

For Information Only

Transit Safety Plan

Presented To: Community Services Committee

Presented: Monday, Oct 23, 2017

Report Date: Monday, Oct 02, 2017

Type: Correspondence for Information Only

Resolution

For Information Only

Relationship to the Strategic Plan / Health Impact Assessment

This report supports the Strategic Plan adopted by the City of Greater Sudbury, as it aligns with the Quality of Life and Place priorities, by providing increased safety and security measures which will improve customer experience for citizens accessing Greater Sudbury Transit Services.

This report will have a positive impact on the Social Determinants of Health in the areas of Human Health/Well-Being and Civic Engagement/Social Capital, as increasing safety and security measures will enhance the quality of services provided through Greater Sudbury Transit Services, which will engage people to take public transit as a preferred mode of transportation and have a positive impact on ridership.

Report Summary

The Downtown Transit Area Working Group has conducted a review of current safety and security management practices within Greater Sudbury Transit Services and best practices within the Transit Industry. The report provides information on the measures Greater Sudbury Transit will implement to ensure safe and secure environments for passengers and Transit Operators.

Financial Implications

Initiatives undertaken by Greater Sudbury Transit to improve safety and security will be within approved budgets.

Signed By

Report Prepared By

Michelle Ferrigan
Director of Transit Services
Digitally Signed Oct 2, 17

Health Impact Review

Michelle Ferrigan
Director of Transit Services
Digitally Signed Oct 2, 17

Manager Review

Michelle Ferrigan
Director of Transit Services
Digitally Signed Oct 2, 17

Division Review

Michelle Ferrigan
Director of Transit Services
Digitally Signed Oct 2, 17

Financial Implications

Apryl Lukezic
Co-ordinator of Budgets
Digitally Signed Oct 3, 17

Recommended by the Department

Catherine Matheson
General Manager of Community Development
Digitally Signed Oct 5, 17

Recommended by the C.A.O.

Ed Archer
Chief Administrative Officer
Digitally Signed Oct 11, 17

Background

Greater Sudbury Transit (Transit) is undertaking a number of initiatives and service reviews with a significant emphasis on enhancing customer experience by creating a transit system that is easily accessible, convenient, comfortable and enjoyable for all passengers. One of these initiatives consists of a review of security and safety practices both at the Transit Terminal and on board Transit buses. Safety and Security is an important aspect of service delivery, as actual or perceived lack of safety has a negative effect on use of Transit services, and affects employee's health and morale.

A Downtown Transit Area Working Group has been established to review current safety management practices and make recommendations to enhance safety and security for City Employees, passengers and residents. The Downtown Transit Area Working Group consists of members with expertise in CPTED audits, Security/Surveillance, Landscaping, Community Outreach, Police Services, Long Term Planning and Transit Services. This report is the outcome of the Downtown Transit Area Working Group's review.

Reasons for Safety Review

Reasons which have led to safety and security concerns and the need for a review:

- The Greater Sudbury Transit Terminal is located at a busy pedestrian intersection between Cedar Street and Elm Street in the downtown core. Located in this area is a number of frequently used health, social and commercial services which has resulted in a high traffic pedestrian area. Concerns have been received regarding a perceived sense of threat resulting from the behavior of some citizens accessing these services and the congestion and funneling of pedestrians that occurs around the Transit Terminal.
- Through the Transit Action Plan Engagement process, and a Greater Sudbury Transit employee survey, "safety and security" was identified as a priority requiring improvement.
- As a result of recent physical assaults on Transit Operators, the Transit Safety Task Force is also reviewing safety practices and security measures to improve safety for Greater Sudbury Transit employees.

Current Safety Management Practices

1. Collaboration Efforts

Building relationships and partnerships with groups who have similar interests and expertise provides an opportunity to better share information and provide cohesive and

complementary support. Greater Sudbury Transit collaborates and receives support from Greater Sudbury Police Services, Transit Safety Task Force and Community Outreach Services.

2. Technology

Greater Sudbury Transit is equipped with the following technology enabling communication, monitoring, and information which assist both the City of Greater Sudbury and Greater Sudbury Police in investigation of incidents.

- Automated Vehicle Location Systems
- Mobile Radio Units
- Surveillance Cameras on Buses
- Surveillance Cameras at the Transit Terminal

3. Security –Related Policies and Programs

The following security-related policies and programs are in place as part of Greater Sudbury Transit's operations.

