projections are presented in Chapter 5 ***but it is clear that the AGS will require substantially more operating support from government and private sources, largely from the City of Greater Sudbury. However, this study recommends that the City cash operating support for the AGS remain at the current \$200,000 level based on the following recommendations/ assumptions that assume in-kind City support for the Gallery:***
 - Space will be leased by the City of Greater Sudbury to AGS on a long-term basis at one dollar per year. This represents substantial value provided by the City to the AGS.
 - AGS will retain its own independent governance as a long-term tenant within the space, including its own Board and staff, including internal security.
 - As in-kind rather than cash support to AGS, the City of Greater Sudbury as owner of the building will pay for all building occupancy costs (utilities, repairs and maintenance, insurance) and staff associated with these requirements to include spaces occupied by the AGS.
 - Evening rentals of the lobby space will take place only from Friday to Sunday evenings when the Library is closed to the public. On other evenings when the Library is open until 9 pm there will be no lobby rentals. This allows for a shared lobby as opposed to separate lobbies.
 - Lobby rentals income will go to AGS while revenue from rental of the multi-purpose and meeting rooms within the GSPL will go to the Library.
 - Revenue from the gift shop will go to AGS, which will also bear the staffing and operating costs of the retail operation.
 - AGS will seek to raise as much in capital funding from private and non-municipal government sources as possible.
 - Although it will only be a long-term tenant in the building, the AGS should be able to generate several million dollars of senior government capital funding as well as private support that will help to limit the capital investment of the City of Greater Sudbury in the GSPL building.
 - The AGS will offer the value achieved by receiving the Mastin collections of Carmichael works of art valued at \$3.5 million, which would otherwise be lost to Greater Sudbury.
 - It is also assumed that AGS will seek to develop an endowment to support operations.

4.2 SITE

A **site evaluation** process was conducted by a team of City staff and Board members of the Public Library of Greater Sudbury and the Art Gallery of Sudbury, with input from the consultant. The objective was to lead to a recommended/assumed site for the co-located Public Library of Greater Sudbury and Art Gallery of Sudbury. After reducing from a longer list, the five finalist sites considered by the Site Evaluation Committee were, in alphabetical order:

- Minto Parking Lot

- 10 Elm Office Complex, Assuming Adaptive Reuse of Spaces
- Shaughnessy Parking Lot
- Sudbury Community Arena, Assuming Demolition and New Construction
- Sudbury Community Arena, Assuming Renovation

The evaluation process included site tours, collection and analysis of data regarding each of the sites, the identification of evaluation criteria and a weighting and rating system, all culminating in an all-day evaluation workshop. The results of this workshop led to the ranking of the sites.

7. *The Sudbury Community Arena site emerged as the highest ranking assuming demolition and new construction* on that site to offer the primary benefit of new, purpose-built construction. That being said, there are also uncertainties regarding the timeliness of implementation.

4.3 SPACES AND FACILITIES

The GSPL and AGS are two distinct entities that will be housed within one common building. Their differences are reflected in the distribution of spaces therefore their space programs are addressed individually in this section. Since the building will be owned by the Library, any shared spaces will be spaces of the GSPL and made available periodically to the AGS. Those shared spaces are presented in GSPL's program.

4.3.1 GSPL Space Program

The GSPL's space program provide below is conceptual in nature, provided as a guide to the selected architect who will refine it. It is divided into four areas, each containing similar functions of the library. The fifth column from the left shows what spaces could be shared with the AGS.

DETAILED SPACE PROGRAM FOR MAIN BRANCH OF GSPL

Legend

Area 1: Entry Level Lobby Spaces

Area 2: Meeting Rooms

Area 3: Age Level Service Spaces

Area 4: Staff Spaces

Area	Space Name	Existing Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Assumed New Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Library Spaces with AGS Access	Notes/Comments
1	ENTRY LEVEL LOBBY SPACES				
1.1	Vestibule		200	✓	
1.2	Lobby		1,750	✓	Ticketing takes place here for AGS - ticket counter, membership desk required. Standing area for 150 person reception or banquet seating for 75 persons.
1.3	Café		450	✓	Accessible to AGS patrons. Seating capacity of 30 persons.
1.4	Café kitchen and pantry		175	✓	Can be used for catered events.
1.5	Library Marketplace (new book displays, computer stations)		2750		Filled with displays for books, self-check terminals, info desk, new media, etc. It is a space for transaction, information and quick access to the latest books and media.
1.6	Material Returns Area		75		
1.7	Library Exhibition Space		500		
1.8	Customer Service Desk		400		
1.9	Self Checkout Stations		200		
1.10	Self Pickup Shelves		100		
1.11	Staff Workroom and storage		900		
	Subtotal Area 1 Net Sq Ft	1,332	7,500		

Area	Space Name	Existing Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Assumed New Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Library Spaces with AGS Access	Notes/Comments
2	MEETING ROOMS				
2.1	Multi-Purpose space (100 people) that can be divided into two spaces – flexible		2500	✓	
2.2	Meeting Rooms for up to 8 people (3 @250)		750	✓	
2.3	Meeting Rooms for up to 4 people (4 @ 200)		800	✓	
2.4	Board/Larger Group Room for up to 20		700	✓	
2.5	Quiet Study Rooms (8@100)		800		
	Subtotal Area 2 Net Sq Ft	1,070	5,550		

Area	Space Name	Existing Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Assumed New Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Library Spaces with AGS Access	Notes/Comments
3	AGE LEVEL SERVICES SPACES				
3.1	Children – includes Early Literacy Center		3500		
3.2	-Story Hour/Crafts Room		500		
3.3	Teens		2000		
3.4	Adults- Circulating Collections-Print/Media (69,000 items)		7000		
3.5	-Seating –varied types for 50 people		2000		
3.6	-Reference collection		1500		
3.7	-Genealogy and Local History		2000		
3.8	Maker Space and Digital Media Lab		3000		
3.9	Adult Services – Info Desk		200		
3.1	Technology Learning Center		1200		
	Subtotal Area 3 Net Sq Ft	14,264	22,900		

Area	Space Name	Existing Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Assumed New Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Library Spaces with AGS Access	Notes/Comments
4	STAFF SPACES				
4.1	Staff workrooms - offices		2600		
4.2	Staff breakroom/small kitchen		300		
4.3	Administration Offices		450		
4.4	Technical Services Staff Workrooms -Offices		950		
4.5	Storage (compact shelving?) archives, etc.		1500		
4.6	Shipping and Receiving*		1150	✓	Separate areas off the dock each for art and library receiving.
4.7	Mail Room*		350	✓	
4.8	Staff Lockers, Mail Cubbies, Coat Rack		150		
4.9	Telecommunications Room		150		
4.1	Electrical Room		100		
4.11	Custodial Services Closet		50		
4.12	Building Maintenance Office		100		
	Subtotal Area 4 Net Sq Ft	8,849	7,850		

GSPL - Main Branch Total - Square Fee by Area	Existing Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.	Assumed New Main Branch Net Sq. Ft.
Area1: Entry Level Lobby Spaces	1,332	7,500
Area 2: Meeting Rooms	1,071	5,550
Area 3: Age Level Service Spaces	14,264	22,900
Area 4: Staff Spaces	8,849	7,850
Total New Main Branch Excluding AGS (Net Sq Ft.)	25,516	43,800
Total New AGS Facilities (Net Sq Ft.)		18,000
Total New Main Branch Including AGS (Net Sq Ft.)		61,800
Pre-Design Grossing Factor (50%)		30,900
Total New Main Branch Including AGS (Gross Sq Ft.)		92,700

4.3.2 Detailed AGS Space Program

The following detailed space program for the Art Gallery of Sudbury is broken up into four museum zones, based on public/non-public spaces which are then further broken down to those that house collections and those that do not. This zoning breakdown assists with cost estimating since public spaces in galleries have higher level of finishes and those that house collections require more stringent environmental controls such as temperature and relative humidity.

The four zones are as follows with comparative figures for the existing Art Gallery of Sudbury. The existing AGS offers a small indoor space plus outdoor spaces used for education, rentals and a sculpture garden. It is unknown at this time whether there will outdoor opportunities at the new site.

DETAILED SPACE PROGRAM FOR AGS IN NEW GSPL BUILDING

Legend

Zone A - Public Non-Collection Spaces

Zone B - Public Collection Spaces

Zone C - Non-Public Collection Spaces

Zone D - Non-Public Spaces - Admin/Operations

Zone A	Space Name	Existing Space Net Sq Ft	New AGS Net Sq Ft	Notes/Comments
A1	PUBLIC AMENITIES			
A1.1	Public Lockers/Cloakroom	100	150	With coin operated lockers for public to check personal belongings (backpack and stroller size). Lending of umbrella and wheelchair.
A1.1	Public and Staff Washrooms	164	Part of Grossing	Distributed on each floor except ground floor as assumed to be shared with Library on that level. Must meet barrier-free code requirements.
A1.3	Retail Store + Art Rental Gallery	350	600	
A2	PUBLIC PROGRAM			
A2.1	Family Art Studio	1,380	800	Providing the public with opportunities to participate in and experience artistic creation in painting, drawing, sculpture, prints.
A2.2	Multi-Purpose Room		800	Classroom/multi-purpose space devoted to school group assembly and orientation; school lunchroom; used for other learning activities; rentable for birthday parties .
A2.3	Resource Centre/Art Studio		500	Dedicated space for art education C9:G16
	Total Zone A Net Sq Ft	1,994	2,850	

Zone B	Space Name	Existing Space Net Sq Ft	New AGS Net Sq Ft	Notes/Comments
B	PUBLIC COLLECTION			All environmentally controlled areas
B.1	Temporary Exhibition Gallery	2,193	1,500	Regular venue for temporary exhibitions; will combine with Permanent Collection Gallery B.2 for larger shows.
B.2	Permanent Collection Gallery		1,500	Rotating exhibits of the permanent collection; will combine with the Temporary Exhibition Gallery B.1 when needed for larger temporary shows.
B.3	Franklin Carmichael Gallery		1,000	Permanent but changing exhibition of Carmichael works. Works on paper must be changed every two months. An area will be displayed as his studio with easel etc.
B.4	First Nations Gallery		1,000	
B.5	Francophone Gallery		1,000	
	Total Zone B Net Sq Ft	2,193	6,000	

Zone C	Space Name	Existing Space Net Sq Ft	New AGS Net Sq Ft	Notes/Comments
C1	NON-PUBLIC COLLECTION			All environmentally controlled areas.
C1.1	Collection Storage (Sculpture)	1,241	1,000	
C1.2	Collection Storage (Works on Paper/Photography)		500	
C1.3	Collection Storage (Oil Paintings)		1,000	
C1.4	Collection Storage (New Media)		200	
C1.5	Temporary Exhibition Storage		500	Temporary holding of incoming/outgoing loan collections and temporary exhibitions awaiting galleries installation or repacking for onward shipment.
C1.6	Enclosed Collections Loading Dock: Collections Shipping/Receiving		600	Direct back-in loading dock with dock leveler.
C1.7	Crating/Uncrating		500	For packing/unpacking crated works of art.
C1.8	Isolation Room		130	Accommodates freezer or anoxic chamber.
C1.9	Clean Workshop		375	For matting, framing, mounting, cleaning or other preparation of works of art for display.
C1.10	Curatorial Examination Room		375	For examining and documenting possible acquisitions, and for study of loaned or permanent collection works of art.
C1.11	Crate Storage		300	
Subtotal Zone C Net Sq Ft		1,241	5,480	

Zone	Space Name	Existing Space Net Sq Ft	New AGS Net Sq Ft	Notes/Comments
D1	ADMINISTRATION			
D1.1	Director/Curator	700	150	Private office
D1.2	Curator Alternate and Collection Manager		100	Private office
D1.3	Manager, Education and Public Programs		100	Private office
D1.4	Education Coordinator		70	Open Office
D1.5	Front Desk, Membership and Facilities Coordinator		70	Open Office
D1.6	Project Staff - collections, marketing communications, (+ other needs)		125	2.5 FTE Open Office
D1.7	Manager, Revenue, Development and Marketing		100	Private office with safe
D1.8	Executive Assistant (Volunteer Coordinator and Bookings Clerk)		100	Private office
D1.9	Exhibition and Events Coordinator/Registrar		100	Private office
D1.10	Administrative Assistant		50	0.6 FTE
D1.11	Bookkeeper		50	0.4 FTE
D1.12	Additional evening/Weekend Staff		50	0.4 FTE
D1.13	Photocopy/Mailroom/Storage/Stockroom		100	
D1.14	Staff/ Volunteer Kitchenette + Lounge	100	300	
D2	OPERATIONS			
D2.1	Packing Supplies Storage	521	150	
D2.2	Chemical Supplies Storage		25	
D2.3	Lamp Storage		25	
D2.4	'Dirty' Workshop		400	Workshop for making and painting plinths, crates, panels, cases, mounts, frames.
D2.5	Moving Equipment Storage Area		100	Area in shipping-receiving to hold forklift when not in use.
D2.6	Exhibit Case/Prop Storage		600	
D2.7	Education Program Storage		30	
D2.8	Equipment Storage		75	
D2.9	Storage - Tables and Chairs		400	
D2.10	Information Services Server Room		50	
D2.11	Retail Stockroom		200	
D2.12	Collection Loading Dock Security Booth		100	Surveillance over Collection Shipping/Receiving
D2.13	Collection Loading Dock Security Guards' Toilet		50	
Subtotal Zone D Net Sq Ft		1,321	3,670	

The chart below compares the AGS' area distribution per zone in square feet for the existing AGS to the assumed space within the Main Branch of the GSPL. Also included is a percentage breakdown of the space allocation for the new AGS spaces.

Art Gallery of Sudbury Total Sq Ft. by Zone	Existing Space Net Sq Ft	New AGS Net Sq Ft
Zone A: Public Service/Program	1,994	2,850
Zone B: Public Collection Space	2,193	6,000
Zone C: Non-Public Collection Spaces	1,241	5,480
Zone D: Non-Public Non-Collection Spaces	1,321	3,670
Total Indoor Net Sq Ft.	6,749	18,000
Existing Outdoor Space	8,280	N/A
Total Indoor and Outdoor Net Sq Ft.	15,029	18,000

4.4 STAFFING

Staffing accounts for a large percentage of the operating costs of both public libraries and public art galleries. The space and facilities program above indicates spaces within the GSPL to which the AGS will have periodic access. Although the staff will be separate, the assumption is of ongoing collaboration, including shared programming opportunities.

4.4.1 Greater Sudbury Public Library

The staffing estimates for the GSPL are based on the following assumptions:

- There will be two floors of public service functions. Offices, meeting rooms, etc. may be on another floor or floors but only two will have library public functions.
- The hours and days of opening will remain the same as current facility.
- The library will use RFID tags and self-check in and out for the majority of the circulation functions.
- The layout of the public service floors will be open and visible with very few closed rooms.
- There will be small information desks on each floor and one in the children's area with a minimum of staffing (1 or 2 persons depending on time of day and demand) on each.
- There will be 1 or 2 staff members who will have the expertise to assist in the Maker Space and the Digital Media Lab.
- The use of the meeting rooms by the library as well as external groups will be significant. Staff may be needed to do meeting room set ups and break downs.
- The library usage will increase substantially based on the experience of new and/or major renovated and expanded libraries.

The consultants were informed that 27 Full Time Equivalent staff positions are currently allocated to the Greater Sudbury Public Library – Main Branch. Some 26 staff members work on one or more public service shifts per week (at full capacity). Based on the assumptions above, it is recommended and assumed that GSPL plan to add the following positions:

- Emerging Technology Programmer to develop programming with the public, assist with technology and technology instruction and to work in the Makerspace and Digital Media Lab as needed.
 - Curatorial Assistant to assist with bringing up to standard the state of all museum permanent collection storage, permanent collection displays and associated all associated documentation.
 - Security Guard to enhance the security of the new facility.
8. *It is assumed that there will be an additional 3.0 FTE positions leading to a total of 30 FTE positions relative to the current 27.*

4.4.2 Art Gallery of Sudbury

At present the reported level of staffing at the Art Gallery of Sudbury is only five full time staff plus, a reduction of two project-funded positions from the previous 7 FTE, plus part-time, seasonal and project staff that bring the total to 9.1 FTE. It is recommended and assumed that the two positions will be reinstated and that the staffing in the context of a larger facility with more programming, open hours, evening rentals and other needs.

It has also been recommended and assumed that as in-kind rather than additional City cash support to the AGS, the janitorial and maintenance staff of the GSPL will cover the entire building, including the AGS.

The existing, reinstated and additional staff of the Art Gallery of Sudbury are recommended/assumed as follows. Including project, seasonal and part-time staff, the AGS operates with 9.1 FTE positions. It has been assumed that the two positions recently eliminated will be reinstated in the new facility and that as shown in parentheses, the Executive Assistant position will include responsibility for volunteer coordination and bookings, both for rentals and educational program visits. And it is assumed that internal security will be the responsibility of the AGS.

9. In the context of a larger but co-located facility, the **AGS is recommended/assumed to add 4.4 FTE positions as shown on table, to bring the total to 13.5 FTE.** However, during the assumed 3-month major exhibition in Year 2, which will have fixed admission charges, it is assumed there will be that an additional 0.5 FTE part-timers.

Art Gallery of Sudbury Staffing Plan	FTE
Existing Positions	
Director/Curator	1.0
Curator Alternate and Collections Manager/Registrar	1.0
Manager, Education and Public Programs	1.0
Education Coordinator	1.0
Front Desk, Membership and Facilities Coordinator	1.0
Project Staff - collections, marketing, communications, (other needs)	2.5
Seasonal and part-time staff - education, grounds and building	1.6
Reinstated and Modified Positions	
Development, Revenue and Marketing Coordinator	1.0
Additional Positions	
Security and Preparator	1.0
Exhibition, Events and Volunteer Coordinator	1.0
Administrative Assistant and Bookings Clerk	0.6
Bookkeeper	0.4
Additional evening/weekend staff	0.4
Total AGS Staff in Co-Located Facility	13.5

4.5 OPERATING SCHEDULE

10. The operating hours of the GSPL and the AGS are as follows, with recommended changes set out on the table as well. For the AGS a downtown, easily accessible site should enable it to maintain consistent hours on a year-round basis. This includes a recommended evening opening once per week and opening to the public daily at 10 a. m. and allowing for pre-booked exclusive school use earlier in the morning.

