

For Information Only

Status Report on Wrongdoing Hotline

Presented To:	Audit Committee
Presented:	Tuesday, Jun 20, 2017
Report Date	Thursday, May 25, 2017
Type:	Correspondence for Information Only

Resolution

For Information Only

Relationship to the Strategic Plan / Health Impact Assessment

This report relates to the priority of "Responsive, Fiscally Prudent, Open Governance" as outlined in 2015-2018 Corporate Strategic Plan.

Report Summary

Issue: Residents and/or staff have filed complaints to the wrongdoing hotline.

Rule: In accordance with our priority of "Open Governance", complaints need to be properly investigated.

Analysis: Our analysis identified a higher than anticipated volume of complaints due to some confusion about the purpose of the Wrongdoing Hotline.

Conclusion: Approximately ten percent of the 80 complaints required investigations to be conducted. Eight of these investigations resulted in actions being taken to improve future compliance with CGS policies.

Financial Implications

No financial implication.

Signed By

Auditor General

Ron Foster

Auditor General

Digitally Signed May 25, 17

Status Report on the Wrongdoing Hotline

Seven Month Period Ended
December 31, 2016

 **AUDITOR GENERAL**

BACKGROUND

On June 1, 2016, the City of Greater Sudbury opened its 'Wrongdoing Hotline' for citizens, employees and contractors to report complaints/allegations that could be deemed illegal, dishonest, wasteful or a deliberate violation of city policy.

This report summarizes Hotline activities on a monthly and year-to-date basis and provides information on the nature, status and disposition of specific complaints/allegations received during the period from June 1 to December 31, 2016. The next quarterly report on complaint statistics will be provided in April 2017 and the next detailed annual report will be provided in early 2018.

OBSERVATIONS

1. The volume of complaints has been higher than anticipated due to some confusion about the purpose of the Wrongdoing Hotline. Additional information will be provided on the website to channel service complaints to the City's 311 service and to channel employees to existing resolution processes. Forty percent of the complaints (32 of 80) have been referred to others for review. Thirty percent of the complaints (24 of 80) were not supported by the evidence or were subject to other resolution processes. Only ten percent of the complaints (8 of 80) required actions to be taken which is typical for municipalities that have implemented hotlines.
2. As staff members in Human Resources & Organizational Development and the Auditor General's Office spend significant time responding to wrongdoing complaints, the costs and benefits of the Hotline will be monitored and reported on a quarterly basis.
3. Three complaint investigations were contracted to third parties to ensure unbiased reviews of the facts occurred prior to making final decisions about outcomes and communicating with complainants. The cost of those investigations has totaled approximately \$19,000 and is being borne by the budgets of Human Resources and the Auditor General's Office.

COMPLAINT STATISTICS

Source of Complaint	YTD Number	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec
Total complaints	97	25	7	10	11	13	11	20
Tests	4	2	0	0	0	0	2	0
Incomplete complaints	13	4	2	2	1	2	0	2
Complaints received	80	19	5	8	10	11	9	18
Complaints closed	64	19	5	7	9	6	9	9
Active complaints	16	0	0	1	1	5	0	9

Complaints Received	80
Referred to Bylaw for review	(14)
Referred to 311 for review	(4)
Referred to related Agencies and Boards for review	(2)
Referred to external law enforcement or courts	(2)
Referred to others as not related to CGS services	(10)
Complaints subject to investigation	48

Complaints Subject to Investigation	48
Closed as no evidence of wrongdoing found	(22)
Closed with no action planned or required	(2)
Complaints which required further analysis	24
Closed with action planned or taken (see table below)	(8)
Active complaints not yet analyzed	16

Complaint	Date	Complaints Closed with Action Planned or Taken
16-0026	July	Staff reminded of City policy on personal cell phone usage.
16-0027	July	Need for adherence to schedules reviewed by Transit staff.
16-0035	Aug	Job site etiquette reviewed with Roads and Transportation employees.
16-0055	Oct	Management spoke with the operator and will provide additional training if necessary.
16-0075	Nov	The timeliness of the work was reviewed by staff for an explanation and the concerns about rudeness were reported to the contracting organization
16-0081	Dec	Semi-annual status reports will be provided to the public on the wrongdoing hotline commencing in June 2017.
16-0084	Dec	There have been and will continue to be steps taken by Transit management in cooperation with employees and CUPE to attempt to address abuse of bus operators by the public.
16-0087	Dec	This complaint contains a good suggestion which has been forwarded to management in the area for review and action.

Subject of Complaints Investigated	Active Complaints	Closed Complaints	Total
Office of the Mayor	0	1	1
Members of Council	1	1	2
Contractors	2	4	6
Staff	13	26	39
Total	16	32	48

Complaint Number	Opened	Closed	Complaint/Allegation	Investigation Outcome
16-0001	June	June	Test	N/A
16-0002	June	June	Test	N/A
16-0003	June	Sept	Dog attack	ACR 718642
16-0004	June	June	Parking infractions	Referred to Bylaw Services
16-0005	June	June	Barking dogs	Referred to Bylaw Services
16-0006	June	Sept	Equipment lost at Azilda dump	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0007	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0008	June	Aug	Results of investigation by the Mayor's Office	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0009	Sept	Sept	City support for medical clinic in Chelmsford	No evidence of wrongdoing