- Driver Certification Program
- On the Job Training
- Refresher Training
- Incident Reporting and investigation
- After 6 p.m. Stop Request Policy
- Top 10 Rules of Conduct

4. Security Contract Service Level

Seven days per week between the hours of 8:00 am and 12:30 am, as overseen by the Manager of Security and By-law Services, the City of Greater Sudbury hosts one (1) contracted security guard at the Transit Terminal. The expectation of the security service is to provide a high level of customer service while actively monitoring for, and discouraging anti-social behavior witnessed on Transit property.

Security guards are directed to enforce the Trespass to Property Act, by asking a person to refrain from unauthorized behavior and/or leave the premises. If the individual refuses to comply, the guard may arrest and immediately call the Police.

With consideration for personal risk in mind and with obligations for a safe working environment as mandated by the Occupational Health and Safety Act, contracted security guards are coached to reserve any active use of force such as making an arrest. As only one guard is stationed at the Transit Terminal, coupled with the fact that they do not have the proper training or equipment, they are asked to call the Greater

Sudbury Police whenever there is an immediate level of danger for themselves or another person.

The lack of ability to enforce non-threatening incidents leads to issues of loitering and unwanted behavior on Transit Terminal property.

5. Transit Operator Compartment Barrier Pilot

In 2014, Transit Operator compartment barriers were tested, and a survey was conducted with the employees which revealed that the majority of Transit Operators were not in favor of the barriers. This unease of barrier use is typical of what other Transit Municipalities have heard from their Transit Operators, and in general, reasons provided for the lack of interest include reduced air flow, increased glare, the restricted ability to interact with customers, a false sense of security and the sense that the barriers may in fact provoke aggression.

In response to a physical assault which occurred in May 2017, the Transit Safety Task Force committee and Greater Sudbury Transit Services have agreed to review the use of barriers once again. A sample barrier has been ordered, and one bus will be retrofitted for the purposes of gathering information. Once the results have been reviewed, next steps will be identified and a report will follow to Community Services Committee for consideration.

Recent Improvements

1. Renovations at Downtown Transit Terminal

The Greater Sudbury Downtown Transit Terminal is the main hub of the route network where thousands of people converge to transfer from one route to another on a daily basis. Renovations are underway and are scheduled to be completed by end of November 2017. These renovations were made possible by the Canada-Ontario Public Transit Infrastructure Fund (PTIF). The Government of Canada is cost-matching a 2017 municipal capital investment of \$500,000 for a total of \$1 Million.

Prior to developing the scope of work for the renovations, a Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) audit was performed.

The audit provided the following recommendations which were brought into the scope of work (Appendix A – Transit Terminal CPTED Audit):

- Improved and additional lighting
- Redesign of the garbage disposal area
- Additional anti-sit devices
- Adjustment and addition of security cameras
- Trim shrubs to provide better sightlines
- Remove structure/canopy entering Transit Terminal from Elm Street

- Remove pay phones
- Remove architectural features on the interior of the build to increase sightlines
- Fresh coats of paint on rusted metal

Along with these recommendations, further operational and customer comfort improvements are being undertaken (Appendix B – Transit Terminal Renovation Rendering):

- Repair asphalt throughout the property
- Repair curbs and paint yellow
- Create clear walking paths to minimize vehicle and pedestrian conflict
- Create parking for vans and buses
- Improve kiosk interior design for storage & safety improvements
- Wayfinding throughout property
- New tile flooring
- Fresh coat of paint throughout interior of building
- New accessible washroom fixtures
- HVAC and boiler replacement
- New sliding doors
- New and additional camera system

Safety Related Best Practices in Transit Industry

The Downtown Transit Area Working Group compared Greater Sudbury Transit's current safety management practices with those of other municipalities throughout Canada, and has identified several gaps.

1. Improve Perception of Transit Services

Perception plays an important role in decisions that an individual will make as it relates to Transit Services. Perception of Transit Services is influenced by many factors, such as comfort, courtesy, safety and security. The following programs and initiatives should be considered in order to build awareness, share information, and increase confidence in Greater Sudbury Transit Services.

Building Awareness on Mental Health: Through collaboration efforts with stakeholders, build programs aimed at de-stigmatizing mental health and/or to encourage at-risk individuals to seek help.