	Main Library - Greater Sudbury Public Library	Art Gallery of Sudbury
Current Open Days/ Hours	Early June to early Sept: Monday and Thursday 8:30 to 9; Tuesday, Wednesday and Friday: 8:30 to 5; Saturday 10 to 2 Sunday closed Early September to Early June: Monday to Thursday 8:30 – 9; Friday 8:30 – 5; Saturday 10-4; Sunday 12-4	Summer: Monday to Saturday 9-5 Rest of Year : Tuesday to Saturday 10 - 5 Sundays Year-Round: 12 – 5
Recommended Open Days/ Hours	No changes are recommended	Year Round: Daily 10 a. m. to 5 p. m. One evening to 9 p. m. Exclusive school use before 10 a. m. if pre-booked

4.6 ADMISSION CHARGES

A charged admission AGS does not appear practical in a co-located facility with a free admission public library, particularly when the majority of art galleries in Ontario offer admission by donation or free admission and when none of the library/art gallery co-locations studied included charged admission for the Gallery.

Our recommendations/assumptions associated with admission charges are as follows:

11. It is recommended/assumed that the Art Gallery of Sudbury will offer its ***permanent collection and most temporary exhibitions on the basis of suggested admissions (pay what you can)*** while major level temporary exhibitions are charged.
12. For the purposes of the projections in this report we assume ***one major level temporary exhibition that will be charged every two years for a period of three months during the summer***. This takes into account the cost of bringing in such exhibitions and the need for government or private funding to help pay for them as occurred for example with the *For Better or Worse* exhibition.
13. We recommend that the ***charge for major temporary exhibitions*** be applicable to all visitors with the exception of AGS members. Recommended charges are as follows, with adults defined to be age 25 and older to provide a price break to youth, whether attending school/university or not.

Recommended Admission Charges for Periodic Major Temporary Exhibitions	
Category	Admission Charge
Adult (25-64)	\$10.00
Senior (65+)/Youth (13-24)	\$8.00
Child (5-12)	\$5.00
School Group (per person)	\$4.00
Other Group (per person, average)	\$6.50
Members, under 5, other free	\$0.00

4.7 REVENUE CENTRES

4.7.1 Retail

14. ***The AGS store will be integrated with admissions/information off the lobby to allow the same staff to operate both.***
15. The ***product line will include*** a selection of collection related and other art and craft books and journals, reprints, and also items that reflect the AGS brand.

4.7.2 Rentals

Rental of spaces for functions and other events is the fastest growing revenue center for museums/galleries and most new facilities are being designed to maximize income from this source. Among the various museum types art museums/galleries are the most successful in generating income from rentals. Public libraries are also developing revenues from facility rentals. Recommendations/ assumptions associated with facility rentals are as follows:

16. It is assumed that the **AGS will have access to the lobby when the GSPL is not open to the public. This will often be during Friday, Saturday and Sunday evenings.** Rental rates will be at or above market rates to avoid competing unfairly with private sector facilities and other municipal facilities that are also seeking to maximize rentals income.
17. Rentals will also take place in the GSPL the multi-purpose space, which is assumed to be a flat floor space with flexible seating. **The revenue from the multi-purpose space will accrue to the Library.**
18. The GSPL will also generate revenue from **rental of its meeting rooms** based on charges for commercial or for-profit entities.
19. A **preferred caterer** will be designated to have near exclusive rights to events, with opportunities for other caterers for special circumstances like kosher, halal or other specialty foods. It is assumed the caterer will have access to kitchen facilities.

4.7.3 Café

Taking into account the assumed Sudbury Community Arena site, it is assumed that:

20. There will be a **small café concessioned out to a private operator**, based on approved City procurement policies, who will also be the preferred (but not exclusive) caterer for events/rentals in the facility, both the lobby rentals of AGS and the GSPL-operated multi-purpose space.
21. There will be a related café/catering kitchen with storage.
22. No food/garbage deliveries and route of travel will cross the AGS front of house and back of house spaces that house collections.

4.7.4 Membership

Whereas library cards, which represent a type of membership, are free, membership in art galleries/museums is charged.

Regarding membership in the AGS, it must be emphasized there are essentially two main motivations for membership. The most common, particularly for the lower level membership categories such as family, individual and student, is value for money spent in unlimited free admission, discounts on retail purchases, programs and rentals. A second motivation is love of the institution and what it represents or associated philanthropy or civic pride. These persons tend to become upper level members in categories with names like patron, sustainer, benefactor, etc. and are easier to transition to donor categories.

Assuming admission by donation with the exception of major exhibitions means that lower level memberships for the AGS will continue to be limited but the admissions by donation should help to boost upper level memberships.

23. The **benefits associated with lower level membership categories** are assumed to include free admission to major exhibitions, discounts on retail, programs and rentals.
24. For upper level membership we recommend introduction of **guest passes** during charged temporary exhibitions distributed through social service agencies, religious institutions and schools to those who cannot afford admission to major exhibitions. Tax receipts should be issued to the upper level members who participate.

4.7.5 Other Sources of Income

Additional recommendations/assumptions associated with earned and other income sources are as follows:

25. An increase in the size of the space and additional staffing will allow for expansion of the **educational and public programs** offered by the AGS, and thus the revenues that may be generated.
26. A **menu of sponsorship and programming opportunities** will be developed and promoted to potential private funders. This might include sponsored free admission tickets for major exhibitions, parking, sponsored staff positions and other ideas developed by management.
27. The AGS will continue to access senior government project and operating **grants**.
28. The AGS will encourage a volunteer to create an **interactive donation box** that not only seeks funds on the basis of supporting the mission of the institution but also on interactive features in which the box responds mechanically to the donation of money, perhaps something related to the mixing of colours.
29. The GSPL will **introduce fundraising activities and seek donors** to support efforts on literacy education, children's services, new technologies and enhanced collections.

4.8 MARKETING

The best form of marketing is the product or visitor experience itself as it leads to favourable word of mouth. This applies to both the GSPL and the AGS. A good downtown site and much improved facilities featuring high quality exhibition space and enhanced public and educational programs will help to boost resident, school and tourist attendance for the AGS. Nonetheless additional marketing expenditures and other initiatives will also be required. For example, it is recommended/ assumed that:

30. **The AGS marketing budget will increase** to help boost awareness and attendance levels and exposure to revenue centers, but also reflect the need to control operating costs.
31. The AGS **web site and brochure** will focus very much on the Franklin Carmichael and Group of Seven as well as communicating the opportunities available to visitors.
32. Given the visual nature of an art gallery, **media placement** by the AGS will focus primarily on, web-based and social media and there will be cross-promotion with the GSPL.

33. Marketing and branding are key for public libraries. The new *GSPL will seek to widen its social media presence and enhance its website* as the most important entry point to the public for using and understanding library services.

4.9 OPTIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE OF EXISTING MAIN BRANCH OF GSPL AND BELL MANSION SITES

This section sets out options and recommendations associated with the future uses of the existing Main Branch of the GSPL on Mackenzie Street and the Bell Mansion properties assuming a relocation of the Main Branch of the GSPL and the AGS to the Sudbury Community Arena site.

4.9.1 GSPL – Main Branch Property

The Main Branch of the Greater Sudbury Public Library facility on Mackenzie Street downtown was originally constructed in 1952 with an addition in 1976. As discussed earlier, a building condition report prepared in 2012 concluded that “some of the components of the building are not in a state of good repair. Major capital outlay is required to ensure the viability of this facility. In this context, a number of options for the future use of the Mackenzie Library property were identified in the interview process.

These included:

- Adaptive reuse as a City archives based on a relocation of the archives from the current Falconbridge site.
 - Another unidentified City use of the space.
 - Sale of the property to allow for expansion of the seniors’ housing in the area or another non-municipal use.
34. Given the substantial capital reinvestment that would be required for use as an archives or other adaptive reuse, the most practical future use would be the **sale of the property**, the proceeds from which could be used to help offset costs of the new co-located Greater Sudbury Public Library and Art Gallery of Sudbury project.

4.10 BELL MANSION PROPERTY

The Bell Mansion and gardens was originally a private residence and was renovated at public expense through a Chamber of Commerce drive in the mid-1960s to become a museum. It was a community centennial project for Sudbury. The property was transferred in 1968 in a renovated condition to Laurentian University, which retains ownership while the Art Gallery of Sudbury occupies the property. The University has insured the building and property at a value of over \$2.1 million.

The options for the future use of the Bell Mansion once the Art Gallery of Sudbury relocates to become a long-term tenant in a co-located facility with the Public Library of Greater Sudbury are challenging given ownership by Laurentian University and the heritage nature of the building in a residential neighborhood. Potential options identified during the interview process in this study include:

- A not-for-profit historic house and public gardens that could generate revenue from admissions, weddings and other rentals, but would require substantial ongoing operating support following substantial capital reinvestment.
 - An unidentified use by Laurentian University.
 - Sale of the property to enable it to return to being a private residence, with the proceeds used to help support the capital cost requirements of the co-located Public Library and Art Gallery and/or initiatives of Laurentian University.
35. There is no clear recommendation that emerges among these options. *As a property owned by Laurentian University, there may be a desire to engage in a community consultation process before determining the most appropriate use of the site.*

4.11 OTHER ASSUMPTIONS

36. The GSPL and AGS will not be responsible for payment of any property **taxes**.
37. **Debt repayment** will be part of the operating expenses applied to the GSPL, recognizing that the City of Greater Sudbury will be making the debt payments. There will be no debt payments for the AGS.
38. All revenue and expense projections will be stated in year **2018 constant dollars**, thus a specific inflation factor will not be included in our estimates. However, some revenues and expenses tend to increase at a higher rate than the rate of inflation. For example, staff compensation levels (salaries, wages, benefits and taxes) will be projected to grow on an annual basis by 0.5% above the prevailing rate of inflation each year.

It must be noted that financial projections are subject to the inherent uncertainties of the future. There is no representation that the projections will be realized in whole or in part. However, taking the assumptions into account and based on the scope of our work, we believe the projections set out in the next chapter of this report are reasonable.

5. FINANCIAL ANALYSIS

This chapter sets out capital cost estimates and identifies potential capital funding sources. It also details projections of attendance, operating revenues and expenses of the Greater Sudbury Public Library (GSPL) and the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS) assuming new construction at the Sudbury Community Arena site. The estimates are understood to be preliminary and order of magnitude at this pre-design stage of planning.

5.1 CAPITAL COST ESTIMATE

The capital cost estimates in this report are at a pre-design level and reflect the assumed functional program for the proposed new Greater Sudbury Public Library (GSPL) detailed in the previous chapter, which includes the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS) as a long-term tenant within the space. The estimates also assume new construction which could be on any downtown site plus estimated site development costs associated with demolition of the existing Sudbury Community Arena and new construction on that site.

The net program area for the Library portion for the building is 43,800 square feet. At this stage we have applied a gross up factor of 50% to the net program area to estimate a total gross building area of 65,700 square feet. Similarly, the Art Gallery space within the building is 18,000 net square feet. For estimate purposes, we have applied a gross up factor of 50% to the net program area to estimate a total gross building area of 27,000 square feet.

The combined program area for the building is 61,800 net square feet with an estimated total gross building area of 92,700 square feet.

For the purposes of developing a realistic elemental estimate for the building, we have assumed the building would be two storeys high with a 60/40 split between the Ground (60%) and Second Floors (40%).

The Order of Magnitude Estimate is intended to establish a realistic budget of the hard construction costs at this pre-design stage. The estimate reflects our opinion as to the fair market value for the construction of this proposed project and is not intended to predict the lowest bid.

The estimate includes all direct and indirect construction costs consistent with the information available. Certain exclusions and qualifications may apply as set out below.

5.1.1 Project Details

General Information:

From the functional program information in Chapter 4 we have developed elemental quantities where possible and applied unit rates for the specific items based on historical and current cost data for this type of project. Where design information was limited, we have made assumptions based on our experience with projects of a similar type, size, and standard of quality.

Location:

The location cost base for this estimate is the Sudbury Community Arena in downtown Sudbury, Ontario.

Measurement and Pricing:

The estimate has been derived using generally accepted principles on method of measurement as per the Canadian Institute of Quantity Surveyors Elemental Cost Analysis and/or Method of Measurement of Construction Works.

The rates used and developed for this estimate where applicable include labour and material, equipment, and subcontractor's overheads and profit. Unit rates are based on our experience with similar projects of this nature and our recent project experience in Sudbury, Ontario.

We have assumed that unionized commercial contractors would perform the work. This estimate is not intended to be a prediction of the lowest bid and assumes competitive bidding for all aspects of the work.

Environmental Sustainability:

The estimate incorporates design elements consistent with LEED and Green Globes as identified within the estimate; however the premiums associated with LEED Certification and a third party LEED consultant have been excluded from the estimate.

Taxes:

The estimate excludes Harmonized Sales Tax (HST).

General Requirements and Fees:

The fee for the General Contractor is included as a percentage of the hard construction cost. The general requirements are based on our assumptions of the anticipated construction approach and schedule.

The estimate includes premiums associated with bonding and insurance. The actual cost of insurance and bonding would be subject to the project specific requirements and the contractor's performance history.

Procurement Methodology:

We have assumed that the project would be procured with a General Contractor approach under a CCDC 2 - 2008 standard form of contract. We have assumed a minimum of three bids would be received for all trade categories to establish competitive bidding and tender results. The estimate is a determination of fair market pricing and not a prediction of lowest bid in any trade category. Please note that should the above minimum bidding conditions not occur on this project, construction bids received could vary significantly from the estimated costs included within this report.

Schedule / Phasing:

The project has been priced to be completed as a single phase. The estimate is based on a schedule of approximately 14 to 16 months with a construction start at Q2 2019. The unit rates in our estimate are based on construction activities occurring during normal working hours and proceeding within a non-accelerated construction schedule. The premiums associated with an accelerated construction schedule and onerous winter working conditions are excluded from the estimate.

Area / Project Statistics:

The areas have been measured in accordance with the Canadian Institute of Quantity Surveyors Standard Method of Measurement.

5.1.2 Contingencies

General:

The effective use of contingencies in construction cost planning requires a clear understanding of estimating risks in both a project specific and general construction market sense. The appropriate level of contingency is dependent on the amount of information available, knowledge of the design teams' methods and philosophy, the timing of the estimate preparation relative to the project design and construction schedule, and the anticipated complexity of the construction work.

Design and Pricing:

A design and pricing contingency of 12% is included in the estimate. This allowance where included is meant to cover pricing and design unknowns during the preparation of this estimate, and not additional scope or functional program requirements.

Escalation:

An allowance for escalation based on 6% (straight-line 3% per annum x 2 years) of the estimate hard construction costs has included in the estimate. This allowance where included is meant to address anticipated changes in construction costs due to market fluctuations between the date of this report and the anticipated tender date.

Construction Contingency (Post Contract):

A post contract contingency of 5% has been included. The intention of this contingency is to cover the cost of post contract change orders.

5.1.3 General Statement of Liability

Probable Costs and Ongoing Cost Control:

Altus Group Limited does not guarantee that tenders or actual construction costs will not vary from this estimate. Acute market conditions, proprietary specifications, or competition/collaboration among contractors may cause tenders to vary from reasonable estimates based on normal and abnormal competitive conditions.

Altus Group Limited recommends the owner and/or design team review the cost estimate report including line item descriptions, unit prices, allowances, assumptions, exclusions, and contingencies to ensure the appropriate design intent has been accurately captured within the report.

It should be noted that the cost consultants are not qualified to confirm that construction work and design is in accordance with approved plans and specifications.

5.1.4 Project Description and Scope Assumptions

Inclusions and Assumptions:

The estimate includes the following major assumptions:

Substructure

- No basement area assumed
- Conventional spread footing foundation including strip and pad footings
- Cast-in-place reinforced concrete foundation walls
- Open cut excavation
- Local dewatering (pumping to grade)
- Perimeter weeping tile
- Insulation to the perimeter foundation walls at 5 feet below grade

Structure

- 5" thick concrete slab on grade with vapour barrier and insulation
- Conventional structure steel framed building with columns, beams and open web joists, composite metal deck at upper floors
- Structural steel stairs including a Feature stair from Ground to Second Floor
- Mechanical space would be located on the Upper Floor (not as a separate penthouse over the Upper Floor)

Exterior Enclosure

- Reinforced concrete block walls where required
- Aluminum framed glass curtain wall to 60% of the total cladding area
- Masonry brick / Precast concrete panels to 40% of the total cladding area with the appropriate back up exterior wall assembly
- Glazed main entry doors, hollow metal exit doors, overhead door at Receiving area
- Metal louvers to mechanical room
- Built up membrane roofing with a minimum of 6" roof insulation
- Roof paver allowance
- Entrance canopy allowance
- Roof parapets and soffit projections

Interior Partitions and Doors

- Reinforced concrete shear / elevator / stair walls
- Concrete block walls where fire rating is required
- Metal stud and gypsum board at demising walls, corridors, and common areas
- Glazed partitions to vestibules and public areas
- Glazed doors at entry vestibules
- Hollow metal doors and frames to storage, service areas, and stairwells
- Solid core wood doors and wood frames to the administration areas

Floor Finishes

- Floor finishes have been assumed based on the room function. Refer to Element B2.1
 - Floor Finishes in the estimate for the floor finishes assumptions.
- Ceiling finishes have been assumed based on room function. Refer to Element B2.2
 - Ceiling Finishes in the estimate for the ceiling finishes assumptions.
- Wall finishes have been assumed based on the room function. Refer to Element B2.3
 - Wall Finishes in the estimate for the wall finishes assumptions.