16-0010	June	June	Conduct of staff	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0011	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0012	June	June	Resident who yells at people	Referred to law enforcement
16-0013	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0014	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0015	June	Sept	Cooking device on apartment balcony	ACR 719325
16-0016	June	June	Shoreline alterations by employee in another municipality	Not related to CGS services
16-0017	June	Sept	Watering of lawn	Referred to Bylaw Services
16-0018	June	Sept	Watering of lawn	Referred to Bylaw Services
16-0019	June	Dec	Conduct of the Mayor	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0020	June	Sept	Use of City equipment	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0021	June	Aug	Renovations to City Street	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0022	June	Aug	Purchases of big blue brute containers for recycling	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0023	June	Sept	Price of waste containers	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0024	June	Sept	Unfair contract award process	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0025	June	July	Fairness of bidding process	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0026	July	Aug	Use of personal cell phone by staff	Action planned or taken
16-0027	July	July	Bus failed to show up	Action planned or taken
16-0028	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0029	July	Sept	Personal use of city vehicle	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0030	July	Aug	Alleged harassment in workplace	Closed with no action planned or taken as this complaint has been heard through the formal grievance process in Human Resources
16-0031	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0032	July	Sept	Use of firecrackers and fireworks	ACR 723876
16-0033	Aug	Sept	Actions of staff	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0034	Aug	Aug	Kids smoking in public places	Referred to Bylaw Services
16-0035	Aug	Aug	Actions of City staff	Closed with action planned or taken
16-0036	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0037	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0038	Aug	Aug	Unacceptable wait times at road construction site	Not related to CGS services
16-0039	Aug	Open	Conduct of City staff on a job site	Open and under investigation
16-0040	Aug	Aug	Actions of Co-op program staff	Not related to CGS services
16-0041	Aug	Sept	Parking leaky camper trailer	ACR 727141
16-0042	Aug	Sept	Unfair contract award process	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0043	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0044	Sept	Open	Potential harm to people	Open and under investigation
16-0045	Sept	Dec	Actions of a staff member	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0046	Sept	Sept	Parking in park	ACR 728780

16-0047	Sept	Sept	Loud concert music in evening	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0048	Sept	Sept	Garbage burning	ACR 729407
16-0049	Sept	Oct	Plumbing not to standards	Referred to Building Inspection for review
16-0050	Sept	Sept	Premature closure of dump	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0051	Sept	Sept	Misuse of handicap parking.	ACR 729953
16-0052	Sept	Oct	Premature closure of Chelmsford wastewater treatment plant	ACR 730463
16-0053	Sept	Dec	Upgrade of fire hall kitchens	To be examined in audit of Fire Services
16-0054	Oct	Dec	Alleged conflict of interest	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0055	Oct	Oct	Driving of a staff member	Closed with action planned or taken
16-0056	Oct	Open	Supervisory comments and conduct	Open and under investigation
16-0057	Oct	Oct	Garbage bag limits	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0058	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0059	Oct	Open	Personal use of City vehicles	Open and under investigation
16-0060	Oct	Dec	Building inspection assignments	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0061	Oct	Open	Complaint against a Councilor	Open
16-0062	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0063	Oct	Oct	Increase in parking fine	POA matter subject to Appeal See Council report Dec 2016
16-0064	Oct	Open	Price increase on contracts	Open
16-0065	Oct	Dec	Restricted use of library services	No action planned or taken
16-0066	Oct	Open	Request for fees reimbursement	Open
16-0067	Nov	Nov	Lack of signs to indicate road painting	Not related to CGS services
16-0068	Nov	Nov	Vehicle damaged by road paint	Not related to CGS services
16-0069	Nov	Nov	Complaint regarding Sudbury and District Health Unit	Not related to CGS services
16-0070	Nov	Nov	Actions of a private property owner	Not related to CGS services
16-0071	Nov	Nov	Test	N/A
16-0072	Nov	Nov	Test	N/A
16-0073	Nov	Nov	Expenditures of a non-profit housing board	Not related to CGS services
16-0074	Nov	Nov	Tenant on Ontario Works not paying rent	Not related to CGS services
16-0075	Nov	Nov	Quality of construction work	Closed with action planned or taken
16-0076	Nov	Dec	Illegal plumbing	Referred to Buildings Services
16-0077	Nov	Dec	Actions of Sudbury Housing staff	No action planned or taken
16-0078	Dec	Dec	Road through conservation area	ACR 737733
16-0079	Dec	Dec	Vehicles idling	ACR 737613
16-0080	Dec	Dec	Driving of city bus driver	ACR 737788
16-0081	Dec	Dec	Information on complaints to this	Closed with action planned

			hotline	or taken within this report
16-0082	Dec	Dec	Failure to collect garbage	ACR 738206
16-0083	Dec	Dec	Personal use of City vehicle	No evidence of wrongdoing found
16-0084	Dec	Dec	Bus drivers abused by customers and management	Closed with action planned or taken by transit
16-0085	Dec	Dec	Recyclable waste not collected	No evidence of wrongdoing
16-0086	Dec	Dec	Snowplowing on Hwy 144	Complaint referred to external entity
16-0087	Dec	Dec	Lack of green bin in a City facility	Closed with action planned or taken
16-0088	Dec	Open	Complaint about a supervisor	Open
16-0089	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0090	Dec	Open	Privacy issue	Open
16-0091	Dec	Open	Allegation regarding invoices of a contractor	Open
16-0092	Dec	Open	Use of foul language by staff	Open
16-0093	N/A	N/A	Complaint form not completed	N/A
16-0094	Dec	Open	Complaint about a supervisor	Open
16-0095	Dec	Open	Residents pushing snow onto the road	Open
16-0096	Dec	Open	Failure to be fair during the resolution of a complaint	Open
16-0097	Dec	Open	Complaint about a supervisor	Open