Public Involvement: Launch a "See Something, Say Something" public campaign to encourage passengers to report criminal behavior they observe on buses to the Transit Operator or other Transit representative, so that action can be taken.

Safety Culture - Display safety messages throughout the Transit Terminal, buses and shelters to provide reinforcement of the safety culture within the services.

Cleanliness - Provide a clean and well maintained environment for both passengers and Transit Operators. This includes buses, shelters and the Transit Terminal.

Transit Supervisor Assistance - Increase presence of Transit Supervisors both on board buses and on Transit Terminal Platforms. Visibility of Management promotes professionalism and provides additional customer service.

Public Art – Integrate art into Transit Services in order to contribute a positive experience for passengers, attract new riders, and provide a sense of community identity and vibrancy.

2. Create a Transit By-Law and Increase Security Service Level

There is a monthly average of sixty (60) higher risk interactions occurring at the Transit Terminal as reported by contracted uniformed security, with only the Trespass to Property Act to support enforcement. Fare evasion, loitering and unruly behavior are common issues, which are not adequately addressed through the contracted service. There is also a gap in hours of operations between 6 a.m. and 8 a.m.; Transit Employees arrive at the Transit Terminal by 6 a.m., and Security Guards arrive for their shift at 8 a.m.

Transit By-Law: While Greater Sudbury Transit has always requested that passengers behave in a safe and appropriate manner, a Transit By-Law should be considered similar to other Municipalities such as Sault Ste. Marie, Hamilton, Mississauga, York and Ottawa. A Transit By-Law establishes rules and regulations governing the use of the Transit system and provides the opportunity for enforcement officers to issue offence notices to those contravening the By-Law, thereby providing a deterrent to undesirable behavior. The By-Law would not only apply to the Transit Terminal property, but to other transit hubs within the City and on-board buses. The ability to deploy a Municipal Enforcement Officer offsite could become of increasing importance should the service move towards a multi hub system.

Municipal Enforcement Officers

In order to effectively enforce the Transit By-Law, the current security services should be replaced with the use of dedicated Municipal Law Enforcement Officers. This service would be required daily from 6:00 a.m. until 1:00 a.m., and would be best deployed with the use of two Municipal Enforcement Officers who would have the ability to support a mobile response for on-board bus incidents and provide adequate support to address occurrences at the Transit Terminal.

3. Develop a Transit Safety Plan

A Transit Safety Plan provides information on policies, programs, standard operating procedures, use of technology and security levels as they relate to delivering a safe environment for passengers and Transit Operators. Not all incidents can be prevented;

however, by preparing for the issues in a proactive manner, incidents can be responded to more quickly and effectively.

Equally important is to ensure that all involved in providing a safe and secure service understand their role and implications of their actions. A Transit Safety Plan is a guide which is typically distributed to all Transit Employees. It is a living document requiring updates and reviews as risks are identified and programs or policies are implemented.

Next Steps

Greater Sudbury Transit's objective is to continuously develop, implement and improve strategies and processes to ensure that Transit achieves the highest practicable level of safety and provides a comfortable, inviting and safe environment for passengers and Transit Operators. In collaboration with the Transit Safety Task Force, Greater Sudbury Transit will develop a Transit Safety Plan. Within this plan, programs will be initiated with an aim to improve the perception and existence of safety and security issues.

Resources Cited

Transit Supportive Guidelines

www.mto.gov.on.ca/english/transit/supportive-guideline/index.shtml

Canadian Urban Transit Association

<http://cutaactu.ca/en/advocacy/policy-issues-and-research>

CPTED AUDIT – GREATER SUDBURY TRANSIT TERMINAL

9 ELM ST, SUDBURY, ON P3C 1S9

PERFORMED BY: JAMES ST. JOHN ON JANUARY 26, 2017

Disclaimer: The following pages are enclosed to help better understand the security issues in the area. The recommendations are not intended to make the area crime-free. They will, however, reduce the probability of losses occurring if they are properly applied and maintained. Loss prevention and reduction of other crime, like all management responsibilities, will require constant upgrading and attention to further keep abreast of the changing operational need of security. Human error or complacency is also often responsible for the losses which sometimes occur. The suggestions outlined in this report should only be considered after consulting with building codes, fire codes and other relevant legislation.