Fittings and Fixtures

- Steel handrails and balustrades to stairs
- Miscellaneous metals
- Interior signage allowance (doors and wayfinding)
- Staff lockers
- Common area washroom accessories
- Recessed entrance pedimats
- Kitchen millwork with solid surface counter tops
- Washroom vanity millwork with solid surface counter tops
- Closet rod and shelf
- Allowance for millwork to public and administration areas

Equipment and Furnishings

- Window washing anchors only (window washing equipment is excluded)
- Public area window coverings/blinds

Conveying Systems

- No. 1 hydraulic passenger elevator assumed oversized and added capacity to act as both a passenger and service elevator to the Upper Floor

Mechanical

- Good quality commercial plumbing fixtures
- Fire protection (sprinkler) system throughout to NFPA standards
- Kitchen and washroom exhaust directly vented
- Gas hot water boiler provides domestic hot water
- Gas fired hot water boiler provides hot water for building heating
- Make-up air units include hot water heating and chilled water cooling
- Allowance for central building filtration system
- Allowance for controls for major mechanical equipment and the individual HVAC units
- Natural gas service by local utility

Electrical

- LED lighting throughout
- Security system
- Fire alarm system
- Digital metering – installation only
- Communication cables are excluded (only conduits provided)

Site

- Rough and finish grading
- Concrete sidewalks and pavers
- Asphalt paving and concrete curbs to parking areas and driveways
- Soft landscaping including trees, shrubs, plantings, and sod
- Incoming mechanical and electrical services
- Site lighting
- Mechanical site storm drainage

5.1.5 Exclusions

The following items are excluded from the estimate:

- Harmonized Sales Tax (HST) and any related tax exemptions or credits
- Land and associated costs
- Removal and/or handling of hazardous/contaminated material
- Abnormal soil conditions
- Rock excavation

- Utility connection costs/charges
- Soft costs and professional fees
- Legal fees and expenses
- Realty taxes, levies, insurance
- Operating or maintenance costs
- Interest/finance charges
- Owner supplied FF&E such as loose furniture and equipment (except as noted)
- Municipal off site service connections
- Building and/or development permit fees
- Moving or relocation costs
- Decanting costs of the existing library or art gallery
- Sole sourcing of materials, services, or equipment
- Premiums related to accelerated schedule or after hours work
- Public art or interior art work
- Storage racking to the Collection areas
- Woodworking equipment to Workshop areas

5.1.6 Executive Estimate Summary

The 'Hard' Construction Cost Estimate can be summarized as follows:

	Component	GFA(m2)	\$/ (m2)	GFA(SF)	\$/SF	ESTIMATE TOTAL
1	Decommissioning & Demolition (Existing Arena)					
1.1	Decommission the existing Sudbury Community Arena	10,100	\$99	108,715	\$9	\$997,000
1.2	Demolish the existng Sudbury Community Arena	10,100	\$286	108,715	\$27	\$2,886,000
1.3	Site Work (Backfill and making good)	10,100	\$61	108,715	\$6	\$617,000
	Sub Total - GFA (excluding contingencies)	10,100	\$446	108,715	\$41	\$4,500,000
2	New Construction - Library & Art Gallery					
2.1	New Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury - Base Building	8,612	\$1,966	92,700	\$182.68	\$16,934,000
2.2	Public Library Fit Out	6,104	\$1,558	65,700	\$145	\$9,509,267
2.3	Art Gallery of Sudbury - Fit Out	2,508	\$1,536	27,000	\$143	\$3,853,665
	Combined Total - Base Building + Fit Out	2,508	\$12,078	92,700	\$327	\$30,296,900
3	Site Development (Brownfield site at 240 Elgin Street)	2,508	\$37	92,700	\$42	\$3,871,700
	Sub Total - GFA (excluding contingencies)	8,612	\$3,968	92,700	\$369	\$34,168,600
4	Design and Pricing Allowance 12.0%	8,612	\$476	92,700	\$44	\$4,100,300
	Sub Total - GFA (including design allowance)	8,612	\$11	92,700	\$413	\$38,268,900
	Contingencies:					
5	Escalation Contingency 6.0%	8,612	\$238	92,699	\$22	\$2,050,100
6	Construction Contingency 5.0%	8,612	\$195	92,700	\$18	\$1,681,000
	TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COST (excluding HST)	8,612	\$4,877	92,700	\$453	\$42,000,000
7	Harmonized Sales Tax (HST) 0%					EXCLUDED
	TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COST (excluding HST)	8,612	\$5,399	92,700	\$502	\$46,500,000

The 'Hard' Construction Cost Estimate can be summarized as follows:

Component		GFA(m2)	\$/ (m2)	GFA(SF)	\$/SF	ESTIMATE TOTAL
ITEMIZED ESTIMATES (Included Above): <i>(Itemized Estimates include the associated General Requirements, Fee & Contingencies)</i>						
Separate Item Description		Quantity	Unit	Rate	Sub-Total	Estimate Total
1	Sudbury Public Library					
1.1	Public Library - Base Building	65,700	SF	\$219.27	\$14,406,079	
1.2	Public Library - Fit Out	65,700	SF	\$180.42	\$11,853,872	
1.3	Art Gallery of Sudbury - Site Development	65,700	SF	\$50.74	\$3,333,534	
	Total for Itemized Estimate - Public Library	65,700	SF	\$450.43		\$29,593,000
2	Art Gallery of Sudbury					
2.1	Art Gallery of Sudbury - Base Building	27,000	SF	\$228.67	\$6,174,034	
2.2	Art Gallery of Sudbury - Fit Out	27,000	SF	\$142.73	\$4,803,824	
2.3	Art Gallery of Sudbury - Site Development	27,000	SF	\$43.02	\$1,428,657	
	Total for Itemized Estimate - Art Gallery	27,000	SF	\$459.52		\$12,407,000
	Combined Total (excluding HST)	92,700	SF	\$453.07		\$42,000,000
3	Decommissioning & Demolition	108,715	SF	\$41.39		\$4,500,000
	Combined Total (excluding HST)	92,700	SF	\$502		\$46,500,000

5.1.6 Potential Capital Funding Sources

As is common for all public libraries in Canada, the capital funding of the new Greater Sudbury Public Library will be primarily from the financial resources of the City of Greater Sudbury. However, there are available senior government capital funding sources available to both public libraries and especially to public art galleries described below. In fact, the inclusion of the Art Gallery of Sudbury within the facility will increase the likelihood of and amounts that may be achieved for the co-located project from senior government sources and especially private support.

The main sources of government funds that would be applicable to both public libraries and public art galleries are as follows. Other programs that were identified in the interviews process as potential sources are also listed but FEDNOR and the NOHFC would not be applicable for capital funding for reasons set out below:

Canada Cultural Spaces Fund (CCSF)

The Program components are:

- Construction and/or Renovation
- Specialized Equipment
- Feasibility Studies for Construction and/or Renovation Projects

Eligible Projects

Eligible projects are construction and/or renovation projects, and specialized equipment purchases related to cultural infrastructure projects intended for professional arts and/or heritage activities.

To be eligible, organizations that apply for a construction and/or renovation project must demonstrate that they own the building or they have a long term lease (minimum of 10 years). *The Art Gallery of Sudbury was advised that up to 50% of the Gallery costs plus up to 50% of specialized equipment and that an application to CCSF would be rated as a higher priority for funding should it come from the Gallery rather than the municipality on the basis of a long-term tenancy.*

Eligible Expenses

Eligible expenses must be directly related to the project presented, including but not limited to these below:

Construction and/or Renovation Projects:

- Professional fees such as architectural, engineering and technical services, project management and environmental assessment
- Construction and/or renovation of cultural infrastructure, including:
 - Property acquisition/transfers
 - Project's interest on short-term financing
 - Demolition, excavation
 - Materials and labour
 - Fire safety and security systems
 - Systems and measures to improve accessibility and mobility
 - Environmental practices and sustainable construction, e.g. LEED, ecoENERGY, etc.
 - Permanent seating
- Administrative costs directly related to the project, e.g. salaries, postage, photocopies, telephone, calls for tender, services to provide materials in both official languages, etc.
- Purchase and installation of public art as part of construction and/or renovation project

Specialized Equipment:

- Sound and lighting equipment
- Removable seating
- Stage curtains
- Staging and rigging equipment
- Multimedia equipment
- Portable dance floor
- Purchase and installation of an integrated data collecting and ticketing system

- Environmental control systems
- Storage system
- Exhibition cases, panels and interactive displays related to a permanent exhibition
- Installation costs and initial training related to the operation of specialized equipment
- Hanging system for exhibition
- Hygrothermograph

Feasibility Study:

- Professional fees related to the assessment of the viability of the project
- Professional fees related to the design, market analysis and resources required to operate the new or renovated site
- Professional fees related to specialized technicians

Ineligible Projects and Expenses

Ineligible Projects:

- Historic building renovations or restorations that are not directly linked to professional arts or heritage programming
- Construction or renovations to the physical envelope of buildings not owned by the applicant
- Projects related to regular or routine maintenance of a building
- Projects primarily involving space for worship or congregational purposes, cemeteries or tourism signage
- Design or production of exhibition content or artistic works
- Purchase and installation of public art as part of a stand-alone project
- Restoration and refurbishment of artefacts/collections
- Commissioning and purchasing of works of art
- Landscaping
- Parking lots
- Gift shops
- Commercial beverage and food facilities
- Long-term accrued interest on financing
- Musical instruments and cases
- Office equipment, such as computers dedicated to administrative tasks and furniture
- Administrative systems
- Equipment for commercial beverage and food facilities or gift shops

Costs related to the development of the project proposal and/or applications are also not eligible.

Ontario Trillium Foundation (OTF)

The OTF makes capital grants for equipment, renovations, repairs, new buildings, and outdoor installations and equipment. In the case of new buildings, applicants will need to demonstrate the need for additional community space. In the case of renovations and new buildings, OTF ensures that the grantee, on behalf of the community, has the benefit of the improvements created by OTF funding for at least five years.

Funding is limited to one grant per project of up to \$150,000. Developmental costs associated with construction, such as the development of plans, legal fees or survey costs, are eligible for funding as part of the capital grant. These costs are limited to 20% of the total grant.

The OTF does not fund capital campaigns. Contributions to building and renovation projects are to specific costs of the project identified in the application.

FEDNOR

FEDNOR is the Government of Canada's economic development organization for Northern Ontario. There are three funding priorities under which FEDNOR produces grants:

- Community Economic Development
- Business Growth and Competitiveness
- Innovation

However, FEDNOR notes that "activities and infrastructure primarily of a social/recreational nature such as museums, libraries, cultural centres, recreation centres, tourist information/welcome centres, arenas and waste management disposal" are ineligible project activities and costs. ***The Library/Gallery project would thus not be able to access funds under this program.***

Northern Ontario Heritage Fund Corporation (NOHFC)

NOHFC lists "arts, culture and creative industries" as one of the 11 priority sectors in the Growth Plan cited for Northern Ontario. However, the Community Capacity Building Program, which most closely aligns with this project *does not offer funding for capital projects*. Instead, NOHFC will fund "non-capital projects that promote or support economic growth and would bring benefits to Northern Ontario" and may help with project costs in the future.

Private Fundraising

In Canada, it is far more likely for private funders to support the capital costs (and ongoing operating costs) of a public art gallery than a public library. Based on expressions of support to date, the Art Gallery of Sudbury believes that they may generate about \$1.5 million in capital funds from private sources. In addition it must be emphasized that the Mastin Family donation of Franklin Carmichael art works have been estimated at \$3.5 million if fully executed as a donation.

5.2 ATTENDANCE, OPERATING REVENUE AND EXPENSE PROJECTIONS

The projections that follow are based on the analyses and assumptions in the previous chapters and the judgment and experience of the consultants. They assume new construction on the site of the current Sudbury Community Arena and build upon a base level of existing data for the GSPL and the AGS. The projections are for the opening three years of operation but it is uncertain when implementation will take place. The projections therefore refer to Year 1, 2 and 3 of operation with Year 3 a stabilized year that would be representative of subsequent years of operation.

The projections associated with operations are in constant 2018 dollars and thus indicate that revenues and costs will change at the prevailing rate of inflation, except where noted.

5.2.1 Greater Sudbury Public Library

The Greater Sudbury Public Library has 13 library locations throughout the City of Greater Sudbury. The focus of this study is the Main Branch. The total operating budget for the Greater Sudbury Public Library was \$8,346,495 in 2017. Of this total, some \$3,262,737 may be allocated to the Main Branch. We have built upon these base level figures to prepare revenue and expense projections for the Main Branch of the GSPL.

PROJECTED USAGE AND REVENUES

When new main libraries open, there is usually a tremendous interest in the building and in the services the new library is now able to provide to the public. In the case of this co-located facility, there should be even more interest to see a building that now houses a major public library and an important art museum. Getting people to the new building for a first visit should not be at all difficult. Getting people to return, again and again, for subsequent visits means making sure that the services and resources in the library meet the needs of the community and are intriguing and exciting. The new building must be inviting, comfortable and welcoming with spaces for individuals and groups to work and study and for people of all ages to learn, create and explore.

The GSPL can expect to see a significant rise in usage across the board once a new facility opens to the public. In consultation with GSPL staff we estimate an increase of at least 30% in all areas. Currently, the GSPL has seen the circulation of materials from the Main Branch decline almost 45% from what it was in 2010 and 20% from 2015. These are significant indicators that either (1) the library may be seeing fewer users or (2) the collection at Main is not meeting the needs of the community. While the GSPL has been actively, and correctly, assessing its collection and de-accessioning materials not used over a long period time in an effort to keep the collection current, fresh and customer-focused, the absolute necessity of having the right collection with new titles, attractively displayed and merchandised when the new facility open is paramount. To this end, ***it is recommended that an amount of money be allocated to add to and refresh the collection for opening day (\$250,000 is suggested as a baseline amount). By adding new items to the collection and displaying and marketing it effectively, it is projected that the circulation of library materials should see a double digit increase.***

Programs are an area that should see an additional focus as well. GSPL places emphasis on services to children. In 2016, the GSPL held 2,226 programs attended by 47,620 individuals. The majority of these were for children and teens (1,412 programs with an attendance of 34,895) throughout the library system. With the new spaces for children and teens as well as multiple spaces for programs and meetings, the GSPL should see a real increase not only in programs for youth but, if staff puts together an intriguing series of programs for adults, some in cooperation with the Art Gallery of Sudbury, the number of adult program attendees should increase substantially. In addition, the Maker Space and the array of new technologies should attract new users and returning users as well.

A new library should also be a way of attracting new library cardholders. In 2016, there were 88,999 active library cardholders in Greater Sudbury. A card campaign, as part of an effective and exciting marketing campaign leading up to the opening of the new building should have a goal of signing up 10,000 new cardholders while retaining the almost 90,000 currently active cardholders.

*In consultation with GSPL staff we estimate that **new cardholders coupled with the new building should mean an estimated 30% increase in the number of library visitors. We also estimate that user fees will increase by over 30% in the opening year over the 2017 budget level, with an additional 2% per year in the subsequent two years projected. Building upon a base level of \$39,000 in user fees for the Main Branch leads to projections set out in the following table.***

The assumption is that the new Library will include a 2,500 sq. ft. space that includes a maximum capacity of 100 persons and divisible into two equal sized halves. The multi-purpose space will be available to community groups for free, as is currently the case in the existing Library, while commercial users will also continue to pay to use the space. For the purposes of these projections we estimate that revenues will open at \$25,000 and grow to \$30,000 by Year 3. This estimate takes into account the private/commercial rental rates at other public libraries, including the Halifax Public Library, and the fact there will be some smaller paid room rentals as well. Other revenues have been rounded up to \$5,500 per year.

For the purposes of these projections we have assumed no change in the 2017 budget for Provincial Grants and subsidies and the Contributions from the Reserve and Capital and the annual City allocation. This will lead to a bottom line of the additional amount required from government sources to break even on operations.

The revenue projections are summarized in the following table.

Revenues	Total GSPL	Main Branch	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Provincial Grants and Subsidies	\$413,240	\$120,972	\$120,972	\$120,972	\$120,972
User Fees	\$157,862	\$39,000	\$51,714	\$52,748	\$53,803
Contributions from Reserve and Capital	\$143,439	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other Revenues	\$5,464	\$5,464	\$5,500	\$5,500	\$5,500
Additional Rentals Income	\$0	\$0	\$25,000	\$28,000	\$30,000
City Allocation	\$7,626,490	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301
Total Revenues	\$8,346,495	\$3,262,737	\$3,300,487	\$3,304,521	\$3,307,576

Projected Staffing Costs

Increased visitors, library cardholders, circulation, programming and program attendance combined will, naturally, have an impact on the building and, more importantly, on library staff. Having an adequately staffed facility with people ready to provide assistance to the public is the key to have first time visitors return again and again. The demands from the public on the building's multiple meeting spaces, maker space, technology and services will mean having the right staff in the right space at the right time. Even with no additional hours included, heavy usage and many new spaces and services will require additional staff.

As has been discussed in Section 4.4.1, the increase in the size and the number of floors in the new building, in addition to the anticipated new services and higher usage, will call for additional staff members increasing the Main Branch GSPL staff from the current 27 FTE positions to 30 FTE positions with the caveat that patterns of usage and demands for services will, most likely, necessitate a review of staffing after the first three months of operation and annually thereafter.

The following table indicates the current salary for equivalent positions for the GSPL as a whole and for the Main Branch. The projections assume that salaries in 2018 constant dollars will exceed the prevailing rate of inflation by a total of 2.0% until opening and that it will be 0.5% higher in each of Year 2 and 3. Mandatory employment related costs plus other City-paid benefits are added as well. This leads to the following additional staffing costs for the GSPL over the 2017 budget base level.

GSPL - Main Branch Staffing Costs	FTE	2017 Salaries Wages and Benefits	Base Level Salary per FTE (2018\$)	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
All GSPL Salaries/Wages/Benefits		\$5,135,976				
Existing Main Branch Salaries/Wages/Benefits	27.0	\$2,003,520		\$2,063,626	\$2,125,534	\$2,189,300
Additional Positions						
Emerging Technology Programmer	1.0		\$54,901	\$56,548	\$58,244	\$59,992
Curatorial Assistant	1.0		\$51,430	\$52,973	\$54,562	\$56,199
Security Guard	1.0		\$57,587	\$59,315	\$61,094	\$62,927
Total Additional Salaries and Wages	3.0		\$163,918	\$168,836	\$173,900	\$179,118
Total Additional Benefits (@ average 20% for new staff)				\$33,767	\$34,780	\$35,824
Total Additional Salaries, Wages and Benefits				\$202,603	\$208,680	\$214,942
TOTAL STAFFING COSTS	30.0	\$2,003,520		\$2,266,229	\$2,334,214	\$2,404,242

Other Projected Operating Costs

The following table starts with a base level of 2017 budget figures and includes estimates of changes to categories that would be affected by a new building. These includes materials and operating expenses, energy costs, and purchased/contract services. We have not assumed any changes to debt repayment, grants/transfer payments contribution to reserve and capital and internal recoveries.

Our estimates are as follows:

- **Materials and Operating Expenses:** It has been recommended that \$250,000 be added to the \$776,929 base level to enhance the collection in the opening year and that \$50,000 be added in subsequent years. Taking into account other costs over the prevailing rate of inflation this leads to the figures in the table below.
- **Energy Costs:** The base level costs of \$67,742 in the existing building of 32,772 gross sq. ft. translates to \$2.07 per sq. ft., in an energy inefficient building. With a new energy efficient building of 97,200 gross square feet, the energy costs will be substantially lower per gross square foot and are estimated at \$1.95 per sq. ft., leading to annual energy costs, in 2018 dollars, of \$189,540 for the Main Branch.
- **Purchased/Contract Services:** We have recommended and assumed an additional \$500,000 as an opening year, one-time expense to equip the building with additional technology, with annual upgrades of \$50,000 per year.
- **Internal Recoveries:** These costs are estimated to be as set out on the following table.

Non-Staff Operating Costs	Total GSPL	Main Branch	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Materials and Operating Expenses	\$1,677,379	\$776,929	\$1,042,468	\$1,113,317	\$1,185,583
Energy Costs	\$236,355	\$67,742	\$189,540	\$189,540	\$189,540
Purchased/Contract Services	\$11,686	\$0	\$500,000	\$50,000	\$50,000
Debt Repayment	\$143,439	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Contribution to Reserve and Capital	\$168,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Internal Recoveries	\$973,660	\$414,546	\$452,337	\$461,384	\$470,611
Total Costs	\$3,210,519	\$1,259,217	\$2,184,345	\$1,814,241	\$1,895,734

Summary of Revenues and Expenses

The following table summarizes the projections of operating revenues and expenses for the Main Branch of the Greater Sudbury Public Library assuming a new facility at the site of the current Sudbury Community Arena, within which the Art Gallery of Sudbury will be a long-term tenant. The bottom line of the data indicates the additional amount that will be required from government sources to break even on operations each year. The data indicate the need for an additional \$1,150,000 million in Year 1, in large part to reflect investment in needed new technology, \$844,000 in Year 2 and about \$992,000 in Year 3, which would be reflective of subsequent years of operation.

Summary of Revenues and Expenses for GSPL - Main Branch					
Revenues	Total GSPL	Main Branch	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Provincial Grants and Subsidies	\$413,240	\$120,972	\$120,972	\$120,972	\$120,972
User Fees	\$157,862	\$39,000	\$51,714	\$52,748	\$53,803
Contributions from Reserve and Capital	\$143,439	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other Revenues	\$5,464	\$5,464	\$5,500	\$5,500	\$5,500
Additional Rentals Income	\$0	\$0	\$25,000	\$28,000	\$30,000
City Allocation	\$7,626,490	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301	\$3,097,301
Total Revenues	\$8,346,495	\$3,262,737	\$3,300,487	\$3,304,521	\$3,307,576
Operating Costs	Total GSPL	Main Branch	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Staffing Costs	\$5,135,976	\$2,003,520	\$2,266,229	\$2,334,214	\$2,404,242
Materials and Operating Expenses	\$1,677,379	\$776,929	\$1,042,468	\$1,113,317	\$1,185,583
Energy Costs	\$236,355	\$67,742	\$189,540	\$189,540	\$189,540
Purchased/Contract Services	\$11,686	\$0	\$500,000	\$50,000	\$50,000
Debt Repayment	\$143,439	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Contribution to Reserve and Capital	\$168,000	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Internal Recoveries	\$973,660	\$414,546	\$452,337	\$461,384	\$470,611
Total Costs	\$8,346,495	\$3,262,737	\$4,450,574	\$4,148,455	\$4,299,976
Additional Amount Required from Government Sources to Break Even		\$0	-\$1,150,087	-\$843,934	-\$992,399

5.2.2 Art Gallery of Sudbury

On-Site Attendance Projections

Although the AGS has offered outreach opportunities, the development of a proper new space for the Gallery in the GSPL building should reduce the need for such ventures. The attendance projections are nonetheless on-site only. In this context a visitor is defined as someone who attends the Gallery on-site for the purposes of experiencing its exhibits and programs, including those attending various special events and rentals. This definition would exclude those who enter the building to only use the gift shop or to wander into an initial gallery for a few feet then depart while in the Library. This suggests the need for an infrared counter half way into the exhibition space or it will require a reasonable estimate of actual visitors. The definition also excludes staff and volunteers, service and delivery people.

It must also be noted that there is no simple computer formula that leads to credible attendance projections. The process used here considers the experience of the existing AGS, data from the art gallery marketplace, and other public library/art gallery co-locations to provide benchmarks for formulas that help to guide our judgment associated with important qualitative factors.

Parameters for On-Site Attendance Projections

A variety of data may be used to help establish parameters or benchmarks for the attendance projections. Although each benchmarking method has its weaknesses, all have been considered to establish parameters to help guide our judgment.

Extrapolation from Existing AGS Operation

Even though the existing Bell Mansion site and facilities are not favourable, it is important to start with current attendance levels and extrapolate from them as one method to consider future attendance. The usefulness of this method also takes into account that AGS offered free admission during 2016, which is assumed to largely continue within the GSPL facility at the Arena site. Reported attendance was 12,033 in 2,193 net sq. ft. of exhibition space, or about 5.5 visitors per sq. ft. Assuming a growth in exhibition space to 6,000 nsf suggests an attendance of about 33,000 visitors in a stabilized year of operation.

Benchmark from Average Attendance Figures of Medium Sized Ontario Art Galleries

As shown in the table in Chapter 2.3.2, the operating revenues of the AGS exceeded the average for medium sized art galleries in Ontario by about 69%. The average attendance for medium sized art galleries in Ontario was 17,869. Applying the 69% increment to the average attendance for Ontario art galleries to the AGS suggests an attendance total of about 29,800.

Benchmarks from Other Art Galleries within Public Libraries

Chapter 2 also sets out data regarding art galleries/museums that are within public libraries. These are therefore particularly important ratios. The data applicable to attendance projections are summarized in the following table and use ratios of visitors per sq. ft. exhibition space and visitors per thousand city/town population.

- **Visitors per Sq. Ft. Exhibition Space:** The ratio that emerges from the comparables is 12.3 visitors per sq. ft. of exhibition space. Applied to the assumed 6,000 nsf of exhibition space for AGS leads to an attendance projection of about 73,800.
- **Visitors per Thousand City/Town Population:** The ratio that emerges is 394.7 visitors per thousand residents. Applied to the 164,689 population of Greater Sudbury leads to an attendance estimate of 65,000.

Canadian Art Galleries within Public Libraries (all free admission)	Reported Attendance	Exhibition Space Sq. Ft.	Visitors per sf Exhibition Space	Town/City Population	Visitors per Thousand Population
Grimsby Public Art Gallery	20,000	1,600	12.5	27,314	732.2
Idea Exchange, Cambridge (four sites)	86,000	6,000	14.3	129,920	661.9
Oakville Galleries (Centennial Library site)	17,500	1,900	9.2	193,832	90.3
Dunlop Gallery, Regina	25,000	2,000	12.5	214,631	116.5
Average	37,125	2,875	12.1	141,424	400.2
Median	22,500	1,950	12.5	161,876	389.2
Mid-Point	29,813	2,413	12.3	151,650	394.7
Assumptions for New AGS		6,500		164,689	

Summary of Figures Extrapolated from Ratios and Ranking Method

Averaging these figures suggests a stabilized attendance figure in the range of 50,000 visitors in the stabilized Year 3, as seen in the following table.

Figures Emerging from:	Attendance (rounded)
Extrapolation from Existing AGS Operation	33,000
Ratios from Public Art Galleries in Ontario	29,800
Exhibition Space Ratio from Comparable Galleries in Public Libraries	73,800
Population Ratio from Comparable Galleries in Public Libraries	65,000
Average (rounded)	50,000

Judgment Regarding Impact of Qualitative Factors

While the ratios above help to guide our judgment regarding potential attendance levels, and suggest a stabilized attendance level of about 50,000 visitors per year, other factors discussed in earlier chapters help to refine the analysis. Some factors suggest higher attendance while others suggest that attendance levels will likely be lower. These factors are as follows, and help to lead to our projected attendance levels for AGS in its first three years of operation:

Positive Factors:

- **Limited Competition:** The Art Gallery of Sudbury is the only public art gallery within a radius of 38,000 square kilometers and its larger size and downtown location will serve to widen its regional appeal.
- **Franklin Carmichael and Group of Seven Brand:** This is very positive and will be implementable only with the new facility as the collection will not be available to Greater Sudbury without a proper new facility.
- **A Largely Free Admission Art Gallery in a Free Admission Public Library:** This will help to attract visitors who might not otherwise attend.
- **An Assumed Downtown Site Involving New Construction to Replace the Sudbury Community Arena:** This will offer much better access and visibility than is currently available at the Bell Mansion, opportunities for purpose-built new construction, on-site parking, outdoor opportunities and other benefits.
- **Potential Synergies with Other Uses at the Arena Site:** It is uncertain at this time what the other uses of the site will be, but there may be opportunities for additional crossover visits with complementary uses.

Negative Factors:

- **Uncertainty about Timing of Implementation:** While selection of the Sudbury Community Arena site for the co-located Public Library of Greater Sudbury and Art Gallery of Sudbury offers substantial advantages, there are uncertainties regarding how long it will take to be implemented. If too lengthy this might risk, for example, loss of the Mastin Collection of Franklin Carmichael works of art.
- **Market Size and Profile:** One of the reasons for investment in a new public library and art gallery is to provide the type of infrastructure that will make Greater Sudbury a more attractive place to live and work. However, relative to larger population centres, the resident market is of limited size and the level of educational attainment, the most important determinant of museum/gallery attendance, is lower than provincial and national averages.

On balance, we believe the positive and negative factors essentially balance and have therefore used the 50,000 attendance figure indicated by the various ratios set out earlier as the estimated on-site attendance in the stabilized Year 3. Year 1 attendance is estimated to be about 20% higher at a rounded 60,000 because of the common opening year curiosity factor, with Year 2 higher than Year 3 at about 55,000 because of an assumed 3-month major exhibition that will be charged. The charge will serve to limit the attendance but will help to generate earned income for AGS.

Projected On-Site Attendance Levels by Segment

The table that follows provides our estimates of total on-site attendance by visitors on weekdays and weekends, helping to lead to design day projections and projected attendance by main market segment and by admissions ticket category during the assumed 3-month charged major exhibition in Year 2.

The projections are also based on the following estimates and assumptions.

- **Attendance by Weekdays and Weekend Days:** It is common for weekend days to account for about half of all visitors. We have used 50% for the purposes of these projections as well.
- **Design Day Calculation:** The Design Day (not peak attendance) calculation is of a higher than average weekend day in a higher than average attendance month. We estimate attendance during such a weekend day at 10% higher than average with the exception of Year 2 in which a major level exhibition is assumed and is increased to 15%. The resultant figures are then applied to estimate how many people will be in the building at one time. Based on the size of the exhibition space, we have estimated about 30% of daily visitors will be in the building at one time, which is within a common 25-35% range.
- **Attendance by Main Market Segment:** The assumed pattern is that, on a percentage basis, resident attendance will be highest in the opening year then decline, with tourist percentages increasing in Years 2 and 3 and school attendance in the same general range. With location in a public library and free admission to most exhibitions the large majority of visitors will remain as residents.
- **Attendance by Ticket Category during Periodic Charged Temporary Exhibitions:** The table that follows also provides estimates of attendance by the admission ticket category. Persons in an Indirect Paid category include members, program participants and rentals guests and those receiving free admission during this 3-month period in Year 2. And there will be people attending the permanent exhibitions who do not pay to attend the major temporary exhibition during this period. Our estimate is that those who pay directly would be about 50% of the total attendance during that period, or a total of about 7,500 paid admission visitors.

Projected Attendance (rounded)	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Projected Total On-Site Attendance				12,000	60,000	55,000	50,000
Attendance by Weekday/Weekend							
Weekdays	50%	50%	50%		30,000	27,500	25,000
Weekend Days/Holiday Mondays	50%	50%	50%		30,000	27,500	25,000
Total					60,000	55,000	50,000
Design Day Calculation							
Total Projected Attendance					60,000	55,000	50,000
Total Weekend Attendance					30,000	27,500	25,000
Average Weekend Day Attendance					288	264	240
Weekend Day Attendance in Higher Attendance Month (10/15% above average)					317	304	264
Maximum Number of People in Building at One Time (30% of daily total)					95	91	79
Attendance by Main Segment							
Residents (50-mile radius)	80%	75%	70%		48,000	41,250	35,000
School Groups	10%	10%	10%		6,000	5,500	5,000
Tourists	10%	15%	20%		6,000	8,250	10,000
Total	100%	100%	100%		60,000	55,000	50,000
Attendance During Summer Major Temporary Exhibition (Year 2)							
Total Attendance During Charged Exhibition						15,000	
Visitors Paying for Charged Exhibition		50%				7,500	
Attendance by Ticket Category (periodic major exhibitions)							
Adult (25-64)		50%				3,750	
Senior (65+)		20%				1,500	
Student/Youth (13-24)		15%				1,125	
Child (6-12)		5%				375	
Non-School Groups		5%				375	
School Groups		5%				375	
Total On-Site Attendance		100%				7,500	

Projected Operating Revenues

The projections of operating revenues projected for the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS) are set out in the following categories. The revenue and expense projections both build primarily upon a base level of rounded recent figures for the AGS:

- Pay What You Can Admissions;
- Fixed Admission Charges for Major Temporary Exhibitions;
- Retail Sales;
- Membership;
- Facility Rentals;

- Educational and Public Programs;
- Fundraising Events (net);
- Other Earned Income;
- Existing Private Support;
- Existing Endowment;
- Existing Government Support.

The bottom line for the projections is the amount of projected expenses minus projected earned income and continued levels of private, endowment and government sources to indicate the additional amounts required from these sources to break even on operations each year.

Pay What You Can Admissions

Current admissions revenue based on “pay what you can” is a rounded \$5,810. Calculated on the basis of the total attendance count the revenue is it is about 48 cents per visitor. We estimate that the pay what you can donations will be the highest in the opening year at 60 cents per total visitors then decline to 40 cents in Year 2 when there is a 3-month fixed admission period for a major temporary exhibition and increase again to 45 cents per visitor in the stabilized Year 3. This leads to the following projections.

Pay What You Can Admissions				
	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Projected Annual Attendance	12,000	60,000	55,000	50,000
Average Donation Per Visitor	\$0.48	\$0.60	\$0.40	\$0.45
Total Revenue	\$5,810	\$36,000	\$22,000	\$22,500

Fixed Admissions for Major Temporary Exhibition

It has been assumed that a major 3-month temporary exhibition capable of fixed charged admission will be implemented in Year 2. The attendance projections during this period are applied to the assumed admission charges. The projections also assume that discounts offered to visitors in combination with other museums, attractions, hotels, restaurants, CAA/AAA etc. would result in 7% lower income than if such discounts were not in place during the fixed admission period. The admissions revenue projections are therefore as follows:

Fixed Admission Revenue				
Ticket Categories for Periodic Major Exhibition	Ticket Prices	Base Level	Year 2 Visitors	Year 2 Admission Revenue
Adult (25-64)	\$10.00		3,750	\$37,500
Senior (65+)	\$8.00		1,500	\$12,000
Student/Youth (13-24)	\$8.00		1,125	\$9,000
Child (6-12)	\$5.00		375	\$1,875
Non-School Groups (per person)	\$6.50		375	\$2,438
School Groups (avg. per person)	\$4.00		375	\$1,500
Total (before discounts)			7,500	\$64,313
Total (after discounts)		\$0		\$59,811

Retail Sales

The AGS generated about \$33,200 in retail sales in 2016-17 and has budgeted \$34,000 for the current year. The mid-point for the purposes of a base level is \$33,600. At an existing 350 sq. ft. that indicates about \$96 per sq. ft. on retail sales, or \$2.80 per visitor based on 12,000 visitors. But this high per visitor figure is based on a smaller enthusiast market than will be the case in the GSPL facility in which more of the general public will attend and be less inclined to make retail purchases.

The assumption is that the retail store will be located within the AGS at about 600 sq. ft. with a wide variety of products related to the AGS exhibitions and programming. The store will be visible and easily accessible to not only Gallery visitors but also to Library patrons.

Sales per AGS visitor are projected at \$2.00 in Year 1 and to grow by 2% per year to take into account better product and market knowledge over time. However, with more art enthusiasts attending during the major temporary exhibition in Year 2, we estimate sales per visitor that year at \$2.50. Retail cost of goods sold, staffing and other overhead costs are included with those expense projections later in this chapter. These estimates lead to the following retail sales projections.