CPTED PRINCIPLES

CPTED is based on the belief that the proper design and effective use of the build environment can lead to a reduction in the fear and incidence of crime as well as an improvement in the quality of life.

CPTED OBJECTIVES

CPTED has several objectives. These include:

- Match intended human functions with spaces that can support them;
- Ensure that the intended activity has the opportunity to function well and directly support the control of human behavior;
- CPTED encourages diverse and compact urban forms which help to establish informal surveillance to public spaces. An important aspect of ensuring a safer urban environment is to establish the sense of ownership in every place we design;
- Safe urban environments require the presence of people in public places. Casual encounters of individuals are an important factor for CPTED solutions in dealing with vandalism, assault, loitering, mugging, harassment and other negative activities. Any public place should be under surveillance by its residents in order to avoid isolated areas.

DESIGN STRATEGIES

CPTED principles include the concept that the physical environment can be manipulated for the purpose of influencing certain desired human behavior. CPTED design strategies which can reduce the fear and incidence of crime and improve the quality of life include the following strategies:

Natural Surveillance: : a design strategy directed at keeping intruders under observation by other users of the space or from surrounding areas	
Visibility of Public Realm	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The layout of the site must be visually accessible• The site must have sufficient lighting to support the intended uses of the space• The casual surveillance and sightlines of people in the area must be maintained• The visibility of the site from adjacent building and open spaces is optimized• Landscape elements must provide sufficient sightlines• The site has an active relationship with the adjacent neighbourhood and is not isolated from casual public encounters and activities
Natural Access Control : a design strategy directed at decreasing crime opportunities by denying access to a crime target and creating a perception of risk for potential offenders	
Safe and Convenient Movement & Connections	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The layout of the site must be designed for safe and accessible pedestrian movement• The circulation routes must be defined with clear sightlines to all intended function
Access Control	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The site must have a limited number of entrance and exit routes which are clearly defined

Appendix A - Transit Terminal CPTED Audit

Territorial Reinforcement : Territorial Reinforcement: a design strategy that realizes that physical design can create or extend a sphere of influence so that users of the property develop a sense of proprietorship over it	
Sense of Belonging/Defensible Space	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The layout of the site must be spatially defined in relation to adjacent buildings and activities to provide for a transition from public to semi-public spaces so as to provide a sense of change between spaces The site must have clear orientation, direction and connection of movement for pedestrians to the adjacent structures and their uses. Areas within the site must not be isolated from observation
Connectivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The site must have active relationship with the surrounding neighbourhood and not be isolated from casual public encounter or activity The must be integrated into the neighbourhood system

Mechanical forms of surveillance and access control such as locks, lighting, cameras etc. should support the intended function of the space and be designed to complement the natural design strategies of CPTED.

While CPTED principles support natural control systems as a core goal, mechanical devices may be necessary for the enhancement of safety and security control.

The following table compares natural and mechanical forms of access control, surveillance and territoriality.

Natural Control	Mechanical Control
Surveillance of activities under casual observation from windows, doors and amenity areas of adjacent buildings.	Surveillance is under camera observation and visually recorded.
To direct access so that potential intruders are observable and discernable by the human senses.	Access is provided through controlled access points such as a gate or door with locks. Only authorized persons or vehicles are allowed to enter the site, usually with a special pass, key or other device.
Territory is defined through the use of landscape treatments, paving patterns etc.	Territory is enclosed by structures such as fencing with gates, walls, etc.

CPTED ASSESSMENT OF GREATER SUDBURY TRANSIT TERMINAL

CPTED strategy	Observation of Greater Sudbury Transit Terminal
Interior of Building	
Natural surveillance	Natural surveillance is present with a mixture of formal and informal observers which are present on site such as: Employees, Patrons, and Bystanders
Natural Surveillance	Plenty of windows on the building provides natural light, as well as visibility in and out of the building