Retail Sales (600 sq. ft. public space)	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Size of Retail Space	350	600	600	600
Total On-Site Attendance	12,000	60,000	55,000	50,000
Sales per Visitor	\$2.80	\$2.00	\$2.50	\$2.08
Total Sales	\$33,600	\$120,000	\$137,500	\$104,000
Sales Per Sq. Ft.	\$96.00	\$200.00	\$229.17	\$173.33

Membership

The AGS has a modest 90 memberships, reflecting both its free admission, small size and poor location. The revenue from membership totaled about \$3,400 in the current year. That translates to about \$38 per membership.

The excitement about the new location, facility and relationship with the Main Branch of the GSPL should help to boost membership levels which should increase in the context of the charged admission major temporary exhibition Year 2. In addition there should be a growth in support from upper level members to help pay for the cost of bringing it in.

Our estimates of the number of memberships and the average revenue per membership are as follows and leads to the following projections.

Membership	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Memberships	90	300	350	275
Average Revenue per Membership	\$38	\$50	\$60	\$52
Total Revenue	\$3,400	\$15,000	\$21,000	\$14,300

Facility Rentals

In 2016-17 the AGS generated about \$3,200 in rentals income with about the same amount budgeted in the current year, and is thus the base level.

Art museums/galleries are the most successful of any museum type in generating income from evening rentals. In the new facility the 1,750 sq. ft. lobby is part of the overall space of the Main Branch of the Greater Sudbury Public Library, but it has been assumed that rentals revenue in the lobby will be attributable to AGS. Although this space will be available only when the GSPL is closed to the public, likely Friday through Sunday evenings, those are peak days for evening rentals. The lobby space is large enough to accommodate about 75 persons seating at round tables or 150 for receptions

Although the number of rentals may vary widely, we estimate in the range of 25 in Year 1 growing to 35 in Year 3 as seen in the following table. Average income per rental may also vary, but is estimated to average \$800 per rental, including a commission on catering, with growth of 2% per year. The projections are thus as follows.

Rentals	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Rentals per Year		25	30	35
Average Net Income per Rental		\$800	\$816	\$832
Total Revenues	\$3,200	\$20,000	\$24,480	\$29,131

Educational and Public Programs

Educational and public programs have been the primary generator of earned income for the AGS for many years despite inadequate spaces in the Bell Mansion facility. In 2016-17 some \$89,300 was earned with about \$88,300 budgeted in 2017-18. The mid-point base level is \$88,800.

The space assumptions associated with the new facility are for a combined 2,100 sq. ft. to include a Family Art Centre, Resource Centre and Multi-purpose room to accommodate formal school programs, weekend and evening education programs and public programs, all of which will increase in number and the amounts that may be charged.

The revenues that might be generated from public and educational programs may vary widely. For the purposes of these projections and based on higher attendance and staffing and exposure in the GSPL, as well as the experience of other art galleries, we are estimating a substantial growth of 75% above the base level in Year 1, with a growth of 2% per year above the prevailing rate of inflation.

Educational and Public Programming	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Revenue	\$88,800	\$155,400	\$158,508	\$161,678

Fundraising Events (net)

The AGS, like many other museums and cultural attractions requires fundraising events or galas to support operating costs. In 2016-17 the AGS generated about \$13,800 with \$14,000 budgeted in the current year, based on two fundraisers per year. The base level of the projections is the mid-point or about \$13,900. These figures are low relative to other art galleries.

The net amount that might be raised from these fundraising events that would contribute to operating revenues may vary widely. For the purposes of this study we have estimated a growth to \$20,000 in Year 1 in the context of excitement about the long-awaited new facility and recognition that larger facilities need more support.

We estimate additional income in Year 2 to reflect support for the major temporary exhibition and a modest increase over Year 1 levels in Year 3, as follows.

Fundraising Events (net)	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Revenue	\$13,900	\$20,000	\$35,000	\$22,000

Other Earned Income

The other sources of earned income generated by the AGS include exhibition fees, royalties, and other sources that totaled about \$14,100 in 2017 and \$9,000 budgeted in the current year. The mid-point base level is about \$11,600. There may be other sources of earned income to provide additional income associated with the new AGS. Although these amounts may vary widely, our projections are as follows:

Other Earned Income	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Revenue	\$11,600	\$15,000	\$16,000	\$17,000

Existing Endowment

The most recent endowment income is about \$20,000. This figure is assumed to continue each year to allow the bottom line of the projections to be the amount required from *additional* endowment, private, and government support to break even on operations for each year projected.

Existing Private Support

The private support for the AGS totaled about \$53,000 in the most recent year. This figure is assumed to continue each year to allow the bottom line of the projections to be the amount required from *additional* private, endowment and government support to break even on operations for each year projected.

Existing Government Support

As is common, the City of Greater Sudbury has been the primary source of government operating funds for the AGS each year. This has recently amounted to \$200,000 per year. Federal and provincial support brought the total to about \$400,000 in the current year. This figure has been established as the base level that is assumed to continue each year to allow the bottom line of the projections to be the amount required from *additional* government, endowment and private support to break even on operations for each year projected.

Projected Operating Expenses

The operating expense categories of the Art Gallery of Sudbury are as follows. A key assumption helping to control these costs is that utilities, insurance, building repairs and maintenance will be absorbed by the Greater Sudbury Public Library, so that the only building occupancy costs payable by AGS will be internal to its space:

- Salaries, Wages and Benefits;
- Occupancy Costs
- Exhibitions;
- Educational and Public Programming;
- Collections Acquisition and Care;

- General and Administrative Costs;
- Marketing;
- Costs of Fundraising;
- Retail Store Cost of Goods Sold.

Salaries, Wages and Benefits

The largest operating cost of museums is staffing, generally accounting for 50-60% of the total operating budget of institutions with collections care responsibilities, such as the AGS. In 2016-17, staffing costs, including for core and grant-funded staff at AGS, totaled about \$382,800, including benefits, and accounted for 51% of total operating expenses. Project funded staffing reductions in the current year resulted in lower expenditures of \$332,800.

It must be emphasized that some of the funds for staffing are grant-funded and not necessarily secure in the future. For the purposes of these projections we have assumed that grant funding will be maintained for existing staff and that additional grant funding will be in place to cover some of the additional staff requirements. The following table builds upon the \$332,800 base level to indicate the additional staff positions assumed and their salaries and benefits.

It is assumed that staffing costs will exceed the rate of inflation by 0.5% per year during the three-year period projected. Assuming the opening year will be in four years, this adds an increment of 2% to the base level for Year 1. These estimates and assumptions lead to the following staffing costs.

Position	FTE Year 1, 3	FTE Year 2	2017 Salaries Wages and Benefits	Base Level Salary per FTE (2018\$)	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Existing Staffing and Salaries/Wages/Benefits	9.1	9.1	\$332,800	\$334,464	\$341,153	\$342,859	\$344,573
Additional Positions							
Development, Revenue and Marketing Coordinator	1.0	1.0		\$31,500	\$31,973	\$32,292	\$32,615
Security and Preparator	1.0	1.0		\$26,000	\$26,390	\$26,654	\$26,920
Exhibitions, Events and Volunteer Coordinator	1.0	1.0		\$31,500	\$31,973	\$32,292	\$32,615
Administrative Assistant and Bookings Clerk	0.6	0.6		\$26,000	\$15,834	\$15,992	\$16,152
Bookkeeper	0.4	0.4		\$31,500	\$12,789	\$12,917	\$13,046
Additional Weekend/Evening Staff	0.4	0.4		\$18,500	\$7,511	\$7,586	\$7,662
Additional Part-Time Staff During Major Exhibition		0.5		\$18,500	\$0	\$9,435	\$0
Total Additional Salaries and Wages	13.5	14.0			\$126,469	\$137,169	\$129,011
Total Additional Benefits (@ average 7% for new staff)					\$8,853	\$9,602	\$9,031
Total Additional Salaries, Wages and Benefits					\$135,322	\$146,770	\$138,042
TOTAL STAFFING COSTS			\$332,800		\$476,475	\$489,630	\$482,615

Building Occupancy Costs

Building occupancy costs are defined to include all costs, excluding salaries, associated with maintenance and repairs, cleaning, utilities, security systems and building insurance. In the case of the Art Gallery of Sudbury, the core assumptions include no rent, separate metering of utilities or charges associated with building repairs and maintenance or insurance payable by the AGS. These assumptions are part of a strategy to keep the City financial support for AGS in the same range as the \$200,000 per year that has been in place for the past few years, despite more space, staff and programming.

The only occupancy costs to be paid by the AGS are internal repairs and maintenance. These costs will be marginal but will grow over time and are estimated as follows.

Occupancy Costs	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Costs	\$96,000	\$2,000	\$4,000	\$5,000

Exhibitions

The AGS estimates its exhibition costs at \$53,500 when there are no special exhibitions, as is assumed in 2017-18. In 2,193 sq. ft. of exhibition space that translates to about \$24.40 per sq. ft. We have applied this figure to the 6,000 sq. ft. of exhibition space assumed in Year 1 and Year 3.

In the previous two years, with special exhibitions, the exhibition costs ranged from about \$86,400 to \$90,700, with a mid-point at about \$88,600. That would indicate an average for when there are special exhibitions and translates to \$40.40 per sq. ft. We have applied this figure to Year 2 when a major temporary exhibition is in place. This leads to the following projections.

Exhibition Costs	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Size of Exhibition Space	2,193	6,000	6,000	6,000
Cost per Square Foot	\$24.40	\$24.40	\$40.40	\$24.40
Total Costs	\$53,500	\$146,400	\$242,400	\$146,400

Educational and Public Programming

These costs would exclude staffing but include all other costs associated with the development and delivery of various educational and public programs for the AGS. These costs totaled \$23,800 in 2016-17 and are projected at \$24,000 in the current year, leading to a base level of \$23,900. The base level programming costs are about 27% of the revenues. Assuming a more substantial level of programming offered in better located, larger and higher quality spaces in the context of largely free admission, we estimate a higher cost ratio at 40% in Year 1 to take initial purchases into account, and 35% in subsequent years.

Programming Costs	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Costs	\$23,976	\$62,160	\$55,478	\$56,587

Conservation and Collections

These costs totaled about \$61,200 in 2016-17 and are budgeted to decline to \$33,500 in the current year. We have used the mid-point of about \$47,400 as the base level. With a larger space and more works of art on view we estimate that these costs will increase to the following levels over the period projected. Costs will be higher in the opening year to take initial purchases into account.

Conservation/Curatorial Costs	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Costs	\$47,400	\$70,000	\$60,000	\$60,000

General and Administrative

General and administrative costs include office and related supplies, equipment, mailing, printing, telephone, travel, conferences, volunteer perquisites, professional services, dues and subscriptions, credit card fees, entertainment, and other items that do not fit into the other expense categories. In the case of the AGS, these costs have varied over the years and totaled about \$53,300 in 2016-17, with a budgeted decline to about \$25,300 in the current year. The mid-point base level is \$39,300. This is about 11% of the base level staffing costs and thus within a common 10-20% range as a percentage of staffing costs.

For the purposes of these projections, we estimate these costs at 11% of staffing costs each year. These estimates result in the following projections.

General & Administrative	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
11% of staffing costs	\$39,300	\$52,412	\$53,859	\$53,088

Marketing

These costs generally range from 1-5% or more of the total operating budgets of museums while private sector attractions allocate 10% or more. The AGS allocated about \$11,500 in 2016-17, or about 1.5% of total operating costs, with a decline to \$8,000 in the current year with no special exhibition planned, or 1% of total costs. The base level is \$9,800 and reflects the fact that free admission can help to limit marketing costs. Marketing expenditures per visitor are therefore about 82 cents.

Our estimate is based on non-staff marketing expenditures of \$0.60 per visitor in the free admission and much higher attendance Years 1 and 3 and \$0.80 in Year 2 to reflect the need for expenditures associated with the major temporary exhibition that year. This leads to the following projections.

Marketing	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Costs (\$0.60/\$0.80 per visitor)	\$9,800	\$36,000	\$44,000	\$30,000

Costs of Fundraising

These costs totaled \$12,500 in 2016-17, with a budgeted decline to \$9,400 in the current year, and therefore a base level of \$11,000. The \$11,000 is about 79% of the base level fundraising event revenues of \$13,900. We have assumed that this ratio will continue for each year projected, leading to the following projections.

Cost of Fundraising	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Costs	\$11,000	\$15,800	\$27,650	\$17,380

Retail Cost of Goods Sold

Cost of goods sold (COGS) generally range from 50-60% for museums. For the AGS it was \$23,400 in 2016-16, or about 58% of the retail revenues. COGS sold is estimated at \$20,000. The mid-point base level is therefore \$21,700.

We have estimated costs of goods sold at a more common 55% per year to reflect more product turnover with higher attendance and exposure to GSPL visitors. This results in the following projections.

Retail Cost of Goods Sold	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Total Costs (@ 55%)	\$21,700	\$66,000	\$75,625	\$57,200

Summary of Attendance and Financial Projections

The following table summarizes our projections of attendance, operating revenues and expenses for the Art Gallery of Sudbury (AGS), which is likely to be renamed the Franklin Carmichael Art Gallery, in its opening three years of operation as a free rent and long-term tenant within the assumed new Greater Sudbury Public Library at the Sudbury Arena site.

On-site attendance levels are estimated to grow from the base level rounded 12,000 annual visitors in the current Bell Mansion facility to 60,000 in the opening year, 55,000 in Year 2 and 50,000 in the stabilized Year 3. The attendance levels are based on free (pay what you can) admissions each year with the exception of Year 2 when a fixed admission 3-month temporary exhibition is assumed. The attendance projections are for persons who actually tour the AGS exhibits or take part in programs or rentals as opposed to people who might wander into the entrance area for curiosity.

We project that assuming free rent and that most building occupancy costs will be absorbed by the GSPL, the operating budget in a larger, better staffed and operated AGS will increase from the base level \$635,000 to the range of \$908,000 to \$927,000 in Years 1 and 3, with about \$1,053,000 required in the year of the major exhibition. The projected earned income and continuation of existing levels of government, endowment and private support minus operating expenses would leave an additional amount required from government, endowment and private sources to break even ranging from about \$65,000 to \$105,000 per year. Given an objective to limit the cash operating support from the City of Greater Sudbury to the current \$200,000 per year, it will be important that the AGS initiate an endowment fund drive and seek to increase annual private support for the new Gallery as well as additional support for operations from other levels of government.

Summary of Projections for Art Gallery of Sudbury (Franklin Carmichael Art Gallery) within Greater Sudbury Public Library								
	Base Level	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Base Level	Year 1 %	Year 2 %	Year 3 %
Total Attendance (rounded)	12,000	60,000	55,000	50,000				
Revenues (excluding in-Kind support)								
Pay What You Can Admissions	\$5,810	\$36,000	\$22,000	\$22,500	0.9%	3.9%	2.1%	2.5%
Fixed Admissions for Major Exhibition	\$0	\$0	\$59,811	\$0	0.0%	0.0%	5.7%	0.0%
Retail Sales	\$33,600	\$120,000	\$137,500	\$104,000	5.3%	12.9%	13.1%	11.5%
Membership	\$3,400	\$15,000	\$21,000	\$14,300	0.5%	1.6%	2.0%	1.6%
Educational and Public Programs	\$88,800	\$155,400	\$158,508	\$161,678	14.0%	16.8%	15.1%	17.8%
Rentals	\$3,200	\$20,000	\$24,480	\$29,131	0.5%	2.2%	2.3%	3.2%
Fundraising Events (net)	\$13,900	\$20,000	\$35,000	\$22,000	2.2%	2.2%	3.3%	2.4%
Other Earned	\$11,600	\$15,000	\$16,000	\$17,000	1.8%	1.6%	1.5%	1.9%
Existing Endowment	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$20,000	3.1%	2.2%	1.9%	2.2%
Existing Private Support	\$53,000	\$53,000	\$53,000	\$53,000	8.3%	5.7%	5.0%	5.8%
Existing Government Support	\$400,000	\$400,000	\$400,000	\$400,000	62.9%	43.1%	38.0%	44.0%
Total Revenue (rounded)	\$633,310	\$854,400	\$947,299	\$843,609	99.7%	92.1%	90.0%	92.9%
Expenses (excluding depreciation)								
Salaries, Wages, Benefits	\$332,800	\$476,475	\$489,630	\$482,615	52.4%	51.4%	46.5%	53.1%
Occupancy	\$96,000	\$2,000	\$4,000	\$5,000	15.1%	0.2%	0.4%	0.6%
Exhibitions	\$53,500	\$146,400	\$242,400	\$146,400	8.4%	15.8%	23.0%	16.1%
Programs	\$23,976	\$62,160	\$55,478	\$56,587	3.8%	6.7%	5.3%	6.2%
Conservation/Curatorial	\$47,400	\$70,000	\$60,000	\$60,000	7.5%	7.5%	5.7%	6.6%
General & Administrative	\$39,300	\$52,412	\$53,859	\$53,088	6.2%	5.7%	5.1%	5.8%
Marketing	\$9,800	\$36,000	\$44,000	\$30,000	1.5%	3.9%	4.2%	3.3%
Cost of Fundraising	\$11,000	\$15,800	\$27,650	\$17,380	1.7%	1.7%	2.6%	1.9%
Retail Cost of Goods Sold	\$21,700	\$66,000	\$75,625	\$57,200	3.4%	7.1%	7.2%	6.3%
Total Expenses (rounded)	\$635,476	\$927,247	\$1,052,642	\$908,270	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
Amount Required to Break Even from Additional Government, Endowment and Private Sources	(\$2,166)	(\$72,847)	(\$105,343)	(\$64,661)	-0.3%	-7.9%	-10.0%	-7.1%

APPENDIX A: ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The consultants would like to acknowledge the valued assistance and advice of all those who took part in the Visioning/Assumptions Workshop or were interviewed as part the planning process. Particular thanks are extended to Eleethea Savage, Brian Harding and Demetra Christakos for their leadership, advice and assistance in coordinating the planning process.