Appendix A - Transit Terminal CPTED Audit

Natural Surveillance	The security booth may benefit from better visibility through the glass.
Natural Surveillance, Access Control and Mechanical Surveillance	The kiosk booth is located in a visible location. Several security measures have been implemented such as visibility, signage, security camera, and controlled access.
Mechanical Surveillance and Access Control	Organized surveillance is present in the form of security guard (1 present, does regular patrols). Additionally, support is provided by CGS Bylaw department and Greater Sudbury Police Services.
Mechanical Surveillance and Access Control	Mechanical surveillance promotes enhanced visibility and is provided by security cameras (11). After reviewing video surveillance it was noted that the addition of cameras or adjustment of cameras may benefit surveillance
Mechanical Surveillance and Access Control	Transit Terminal has implemented keypad locks reducing access to Restricted areas for staff
Natural Surveillance	Lighting in the interior of the building seems to be sufficient
Natural Access Control	Main entrance to the building provides a congregation area inside the building as people enter the building and stop, which causes some congestion, reducing visibility for surveillance from security guards.
Natural Surveillance, Access Control and Mechanical Surveillance	Washroom areas appear to be clearly defined, possibly additional signage may benefit the area. Washroom entrances are monitored by video surveillance. Possibility of redesign to improve visibility could reduce unwanted activity.
Natural Access Control and Territorial Reinforcement	Pay phone area should be examined to see if they are essentially needed or possibly reduced.
Territorial Reinforcement	Vending machines utilizing plenty of space as well as reducing site lines in and out of the building. Should examine if all five vending machines are required. The vending machines are placed in a good location. Visible from both the kiosk booth and security.
Territorial Reinforcement, Mechanical Surveillance	ATM and change machines are located in visible location. Visible from both the kiosk booth and security. Also under video surveillance.
Natural Surveillance	There may be some benefit to the removal of some architectural features in the interior of the building which would increase sightlines and provide a more open space.
Exterior of building	
Territorial Reinforcement	Overall the general appearance of the site is clean. Minimal graffiti noticed as well as plenty of garbage receptacles were in place which seemed to minimize the amount of litter on site. Some minor maintenance procedures to enhance the area such as a fresh coat of paint on light standards and metal doors would be beneficial.
Natural Surveillance, Natural Access, Territorial Reinforcement and Mechanical Surveillance	The garbage disposal area is of concern. The doors are open as, shopping carts and empty pallets are placed outside. The possibility of redesigning this area may be beneficial to provide a cleaner, more secure location, as we as regular removal of shopping cards and pallets is recommended.

Appendix A - Transit Terminal CPTED Audit

Natural Surveillance	Uniform lighting is recommended to provide equal lighting to all areas. Upon visual inspection of the site during night time hours, some concerns were noticed such as lights not working. An upgrade to the lighting system may be preferred to enhance the visibility, reduce light pollution, and provide energy savings. Additionally, the globe lighting can easily be vandalized to further reduce lighting.
Natural Surveillance	Majority of the shrubs and gardens on site provide good sightlines. However, one area in need of some maintenance is on the North West corner which would include some trimming of trees to provide better sightlines and reduce hiding areas.
Natural Surveillance, Natural Access Control, Territorial Reinforcement and Mechanical Surveillance	Upon observation there is an area on the North side of the site where plenty of people seem to congregate at one of the entrances to the Transit Terminal. To reduce the amount of people that congregate in this area, it may be beneficial to completely remove the shelter structure so pedestrians are encouraged to move to their destination instead of hanging out under this canopy. Additionally, increasing lighting in this area as well as the addition of video surveillance may deter unwanted activity in this area.
Natural Surveillance, Natural Access Control and Territorial Reinforcement	One area that may be enhanced would be the walkway from Cedar St. to Elm St. as it is a movement predictor. Uniform lighting is recommended to provide equal lighting to areas along the walkway. It was noticed that some sections of the retaining wall had anti-sit devices installed but it is recommended that additional anti-sit devices be installed throughout the walkway to discourage loitering.
Surrounding Area	
Territorial Reinforcement	Some challenges are posed with location such as the following: Located next to an LCBO may increase the opportunity for illegitimate use. Also located next to a Tim Horton's which may increase pedestrians not using the bus terminal for intended use.

FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS

- Improved and additional lighting. Burnt out lights should be replaced quickly.
- Redesign of the garbage disposal area
- Additional anti-sit devices
- Adjustment and addition of security cameras
- Trim shrubs to provide better sightlines
- Remove structure/canopy entering Transit Terminal from Elm St.
- Remove pay phones
- Remove architectural features on the interior of the build to increase sightlines
- Fresh coats of paint on rusted metal