Workshop Participants

- Meredith Armstrong, Manager of Tourism and Culture, City of Greater Sudbury
- Michael Bellmore, Board Chair, Greater Sudbury Public Library
- Demetra Christakos, Director/Curator, Art Gallery of Sudbury
- Cindy Derrenbacher, Board Member, Greater Sudbury Public Library
- Josée Forest-Niesing, Board Chair, Art Gallery of Sudbury
- Brian Harding, Manager of Libraries and Heritage Museums, City of Greater Sudbury,
- Lise Labine, Board Member, Art Gallery of Sudbury
- Steven Townend, Board Member, Greater Sudbury Public Library

Additional Interviews

- Ed Archer, Chief Administrative Officer, City of Greater Sudbury
- Brian Bigger, Mayor, City of Greater Sudbury
- David Boyce, Board Member, Greater Sudbury Chamber of Commerce
- Fern Cormier, Councillor, City of Greater Sudbury
- Kathryn Drury, CEO/Chief Librarian, Grimsby Public Library
- Nancy Gareh, Manager, Education and Programs, Art Gallery of Sudbury
- Terrence Galvin, Director, Laurentian University School of Architecture
- Robert Green, Project Coordinator, Vista Hospitality
- Ron Henderson, General Manager of Leisure Services, City of Greater Sudbury
- Ryan Humeniuk, Assistant to the Mayor, City of Greater Sudbury
- Matthew Hyland, Director/Curator, Oakville Galleries Og2

- Mette Kruger, Coordinator of Public Services, Greater Sudbury Public Library
- Guy Labine, Executive Director, Science North
- Ed Landry, Senior Planner, City of Greater Sudbury
- Maureen Luoma, Executive Director, Downtown Sudbury BIA
- Joyce Mankarios, Director of Policy and Public Relations, Greater Sudbury Chamber of Commerce
- Catharine Mastin, Franklin Carmichael Estate
- John Mastin, Franklin Carmichael Estate
- Jennifer Matotek, Director/Curator, Dunlop Art Gallery, Regina
- Rebecca McArthur, Community Librarian (New Sudbury/South End), Greater Sudbury Public Library
- Jeff McIntyre, Board Chair, Downtown Sudbury BIA
- Deanna Nebenionquit, Curator & Collections Manager, Art Gallery of Sudbury
- Debbi Nicholson, President, Greater Sudbury Chamber of Commerce
- Tracy Nutt, Board Chair, Greater Sudbury Chamber of Commerce
- Jeff Pafford, Manager of Arenas, City of Greater Sudbury
- Lynn Reynolds, Councillor, City of Greater Sudbury
- Eleethea Savage, Regional Business Centre Coordinator, City of Greater Sudbury
- Mary Searle, Coordinator of Library Collections, Greater Sudbury Public Library
- Peggy Simon, Executive Director, Ojibwe Cultural Foundation
- Mark Signoretti, Councillor, City of Greater Sudbury
- Al Sizer, Councillor, City of Greater Sudbury
- Karen Thistle, Manager, Development and Communications, Art Gallery of Sudbury
- Amin Visram, Chief Executive Officer, Vista Hospitality
- Rob Walz, Coordinator of Insurance and Risk Management, City of Greater Sudbury
- Aidan Ware, Galleries Director, Idea Exchange
- Wendy Watson, Board Chair, Greater Sudbury Development Corporation
- Jessica Watts, Coordinator of Outreach, Programs and Partnerships, Greater Sudbury Public Library
- Rhona Wenger, Director of Grimsby Art Gallery
- Kara West, Gallery Director, San Diego Central Public Gallery
- Ian Wood, Director of Economic Development, City of Greater Sudbury
- Dario Zulich, Owner, Sudbury Wolves

APPENDIX B: LITERATURE REVIEW BIBLIOGRAPHY

Cannon, Braden. "The Canadian Disease: The Ethics of Library, Archives, and Museum Convergence," *Journal of Information Ethics* 22 (Fall 2013): 66-89. DOI: 10. 3172/JIE. 22. 2. 66

Danilov, Victor J. "Shared Museum/Cultural Complexes," *Museum Management and Curatorship* 10 (1991): 53-60.

Dilevko, Juris, and Lisa Gottlieb. *The Evolution of Library and Museum Partnerships: Historical Antecedents, Contemporary, and Future Directions*. Westport, Connecticut: Libraries Unlimited, 2004.

Dilevko, Juris and Lisa Gottlieb. "Resurrecting a Neglected Idea: The Reintroduction of Library-Museum Hybrids," *The Library Quarterly: Information, Community, Policy* 73 no. 2 (Apr. 2003): 160-198. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4309639>

Donsief, Karen A. "Joint-Use Libraries: Balancing Autonomy and Cooperation," *Resources Sharing & Information Networks* 15 no. 1 (2001): 103-115.

Gunnels, Claire B. , Susan E. Green and Patricia M. Butler. *Joint Libraries: Models that Work*. Chicago: American Library Association, 2012.

Monley, Bruce. "Colocated Rural Public Libraries: Partnerships for Progress," *Aplis* 19 no. 2 (2006): 70-75.

Oliver, Jo. "A Practical Partnership: Library, Museum and Family History Society Cooperation in Camden NSW," *Aplis* 24 no. 4 (December 2011): 167-171

Robinson, Leith. "Library and Cultural Service Convergence: A Case Study of the City of Wanneroo, Western Australia," *Aplis* 24 no. 4 (December 2011): 160-166.

Sinclair, Lindsay. *Municipal Development of Cultural Spaces: Illuminating the Contributions of Municipal Governments to the Development of Cultural Spaces*. Artspace North Society, 2005.

Welch, Sherri Begin. "Art of Collaboration; Cultural institutions look to each other to weather tough times," *Crain's Detroit Business* 24 no. 24 (August 2009).

Yarrow, Alexandra, Barbara Clubb and Jennifer-Lynn Draper. *Public Libraries, Archives and Museums: Trends in Collaboration and Cooperation, International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions IFLA Professional Reports, No. 108*. IFLA, 2008.

APPENDIX C: DETAILED CAPITAL COST ESTIMATE



Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate
Sudbury, Ontario

Project No. 101598

Date: June 15, 2017

EXECUTIVE ESTIMATE SUMMARY

The 'Hard' Construction Cost Estimate can be summarized as follows :

	Component	GFA(m2)	\$(m2)	GFA(SF)	\$/SF	ESTIMATE TOTAL
1	New Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury - Base Building	8,612	\$1,966	92,700	\$182.68	\$16,934,000
2	Public Library Fit Out	6,104	\$1,558	65,700	\$145	\$9,509,267
3	Art Gallery of Sudbury - Fit Out	2,508	\$1,536	27,000	\$143	\$3,853,665
Combined Total - Base Building + Fit Out		2,508	\$12,078	92,700	\$327	\$30,296,900
4	Site Development	2,508	\$37	92,700	\$42	\$3,871,700
Sub Total - GFA (excluding contingencies)		17,224	\$1,984	92,700	\$369	\$34,168,600
5	Design and Pricing Allowance 12.0%	17,224	\$238	92,700	\$44	\$4,100,300
Sub Total - GFA (including design allowance)		17,224	\$5	92,700	\$413	\$38,268,900
Contingencies:						
6	Escalation Contingency 6.0%	17,224	\$119	185,398	\$11	\$2,050,100
7	Construction Contingency 5.0%	17,224	\$98	92,700	\$18	\$1,680,500
TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COST (excluding HST)		17,224	\$2,438	92,700	\$453	\$41,999,500
8	Harmonized Sales Tax (HST) 0%					EXCLUDED
TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COST (excluding HST)		17,224	\$2,438	92,700	\$453	\$42,000,000

ITEMIZED ESTIMATES (Included Above): *(Itemized Estimates include the associated General Requirements, Fee & Contingencies)*

Separate Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Rate	Sub-Total	Estimate Total
1 Sudbury Public Library					
1.1 Public Library - Base Building	65,700	SF	\$219.27	\$14,406,079	
1.2 Public Library - Fit Out	65,700	SF	\$180.42	\$11,853,872	
1.3 Art Gallery of Sudbury - Site Development	65,700	SF	\$50.74	\$3,333,534	
Total for Itemized Estimate - Public Library	65,700	SF	\$450.43		\$29,593,000
2 Art Gallery of Sudbury					
2.1 Art Gallery of Sudbury - Base Building	27,000	SF	\$228.67	\$6,174,034	
2.2 Art Gallery of Sudbury - Fit Out	27,000	SF	\$142.73	\$4,803,824	
2.3 Art Gallery of Sudbury - Site Development	27,000	SF	\$43.02	\$1,428,657	
Total for Itemized Estimate - Art Gallery	27,000	SF	\$459.52		\$12,407,000
Combined Total (excluding HST)	92,700	SF	\$453.07		\$42,000,000



ELEMENTAL ESTIMATE SUMMARY

Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate

Project: Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
 Location: Sudbury, Ontario
 Owner/Client: LORD Cultural Resources
 Architect: Ted Silverberg

Project Number: 101598
 Date: 15-Jun-17

Gross Floor Area: 92,700 SF

Element	Ratio to GFA	Elemental Quantity	Elemental Unit Rate	Elemental Amount	Cost/SF	Total	%
A SHELL							
A1 SUBSTRUCTURE					\$9.60		
A11 Foundation	0.60	55,600 SF	\$16.00	\$889,600	\$9.60		
A12 Basement Excavation	0.00	0 cy	\$0.00	\$0	\$0.00	\$889,600	2.1%
A2 STRUCTURE					\$42.13		
A21 Lowest Floor Construction	0.60	55,600 SF	\$9.46	\$525,900	\$5.67		
A22 Upper Floor Construction	0.40	37,100 SF	\$36.88	\$1,368,100	\$14.76		
A23 Roof Construction	0.60	55,600 SF	\$36.18	\$2,011,600	\$21.70	\$3,905,600	9.3%
A3 EXTERIOR ENCLOSURE					\$54.08		
A31 Walls Below Grade	0.00	0 SF	\$0.00	\$0	\$0.00		
A32 Walls Above Grade	0.40	37,080 SF	\$83.57	\$3,098,800	\$33.43		
A33 Windows & Entrance	0.01	494 SF	\$109.72	\$54,200	\$0.58		
A34 Roof Covering	0.60	55,600 SF	\$27.52	\$1,530,100	\$16.51		
A35 Projections	1.00	92,700 SF	\$3.56	\$330,000	\$3.56	\$5,013,100	11.9%
B INTERIORS							
B1 PARTITIONS & DOORS					\$17.44		
B11 Partitions	0.60	55,620 SF	\$22.13	\$1,231,000	\$13.28		
B12 Doors	0.00	159 No	\$2,428.98	\$386,000	\$4.16	\$1,617,000	3.9%
B2 FINISHES					\$17.85		
B21 Floor Finishes	1.00	92,700 SF	\$9.18	\$850,763	\$9.18		
B22 Ceiling Finishes	1.00	92,700 SF	\$5.86	\$543,600	\$5.86		
B23 Wall Finishes	1.00	92,700 SF	\$2.80	\$260,000	\$2.80	\$1,654,363	3.9%
B3 FITTING & EQUIPMENT					\$18.92		
B31 Fitting & Fixtures	1.00	92,700 SF	\$17.19	\$1,593,700	\$17.19		
B32 Equipment	0.00	0 SF	\$0.00	\$0	\$0.00		
B33 Conveying Systems	0.00	2 NO	\$80,000.00	\$160,000	\$1.73	\$1,753,700	4.2%
C SERVICES							
C1 MECHANICAL					\$83.56		
C11 Plumbing & Drainage	1.00	92,700 SF	\$9.00	\$834,300	\$9.00		
C12 Fire Protection	1.00	92,700 SF	\$4.90	\$453,800	\$4.90		
C13 HVAC	1.00	92,700 SF	\$62.17	\$5,762,700	\$62.17		
C14 Controls	1.00	92,700 SF	\$7.50	\$695,250	\$7.50	\$7,746,050	18.4%
C2 ELECTRICAL					\$42.29		
C21 Service & distribution	1.00	92,700 SF	\$10.50	\$973,400	\$10.50		
C22 Lighting, Devices & Heating	1.00	92,700 SF	\$19.50	\$1,807,700	\$19.50		
C23 Systems & Ancillaries	1.00	92,700 SF	\$12.29	\$1,139,400	\$12.29	\$3,920,500	9.3%
NET BUILDING COST (Excluding Site)					\$285.87	\$26,499,913	63.1%
D SITE							
D1 SITE WORK					\$36.53		
D11 Site Development	0.29	27,000 SF	\$109.87	\$2,966,400	\$32.00		
D12 Mechanical Site Services	0.29	27,000 SF	\$6.85	\$185,000	\$2.00		
D13 Electrical Site Services	0.29	27,000 SF	\$8.70	\$235,000	\$2.54	\$3,386,400	8.1%
D2 ANCILLARY WORK					\$0.00		
D21 Demolition	0.00	0 SF	\$0.00	\$0	\$0.00		
D22 Alterations	0.00	0 SF	\$0.00	\$0	\$0.00	\$0	0.0%
NET BUILDING COST (Including Site)					\$322.40	\$29,886,313	71.2%
Z MARKUPS							
Z1 GENERAL REQUIREMENTS	14.0%				\$46.20		
Z11 General Requirements	11.0%			\$3,287,500	\$35.46		
Z12 Fee	3.0%			\$995,200	\$10.74	\$4,282,700	10.2%
TOTAL CONSTRUCTION ESTIMATE (Excluding Contingencies)					\$368.60	\$34,169,013	81.4%
Z2 CONTINGENCIES	23.0%				\$84.48		
Z21 Design Contingency	12.0%			\$4,100,300	\$44.23		
Z22 Escalation Contingency	6.0%			\$2,050,100	\$22.12		
Z23 Construction Contingency	5.0%			\$1,680,500	\$18.13	\$7,830,900	18.6%
13. Pr SALES TAX (HST)					0% EXCLUDED	\$0	0.0%
TOTAL CONSTRUCTION ESTIMATE (Including Allowances)					\$453.07	\$42,000,000	100.0%
GFA:	92,700 SF				per SF	\$453	
GFA:	8,612 m2				per m2	\$4,877	

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
KEY STATISTICS						
Number of levels		2 Levels (assumed)				
1 Ground Floor		39,400	SF	60%	assumed 60% on Grd. Floor	
2 Second Floor		26,300	SF	40%	assumed 40% on Sec. Floor	
3 Subtotal for the Public Library		65,700	SF			
4 Ground Floor		16,200	SF	60%	assumed 60% on Grd. Floor	
5 Second Floor		10,800	SF	40%	assumed 40% on Sec. Floor	
6 Subtotal for the Art Gallery		27,000	SF			
7 Total Gross Floor Area (GFA)		92,700	SF			
A1 SUBSTRUCTURE						
A11 Foundations						
10 Allowance for conventional spread footing foundations including excavation, backfill, and dewatering		55,600	SF	\$16.00	\$889,600	
11 TOTAL A11 Foundations		55,600	SF	\$16.00	\$889,600	
A12 Basement Excavation						
13 Bulk excavation not required, assumed					Excluded	
14 TOTAL A12 Basement Excavation		0	CY	\$0.00	\$0	
15 TOTAL A1 SUBSTRUCTURE		55,600	SF	\$16.00	\$889,600	
A2 STRUCTURE						
A21 Lowest Floor Construction						
18 5" thick concrete slab-on-grade including:		55,600	SF	\$9.16		\$509,512
19 6 mil poly vapour barrier		55,600	SF	\$0.15	\$8,340	
20 50 mm rigid insulation under the slab		55,600	SF	\$3.00	\$166,800	
21 concrete - supply 25 Mpa - C4		908	CY	\$135.00	\$122,598	
22 concrete - place		908	CY	\$45.00	\$40,866	
23 concrete - accessories		908	CY	\$5.00	\$4,541	
24 concrete - finishing leveling		55,600	SF	\$0.85	\$47,260	
25 formwork edge of slab on grade		55,600	SF	\$0.35	\$19,460	
26 granular - 200mm thk (incl. labour)		1,449	CY	\$40.00	\$57,948	
27 steel trowel finish		55,600	SF	\$0.75	\$41,700	
28 Sawcutting and control joints		55,600	SF	\$0.25	\$13,900	
29 Allow for equipment housekeeping pads		1	LS	\$2,500.00	\$2,500	
30 TOTAL A21 Lowest Floor Construction		55,600	SF	\$9.46	\$525,900	



Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
31 A22 Upper Floor Construction						
32 Upper floor structure (assumed structural steel framed with composite metal deck and concrete topping)		37,100	SF	\$35.00	\$1,298,500	
33 Structural steel framing to floor opens and floor penetrations		1	LS	\$30,000.00	\$30,000	
34 Feature interior stair at Library & Art Gallery, structural steel with special floor finish (see Floor Finish element for stone treads)		176	LF	\$225.00	\$39,600	
35 Structural steel with formed metal pan treads and risers at the Exit Stairs (4 No) including:		352	LF	\$121.80		\$42,872
36 - stairs		352	LF	\$95.00	\$33,440	
37 - mid landings		4	NO	\$1,500.00	\$6,000	
38 - concrete fill		4	CY	\$550.00	\$2,200	
39 - screed, cure and steel trowel finish		352	LF	\$3.50	\$1,232	
40 TOTAL A22 Upper Floor Construction		37,100	SF	\$36.88	\$1,368,100	
41 A23 Roof Construction						
42 Allowance for roof construction (assumed some wood elements in the roof structure)		55,600	SF	\$36.00	\$2,001,600	
43 Structural steel framing to roof openings and penetrations		1	LS	\$10,000.00	\$10,000	
44 TOTAL A23 Roof Construction		55,600	m2	\$36.18	\$2,011,600	
45 TOTAL A2 STRUCTURE		92,700	SF	\$42.13	\$3,905,600	
46 A3 EXTERIOR ENCLOSURE						
47 A31 Walls Below Grade						
48 No scope					Excluded	
49 TOTAL A31 Walls Below Grade		0	SF	\$0.00	\$0	
50 A32 Walls Above Grade						
51 Assumed Cladding Ratio		0.40				
52 Assumed Total Cladding Area		37,080	SF			
53 Stone or masonry veneer exterior cladding including back up (assumed 40% of the total cladding area)		14,832	SF	\$58.00	\$860,256	
54 Aluminum framed glass curtainwall, double glazed thermally sealed, assumed 60% of the cladding area		22,248	SF	\$95.00	\$2,113,560	



**Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate**

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
55 Allowance for exterior feature cladding		1	LS	\$125,000	\$125,000	
56 TOTAL A32 Walls Above Grade		37,080	SF	\$83.57	\$3,098,800	
57 A33 Windows & Entrances						
58 Aluminum framed glazed doors including supply, installation and hardware, standard colour		8	leafs	\$3,000.00		\$24,000
59 single, 1000 mm x 2250 mm		4	NO	\$3,000.00	\$12,000	
60 double, 1000 mm x 2250 mm		2	pair	\$6,000.00	\$12,000	
61 Hollow metal doors, frames, hardware and paint finish		4	NO	\$1,800.00		\$7,200
62 single, 950 mm x 2250 mm		4	NO	\$1,800.00	\$7,200	
63 Overhead doors and shipping & Receiving		2	NO	\$6,500.00	\$13,000	
64 Automatic door operators, allow		4	NO	\$2,500.00	\$10,000	
65 TOTAL A33 Windows & Entrances		494	SF	\$109.72	\$54,200	
66 A34 Roof Covering						
67 4 ply modified bituminous roofing system		55,600	SF	\$25.00	\$1,390,000	
68 Allowance sloped insulation (30% of roof area)		16,680	SF	\$7.50	\$125,100	
69 Flashings to roof penetrations		1	LS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000	
70 Allowance for vertical flashing		1	LS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000	
71 Allowance for precast roof pavers		1	LS	\$5,000.00	\$5,000	
72 TOTAL A34 Roof Covering		55,600	SF	\$27.52	\$1,530,100	
73 A35 Projections						
74 Parapet projection at the curtain wall locations, assumed 16" high including;		1,050	LF	\$99.97		\$104,963
75 composite panel cap flashing		1,050	LF	\$18.00	\$18,900	
76 wood blocking & framing		1,397	SF	\$3.50	\$4,888	
77 cladding system		1,397	SF	\$45.00	\$62,843	
78 air barrier membrane		1,397	m2	\$1.50	\$2,095	
79 5/8" plywood sheathing		1,397	SF	\$3.00	\$4,190	
80 insulation		1,397	SF	\$1.50	\$2,095	
81 5/8" plywood sheathing		1,397	SF	\$3.00	\$4,190	
82 4" x 4" fibre cant strip		1,050	LF	\$1.50	\$1,575	
83 roofing membrane		1,397	SF	\$3.00	\$4,190	
84 Allowance for prefinished metal roof screens to mechanical equipment		1	LS	\$50,000.00	\$50,000	

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
85 Allowance for entrance canopy		400	SF	\$250.00	\$100,000	
86 Allowance for unmeasured projections		1	LS	\$75,000.00	\$75,000	
87 TOTAL A35 Projections		92,700	m2	\$3.56	\$330,000	
88 TOTAL A3 EXTERIOR ENCLOSURE		92,700	SF	\$54.08	\$5,013,100	
89 TOTAL A SHELL		92,700	SF	\$105.81	\$9,808,300	
1 B1 PARTITIONS & DOORS						
90 B11 Partitions						
91 Assumed Partition Ratio		0.60				
92 Assumed Total Partition Area		55,620	SF			
93 Aluminum framed glazed partitions, assumed 20%		11,124	SF	\$60.00	\$667,440	
94 Concrete block walls - 190mm, assumed 15%		8,343	SF	\$18.50	\$154,346	
95 Gypsum board partition, assumed 45%		25,029	SF	\$11.50	\$287,834	
96 16mm gypsum board		25,029	m2	\$3.00	\$75,087	
97 150 mm metal stud		25,029	m2	\$4.50	\$112,631	
98 batt insulation		25,029	m2	\$1.00	\$25,029	
99 16mm gypsum board		25,029	m2	\$3.00	\$75,087	
100 Gypsum board partition, one sided, allow		5,562	SF	\$6.50	\$36,153	
101 16mm gypsum board		5,562	m2	\$3.00	\$16,686	
102 92mm metal stud		5,562	m2	\$3.50	\$19,467	
103 Extra over for waterproof gypsum board		2,000	SF	\$1.00	\$2,000	
104 Extra over for plywood backing to gallery partitions (assumed 50% of the gypsum drywall partitions)		12,515	SF	\$3.00	\$37,544	
105 Extra over for fire rated gypsum drywall		4,000	SF	\$1.00	\$4,000	
106 Sealing and caulking to partitions		55,620	SF	\$0.75	\$41,715	
107 TOTAL B11 Partitions		55,620	SF	\$22.13	\$1,231,000	
108 B12 Doors						
109 Assumed Elemental Door Area (6% of partition area)		3,337	SF			
110 Average SF per door leaf (21 SF)		159	NO			
111 Aluminum framed glazed doors including supply, installation and hardware, standard colour		16	NO	\$3,000.00	\$48,000	
112 single, 950 mm x 2250 mm		10	NO	\$3,000.00	\$30,000	
113 double, sliding		3	pair	\$6,000.00	\$18,000	

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

	Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
114	Hollow metal doors, frames, hardware and paint finish		68	NO	\$1,014.71		\$69,000
115	single, 950 mm x 2250 mm		58	NO	\$1,000.00	\$58,000	
116	double, 950 mm x 2250 mm		5	pair	\$2,200.00	\$11,000	
117	Solid core wood doors, frames, hardware and paint finish		75	NO	\$1,000.00		\$75,000
118	single, 900 mm x 2250 mm		75	NO	\$1,000.00	\$75,000	
119	Door hardware supply		159	NO	\$1,000.00	\$159,000	
120	Automatic door operator		6	NO	\$2,500.00	\$15,000	
121	Allowance for security hardware		1	LS	\$10,000.00	\$10,000	
122	Allowance for acoustic door seals		1	LS	\$10,000.00	\$10,000	
123	TOTAL B12 Doors		159	NO	\$2,429	\$386,000	
124	TOTAL B1 PARTITIONS & DOORS		92,700	SF	\$17.44	\$1,617,000	
125	B2 FINISHES						
126	B21 Floor Finishes						
127	PUBLIC LIBRARY						
128	ENTRY LEVEL LOBBY SPACES						
129	Vestibule, PT		200	SF	\$12.00	\$2,400	
130	Lobby, PT		1,750	SF	\$12.00	\$21,000	
131	Café, PT		450	SF	\$12.00	\$5,400	
132	Café kitchen and pantry, CT		175	SF	\$12.00	\$2,100	
133	Library Marketplace (new book displays, computer stations), WD		2,750	SF	\$14.00	\$38,500	
134	Material Returns Area, SV		75	SF	\$7.50	\$563	
135	Library Exhibition Space, WD		500	SF	\$14.00	\$7,000	
136	Customer Service Desk, PT		400	SF	\$12.00	\$4,800	
137	Self Checkout Stations, PT		200	SF	\$12.00	\$2,400	
138	Self Pickup Shelves, PT		100	SF	\$12.00	\$1,200	
139	Staff Workroom and storage, SV		900	SF	\$7.50	\$6,750	
140	Gross Up for Entry Lobby		3,750	SF	\$10.00	\$37,500	
141	MEETING ROOMS (CPT)						
142	Multi-Purpose space (100 people) that can be divided into two spaces – flexible		2,500	SF	\$5.50	\$13,750	
143	Meeting Rooms for up to 8 people (3 @250)		750	SF	\$5.50	\$4,125	
144	Meeting Rooms for up to 4 people (4 @ 200)		800	SF	\$5.50	\$4,400	
145	Board/Larger Group Room for up to 20		700	SF	\$5.50	\$3,850	
146	Quiet Study Rooms (8@100)		800	SF	\$5.50	\$4,400	
147	Gross Up for Meeting Rooms		2,775	SF	\$5.50	\$15,263	
148	AGE LEVEL SERVICES SPACES						
149	Children – includes Early Literacy Center, SV		3,500	SF	\$7.50	\$26,250	
150	-Story Hour/Crafts Room		500	SF	\$7.50	\$3,750	
151	Teens, WD		2,000	SF	\$14.00	\$28,000	
152	Adults- Circulating Collections-Print/Media (69,000 items), WD		7,000	SF	\$14.00	\$98,000	

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
153 Seating –varied types for 50 people, PT		2,000	SF	\$12.00	\$24,000	
154 Reference collection		1,500	SF	\$14.00	\$21,000	
155 Genealogy and Local History, WD		2,000	SF	\$14.00	\$28,000	
156 Maker Space and Digital Media Lab		3,000	SF	\$14.00	\$42,000	
157 Adult Services – Info Desk, PT		200	SF	\$12.00	\$2,400	
158 Technology Learning Center, WD		1,200	SF	\$14.00	\$16,800	
159 Gross Up for Age Level Services		11,450	SF	\$12.00	\$137,400	
160 STAFF SPACES						
161 Staff workrooms - offices , CPT		2,600	SF	\$5.50	\$14,300	
162 Staff breakroom/small kitchen, PT		300	SF	\$12.00	\$3,600	
163 Administration Offices, CPT		450	SF	\$5.50	\$2,475	
164 Technical Services Staff Workrooms -Offices, CPT		950	SF	\$5.50	\$5,225	
165 Storage (compact shelving?) archives, etc. , VCT		1,500	SF	\$6.50	\$9,750	
166 Shipping and Receiving*, CS		1,150	SF	\$1.00	\$1,150	
167 Mail Room*, VCT		350	SF	\$6.50	\$2,275	
168 Staff Lockers, Mail Cubbies, Coat Rack, CT		150	SF	\$12.00	\$1,800	
169 Telecommunications Room, VCT		150	SF	\$7.50	\$1,125	
170 Electrical Room, CS		100	SF	\$1.00	\$100	
171 Custodial Services Closet, CT		50	SF	\$12.00	\$600	
172 Building Maintenance Office , VCT		100	SF	\$6.50	\$650	
173 Gross Up for Staff Spaces		3,925	SF	\$6.00	\$23,550	
174 Subtotal - Public Library		65,700	SF			
175 Allowance for special floor finishes in the Library Lobby		1	LS	\$10,000.00	\$10,000	
176 ART GALLERY OF SUDBURY						
177 PUBLIC AMENITIES						
178 Public Lockers/Cloakroom, VCT		150	SF	\$5.50	\$825	
179 Public and Staff Washrooms				Included in the Gross Up		
180 Retail Store + Art Rental Gallery, hardwood		600	SF	\$12.00	\$7,200	
181 PUBLIC PROGRAM						
182 Family Art Studio, PT		800	SF	\$12.00	\$9,600	
183 Multi-Purpose Room, PT		800	SF	\$12.00	\$9,600	
184 Resource Centre/Art Studio, PT		500	SF	\$12.00	\$6,000	
185 Gross Up - Zone A		1,425	SF	\$12.00	\$17,100	
186						
187 PUBLIC COLLECTION (Epoxy)						
188 Temporary Exhibition Gallery, epoxy		1,500	SF	\$7.50	\$11,250	
189 Permanent Collection Gallery		1,500	SF	\$7.50	\$11,250	
190 Franklin Carmichael Gallery		1,000	SF	\$7.50	\$7,500	
191 First Nations Gallery		1,000	SF	\$7.50	\$7,500	
192 Francophone Gallery		1,000	SF	\$7.50	\$7,500	
193 Gross Up - Zone B		3,000	SF	\$7.50	\$22,500	
194						
195 NON-PUBLIC COLLECTION						
196 Collection Storage (Sculpture), CS		1,000	SF	\$1.00	\$1,000	
197 Collection Storage (Works on Paper/Photography), CS		500	SF	\$1.00	\$500	
198 Collection Storage (Oil Paintings) , CS		1,000	SF	\$1.00	\$1,000	
199 Collection Storage (New Media), CS		200	SF	\$1.00	\$200	
200 Temporary Exhibition Storage, CS		500	SF	\$1.00	\$500	
201 Enclosed Collections Loading Dock: Collections Shipping/Receiving, CS		600	SF	\$1.00	\$600	
202 Crating/Uncrating, CS		500	SF	\$1.00	\$500	
203 Isolation Room, Epoxy		130	SF	\$7.50	\$975	



**Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate**

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
204 Clean Workshop, Epoxy		375 SF		\$7.50	\$2,813	
205 Curatorial Examination Room , Epoxy		375 SF		\$7.50	\$2,813	
206 Crate Storage, CS		300 SF		\$1.00	\$300	
207 Gross Up - Zone C		2,740 SF		\$1.00	\$2,740	
208 ADMINISTRATION						
209 Director/Curator, CPT		150 SF		\$5.50	\$825	
210 Curator Alternate and Collection Manager, CPT		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
211 Manager, Education and Public Programs, CPT		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
212 Education Coordinator, CPT		70 SF		\$5.50	\$385	
213 Front Desk, Membership and Facilities Coordinator, CPT		70 SF		\$5.50	\$385	
214 Project Staff - collections, marketing communications, (+ other needs), CPT		125 SF		\$5.50	\$688	
215 Manager, Revenue, Development and Marketing, CPT		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
216 Executive Assistant (Volunteer Coordinator and Bookins Clerk), CPT		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
217 Exhibition and Events Coordinator/Registrar, CPT		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
218 Administrative Assistant, CPT		50 SF		\$5.50	\$275	
219 Bookkeeper, CPT		50 SF		\$5.50	\$275	
220 Additional evening/Weekend Staff, CPT		50 SF		\$5.50	\$275	
221 Photocopy/Mailroom/Storage/Stockroom, VCT		100 SF		\$6.50	\$650	
222 Staff/ Volunteer Kitchenette + Lounge, CT		300 SF		\$12.00	\$3,600	
223 OPERATIONS						
224 Packing Supplies Storage, CS		150 SF		\$1.00	\$150	
225 Chemical Supplies Storage , CS		25 SF		\$1.00	\$25	
226 Lamp Storage, CS		25 SF		\$1.00	\$25	
227 Dirty' Workshop, CS		400 SF		\$1.00	\$400	
228 Moving Equipment Storage Area, CS		100 SF		\$1.00	\$100	
229 Exhibit Case/Prop Storage, CS		600 SF		\$1.00	\$600	
230 Education Program Storage, CS		30 SF		\$1.00	\$30	
231 Equipment Storage, CS		75 SF		\$1.00	\$75	
232 Storage - Tables and Chairs, CS		400 SF		\$1.00	\$400	
233 Information Services Server Room, non static VCT		50 SF		\$10.00	\$500	
234 Retail Stockroom, VCT		200 SF		\$6.50	\$1,300	
235 Collection Loading Dock Security Booth, VCT		100 SF		\$6.50	\$650	
236 Collection Loading Dock Security Guards' Toilet, CT		50 SF		\$12.00	\$600	
237 Gross Up - Zone D		1,835 SF		\$1.00	\$1,835	
238 Cut stone treads to the Feature Stairs		176 LF		\$100.00	\$17,600	
239 Allowance for special floor finishes, patterns, accents		1 LS		\$5,000.00	\$5,000	
240 Subtotal for the Art Gallery		27,000 SF				
241 TOTAL B21 Floor Finishes		92,700 SF		\$9.18	\$850,763	
242 B22 Ceiling Finishes						
243 PUBLIC LIBRARY						
244 ENTRY LEVEL LOBBY SPACES						
245 Vestibule, GYP DW		200 SF		\$10.00	\$2,000	
246 Lobby, GYP DW		1,750 SF		\$10.00	\$17,500	
247 Café, SAT		450 SF		\$6.50	\$2,925	
248 Café kitchen and pantry, GYP DW		175 SF		\$10.00	\$1,750	



**Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate**

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
249 Library Marketplace (new book displays, computer stations), SAT		2,750	SF	\$5.50	\$15,125	
250 Material Returns Area, SAT		75	SF	\$5.50	\$413	
251 Library Exhibition Space, SAT		500	SF	\$5.50	\$2,750	
252 Customer Service Desk, GYP DW		400	SF	\$10.00	\$4,000	
253 Self Checkout Stations, GYP DW		200	SF	\$10.00	\$2,000	
254 Self Pickup Shelves, SAT		100	SF	\$5.50	\$550	
255 Staff Workroom and storage, SAT		900	SF	\$5.50	\$4,950	
256 Gross Up for Entry Lobby		3,750	SF	\$7.50	\$28,125	
257 MEETING ROOMS (SAT)						
258 Multi-Purpose space (100 people) that can be divided into two spaces – flexible		2,500	SF	\$5.50	\$13,750	
259 Meeting Rooms for up to 8 people (3 @250)		750	SF	\$5.50	\$4,125	
260 Meeting Rooms for up to 4 people (4 @ 200)		800	SF	\$5.50	\$4,400	
261 Board/Larger Group Room for up to 20		700	SF	\$5.50	\$3,850	
262 Quiet Study Rooms (8@100)		800	SF	\$5.50	\$4,400	
263 Gross Up for Meeting Rooms		2,775	SF	\$5.50	\$15,263	
264 AGE LEVEL SERVICES SPACES						
265 Children – includes Early Literacy Center, SAT		3,500	SF	\$5.50	\$19,250	
266 –Story Hour/Crafts Room		500	SF	\$5.50	\$2,750	
267 Teens, SAT		2,000	SF	\$5.50	\$11,000	
268 Adults- Circulating Collections-Print/Media (69,000 items), SAT		7,000	SF	\$5.50	\$38,500	
269 Seating –varied types for 50 people, SAT		2,000	SF	\$5.50	\$11,000	
270 Reference collection		1,500	SF	\$5.50	\$8,250	
271 Genealogy and Local History, SAT		2,000	SF	\$5.50	\$11,000	
272 Maker Space and Digital Media Lab, SAT		3,000	SF	\$5.50	\$16,500	
273 Adult Services – Info Desk, SAT		200	SF	\$5.50	\$1,100	
274 Technology Learning Center, SAT		1,200	SF	\$5.50	\$6,600	
275 Gross Up for Age Level Services		11,450	SF	\$5.50	\$62,975	
276 STAFF SPACES						
277 Staff workrooms - offices , SAT		2,600	SF	\$5.50	\$14,300	
278 Staff breakroom/small kitchen, GYP DW		300	SF	\$10.00	\$3,000	
279 Administration Offices, SAT		450	SF	\$5.50	\$2,475	
280 Technical Services Staff Workrooms -Offices, SAT		950	SF	\$5.50	\$5,225	
281 Storage (compact shelving?) archives, etc., SAT		1,500	SF	\$5.50	\$8,250	
282 Shipping and Receiving*, PT EXP		1,150	SF	\$2.50	\$2,875	
283 Mail Room*, SAT		350	SF	\$5.50	\$1,925	
284 Staff Lockers, Mail Cubbies, Coat Rack, GYP DW		150	SF	\$10.00	\$1,500	
285 Telecommunications Room, Exposed		150	SF	\$2.50	\$375	
286 Electrical Room, Exposed		100	SF	\$2.50	\$250	
287 Custodial Services Closet, GYP DW		50	SF	\$10.00	\$500	
288 Building Maintenance Office , SAT		100	SF	\$5.50	\$550	
289 Gross Up for Staff Spaces		3,925	SF	\$5.50	\$21,588	
290 Subtotal - Public Library		65,700	SF			
291 Allowance for suspended gypsum drywall bulkheads		1	LS	\$40,000	\$40,000	

Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
292 ART GALLERY OF SUDBURY						
293 PUBLIC AMENITIES						
294 Public Lockers/Cloakroom, SDW		150 SF		\$10.00	\$1,500	
295 Public and Staff Washrooms, SDW				Included in the Gross Up		
296 Retail Store + Art Rental Gallery, SAT		600 SF		\$5.50	\$3,300	
297 PUBLIC PROGRAM						
298 Family Art Studio, SDW		800 SF		\$10.00	\$8,000	
299 Multi-Purpose Room, SAT + SDW		800 SF		\$7.50	\$6,000	
300 Resource Centre/Art Studio, SAT + SDW		500 SF		\$7.50	\$3,750	
301 Gross Up - Zone A		1,425 SF		\$7.50	\$10,688	
302						
303 PUBLIC COLLECTION						
304 Temporary Exhibition Gallery, PT EXP		1,500 SF		\$2.50	\$3,750	
305 Permanent Collection Gallery, PT EXP		1,500 SF		\$2.50	\$3,750	
306 Franklin Carmichael Gallery, PT EXP		1,000 SF		\$2.50	\$2,500	
307 First Nations Gallery, PT EXP		1,000 SF		\$2.50	\$2,500	
308 Francophone Gallery, PT EXP		1,000 SF		\$2.50	\$2,500	
309 Gross Up - Zone B		3,000 SF		\$2.50	\$7,500	
310						
311 NON-PUBLIC COLLECTION (PT EXP)						
312 Collection Storage (Sculpture)		1,000 SF		\$2.50	\$2,500	
313 Collection Storage (Works on Paper/Photography)		500 SF		\$2.50	\$1,250	
314 Collection Storage (Oil Paintings)		1,000 SF		\$2.50	\$2,500	
315 Collection Storage (New Media)		200 SF		\$2.50	\$500	
316 Temporary Exhibition Storage		500 SF		\$2.50	\$1,250	
317 Enclosed Collections Loading Dock: Collections		600 SF		\$2.50	\$1,500	
Shipping/Receiving						
318 Crating/Uncrating		500 SF		\$2.50	\$1,250	
319 Isolation Room		130 SF		\$2.50	\$325	
320 Clean Workshop		375 SF		\$2.50	\$938	
321 Curatorial Examination Room, SDW		375 SF		\$10.00	\$3,750	
322 Crate Storage		300 SF		\$2.50	\$750	
323 Gross Up - Zone C		2,740 SF		\$2.50	\$6,850	
324 ADMINISTRATION (SAT)						
325 Director/Curator		150 SF		\$5.50	\$825	
326 Curator Alternate and Collection Manager		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
327 Manager, Education and Public Programs		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
328 Education Coordinator		70 SF		\$5.50	\$385	
329 Front Desk, Membership and Facilities Coordinator		70 SF		\$5.50	\$385	
330 Project Staff - collections, marketing communications, (+ other needs)		125 SF		\$5.50	\$688	
331 Manager, Revenue, Development and Marketing		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
332 Executive Assistant (Volunteer Coordinator and Bookins Clerk)		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
333 Exhibition and Events Coordinator/Registrar		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
334 Administrative Assistant		50 SF		\$5.50	\$275	
335 Bookkeeper		50 SF		\$5.50	\$275	
336 Additional evening/Weekend Staff		50 SF		\$5.50	\$275	
337 Photocopy/Mailroom/Storage/Stockroom		100 SF		\$5.50	\$550	
338 Staff/ Volunteer Kitchenette + Lounge		300 SF		\$5.50	\$1,650	



**Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate**

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
339 OPERATIONS (PT EXP)						
340 Packing Supplies Storage		150	SF	\$2.50	\$375	
341 Chemical Supplies Storage		25	SF	\$2.50	\$63	
342 Lamp Storage		25	SF	\$2.50	\$63	
343 Dirty' Workshop		400	SF	\$2.50	\$1,000	
344 Moving Equipment Storage Area		100	SF	\$2.50	\$250	
345 Exhibit Case/Prop Storage		600	SF	\$2.50	\$1,500	
346 Education Program Storage		30	SF	\$2.50	\$75	
347 Equipment Storage		75	SF	\$2.50	\$188	
348 Storage - Tables and Chairs		400	SF	\$2.50	\$1,000	
349 Information Services Server Room		50	SF	\$2.50	\$125	
350 Retail Stockroom, SAT		200	SF	\$5.50	\$1,100	
351 Collection Loading Dock Security Booth, SDW		100	SF	\$10.00	\$1,000	
352 Collection Loading Dock Security Guards' Toilet, SDW		50	SF	\$10.00	\$500	
353 Gross Up - Zone D		1,835	SF	\$2.50	\$4,588	
354 Allowance for suspended gypsum drywall bulkheads		1	LS	\$25,000	\$25,000	
355 Subtotal for Art Gallery		27,000	SF			
356 TOTAL B22 Ceiling Finishes		92,700	SF	\$5.86	\$543,600	
357 B23 Wall Finishes						
358 Public Library						
359 Paint to partitions		55,000	SF	\$1.50	\$82,500	
360 Ceramic wall tile to washrooms, backsplashes		4,000	SF	\$10.00	\$40,000	
361 Allowance for special wall finishes to public areas		1	LS	\$50,000.00	\$50,000	
362 Art Gallery of Sudbury						
363 Paint to partitions		25,000	SF	\$1.50	\$37,500	
364 Ceramic wall tile to washrooms, backsplashes		2,000	SF	\$10.00	\$20,000	
365 Allowance for special wall finishes to public areas		1	LS	\$30,000.00	\$30,000	
366 TOTAL B23 Wall Finishes		92,700	SF	\$2.80	\$260,000	
367 TOTAL B2 FINISHES		92,700	SF	\$17.85	\$1,654,363	
1 B3 FITTINGS & EQUIPMENT						
368 B31 Fittings & Fixtures						
369 <u>Millwork</u>						
370 Allow for misc. millwork - Library		65,700	SF	\$8.00	\$525,600	
371 Gallery storage shelving					Excluded	



**Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate**

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
372 Allow for misc. millwork - Art Gallery		27,000	SF	\$13.00	\$351,000	
373 <u>Metals</u>						
374 Allowance for miscellaneous metals - Library		65,700	SF	\$1.25	\$82,125	
375 Allowance for miscellaneous metals - Art Gallery		27,000	SF	\$1.25	\$33,750	
376 <u>Rough Carpentry</u>						
377 Allowance for rough carpentry - Library		65,700	SF	\$1.00	\$65,700	
378 Allowance for rough carpentry - Art Gallery		27,000	SF	\$1.00	\$27,000	
379 Allow for caulking and sealing - Library		65,700	SF	\$0.50	\$32,850	
380 Allow for caulking and sealing - Art Gallery		27,000	SF	\$0.50	\$13,500	
1 <u>Specialties</u>						
381 Allowance for specialties - Library		65,700	SF	\$4.50	\$295,650	
382 Allowance for specialties - Art Gallery		27,000	SF	\$4.50	\$121,500	
383 Allowance for wayfinding signage, Library		1	LS	\$20,000.00	\$20,000	
384 Allowance for wayfinding signage, Art Gallery		1	LS	\$10,000.00	\$10,000	
385 Donor wall allowance, Art Gallery		1	LS	\$15,000.00	\$15,000	
386 TOTAL B31 Fittings & Fixtures		92,700	SF	\$17.19	\$1,593,700	
387 B32 Equipment						
388 Audio / visual equipment, not required					Excluded	
389 Computers / digital equipment, not required					Excluded	
390 Loose furniture, chairs, tables, etc					Excluded	
391 Workshop woodworking equipment					Excluded	
392 TOTAL B32 Equipment		0	SF	\$0.00	\$0	
393 B33 Conveying Systems						
394 Hydraulic passenger/freight elevator, 2 stops - Library		2	NO	\$40,000.00	\$80,000	
395 Hydraulic passenger/freight elevator, 2 stops - Art Gallery		2	NO	\$40,000.00	\$80,000	
396 TOTAL B33 Conveying Systems		2	NO	\$80,000	\$160,000	
397 TOTAL B3 FITTINGS & EQUIPMENT		92,700	SF	\$18.92	\$1,753,700	



Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
398 TOTAL B INTERIORS		92,700 SF		\$54.21	\$5,025,063	
399						
400 C1 MECHANICAL						
401 C11 Plumbing & Drainage						
402 Public Library						
403 Allowance for Base Building plumbing and drainage		65,700 SF		\$5.50	\$361,350	
404 Allowance for Fit Out plumbing and drainage		65,700 SF		\$3.50	\$229,950	
405 Art Gallery						
406 Allowance for Base Building plumbing and drainage		27,000 SF		\$5.50	\$148,500	
407 Allowance for Fit Out plumbing and drainage		27,000 SF		\$3.50	\$94,500	
408 TOTAL C11 Plumbing & Drainage		92,700 SF		\$9.00	\$834,300	
409 C12 Fire Protection						
410 Public Library						
411 Base Building sprinklers		65,700 SF		\$3.50	\$229,950	
412 Fit Out sprinklers		65,700 SF		\$1.25	\$82,125	
413 Art Gallery						
414 Base Building sprinklers		27,000 SF		\$4.00	\$108,000	
415 Fit Out sprinklers		27,000 SF		\$1.25	\$33,750	
416 TOTAL C12 Fire Protection		92,700 SF		\$4.90	\$453,800	
417 C13 HVAC						
418 Public Library						
419 Allowance for Base Building HVAC		65,700 SF		\$36.00	\$2,365,200	
420 Allowance for Fit Out HVAC		65,700 SF		\$25.00	\$1,642,500	
421 Art Gallery						
422 Allowance for Base Building HVAC		27,000 SF		\$40.00	\$1,080,000	
423 Allowance for Fit Out HVAC		27,000 SF		\$25.00	\$675,000	
424 TOTAL C13 HVAC		92,700 SF		\$62.17	\$5,762,700	



Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
425 C14 Controls						
426 Public Library						
427 Allowance for Base Building Controls		65,700	SF	\$5.00	\$328,500	
428 Allowance for Fit Out Controls		65,700	SF	\$2.50	\$164,250	
429 Art Gallery						
430 Allowance for Base Building Controls		27,000	SF	\$5.00	\$135,000	
431 Allowance for Fit Out Controls		27,000	SF	\$2.50	\$67,500	
432 TOTAL C14 Controls		92,700	SF	\$7.50	\$695,250	
433 TOTAL C1 MECHANICAL		92,700	SF	\$83.56	\$7,746,050	
434 C2 ELECTRICAL						
435 C21 Service & Distribution						
436 Public Library						
437 Service & Distribution - Base Building		65,700	SF	\$8.00	\$525,600	
438 Service & Distribution - Fit Out		65,700	SF	\$2.50	\$164,250	
439 Art Gallery						
440 Service & Distribution - Base Building		27,000	SF	\$8.00	\$216,000	
441 Service & Distribution - Fit Out		27,000	SF	\$2.50	\$67,500	
442 TOTAL C21 Service & Distribution		92,700	SF	\$10.50	\$973,400	
443 C22 Lighting, Devices & Heating						
444 Public Library						
445 Lighting , Devices & Heating - Base Building		65,700	SF	\$7.50	\$492,750	
446 Lighting , Devices & Heating - Fit Out		65,700	SF	\$12.00	\$788,400	
447 Art Gallery						
448 Lighting , Devices & Heating - Base Building		27,000	SF	\$7.50	\$202,500	
449 Lighting , Devices & Heating - Fit Out		27,000	SF	\$12.00	\$324,000	
450 TOTAL C22 Lighting, Devices & Heating		92,700	SF	\$19.50	\$1,807,700	



Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
451 C23 Systems & Ancillaries						
452 Public Library						
453 Systems & Ancillaries - Base Building		65,700	SF	\$4.50	\$295,650	
454 Systems & Ancillaries - Fit Out		65,700	SF	\$7.50	\$492,750	
455 Art Gallery						
456 Systems & Ancillaries - Base Building		27,000	SF	\$5.00	\$135,000	
457 Systems & Ancillaries - Fit Out		27,000	SF	\$8.00	\$216,000	
458 TOTAL C23 Systems & Ancillaries		92,700	SF	\$12.29	\$1,139,400	
459 TOTAL C2 ELECTRICAL		92,700	SF	\$42.29	\$3,920,500	
460 TOTAL C SERVICES		92,700	SF	\$125.85	\$11,666,550	
461 NET BUILDING COST (EXCLUDING SITE)		92,700	SF	\$285.87	\$26,499,913	
1 D1 SITE WORK						
462 D11 Site Development						
463 Allowance for site development - green field site		92,700	SF	\$32.00	\$2,966,400	
464 TOTAL D11 Site Development		92,700	SF	\$32.00	\$2,966,400	
465 D12 Mechanical Site Services						
466 Water main and connect to existing main		1	LS	\$20,000.00	\$20,000	
467 Sanitary and connect to existing main		1	LS	\$20,000.00	\$20,000	
468 Storm and connect to existing main		1	LS	\$20,000.00	\$20,000	
469 On site mechanical storm drainage		1	LS	\$125,000.00	\$125,000	
470 Gas - by local utility provider					Excluded	
471 TOTAL D12 Mechanical Site Services		92,700	SF	\$2.00	\$185,000	



**Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate**

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
472 D13 Electrical Site Services						
473 Incoming hydro service		1	LS	\$100,000.00	\$100,000	
474 Incoming communicaitons duct bank		1	LS	\$15,000.00	\$15,000	
475 Electrical site services		1	LS	\$120,000.00	\$120,000	
476 TOTAL D13 Electrical Site Services		92,700	SF	\$2.54	\$235,000	
477 TOTAL D1 SITE WORK		92,700	SF	\$36.53	\$3,386,400	
1 D2 ANCILLARY WORK						
478 D21 Demolition						
479 Scope assumed not required (green field site)					Excluded	
480 Abatement of hazardous materials, assumed not required					Excluded	
481 TOTAL D21 Demolition		0	m2	\$0.00	\$0	
482 D22 Alterations						
483 Not required					Excluded	
484 TOTAL D22 Alterations			m2	\$0.00	\$0	
485 TOTAL D2 ANCILLARY WORK		0	SF	#DIV/0!	\$0	
486 TOTAL D SITE & ANCILLARY WORK		92,700	SF	\$36.53	\$3,386,400	
487 NET BUILDING COST (INCLUDING SITE)		92,700	SF	\$322.40	\$29,886,313	
488 Z1 GENERAL REQUIREMENTS & FEE						
489 Z11 General Requirements						
490 General Requirements		1	LS		\$3,287,500	11.0%
491 TOTAL Z11 General Requirements					\$3,287,500	
492 Z12 Fee						
493 Fee		1	LS		\$995,200	3.0%
494 TOTAL Z12 Fee					\$995,200	
495 TOTAL Z1 GENERAL REQUIREMENTS & FEE		92,700	SF	\$46.20	\$4,282,700	
496 TOTAL CONSTRUCTION ESTIMATE EXCLUDING ALLOWANCES		92,700	SF	\$368.60	\$34,169,013	



Sudbury Public Library & Art Gallery of Sudbury
Order of Magnitude (Class D) Estimate

Project No. 101598
Date: 15-Jun-17

Detailed Elemental Estimate

Gross Floor Area (SF): 92,700

Description	Division	Quantity	Unit	Unit Rate	Extension	Comments
497 Z2 CONTINGENCIES						
498 Z21 Design Contingency						
499 Design Contingency		1	LS		\$4,100,300	12.0%
500 TOTAL Z21 Design Contingency		92,700	SF	\$44.23	\$4,100,300	
501 Z22 Escalation Contingency						
502 Escalation Contingency - Construction planned for 2020		1	LS		\$2,050,100	6.0%
503 TOTAL Z22 Escalation Contingency		92,700	SF	\$22.12	\$2,050,100	
504 Z23 Construction Contingency						
505 Construction Contingency		1	LS		\$1,680,500	5.0%
506 Total Z23 Construction Contingency		92,700	SF	\$18.13	\$1,680,500	
507 TOTAL Z2 CONTINGENCIES		92,700	SF	\$84.48	\$7,830,900	
508 TOTAL Z GENERAL REQUIREMENTS & CONTINGENCIES		92,700	SF	\$130.68	\$12,113,600	
509 TOTAL BUILDING COST INCLUDING ALLOWANCES		92,700	SF	\$453.07	\$42,000,000	